# BOARD OF ETHICS PUBLIC HEARING REGULATION 8 (POLITICAL ACTIVITY)

TRANSCRIPT OF HEARING,

taken by and before CAROL NEALIS,

Professional Reporter and Notary Public, via
ZOOM, Haddonfield, New Jersey, on Wednesday,
July 15, 2020, commencing at 1:00 p.m.

ERSA COURT REPORTERS
30 South 17th Street
United Plaza - Suite 1520
Philadelphia, PA 19103
(215) 564-1233

```
1
    APPEARANCES:
 2
 3
    BOARD MEMBERS
 4
           Michael Reed - Chair
 5
           Phyllis Beck
           Brian McCormick
 6
           Joanne Epps
           Sanjuanita Gonzalez
 7
 8
 9
    ALSO PRESENT:
10
           Bryan McHale
           Thomas Klemm
11
           Jordana Greenwald
           Shane Creamer
           Michael Cooke
12
           Krystle Baker
13
           Dani Gardner Wright
           Jeff Zeman
14
           Frank Iannuzzi
           Robert Keiffer
15
           Pat Christmas
           Patty Gillett
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
```

					3
1		INDEX			
2					
3	TESTIMONY		PAG	E	
4					
5	COUNCILMAN I	DEREK GREEN	1	1	
6	SARAH STEVEN	ISON	1	6	
7	MARY MCDANIE	EL	2	4	
8	ADAM BONIN		2	7	
9					
10					
11					
12					
13					
14		EXHIBI	r s		
15			PAGE	PAGE	
16	NUMBER	DESCRIPTION	MARKED	ATTACHED	
17	Exhibit-1	Documents	7	33	
18	Exhibit-2	Sarah Stevenson	N/A	34	
19	Exhibit-3	Adam Bonin	N/A	35	
20					
21					
22					
23					
24					

	4
1	
2	HEARING TESTIMONY
3	
4	
5	MR. REED: Good afternoon,
6	everyone. So our first item of business is
7	the public hearing for our amended
8	regulation 8.
9	My name a Mike Reed. I'm the
10	chair of the Board of Ethics. Our first
11	activity today is the public hearing on
12	proposed amendments to board regulation 8
13	on political activity.
14	I note for the record that I am
15	joined by Vice-Chair Judge Beck, and board
16	members, Sanjuanita Gonzalez, Brian
17	McCormick and Joanne Epps.
18	I further note for the record
19	that Robert Keiffer from the law department
20	is present or he will be present soon.
21	MR. KEIFFER: Good morning or
22	afternoon, I am here.
23	MR. REED: Welcome. Finally, I
24	note for the record that this meeting is

	nearing
	5
1	conducted via Zoom and is being recorded.
2	Today's hearing is an opportunity
3	for members of the public and interested
4	parties to provide comments and
5	recommendations for modifications to
6	proposed amendments Board Regulation 8 on
7	political activity.
8	The proposed amendments have been
9	made available electronically through the
10	Board's website.
11	The Board is following the
12	process required by a Philadelphia Home
13	Rule Charter Section 8-407 for these
14	proposed amendments.
15	The Board approved these proposed
16	amendments for public posting at the
17	Records Department during it's June 24,
18	2020 public meeting.
19	The law department reviewed the
20	proposed amendments and found the proposed
21	amendments to Board Regulation 8 to be
22	legal, within the Board's authority and in
23	proper form.
24	The Department of Records

	6
1	advertised and gave public notice of the
2	proposed amendments. The Board also took
3	action by notifying members of the relevant
4	email distribution list and by giving
5	notice of the proposed amendments on its
6	website.
7	The Board proactively scheduled
8	this hearing on the proposed amendments and
9	provided notice of this hearing by
10	newspaper and on the Board's website.
11	The Board will not take any
12	action on the proposed amendments at this
13	hearing. Rather, this hearing is an
14	opportunity for the public to make comments
15	on the proposed amendments or
16	recommendations for modifications to the
17	proposed amendments to Board Regulation 8.
18	Board members may ask questions
19	of the witnesses if they wish. A hearing
20	report will be considered and approved by
21	the Board at a future Board meeting.
22	The hearing report will respond
23	to testimony and is the mechanism by which
24	the Board may modify the proposed

