

# Guidelines and Policy for the Dark Energy Survey Strong Lensing Science Team using SPACE WARPS

Aprajita Verma, Phil Marshall & Anupreeta More

March 25, 2015

## Abstract

SPACE WARPS was conceived as a strong lens discovery *service* by harnessing the power of citizen scientists that the DES strong lensing group (hereafter DES survey science team or DES SST) can make use of (within the logistical constraints). In this document we discuss how the DES SST can become involved with SPACE WARPS and the relationship between the DES survey science team and the SPACE WARPS collaboration. This document includes guidelines for proposing projects, data provision, data policy and for publications of SPACE WARPS-enabled discoveries.

TALK<sup>1</sup>).

In order to use SPACE WARPS interface, the DES Survey Science Team **must define and propose a project to the SPACE WARPS PIs** who will establish whether the use of the SPACE WARPS interface is appropriate and liaise with the DES Survey Science Team to implement their project in the SPACE WARPS interface. Details are given in Section 3.

The PIs of the SPACE WARPS project are the authors of this document, P. Marshall, A. More and A. Verma, please do not hesitate to contact us if you require any further information or have any questions. The PIs may be collectively contacted via the email address [spacewarpspi@googlegroups.com](mailto:spacewarpspi@googlegroups.com)

## 1 Introduction SPACE WARPS

The SPACE WARPS website is designed to motivate and enable tens of thousands of people to perform the scientific tasks of strong gravitational lens identification. SPACE WARPS comprises a primary ‘classification’ interface (<http://spacewarps.org>) that allows citizen scientists to inspect images and mark those that contain potential gravitational lenses. In addition, these volunteers are shown simulated lenses (appropriate for the survey being conducted) as an interactive training tool that also allows us to establish the citizens’ likelihood of identifying potential lenses and blank fields using the SPACE WARPS Analysis Pipeline (SWAPR).

A key part of the SPACE WARPS project is the ability for all members of the SPACE WARPS collaboration (see Section 2) to communicate with each other and discuss interesting candidates through

## to 2 Definition of collaboration member types

In this document, we will refer to the entirety of the DES strong lensing science group and the STRIDES team as the DES Survey Science Team (DES SST) to encompass all of the DES strong lensing community.

We now discuss the relationship between the SPACE WARPS collaboration and the DES SST, who wish to use the SPACE WARPS interface to investigate their data. The DES SSTs will liaise with the SPACE WARPS science and development teams to ingest their survey data into the SPACE WARPS interface. There may be some overlap between cur-

---

<sup>1</sup>TALK (found at <http://talk.spacewarps.org>) is a forum for SPACE WARPS collaborators to discuss individual sources and the SPACE WARPS project in general. Bugs can also be reported. This is the direct portal for communication with the SPACE WARPS community.

rent SPACE WARPS members and SSTs. In the case of DES, SPACE WARPS PI Anupreeta More is a member of both the SPACE WARPS collaboration and the DES Strong Lensing Science Group.

When we refer to the SPACE WARPS collaboration, it comprises the SPACE WARPS science team, SPACE WARPS development team, and all the volunteers who have logged in<sup>2</sup> and contributed classifications to the project.

If required, an expanded definition of the SPACE WARPS membership is given in the document “SPACE WARPS Publication Policy: CFHT-LS”<sup>3</sup>, however this will not be relevant for publications, see Section 6.1 for details.

### 3 Defining a suitable SPACE WARPS science project

The DES SST is expected to propose a project to the SPACE WARPS collaboration that can be best or only be done using the power of citizen scientists. Typically this involves visual inspection tasks that are too time consuming for the SST themselves to execute. As such any science programme conducted through SPACE WARPS should be complementary, not in competition, to the lens finding activities being carried out by the SST.

For example, in the first SPACE WARPS project, the SPACE WARPS collaboration conducted a lens finding search with SPACE WARPS over the entire CFHT-LS survey area. The goal was to increase the completeness of strong lenses in the survey areas. Both RingFinder and ArcFinder algorithms had been used to discover lenses of different types. SPACE WARPS complemented these searches with the potential to find strong lenses missed by these algorithms. The method, proposed by Anupreeta More (who served as the SST for this project), was to inspect the entire survey area by getting citizens to inspect  $\sim 430,000$  tiles of the survey area. This was a *blind* search. Such a search could not be conducted by a normal sized SST.

<sup>2</sup>with a Zooniverse ID. It is possible to classify anonymously, and we count those classification but as we don’t know who they are, we are unable to collaborate with them directly.

