

(a) Denote the sentences in Φ as (1), (2), (3) :

- $\forall x(\neg \text{Above}(x, x))$ (1)
- $\forall x \forall y \forall z ((\text{Above}(x, y) \wedge \text{Above}(x, z) \wedge \neg(y = z)) \rightarrow (\text{Above}(z, y) \vee \text{Above}(y, z)))$ (2)
- $\forall x \forall y \forall z ((\text{Above}(x, y) \wedge \text{Above}(y, z)) \rightarrow \text{Above}(x, z))$ (3)

(1) : nothing is above itself

(2) : if x is directly or indirectly above y and x is directly or indirectly above z and y is not the same as z , $y \neq z$, then z is directly or indirectly above y or y is directly or indirectly above z .

(3) : if x is directly or indirectly above y and y is directly or indirectly above z , then x is directly or indirectly above z .

Let model be :

$$M = \{A, B, C\} \quad (\text{domain})$$

$$\text{Above}^M = \{(A, B), (B, C), (A, C)\} \Rightarrow$$

$$\text{Under}^M = \{(A, C)\}$$

$$\text{Clear}^M = \{A\}$$

$$\text{OnTable}^M = \{C\}$$

A
B
C

M satisfies all sentences in Φ :

(1) $\because \tau(\text{Above}(A, A))$ is true

$\tau(\text{Above}(B, B))$ is true

$\tau(\text{Above}(C, C))$ is true

$\therefore A, B, C$ are all not above itself, sentence 1 is satisfied.

(2) we only need to check if it's possible to have

$\text{Above}(x, y) \wedge \text{Above}(x, z) \wedge \tau(y = z)$ be true while

$\text{Above}(z, y) \vee \text{Above}(y, z)$ to be false.

\because to make predicate true, x has to be A, y and z can either be B or C, in any case, $\text{Above}(B, C) \vee \text{Above}(C, B)$ is true.

\therefore It's not possible to have a true predicate, false consequence in this case.

\therefore sentence 2 is satisfied.

(3) we only need to check if it's possible to have:

$\text{Above}(x, y) \wedge \text{Above}(y, z)$ is true, while $\text{Above}(x, z)$ is false

\because to make predicate true, x has to be A, y has to

be B, z has to be C. In this case,
 $\text{Above}(A, B) \wedge \text{Above}(B, C)$ is true, and $\text{Above}(A, C)$
is also true

∴ It's not possible to have a true predicate,
false consequence in this case
∴ sentence 2 is satisfied.

Based on Above^M , $\text{Under}^M(A, B)$ does not satisfy
the English description of Under.

(b) \top should be:

$$\textcircled{1} \forall x (\neg \text{Above}(x, x))$$

$$\textcircled{2} \forall x \forall y \forall z ((\text{Above}(x, y) \wedge \text{Above}(x, z) \wedge \neg(y = z)) \rightarrow \text{Above}(z, y)) \\ \vee \text{Above}(y, z))$$

$$\textcircled{3} \forall x \forall y \forall z ((\text{Above}(x, y) \wedge \text{Above}(y, z)) \rightarrow \text{Above}(x, z))$$

$$\textcircled{4} \forall x \forall y [x \neq y \rightarrow (\text{Under}(y, x) \leftrightarrow (\text{Above}(x, y) \wedge \forall z (\text{Above}(z, y)) \wedge x = z))]$$

$$\textcircled{5} \forall x (\text{Under}(x, x) \leftrightarrow \text{OnTable}(x) \leftrightarrow \neg \exists y (\text{Above}(x, y)))$$

$$\textcircled{6} \forall x (\text{Clear}(x) \leftrightarrow \neg \exists y (\text{Above}(y, x)))$$

2. Φ is not satisfiable.

Justification:

let $M = \{A\}$, $\text{between}^M = \{(A, A, A)\}$

Assume M satisfies (1) - (4)

Show M doesn't satisfy (5)

For (1), $\text{between}(x, y, z)$ and $\text{between}(z, y, x)$ are both between (A, A, A) .

$\text{between}(A, A, A) \rightarrow \text{between}(A, A, A)$ is true \rightarrow true, so (1) is true.

For (2), $\text{between}(x, y, z)$ and $\text{between}(y, z, x)$ are both between (A, A, A) , $\text{between}(x, y, z) \wedge \text{between}(y, z, x)$ is true, and $(x=y)$ is always $(A=A)$ which is also true.
 $\text{between}(A, A, A) \wedge \text{between}(A, A, A) \rightarrow (A=A)$ is true.

For (3), between(y, x, z), between(y, x, w) and
between(z, x, w) are between(A, A, A).

Therefore, between(A, A, A) \rightarrow (between(A, A, A)
 \vee between(A, A, A)) is true.

For (4), between(y, x, z), between(z, y, x),
between(x, z, y) are all between(A, A, A).
Therefore, between(A, A, A) \vee between(A, A, A) \vee
between(A, A, A) is true.

