



### **MEMORANDUM**

TO:

James Leonard, Records Commissioner

FROM:

Kathleen McColgan, Revenue Commissioner

DATE:

October 8, 2025

RE:

Report of the Revenue & Water Commissioners on the Public Hearing with Respect to the Proposed Amendments to the Water Revenue Bureau & Water Department Regulations: Chapter 2 – Section 207 (Charity Water Rates & Charges Program)

On May 14, 2025, pursuant to Section 8-407(a) of the Philadelphia Home Rule Charter, the Department of Revenue and the Water Department jointly filed with the Department of Records proposed amendments to Chapter 2 of the Water Department regulations. In accordance with Section 8-407(b) of the Charter, a hearing was requested; pursuant to Section 8-407(c) of the Charter, a hearing was held on August 20, 2025.

Pursuant to Section 8-407(c) of the Charter, I am forwarding herewith the Report of the Revenue and Water Commissioners on the Public Hearing. A memorandum of approval from the Law Department is attached.

Thank you for your assistance in this matter.

Kathleen McColgan

Revenue Commissioner

cc:

Frances Beckley, Revenue Chief Counsel

Laurice Smith, Divisional Deputy City Solicitor



# CITY OF PHILADELPHIA LAW DEPARTMENT TAX & REVENUE UNIT MUNICIPAL SERVICES BUILDING 1401 JFK BLVD., 5<sup>TH</sup> FLOOR PHILADELPHIA, PA 19102

Frances R. Beckley Revenue Chief Counsel (215) 686-0515 (Tel) frances.beckley@phila.gov (Email)

### **MEMORANDUM**

TO:

Kathleen McColgan, Revenue Commissioner

FROM:

Frances R. Beckley, Chief Revenue Counsel

DATE:

October 8, 2025

RE:

Report of the Revenue & Water Commissioners on the Public Hearing with Respect to the Proposed Amendments to the Water Revenue Bureau & Water Department Regulations: Chapter 2 – Section 207 (Charity Water Rates & Charges Program)

I have reviewed the attached report of the public hearing on the proposed amendment to Philadelphia Water Department Regulation Chapter 2 and find the report and accompanying regulations to be legal and in proper form.

In accordance with Section 8-407(c) of the Philadelphia Home Rule Charter, you may forward the report and amended regulations to the Department of Records where they will be available for public inspection.

Frances R. Beckley

Revenue Chief Counsel

Attachment



### **MEMORANDUM**

**To:** James Leonard, Records Commissioner

From: Benjamin Jewell, Acting Water Commissioner

**Date:** October 8, 2025

**Subject:** Report of Public Hearing on Amendment to Philadelphia Water Department

Regulations Chapter 2

Please find attached for filing the report of the public hearing that was held on the proposed amendments to Chapter 2 of the Philadelphia Water Department's regulations. This report is being filed jointly by the Philadelphia Department of Revenue (Revenue) and the Philadelphia Water Department (PWD).

In accordance with Section 8-407 of the Philadelphia Home Rule Charter, Revenue and PWD are jointly filing this report and amendment with your Department to initiate the public inspection period. Please also find attached a memorandum from the Law Department approving these amendments.

Thank you for your assistance in this matter.

Benjamin Jewell

**Acting Water Commissioner** 

Attachment



### **CITY OF PHILADELPHIA**

LAW DEPARTMENT
One Parkway
1515 Arch Street

Philadelphia, PA 19102-1595

### **MEMORANDUM**

To: Benjamin Jewell, Acting Water Commissioner From: Laurice Smith, Divisional Deputy City Solicitor

Date: October 8, 2025

Re: Report of Public Hearing on Amendment to Philadelphia Water Department Regulation:

Chapter 2

I have reviewed the attached report of the public hearing on the proposed amendment to Philadelphia Water Department Regulation Chapter 2 and find the report and accompanying regulations to be legal and in proper form.

In according with Section 8-407(c) of the Philadelphia Home Rule Charter, you may forward the report and amended regulations to the Department of Records where they will be available for public inspection.

Laurice 1. Smith

Laurice Smith Divisional Deputy City Solicitor

Attachment

### **MEMORANDUM**

To: Kathleen McColgan, Revenue Commissioner

Benjamin C. Jewell, Acting Water Commissioner

From: Elizabeth Scattergood, Assistant City Solicitor

Laurice Smith, Divisional Deputy City Solicitor

Date: September 12, 2025

**Re:** Charity Water Discount Program Public Hearing

### **COMMISSIONERS' REPORT ON**

### CHARITY WATER DISCOUNT PROGRAM PUBLIC HEARING

### August 20, 2025

On May 14, 2025, the Philadelphia Water Department (PWD) and Water Revenue Bureau (WRB) jointly filed with the Department of Records, pursuant to Section 8-407(a) of the Philadelphia Home Rule Charter, the proposed amendments to the PWD/WRB Regulations. These proposed amendments would add Section 207 and, in turn, codify the Water Revenue Charity Discount Program (hereinafter "Program") to be administered by the WRB.

Public notice of the filing of these proposed amendments was published, and on June 13, 2025, a written request for a public hearing was made on behalf of the Philadelphia Large Users Group (PLUG). A public hearing was first scheduled for July 21, 2025 before being rescheduled for August 20, 2025.