<sup>3</sup>available from <https://github.com/drphilmarshall/SpaceWarps/blob/master/doc/sw-publication-policy-cfhtls.pdf>

*Targeted* searches are also possible, as we performed in the second SPACE WARPS project on the VICS82 survey area. Here we inspected  $\sim 40,000$  images from the VICS82 survey centred on likely strong lens targets, e.g. LRGs, groups, clusters, quasars. Again this was more images than the SST could manage to inspect alone.

Another approach is to use the SPACE WARPS service to inspect the typically large output from automated algorithms or searches that are typically dominated by false positives.

#### 3.1 DES specific thoughts

In the case of DES, with its long data release plan and large strong lens group, we request the SST to consider the following:

1. The SPACE WARPS facility should be used for science projects that cannot be completed by the Strong Lens Group itself.
2. Any SPACE WARPS search should be complementary, not in competition, to the lens finding being conducted by the DES SST itself.
3. While SPACE WARPS uses citizen science, its primary goal is **not outreach**, it is harnessing citizen power for visual classifications (and eventually modelling) powered by citizens to perform science.
4. A duplicate project is not encouraged provided there is sufficient scientific motivation and justification to do so.
5. SPACE WARPS requires volunteers/citizens to give up their personal time to conduct the experiment, this should not be taken lightly, the crowd are motivated by contributing to real science not just doing things for the sake of them. This is the reason the suitability of the project for citizen scientists should be carefully considered. The SPACE WARPS PIs will be able to discuss any planned SPACE WARPS-DES projects with the DES SST.
6. The success of SPACE WARPS-DES will rely on input from the DES SST working with the SPACE WARPS collaboration, dedicated effort is required for this and the DES SST should identify team members who can commit time

to the SPACE WARPS-DES tasks for this before embarking on a project. The SPACE WARPS PIs will help to establish the main efforts required, these will depend on the actual project put forward by the DES SST (e.g. image preparation, simulations).

**As such, SPACE WARPS should be considered to be an integral part of the DES SST lens finding strategy, rather than an alternative method.**

The scientific project, process and outcome is the domain of the SST, the SPACE WARPS collaboration enables this work by making it a live project on the website. We do not, per se, expect the SPACE WARPS collaboration lead the resultant papers, we just request some of us are included on discovery papers in return for our help, see Section 6.1 for more details on the publication policy.

Please do remember that SPACE WARPS is setup to provide a service to help your team find lenses, any discovery in SPACE WARPS-DES is the DES SSTs discovery. The goal of the SPACE WARPS PIs or the SPACE WARPS collaboration is to enable your science project and make it work. Using SWAP we will send the DES SST lists of the candidates selected by the citizens (at some regular intervals or at the end of a project). If the DES SST wish to have the SPACE WARPS Pis input or to collaboratively work on targets the SPACE WARPS team are happy to become more involved (the SPACE WARPS Pis have strong lensing science interests) but we will not do anything with the sources found through SPACE WARPS other than provide it to the DES SST. We are happy to then work with you as you wish.

The primary duty of SW PIs is to enable the discovery of lenses through citizen science and forward the catalog of candidates to the SST (the latter part essentially happens automatically through the pipeline SWAPR). The SW team is happy to help with further grading of the candidates or assist with any scientific investigations and follow-up of the candidates, if the DES SST so requests.

Note all possible candidates are in the public domain as all images are available online (but without WCS information). These targets may be discussed by citizens on SPACE WARPS TALK. Members of the DES SST are expected to engage in discussions with citizens through TALK, which in turn has

the very positive effect of motivating the citizens to contribute further.

### 3.2 Previewing images

We are aware that there is some interest in the DES SST for using SPACE WARPS web interface to preview images for the SST themselves. As this is not the function of the SPACE WARPS interface or the Zooniverse, this would only be possible under certain conditions:

- (a) the images<sup>4</sup> inspected are destined to be seen by the crowd **in parallel** with the SST, therefore the URL for the inspection will be publicly available.;
- (b) the framework of the image presentation (i.e the SPACE WARPS interface) is the same as the interface presented to the volunteers (image clicks only and no comments or ranking possible);
- (c) all SST inspectors would have to register with the Zooniverse to classify.

### 3.3 Possible SPACE WARPS-DES survey strategies

In our experience, a citizen science project like SW cannot function successfully without significant support and co-ordination of the SST. Thus, we recommend the all DES members with an interest in strong lensing are told about SPACE WARPS and how it can complement their lens finding effort. We are here to assist your science! While we can't expect the entirety of the DES Strong Lensing Group or the STRIDES consortium to be behind SPACE WARPS-DES, all should be made aware of the projects being undertaken and planned with SPACE WARPS.