For (5), As between(x, y, z) and between(y, x, z)
are both between(A, A, A), and between(A, A, A)
is true. Therefore, between(A, A, A) \rightarrow between(A, A, A)
is false.

\therefore This structure satisfies (1)-(4), but doesn't satisfy (5).

Modification 1: Remove (5) from original Φ

New Φ :

$$\forall x \forall y \forall z (\text{between}(x, y, z) \rightarrow \text{between}(z, y, x)). \quad (1)$$

$$\forall x \forall y \forall z ((\text{between}(x, y, z) \wedge \text{between}(y, x, z)) \rightarrow (x = y)). \quad (2)$$

$$\forall x \forall y \forall z \forall w (\text{between}(y, x, z) \rightarrow (\text{between}(y, x, w) \vee \text{between}(z, x, w))). \quad (3)$$

$$\forall x \forall y \forall z (\text{between}(y, x, z) \vee \text{between}(z, y, x) \vee \text{between}(x, z, y)). \quad (4)$$

let $M = \{A\}$, $\text{between}^M = \{(A, A, A)\}$

This structure is the same as the previous example,
as shown before, this sentence satisfies (1) - (4).

Hence, this set is satisfiable.

Modification 2: Remove (3) from original Φ , and modify (4).

New Φ :

$$\forall x \forall y \forall z (\text{between}(x, y, z) \rightarrow \text{between}(z, y, x)). \quad (1)$$

$$\forall x \forall y \forall z ((\text{between}(x, y, z) \wedge \text{between}(y, x, z)) \rightarrow (x = y)). \quad (2)$$

$$\forall x \forall y \forall z ((x \neq y) \vee (y \neq z) \vee (x \neq z)) \rightarrow (\text{between}(y, x, z) \vee \text{between}(z, y, x) \vee \text{between}(x, z, y)). \quad (4)$$

$$\forall x \forall y \forall z (\text{between}(x, y, z) \rightarrow \neg \text{between}(y, x, z)). \quad (5)$$

let $M = \{A, B\}$, $\text{between}^M = \{(A, B, A), (B, A, B)\}$

for (1): if $\text{between}(x, y, z)$ is between (A, B, A) , then

between(z, y, x) is between(A, B, A), so (1) is true in this case;

if between(x, y, z) is between(B, A, B), then between(z, y, x) is between(B, A, B), so (1) is true in this case;

All other cases are trivially true as between(x, y, z) is false.

For (2): we only need to check if $\text{between}(x, y, z) \wedge \text{between}(y, x, z)$ is true while $x = z$ is false.

However, only between(A, B, A) and between(B, A, B) are true, either case, $\text{between}(y, x, z)$ is false as $\text{between}(B, A, A)$ and $\text{between}(A, B, B)$ one false respectively.

Therefore, (2) is trivially true.

For (4) : if there cannot be all three elements are the same then it's guaranteed that between(A,B,A) or between(B,A,B) will be present, making between(y,z,x) V between(z,y,x) V between(x,z,y) be true.

For (5) : if between(x,y,z) is between(A,B,A), then between(y,x,z) is between(B,A,A), so between(A,B,A) \rightarrow between(B,A,A) is true \rightarrow true which evaluates to true.

if between(x,y,z) is between(B,A,B), then between(y,x,z) is between(A,B,B), so between(B,A,B) \rightarrow between(A,B,B) is true \rightarrow true which evaluates to true.

All other cases are trivially true as between(x,y,z) is false.

Hence, this set is satisfiable.

$$\begin{aligned}
 a) P(C_i=1, H=1) &= P(C_i=1) \times P(H=1 | C_i=1) = \frac{1}{5} \times 0 = 0 \\
 P(C_i=2, H=1) &= P(C_i=2) \times P(H=1 | C_i=2) = \frac{1}{5} \times \frac{1}{4} = \frac{1}{20} \\
 P(C_i=3, H=1) &= P(C_i=3) \times P(H=1 | C_i=3) = \frac{1}{5} \times \frac{1}{2} = \frac{1}{10} \\
 P(C_i=4, H=1) &= P(C_i=4) \times P(H=1 | C_i=4) = \frac{1}{5} \times \frac{3}{4} = \frac{3}{20} \\
 P(C_i=5, H=1) &= P(C_i=5) \times P(H=1 | C_i=5) = \frac{1}{5} \times 1 = \frac{1}{5} \\
 P(C_i=1, H=0) &= P(C_i=1) \times P(H=0 | C_i=1) = \frac{1}{5} \times (1-0) = \frac{1}{5} \\
 P(C_i=2, H=0) &= P(C_i=2) \times P(H=0 | C_i=2) = \frac{1}{5} \times (1-\frac{1}{4}) = \frac{3}{20} \\
 P(C_i=3, H=0) &= P(C_i=3) \times P(H=0 | C_i=3) = \frac{1}{5} \times (1-\frac{1}{2}) = \frac{1}{10} \\
 P(C_i=4, H=0) &= P(C_i=4) \times P(H=0 | C_i=4) = \frac{1}{5} \times (1-\frac{3}{4}) = \frac{1}{20} \\
 P(C_i=5, H=0) &= P(C_i=5) \times P(H=0 | C_i=5) = \frac{1}{5} \times (1-1) = 0
 \end{aligned}$$