The public hearing was held at 9:00am on August 20, 2025 in Room 330 of the Municipal Services Building, located at 1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard, in Philadelphia, Pennsylvania. The following individuals attended and signed in to note their presence:

- Kathleen McColgan, Revenue Commissioner
- Benjamin Jewell, Acting Water Commissioner
- On behalf of WRB:
  - o Susan Crosby, Deputy Revenue Commissioner
  - o Frances Beckley, Chief Revenue Counsel
  - o Elizabeth Scattergood, Assistant City Solicitor
  - o Keitshawna Williams, Assistant City Solicitor
- On behalf of PWD:
  - o Lawrence Yangalay, Deputy Commissioner-Finance
  - o Nina Rivera, Chief Deputy City Solicitor, Regulatory Law Unit
  - o Laurice Smith, Divisional Deputy City Solicitor
- Adeolu A. Bakare, McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC, on behalf of PLUG

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> See Addition to the Philadelphia Water Department Regulations: Chapter 2 – Section 207, (May 14, 2025), available at <a href="https://www.phila.gov/departments/department-of-records/regulations/207.0-charity-rates-and-charges-program-regulations.pdf">https://www.phila.gov/departments/department-of-records/regulations/207.0-charity-rates-and-charges-program-regulations.pdf</a>.

Revenue Commissioner McColgan and Acting Water Commissioner Jewell testified on behalf of the WRB and PWD at the hearing. Mr. Bakare testified on behalf of PLUG. In addition to the testimony provided at the hearing, PWD and WRB sought written comments through August 19, 2025. Mr. Bakare submitted written recommendations on behalf of PLUG. No other written comments or recommendations were submitted.<sup>2</sup>

The Commissioners provided an overview of the proposed amendment to Chapter 2 of the PWD Regulations. Mr. Bakare read his client's written testimony into the record, which is summarized below.

# A. Scope of Section 207.6 – removal from the Program for violation of City laws/regulations

PLUG's primary concern appeared to be the potential for unilateral abuse of discretion in determining what constitutes a violation of City Code sufficient to warrant a participant's removal from the Program. Specifically, PLUG takes issue with subsection 207.6(c)<sup>3</sup> and notes the following in its written testimony:

PLUG is concerned that approval of this language could subject PWD's customers to vague and arbitrary law. Eliminating an otherwise qualified customer from the Charity Rate Program for violation of even the most minor infraction has the potential to render the program inoperable . . . Reasonableness demands a nexus between the violation and the City's recourse.

PLUG believes that the "violation of city law or regulation" should be limited in scope to those violations that directly address PWD's concerns. For example, only allowing customers to be removed from the Program for delinquent water bills or tax liabilities. However, PLUG has suggested that actively disputed amounts be excluded from consideration when evaluating the participant's or applicant's compliance.

The Commissioners do not share this concern and do not intend to amend the regulations in this manner. Removal and denial are already authorized under the Rates and Charges Section 5.7—providing that organizations "which have violated City law or regulations" are considered to have "forfeited such privileges as the Charity Rates and Charges." The proposed section 207.6 (Removal from Program) makes no substantive change to the law. Organizations have always been required to comply with City codes and regulations. The proposed regulations merely afford the WRB a process and avenue to confirm that applicants and participants are compliant and thus maintain the integrity of the Program.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> To the extent that this Report refers to and discusses public comments, those references and discussions pertain solely to those presented by/on behalf of PLUG.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The text of Section 207.6(c) reads: "Nothing in this section shall limit the WRB on its own finding or at the request of another City department from removing Applicants from the Program who have violated any City law or regulation."

### **B.** Due process concerns

PLUG expressed skepticism that the due process avenues set forth in section 207.9<sup>4</sup> are sufficient to protect the rights of applicants and participants who were denied or removed, respectively, from the Program. In particular, PLUG highlighted the dearth of guidance in the regulations as to when a customer may be removed following notice of their removal but prior to any opportunity to dispute that decision:

PWD may counter that Section 207.9 of the proposed regulation provides an opportunity for customers to request a hearing to address concerns with any claimed violation of a City law or regulation. However, the terms of this provision also fail to avoid arbitrary and capricious results, as the regulation lacks clarity as to whether the customer can be removed from the program in advance of a hearing.

PLUG's recommendation was to amend the proposed regulations and clarify that customers will not be removed from the Program until the conclusion of any administrative or judicial review of that decision. Commissioner McColgan and Acting Commissioner Jewell agreed and suggested adding a subsection (only to this particular item) indicating that the delinquent balance can be disputed and the customer would not be removed prior to that dispute being adjudicated.

Section 207.9 of the proposed amendment would read as follows (changes in bold font):

Applicants that have been denied eligibility or been removed from the Program may request an Informal Hearing pursuant to PWD and Department of Revenue joint Regulations section 100.7(a).

- (a) Nothing in this section shall prohibit or otherwise restrict customers that were denied eligibility from seeking administrative or judicial review of that decision, as set forth in Section 100.7 of these Regulations.
- (b) Customers that receive notice of removal under subsection 207.6(d) and choose to pursue administrative or judicial review of the WRB's decision will not be removed from the Program prior to that decision's adjudication.

A revised copy of the proposed amendment has been attached to this Report. The stenographer has not produced the transcript of the hearing as of September 12, 2025.

3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> "Applicants that have been denied eligibility or been removed from the Program may request an Informal Hearing pursuant to PWD and Department of Revenue joint Regulations section 100.7(a)." § 207.9.