In particular, for the first potential SPACE WARPS-DES project (probably on the Y1 data) we encourage the DES SST to strongly consider the timing for when they wish to ingest the images into SPACE WARPS. This could be delayed until the SST has performed all the visual inspection or automated algorithms they wish to do

<sup>4</sup>can still be stripped of WCS information (please see Section 5)

avoid any issue of competition with SPACE WARPS (if that is a concern).

Possible projects for the DES SST could consider (just to get a flavour of what can be done)

- **New Data:** Inspection of areas (targeted or blind) that the SST has not had time to inspect, i.e. use the crowd to increase the speed at which potential lens candidates are discovered
- **Comparison of Expert vs Citizen Classification:** DES SST and citizen's view images in parallel (targeted or blind)
- **Completeness of Expert Classification:** Citizen's classify images already inspected by the DES SST (targeted or blind)
- **Helping the robots:** Use citizens to weed out false positives from candidate samples generated by algorithm based searches
- **Training sets:** Blind inspection to generate a large training set for machine learning algorithms.

Note that the projects that you propose to SPACE WARPS need not be one of the above. You can also suggest multiple projects that we could run in a mixture or phased set of experiments. Please do consider your timeline with reference to data release and the searches the DES SST want to make themselves.

If the DES SST wants to inspect targets within the consortium and is concerned about being scooped, we suggest that this should happen first before images are passed to SPACE WARPS. We would then label any images containing candidate lenses already discovered by the SST as 'known lens candidates'. This applies to visually inspected by the SST or algorithm searched images.

### 3.4 What to do next: Project Proposals

Once you have narrowed down what search you would like to do with SPACE WARPS, please approach the SPACE WARPS PIs (Phil Marshall, Anupreeta More, Aprajita Verma, collectively contacted via [spacewarpspi@googlegroups.com](mailto:spacewarpspi@googlegroups.com)) with a short description of their project that includes the following information.

- Survey area
- Bands to be included
- Total number of images to be viewed (approx.)
- Targeted survey or blind field search <sup>5</sup>
- Brief outline of the overall goal(s) of that inspection, highlighting how this is complementary (not competing) with the goals of the DES lens finding group
- Proprietary data issues
- identify a core team who will lead and work closely with SPACE WARPS

Note, the proposed science project(s) should harness citizen classification power to achieve your science goals.

The SPACE WARPS PIs will then arrange a telecon with the DES SST to discuss the project further. This includes discussing effort required and roles for the the SST team for expected tasks.

The original SPACE WARPS papers, by definition, provide a complete description of the system, and its results from the CFHT-LS survey. The SST will be able to read these papers before designing their own SPACE WARPS project, and cite them as justification for some of their experimental decisions. As the SPACE WARPS paper series get published, links to the papers will be given in this draft. Prior to publications, draft papers can also be shared on request by the SPACE WARPS PIs ([spacewarpspi@googlegroups.com](mailto:spacewarpspi@googlegroups.com))

In the remaining sections we look at discovery publications that might arise from future SPACE WARPS projects, and suggest reasonable guidelines for deciding on their authorship. First, however, we remind ourselves about data access via SPACE WARPS.

## 4 Survey Data Policy

SPACE WARPS is a public website. All images displayed there are by definition in the public domain, and so must be expected to be downloaded, copied and redistributed by any SPACE WARPS user. This

<sup>5</sup>Targeted: inspection of a list of candidates; Blind: inspection of tiles of a survey area

is a **good thing**: images of the sky taken with publicly-funded telescopes belong to everyone.

However, some surveys including DES come with their own proprietary access policy. It is the responsibility of the DES SST to provide images to SPACE WARPS in a way that is consistent with their own data access rules. There are two things that SSTs can do to in order to respect any proprietary period that they have imposed on themselves:

1. Add a “LICENSE” keyword to the FITS and PNG image headers, explaining what the rules for redistribution of these images are. This will almost certainly be ignored, but it would be a nice reminder that nothing comes free of either cost or responsibility. Other keywords could also be included as well: data provenance is important, and links to useful survey webpages would be most welcome!
2. Remove all WCS information from all images provided. The SPACE WARPS interface “dashboards” do allow FITS and JPG files to be downloaded. If images from a proprietary dataset being made available is a concern for an SST, they should remove the WCS. This also has the consequence that it minimises the potential “scooping” of lens candidates by anyone other than the SST. In practice, the objects contained in the SPACE WARPS images will be too faint for anyone without access to a large telescope to observe, and may also be absent from any public catalogs, so the opportunities for follow-up will be quite limited. Images with field of view less than about 3 arcminutes in diameter are not solvable by **astrometry.net**. **Please note**, however, that we cannot exclude the possibility that object co-ordinates are posted in TALK. For example, co-ordinates of previously published lens candidates or recognisable fields from CFHT-LS have been posted in TALK by a very small number of citizens.