b) $P(H=1) = \sum_{i=1}^5 P(H=1 | C_i) P(C_i)$

$$\begin{aligned}
 &= (0 + \frac{1}{4} + \frac{1}{2} + \frac{3}{4} + 1) \cdot \frac{1}{5} \\
 &= \frac{1}{2}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 P(C_i=1 | H=1) &= \frac{\frac{1}{5} \times 0}{\frac{1}{2}} = 0 \\
 P(C_i=2 | H=1) &= \frac{\frac{1}{5} \times \frac{1}{4}}{\frac{1}{2}} = \frac{1}{10} \\
 P(C_i=3 | H=1) &= \frac{\frac{1}{5} \times \frac{1}{2}}{\frac{1}{2}} = \frac{1}{5} \\
 P(C_i=4 | H=1) &= \frac{\frac{1}{5} \times \frac{3}{4}}{\frac{1}{2}} = \frac{3}{10} \\
 P(C_i=5 | H=1) &= \frac{\frac{1}{5} \times 1}{\frac{1}{2}} = \frac{2}{5}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 c) P(H_2=1 | H_1=1) &= \frac{P(H_2=1 \cap H_1=1)}{P(H_1=1)} \\
 &= \frac{\sum_{i=1}^5 P(H_2=1 \cap H_1=1 | C_i) \cdot P(C_i)}{\sum_{i=1}^5 P(H_1=1 | C_i) \cdot P(C_i)} \\
 &= \frac{0^2 \cdot \frac{1}{5} + \left(\frac{1}{4}\right)^2 \cdot \frac{1}{5} + \left(\frac{1}{2}\right)^2 \cdot \frac{1}{5} + \left(\frac{3}{4}\right)^2 \cdot \frac{1}{5} + 1^2 \cdot \frac{1}{5}}{0 \cdot \frac{1}{5} + \frac{1}{4} \cdot \frac{1}{5} + \frac{1}{2} \cdot \frac{1}{5} + \frac{3}{4} \cdot \frac{1}{5} + 1 \cdot \frac{1}{5}} \\
 &= \frac{\frac{3}{4}}{\frac{3}{4}}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$d) P(C_i=1 | B_4) = \frac{P(B_4 | C_i) P(C_i)}{P(B_4)} = \frac{\sum_{i=1}^5 P(B_4 | C_i) P(C_i)}{\sum_{i=1}^5 P(B_4 | C_i) P(C_i)}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 P(B_4) &= \left[(1-0)^3 \times 0 + \left(1-\frac{1}{4}\right)^3 \times \frac{1}{4} + \left(1-\frac{1}{2}\right)^3 \times \frac{1}{2} + \left(1-\frac{3}{4}\right)^3 \times \frac{3}{4} \right. \\
 &\quad \left. + (1-1)^3 \times 1 \right] \times \frac{1}{5} \\
 &= \frac{23}{640}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$P(C_{i=1} | B_4) = \frac{0 \times \frac{1}{5}}{\frac{23}{640}} = 0$$

$$P(C_{i=2} | B_4) = \frac{\left(1-\frac{1}{4}\right)^3 \times \frac{1}{4} \times \frac{1}{5}}{\frac{23}{640}} = \frac{27}{46}$$

$$P(C_{i=3} | B_4) = \frac{\left(1-\frac{1}{2}\right)^3 \times \frac{1}{2} \times \frac{1}{5}}{\frac{23}{640}} = \frac{8}{23}$$

$$P(C_{i=4} | B_4) = \frac{\frac{(1 - \frac{3}{4})^3 \times \frac{3}{4} \times \frac{1}{5}}{23}}{640} = \frac{3}{46}$$

$$P(C_{i=5} | B_4) = \frac{0 \times \frac{1}{5}}{23} = 0$$

4. a) $4 \times 3 \times 2 = 24$ rows

b)

i) $P_{S_1}(G_1, D, C) = P_{S_1}(D) \times P_{S_1}(G_1 | D) \times P(C | D)$

ii) For $P_{S_1}(D)$: 3 rows

For $P_{S_1}(G_1 | D)$: $4 \times 3 = 12$ rows

For $P_{S_1}(C | D)$: $2 \times 3 = 6$ rows

Total rows: $3 + 12 + 6 = 21$ rows

c)

i) $P_{S_2}(G_1, D, C) = P_{S_2}(G_1, D) \times P_{S_2}(C)$

ii) For $P_{S_2}(G_1, D)$: $4 \times 3 = 12$ rows

For $P_{S_2}(C)$: 2 rows

Total rows: $12 + 2 = 14$ rows