1	Page 1 COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA
2	
3	* * * * * *
4	IN RE: WATER REVENUE BUREAU CHARITY RATE
5	PROGRAM REGULATIONS HEARING
6	* * * * * *
7	BEFORE: Kathleen McColgan, Chair
8	Benjamin Jewell, Member
9	
10	HEARING: Wednesday, August 20, 2025
11	9:12 a.m.
12	LOCATION: 1401 JFK Boulevard
13	Room 330
14	Philadelphia, PA 19102
15	WITNESSES: Adeolu Bakare
16	
17	Reporter: Nicole Dehaven
18	
19	Any reproduction of this transcript
20	is prohibited without authorization
21	by the certifying agency.
22	
23	
24	
25	

1	APPEARANCES	Page 2
2		
3	KEITSHAWNA WILLIAMS, ESQUIRE	
4	City of Philadelphia Law Department	
5	1515 Arch Street	
6	Philadelphia, PA 19103	
7	COUNSEL FOR	
8		
9	ALSO PRESENT:	
10	Susan Crosby	
11	Frances Bedley	
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

	06/20/2025	
1	INDEX	Page 3
2		
3	DISCUSSION AMONG PARTIES	5 – 9
4	PUBLIC COMMENT	Ç
5	By Attorney Bakare	9 - 13
6	DISCUSSION AMONG PARTIES	13 - 14
7	CERTIFICATE	15
8		13
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

			08/20/2025		
1			EXHIBITS		Page 4
2					
3				Page	
4	Number	Description		Offered	
5		-	NONE OFFERED		
6					
7					
8					
9					
10					
11					
12					
13					
14					
15					
16					
17					
18					
19					
20					
21					
22					
23					
24					
25					

1	Page 5 PROCEEDINGS
2	
3	MS. MCCOLGAN: Thank you for your patience
4	as we got set up this morning. I'm Kathy
5	McColgan, Revenue Commissioner. We're here today
6	to hear testimony on the proposed amendments to
7	the Charity Water Discount Program regulations.
8	These amendments to Chapter 2 of the Philadelphia
9	Water Department and the Water Revenue Bureau
10	regulations are designed to improve program
11	efficiency and offer applicants better defined
12	guidance.
13	We are joined today by members of the team
14	who help draft these regulations and update the
15	program application materials to reflect the Water
16	Revenue Bureau's role in administrating the
17	program. These regulations are the result of
18	collaboration across several city departments
19	along with valuable input from representatives of
20	Philadelphia's water customers.
21	On May 14, 2025, the Philadelphia Water
22	Department and the Water Revenue Bureau jointly
23	filed the proposed amendments with the City's
24	Department of records.
25	On June 13, 2025, the Philadelphia Large

Page 6

User Group PLUG formally requested a hearing on 1 these amendments. A hearing was initially 2 scheduled for July 20th, 2025, but was rescheduled 3 4 for today. The proposed regulations move the 5 program from the Rates and Charges chapter of the Philadelphia Water Department, Water Revenue 6 7 Bureau and joint regulations into Chapter two. 8 This transition places administration of the program with the Water Revenue Bureau, which 9 already administers other water assistance and 10 11 discount programs. 12 Consolidating these programs under the Water Revenue Bureau will make it easier for customers 13 14 to resolve billing and eligibility issues in one 15 place, while also improving the City's use of 16 resources. The substantive changes to the Charity 17 Discount Program regulations are limited to three 18 19 First, eligibility standards. areas. 20 remain largely unchanged, but the regulations now specify the types of documentation applicants must 21 provide. 22 23 Two, removal of denial --- removal or denial 24 of participation. The proposed language mirrors 25 existing provisions under Section 5.7, which

Page 7 already authorized removal of organizations that 1 violate city laws or regulations. This is not a 2 new requirement. 3 Three, renewal of eligibility. Current 5 participants will now need to renew every two This requirement helps ensure that the 6 vears. 7 program remains limited to those who are eligible 8 and provides the Water Revenue Bureau with updated 9 information on property use. 10 Applicants to the Charity Water Discount Program continue to have the right to an 11 administrative appeal if their application is 12 denied. 13 Good morning. My name is 14 MR. JEWELL: 15 Benjamin Jewell, acting Commissioner of the 16 Philadelphia Water Department. Thank you all for 17 being here today. Today we will hear your thoughts and recommendations for proposed 18 regulations. 19 20 Following today's hearing, the departments will draft a report, outline the issues raised 21 here and providing a response to those issues. 22 23 Additionally, the Department may opt to make 24 amendments to the proposed regulations.

Revenue Commissioner's report, the Water

25

Page 8

1 Commissioner's report and any amendment to the proposed regulations will be filed with the City's 2 Department of Records. The proposed regulations 3 4 will become effective ten days after those 5 filings. Today we'll hear testimony from PLUG and its 7 representatives of the party that requested this 8 hearing and anyone else who may appear to testify 9 may do so. 10 If you have not signed in, the sign-in sheet will be coming around for --- as a record for 11 12 those who are in attendance. We have a stenographer here today taking 13 14 down the proceedings. So please state your name 15 for the record and make sure you speak clearly. We also will accept written testimony if you 16 17 would rather not speak here today or you want to offer shorter remarks. 18 19 Thank you all again for your presence today. 20 We're very proud of the Charity Water Discount Program and we are dedicated to giving 21 organizations the guidance they need to 22 23 participate in this program and stay compliant. 24 Your partnership today and as we move forward is 25 greatly appreciated.