## 5 Data Preparation & SPACE WARPS interface

### 5.1 Collaborating with SPACE WARPS Science Team

Implementing a new project based on different survey data will require support from the SPACE WARPS Science Team, in three respects:

1. In **preparing data** for the site, and uploading it onto the Zooniverse servers. There is a reasonable amount of work in preparing data and images by the DES SST for delivery to SPACE WARPS. The SPACE WARPS team will provide assistance to the DES SST in data preparation. The benefits of using the SPACE WARPS service will far outweigh the time needed to prepare data. The SPACE WARPS Science Team can advise on suitable Training Subjects (images of simulations and false positives) and image display settings, and also on formatting the data ready for ingestion and display. A mandatory element of the training subjects is the production of large samples of simulated lenses. SPACE WARPS will provide resources to assist generating these simulations.
2. In **reconfiguring the site itself** ready for the new data. The DES SST will need to include new Spotter’s Guide images and text, modified tutorial content, and additional survey-specific site content; the SPACE WARPS Science Team can help with all of this.
3. In **maintaining the site** so that it continues to function and deliver correctly. This will involve technical support from the Zooniverse and SPACE WARPS science teams, but will also require the continued engagement of the wider collaboration by the SST in TALK. Since this social filter is a key part of the sample refinement, the latter may involve a significant time commitment.
4. In **running the SPACE WARPS analysis pipeline** which will be our responsibility. This will provide candidates to be sent to the DES SST.

## 6 Resulting publications for SPACE WARPS-DES

### 6.1 Journal Papers

In return for the work outlined in Section 5 in setting up the new surveys, the SPACE WARPS PIs will nominate a small number of core SPACE WARPS collaboration members as authors on **papers that present discovery of a lens or sample of lenses enabled by the SPACE WARPS system**. A “discovery” is defined by the announcement of the source(s) to the astronomical community in a journal paper. We would expect the SPACE WARPS author list to be a small number (less than ten), primarily the Principal Investigators, a few others working on the ingestion of the new data or moderating TALK. All post-discovery follow-up papers would of course be exempt from this: the idea is that SPACE WARPS is purely a gravitational lens discovery service, but not one that runs by magic.

We request that authors of SPACE WARPS-enabled discovery papers should circulate drafts to the list of SPACE WARPS authors and allow a minimum of two weeks to give time for comments. We also request that any papers based on SPACE WARPS enabled discoveries should cite the SPACE WARPS system papers. This policy document will be updated with the correct citations to the SPACE WARPS system papers when available.

SPACE WARPS runs an analysis pipeline (SWAPR) that will be tailored to the science goals of each new survey. Any large changes to the analysis code will be documented by the SPACE WARPS Science Team. The SPACE WARPS Science Team reserve the right to update the SPACE WARPS methodology papers.

### 6.2 Zooniverse LETTERS

Any SPACE WARPS collaboration member, simply by virtue of their Zooniverse registration, may write a Zooniverse Letter<sup>6</sup> describing their investigation of any lens candidate they find in SPACE WARPS. This, along with posts in TALK, is the primary means by which we expect SPACE WARPS-DES collaboration members will communicate their findings to the rest of the astronomical community.

---

<sup>6</sup><http://letters.zooniverse.org>

The investigation of any SPACE WARPS images that are provided without world coordinate system (WCS) information will be necessarily limited but the SPACE WARPS Zooniverse LETTERS will contribute to the collective knowledge and understanding of the presented system(s). Zooniverse LETTERS are citable SPACE WARPS objects, and in some cases will appear listed on ADS<sup>7</sup>.

As SPACE WARPS classifications are a community wide activity, it is impossible to attribute the discovery of a candidate to a single community member, or group of members. Therefore, in recognition of their contribution to the SPACE WARPS project, SPACE WARPS community members will be listed (on their approval) on the SPACE WARPS members web page. This web page will be linked in every ensuing SPACE WARPS publication. If a community member makes a significant contribution e.g. in the further investigation of a lens candidate with modelling tools, they are strongly encouraged to write Zooniverse LETTERS. This may lead to them being invited to join journal publications by the lead author of a “discovery” publication.

## 7 Summary of Publication Guidelines

Any SPACE WARPS series and SPACE WARPS enabled discovery papers should include

- citations to the SPACE WARPS system papers, SPACE WARPS I & II
- a small number of SPACE WARPS authors proposed by the SPACE WARPS PIs (see 6.1).
- the collaboration should be acknowledged in the acknowledgement section with a link to the collaboration membership page (URL: to be confirmed when available).

---

<sup>7</sup>To be confirmed.