1	Page 9 You can call the first speaker.
2	ATTORNEY BAKARE: Good morning. I thank you
3	for the opportunity to appear here before
4	everybody today. My name Adeolu Bakare. That's
5	spelled A-D-E-O-L-U. Last name B, as in boy,
6	A-K-A-R-E.
7	From the outset, I'd like to note that my
8	client appreciates the opportunity to provide
9	comments before representatives of the Water
10	Department and the Water Revenue Bureau this
11	morning.
12	I want to state that PLUG is appreciative of
13	the Department's constant efforts to provide
14	service to the customers. We understand it's a
15	difficult job. There are a lot of constituents, a
16	lot of perspectives to consider and that is
17	understood.
18	This is not meant as a overarching criticism
19	of the efforts to prepare the regulations, nor as
20	a few points that my client believes could improve
21	the operation of the Charitable Discount Program
22	for particularly for the large users affected
23	by the language that I'll discuss in my comments
24	this morning.
25	Also, we appreciate that although the

Page 10

- 1 regulations, particularly the eligibility rules
- 2 that allow to remove customers from the program
- 3 may not be changing as they're adopted by the
- 4 Water Revenue Bureau. But the fact that this
- 5 presents an amendment to the regulations provides
- 6 an opportunity to review the regulations at this
- 7 point in time with the idea of improving the
- 8 operation of the program.
- 9 So with those remarks I will now proceed
- 10 with my more formal comments which are also
- 11 provided in written format and I can give those
- 12 out to anybody here. I have some hard copies, but
- 13 I also emailed them to council for the Water
- 14 Department yesterday morning.
- 15 So with that I'll proceed. These comments
- 16 set forth the recommendations of the Philadelphia
- 17 Water Users Group, better known as PLUG, regarding
- 18 the proposed amendments to Chapter 2 of the
- 19 Philadelphia Water Department's regulations dated
- 20 May 7, 2025. The proposed amendments modify PWD's
- 21 Charity Rate Program by transferring
- 22 administration of the program from PWD to the
- 23 Water Revenue Bureau, or WRB under the
- 24 Philadelphia Department of Revenue. This proposal
- 25 was submitted as part of PWD's pending rate case

Page 11 before the Philadelphia Water, Sewer and 1 Stormwater Rate Board, but the modified regulation 2 was also submitted to the Department for approval. 3 PLUG raised concerns the proposal in the 5 rate case proceedings through the expert witness testimony of Richard A. Baudino. 6 7 B-A-U-D-I-N-O. Before the Rate Board. On July 1, 2025 the hearing officer for that 8 matter proceeded to report to the Rate Board 9 10 determining that Plug's concern regarding changes to the eliqibility requirements for the Charity 11 12 Rate Program fell within the purview of this Department and not the Rate Board. 13 14 That finding was substantially adopted by 15 the Rate Board itself, which brings us to this 16 hearing this morning. 17 PLUG is concerned that the proposed regulations include language that allows the WRB 18 19 or PWD to unilaterally remove customers from the 20 Charity Rate Program for unjust costs. particular, Section 207.6(c) of the proposed 21 regulation includes the following language. 22 23 Nothing in this section shall limit the WRB 24 on its own finding or at the request of another

City Department for removing applicants from the

25

Page 12

- 1 program who have violated any city law or
- 2 regulation. PLUG is concerned that approval of
- 3 this language could subject PWD's customers to
- 4 vague and --- to a vague and arbitrary bond.
- 5 Eliminating an otherwise qualified customer from
- 6 the Charity Rate Program for violation of even the
- 7 most minor infraction has the potential to render
- 8 the program inoperable.
- 9 As testified by Mr. Baudino before the Rate
- 10 Board, the Department of Revenue also failed to
- 11 explain or justify why a customer that violates a
- 12 city law regulation that is minor, such as a
- 13 parking violation and/or completely unrelated to
- 14 PWD services should be removed from the Charity
- 15 Rate Program.
- 16 Reasonableness demands a necessity between
- 17 the violation and the City's recourse. If PWD is
- 18 concerned about getting a discount --- or granting
- 19 a discount to customers with outstanding balances,
- 20 then the regulation should be modified to
- 21 specifically define violations for purposes of
- 22 this rule as limited to unresolved outstanding
- 23 payments or taxes.
- In light of the fact that affected customers
- 25 should reserve their rights to challenge any

Page 13 collection disputes within the city, actively 1 2 disputed payments or taxes should not be considered violations under the rule. 3 PWD may count to the exception 207.9 of the 5 proposed regulation provides an opportunity for customers to request a hearing to address concerns 6 7 with any claim violation of the City law or 8 regulation. However, the terms of this proceeding also fail to avoid arbitrary capricious results as 9 10 the regulation lacks clarity as to whether the customer should be removed from the program in 11 12 advance of the hearing. At minimum, the Department should modify this provision to ensure 13 that a customer is entitled to a hearing before 14 15 the Department of Revenue or other applicable City 16 Department prior to removal from the Charity Rate Program and neither PWD nor WRD can remove 17 customers from the Charity Rate Program until the 18 19 Department of Revenue or other applicable City 20 Department has issued a final determination following such hearing. 21 22 Again, on behalf of PLUG, thank you for hearing and considering these comments. 23

Thank you.

Susan Crosby, Department of

MS. MCCOLGAN:

MS. CROSBY:

24

25

1	Page 14 Revenue. If you have a copy of your comments we
2	can attach those as an exhibit to the transcript
3	today.
4	ATTORNEY BAKARE: I do. However I did just
5	pick up one errant typographical error as I read
6	through them. Can I possibly email you a copy of
7	the comments today or do you need the hardcopy
8	right now?
9	COURT REPORTER: That'S fine. Either way.
10	MS. MCCOLGAN: Her email address is on the
11	sign-up sheet.
12	Is there anyone else present who would like
13	to testify? Okay. That concludes our hearing for
14	today. All right. Thank you very much for
15	attending. I appreciate that.
16	* * * * * * *
17	MEETING CONCLUDED AT 9:25 A.M.
18	* * * * * *
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

1	Page 1! CERTIFICATE	5
2		
3	I hereby certify, as the stenographic reporter,	
4	that the foregoing proceedings were taken	
5	stenographically by me, and thereafter reduced to	
6	typewriting by me or under my direction; and that this	
7	transcript is a true and accurate record to the best of	
8	my ability.	
9	Dated the 26th day of September, 2025	
10	Parte D SAGAME	
12	Nicole B. DeHaven,	
13	Court Reporter	
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
1		,

		adopted	apprecia		Bureau'
1	A	10:3	ted	В	5:16
1	A-D-E-O-	11:14	8:25	B-A-U-D-	
11:8	L-U	advance	apprecia	I-N-O	С
13	9:5	13:12	tes	11:7	call
5:25	A-K-A-R-	affected	9:8	Bakare	9:1
14	E	9:22	apprecia	9:2,4	caprici
5:21	9:6	12:24	tive	14:4	_
5.21		amendmen	9:12	balances	<b>us</b> 13:9
	<b>A.M.</b> 14:17	t	approval	12:19	
2		8:1	11:3		case
2	accept	10:5	12:2	Baudino	10:25
5:8	8:16	amendmen	arbitrar	11:6	11:5
10:18	acting	ts		12:9	challen
2025	7:15	5:6,8,	<b>Y</b> 12:4	behalf	е
5:21,25	actively	23 6:2	13:9	13:22	12:25
6:3	13:1	7:24		believes	changin
10:20	Addition	10:18,	areas	9:20	10:3
11:8	ally	20	6:19	Benjamin	chapter
207.6(c)	7:23	and/or	assistan	7:15	5:8
11:21	address	12:13	ce	billing	6:5,7
207.9	13:6		6:10	6:14	10:18
13:4	14:10	<b>appeal</b> 7:12	attach	Board	Charges
20th	Adeolu		14:2	11:2,7,	6:5
6:3	9:4	applicab	attendan	9,13,15	Charita
		le	ce	12:10	le
5	administ	13:15,	8:12	bond	9:21
	ers	19	attendin	12:4	
5.7	6:10	applican	g		Charity 5:7
6:25	administ	ts	14:15	<b>boy</b> 9:5	5.7 6:17
	rating	5:11	ATTORNEY		7:10
7	5:16	6:21	9:2	brings	8:20
7	administ	7:10	14:4	11:15	10:21
10:20	ration	11:25		Bureau	11:11,
	6:8	applicat	authoriz	5:9,22	20
9	10:22	ion	ed	6:7,9,	12:6,1
	administ	5:15	7:1	13 7:8	13:16,
9:25	rative	7:12	avoid	9:10	18
14:17	7:12		13:9	10:4,23	city
					5:18

7:2	complian	council	defined	11:10	6:14,19
11:25	t	10:13	5:11	difficul	7:4
12:1,12	8:23	count	demands	t	10:1
13:1,7,	concern	13:4	12:16	9:15	11:11
15,19	11:10	COURT	denial	discount	eligible
City's	concerne	14:9	6:23	5:7	7:7
5:23	d	criticis	denied	6:11,18	Eliminat
6:15	11:17	m	7:13	7:10	ing
8:2	12:2,18	9:18	Departme	8:20	12:5
12:17	concerns	Crosby	nt	9:21	email
claim	11:4	13:25	5:9,22,	12:18,	14:6,10
13:7	13:6		24 6:6	19	emailed
clarity	CONCLUDE	Current	7:16,23	discuss	10:13
13:10	D	7:4	8:3	9:23	
client	14:17	customer	9:10	disputed	<b>ensure</b> 7:6
9:8,20	conclude	12:5,11	10:14,	13:2	13:13
collabor	s	13:11, 14	24	disputes	entitled
ation	14:13		11:3,	13:1	13:14
5:18		customer	13,25	document	
collecti	consider	S	12:10	ation	errant
on	ed	5:20	13:13,	6:21	14:5
13:1	13:3	6:13 9:14	15,16,	draft	error
comments	Consolid	10:2	19,20,	5:14	14:5
9:9,23	ating	11:19	25	7:21	exceptio
10:10,	6:12	12:3,	Departme	7 - 21	n
15	constant	19,24	nt's		13:4
13:23	9:13	13:6,18	9:13	E	exhibit
14:1,7	constitu	,	10:19	easier	14:2
Commissi	ents		departme	6:13	existing
oner	9:15		nts	effectiv	6:25
5:5	continue	<b>dated</b> 10:19	5:18	е	expert
7:15	7:11		7:20	8:4	11:5
Commissi	copies	days	designed	efficien	explain
oner's	10:12	8:4	5:10	СĀ	12:11
7:25	сору	dedicate	determin	5:11	
8:1	14:1,6	d	ation	efforts	F
complete	costs	8:21	13:20	9:13,19	fact
ly	11:20	define	determin	eligibil	10:4
12:13		12:21	ing	ity	12:24
		- '		•	

fail	greatly	6:15	July	lot	9:2,11
13:9	8:25	10:7	6:3	9:15,16	24
failed	Group	include	11:8		10:14
12:10	6:1	11:18	June	М	11:16
fell	10:17	includes	5:25	make	move
11:12	guidance	11:22	justify	6:13	6:4
filed	5:12	informat	12:11	7:23	8:24
5:23	8:22	ion		8:15	
8:2		7:9	K	material	N
filings	н	infracti	Kathy	ន	necessi
8:5	hard	on	5:4	5:15	У
final	10:12	12:7		matter	12:16
13:20	hardcopy	initiall	L	11:9	note
finding	14:7	У	lacks	Mccolgan	9:7
11:14,	hear	6:2	13:10	5:3,5	
24	5:6	inoperab	language	13:24	0
fine	7:17	le	6:24	14:10	offer
14:9	8:6	12:8	9:23	meant	5:11
formal	hearing	input	11:18,	9:18	8:18
10:10	6:1,2	5:19	22 12:3	MEETING	officer
formally	7:20	issued	large	14:17	11:8
6:1	8:8	13:20	5:25	members	operati
format	11:8,16	issues	9:22	5:13	n
10:11	13:6, 12,14,	6:14	largely	minimum	9:21
forward	21,23	7:21,22	6:20	13:12	10:8
8:24	14:13		law	minor	opportu
	helps	J	12:1,12	12:7,12	ity
G	7:6	Jewell	13:7	mirrors	9:3,8
give		7:14,15	laws	6:24	10:6
10:11		job	7:2	modified	13:5
giving	idea	9:15	light	11:2	opt
8:21	1 <b>dea</b> 10:7	joined	12:24	12:20	7:23
Good		5:13	limit	modify	organiz
7:14	<pre>improve 5:10</pre>	joint	11:23	10:20	tions
9:2	9:20	6:7	limited	13:13	7:1
granting	improvin	jointly	6:18	morning	8:22
12:18	_	5:22	7:7	5:4	outline
-	g	- <del></del>	12:22	7:14	7:21

	1			1	
outset	perspect	prepare	programs	11:19	record
9:7	ives	9:19	6:11,12	12:14,	8:11,15
outstand	9:16	presence	property	17	records
ing	Philadel	8:19	7:9	13:4,17	5:24
12:19,	phia	present	proposal	PWD's	8:3
22	5:8,21,	14:12	10:24	10:20,	recourse
overarch	25 6:6	presents	11:4	25 12:3	12:17
ing	7:16	10:5	proposed		reflect
9:18	10:16,	prior	5:6,23	Q	5:15
	19,24	13:16	6:4,24	qualifie	regulati
P	11:1		7:18,24	d	on
	Philadel	proceed	8:2,3	12:5	11:2,22
parking	phia's	10:9,15	10:18,	12.3	12:2,
12:13	5:20	proceede	20		12.2,
part	pick	d	11:17,	R	13:5,8,
10:25	14:5	11:9	21 13:5	raised	10
particip	place	proceedi	proud	7:21	regulati
ants	6:15	ng	8:20	11:4	
7:5		13:8	provide	rate	ons 5:7,10,
particip	places 6:8	proceedi	6:22	10:21,	14,17
ate		ngs	9:8,13	25	6:4,7,
8:23	PLUG	8:14	provided	11:2,5,	18,20
particip	6:1 8:6	11:5	10:11	7,9,12,	7:2,19,
ation	9:12	program		13,15,	24 8:2,
6:24	10:17	5:7,10,	providin	20	3 9:19
partners	11:4,17 12:2	15,17	g	12:6,9,	10:1,5,
hip	13:22	6:5,9,	7:22	15	6,19
8:24		18 7:7,	provisio	13:16,	11:18
	Plug's	11	n	18	remain
party	11:10	8:21,23	13:13	Rates	6:20
8:7	point	9:21	provisio	6:5	remains
patience	10:7	10:2,8,	ns	read	7:7
5:3	points	21,22	6:25	14:5	remarks
payments	9:20	11:12,	purposes	Reasonab	8:18
12:23	possibly	20	12:21	leness	10:9
13:2	14:6	12:1,6,	purview	12:16	
pending	potentia	8,15	11:12	recommen	removal
10:25	1	13:11,	PWD	dations	6:23
	12:7	17,18	10:22	7:18	7:1 12:16
			_ 0 _ 2	10:16	13:16

	1			1	<u> </u>
remove	reschedu	rules	spelled	team	transiti
10:2	led	10:1	9:5	5:13	on
11:19	6:3		standard	ten	6:8
13:17	reserve	S	s	8:4	types
removed	12:25	schedule	6:19	terms	6:21
12:14	resolve	d	state	13:8	typograp
13:11	6:14	6:3	8:14	testifie	hical
removing	resource	section	9:12	đ	14:5
11:25	s	6:25	stay	12:9	
render	6:16	11:21,	8:23	testify	ប
12:7	response	23	stenogra	8:8	unchange
renew	7:22	service	pher	14:13	d
7:5	result	9:14	8:13	testimon	<b>6:</b> 20
renewal	5:17	services	Stormwat	У	understa
7:4	results	12:14	er	5:6	nd
report	13:9	set	11:2	8:6,16	9:14
7:21,25	Revenue	5:4	subject	11:6	understo
8:1	5:5,9,	10:16	12:3	thoughts	od
11:9	16,22	Sewer	submitte	7:18	9:17
REPORTER	6:6,9,	11:1	d	time	unilater
14:9	13 7:8,	sheet	10:25	10:7	ally
represen	25 9:10	8:10	11:3	today	11:19
tatives	10:4,	14:11	substant	5:5,13	unjust
5:19	23,24	shorter	ially	6:4	11:20
8:7 9:9	12:10	8:18	11:14	7:17	
request	13:15,	sign-in	substant	8:6,13,	unrelate
11:24	19 14:1	8:10	ive	17,19,	<b>d</b>
13:6	review		6:17	24 9:4	12:13
requeste	10:6	sign-up 14:11	Susan	14:3,7,	unresolv
đ	Richard		13:25	14	ed
6:1 8:7	11:6	signed 8:10	13 - 23	today's	12:22
requirem	rights			7:20	update
ent	12:25	speak		transcri	5:14
7:3,6	role	8:15,17	taking	pt	updated
requirem	5:16	speaker	8:13	14:2	7:8
ents	rule	9:1	taxes	transfer	User
11:11	12:22	specific	12:23	ring	6:1
	13:3	ally	13:2	10:21	users
		12:21			
	1				

		00/20/2025	
9:22	WRB		
10:17	10:23		
	11:18,		
v	23		
	WRD		
vague	13:17		
12:4			
valuable	written		
5:19	8:16		
violate	10:11		
7:2			
violated	Y		
12:1	years		
violates	7:6		
12:11	yesterda		
	y		
violatio	10:14		
n			
12:6,			
13,17			
13:7			
violatio			
ns			
12:21			
13:3			
W			
water			
5:7,9,			
15,20,			
21,22			
6:6,9,			
10,12			
7:8,10,			
16,25			
8:20			
9:9,10			
10:4,			
13,17,			
19,23			
11:1			

#### COMMENTS OF THE PHILADELPHIA LARGE USERS GROUP

# BEFORE THE COMMISSIONERS OF THE PHILADELPHIA WATER DEPARTMENT AND THE PHILADELPHIA DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE

### **AUGUST 20, 2025**

These comments set forth the recommendations of the Philadelphia Large Users Group (PLUG) regarding the proposed amendments to Chapter 2 of the Philadelphia Water Department ("PWD") Regulations, dated May 7, 2025.

The proposed amendments modify PWD's Charity Rate Program by transferring administration of the program from PWD to the Water Revenue Bureau ("WRB") under the Philadelphia Department of Revenue ("Department"). This proposal was submitted as part of PWD's pending rate case before the Philadelphia Water, Sewer and Storm Water Rate Board ("Rate Board"), but the modified regulation was also submitted to the Department for approval. PLUG raised concerns with the proposal in the rate case proceedings through the expert witness testimony of Richard A. Baudino before the Rate Board. On July 1, 2025, the Hearing Officer for that matter issued a Report to the Rate Board determining that PLUG's concerns regarding changes to the eligibility requirements for the Charity Rate Program fell within the purview of this Department and not the Rate Board.

PLUG is concerned that the proposed regulations include language that allows the WRB or PWD to unilaterally remove customers from the Charity Rate Program for unjust cause. In particular, Section 207.6(c) of the proposed regulation includes the following language:

Nothing in this section shall limit the WRB on its own finding or at the request of another City department from removing Applicants from the Program who have violated any City law or regulation.

PLUG is concerned that approval of this language could subject PWD's customers to vague and arbitrary law. Eliminating an otherwise qualified customer from the Charity Rate Program for violation of even the most minor infraction has the potential to render the program inoperable. As testified by Mr. Baudino before the Rate Board, "the Department of Revenue also failed to explain or justify why a customer that violates a City law or regulation that is minor (such as a parking violations), and/or completely unrelated to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Hearing Officer Report before the Philadelphia Water Sewer and Storm Water Rate Board (July 1, 2025), at 42-43 available at 2025-GRP-hearing-report-final.pdf.

PWD's service, should be removed from the Charity Rate program." Reasonableness demands a nexus between the violation and the City's recourse. If PWD is concerned about granting a discount to customers with outstanding balances, then the regulation should be modified to specifically define violations for purposes of this rule as limited to unresolved outstanding payments or taxes. In light of the fact that affected customers should reserve their rights to challenge any collection disputes with the City, actively disputed payments or taxes should not be considered violations under the rule.

PWD may counter that Section 207.9 of the proposed regulation provides an opportunity for customers to request a hearing to address concerns with any claimed violation of a City law or regulation. However, the terms of this provision also fail to avoid arbitrary and capricious results, as the regulation lacks clarity as to whether the customer can be removed from the program in advance of a hearing. At minimum, the Department should modify this provision to ensure that a customer is entitled to a hearing before the Department of Revenue or other applicable City department prior to removal from the Charity Rate Program and neither PWD nor the WRB can remove the customers from the Charity Rate Program until the Department of Revenue or other applicable City department has issued a final determination following the hearing.

On behalf of PLUG, thank you for considering these comments.

Respectfully submitted,

Adeolu Bakare, Esq.
Counsel to the Philadelphia Large Users Group

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Direct Testimony of Richard A. Baudino before the Philadelphia Water Sewer and Storm Water Rate Board (May 1, 2025), at 19 *available at PLUG-Direct-Testimony-of-Baudino-2025.pdf*.

# 207.0 CHARITY WATER RATES AND CHARGES PROGRAM

### **207.1 Purpose:**

The City of Philadelphia has determined that public and private schools, institutions of purely public charity, and places used for actual religious worship should be afforded a discounted rate for water and sewer rents if the institution meets the criteria as set forth in this Section. Pursuant to City Code section 13-101(4)(e), the Philadelphia Water Department ("PWD") and the Department of Revenue are promulgating regulations that define such a program and its administration. An approved Applicant will receive the discount pursuant to these Regulations.

### 207.2 Eligibility:

A customer may apply to the Water Revenue Bureau ("WRB") for enrollment into the Charity Water Rates and Charges Program (the "Program"). To be eligible for the Program, all of the following conditions must be met:

- (a) Applicant is a public or private school, a place used for actual religious worship, or meets all the requirements of a purely public charity as defined by the Institutions of Purely Public Charity Act, 10 P. S. section 371, et seq., (the "Act").
- (b) Applicant is either the owner of the property or a tenant of the property. In the event the Applicant does not occupy the entire property, the area occupied by the Applicant must have a dedicated supply line and meter with a corresponding water/sewer account with the WRB.

- (c) The property's principal use is devoted to the advancement of the Applicant's stated charitable purpose.
- (d) Applicant is in compliance with City Code section 17-1303.
- (e) Applicant is in compliance with City Code section 17-107(12).
- (f) Applicant is in compliance with all other PWD Regulations.
- (g) Applicant does not have any outstanding PWD violations.
- (h) Applicant is in compliance with City Code 4-200(Subcode P).
- (i) If the Applicant's property has water and sewer service, the property must have an operating water meter that is in compliance with current PWD specifications, and the property must have a current water meter readings.

### 207.3 Discount:

Subject to approval of a complete application by the WRB as set forth in Section 204.4, an Applicant meeting the criteria in Section 204.2 shall be afforded a discounted rate on water/sewer usage and stormwater charges as established by the Water, Sewer and Storm Water Rate Board.

### **207.4 Application Process:**

- (a) An application for the discount shall be made on a form provided by the WRB. A complete application includes all of the following:
  - (1) Proof of eligibility by submitting:
- (A) Documentation of valid tax exemption from the Commonwealth as a purely public charity as defined in the Act, or
- (B) Documentation that the Applicant otherwise meets the requirements under section 204.2, including but not limited to:
- (i) State or federal tax documentation indicating charitable status; or
- (ii) Corporate formation documents; or
- (iii) Certification of charitable status by another state; or
- (iv) Proof of establishment as a public school within the City of Philadelphia; or
- (v) Proof of registration or licensure as a nonpublic or private school from the Commonwealth; or
- (vi) Proof that the Applicant's property is primarily used for actual religious worship.
- (2) Proof of compliance with City Code section 17-1303.
- (3) An attestation by the Applicant to 204.2(b) and (g).

- (b) An application shall be signed by an officer or authorized agent of the Applicant.
- (c) The City may inspect any property seeking a discount under this Regulation at any time in order to ascertain whether it meets the criteria set forth in City Code sections 17-1303 and 17-102(12), the Act, and these Regulations.

#### **207.5 Renewal:**

A discount provided under 204.3 shall expire after 2 years and may be renewed upon submittal of a newly completed application.

### 207.6 Removal from Program:

- (a) A customer enrolled in the Program may request to be removed from the Program at any time.
- (b) The WRB may remove customers from the Program if:
- (1) The customer fails to comply with City Code sections 17-1303 and 17-107(12), the Act, or these Regulations; or
- (2) The property ceases to be used for the stated charitable purpose by the Applicant; or
- (3) The property ceases to be owned or occupied by the Applicant; or
- (4) The customer fails to make full and on-time payments for two (2) consecutive billing cycles; or

- (5) It is discovered that the customer submitted intentionally false enrollment or renewal information and/or documentation.
- (c) Nothing in this section shall limit the WRB on its own findings or at the request of another City department from removing Applicants from the Program who have violated any City law or regulation.
- (d) Customers shall be informed of their removal from the Program by first-class mail.
- (e) Removal from the Program shall remain in effect for a minimum of twelve (12) months from the date on the notice of removal.

#### **207.7** Effective Date of Discount:

Any discount provided under this Section shall be effective the date the completed application is received.

### 207.8 Exclusions:

Any separate or adjoining facilities or structures not used exclusively for the principal purpose of the Applicant shall be excluded from the Program.

### 207.9Hearing:

Applicants that have been denied eligibility or been removed from the Program may request an Informal Hearing pursuant to PWD and Department of Revenue joint Regulations section 100.7(a).

(a) Nothing in this section shall prohibit or otherwise restrict customers that were

- denied eligibility from seeking administrative or judicial review of that decision.
- (b) Customers that receive notice under subsection 207.6(d) and choose to pursue administrative or judicial review of the WRB's decision will not be removed from the Program prior to that decision's adjudication.