	7
1	amendments to the regulation that are
2	pending.
3	A court reporter is present to
4	transcribe this hearing. At this time the
5	documents that the Board filed with the
6	Department of Records, including the
7	proposed amendments to Board Regulation 8,
8	should be entered on the record of this
9	hearing and marked as Exhibit-1.
10	(At this time, a document was
11	marked for identification as Exhibit No. 1
12	MR. REED: And has that been
13	done?
14	MS. Gonzalez: Does that require
15	any action from us?
16	MR. REED: No. It requires
17	action from the court reporter.
18	COURT REPORTER: Yes. It's
19	marked.
20	MR. REED: Thank you.
21	COURT REPORTER: You're welcome.
22	MR. REED: We now we will now
23	take testimony. As our Zoom host, Board
24	staff member by the way, Zoom host is

	8
1	I don't know whether it's in Websters yet,
2	but it's a very exalted status now,
3	somewhere along, you know, in the pantheon
4	with chancellor.
5	So the Zoom host of this meeting
6	is Bryan McHale. He will give an
7	explanation of the mechanics of how the
8	rest of the hearing will proceed.
9	Mr. McHale, you're on.
10	MR. MCHALE: Thank you, Chair
11	Reed. Good afternoon, in order to keep
12	this process as simple as possible, I'm
13	going to call on every participate that I
14	see to testify.
15	If you do not have testimony when
16	called, please say that you have no
17	testimony and I will move on to the next
18	participate.
19	If you do have testimony when
20	you're called, the floor will be yours.
21	Please begin by introducing yourself for
22	the record.
23	If you have a document you wish
24	to submit for the record and have not

	9
1	already emailed it to staff, please
2	indicate that you have an exhibit and email
3	the document as a PDF to
4	GCstaff@phila.gov.
5	MR. REED: Bryan, you are fading
6	in and out for some reason. So would you
7	please repeat the last thing you said?
8	MR. MCHALE: Certainly, for those
9	who have an exhibit that they would like to
10	attach to the record and you have not
11	already sent it to GCstaff, can you please
12	send it to the email BOEGCstaff@phila.gov.
13	And it will then be amended to the record.
14	With that, first up
15	MR. REED: Bryan, I'm going to
16	let you take control and introduce our
17	witnesses.
18	The one thing I'm wondering,
19	would it be wise for everyone to be on mute
20	unless and until they need to speak?
21	MR. MCHALE: I believe that that
22	would be good practice, yes.
23	MR. REED: Okay.
24	MR. MCHALE: You know, I would

	10
1	say that for purposes of the Board, if you
2	are going to weigh in with questions, you
3	should unmute yourself as you need to and
4	jump in.
5	MR. REED: Yeah. I would request
6	that all Board members, all staff and all
7	guests put themselves on mute, and I am
8	about to do that, while Bryan and our
9	witnesses are speaking simply as a matter
10	of enhancing the our ability to hear
11	each other.
12	MS. Gonzalez: Mr. Chairman,
13	before we proceed, I have a question. Is
14	this meeting being recorded right now?
15	MR. MCHALE: It is.
16	MR. REED: Yes.
17	MS. GONZALEZ: Okay. I just
18	wanted to make sure. Thank you.
19	MR. REED: Yep.
20	MR. MCHALE: So with perfect
21	timing, Councilman Green, if you would like
22	to testify first, if you could unmute
23	yourself and introduce yourself to the Zoom
24	meeting and then proceed with testimony.

	11
1	COUNCILMAN GREEN: Thank you,
2	Bryan. Can you hear me?
3	MR. MCHALE: We can.
4	COUNCILMAN GREEN: Yes. Thank
5	you for this opportunity to offer a few
6	words regarding today's agenda item in
7	reference to this regulation of political
8	activity.
9	For many of the people on this
10	call and for those of you who may not be as
11	aware, I've been very engaged in the work
12	of the Board of Ethics for a number of
13	years.
14	In fact, prior to you all coming
15	into your current positions, I along with
16	Julie Chapman then working with then
17	Council Member Michael Nutter, helped to
18	draft the legislation which I think has put
19	us as a city in a much better place
20	regarding ethics and political activity.
21	And I've had a chance to work
22	with the Ethics Board staff in some detail
23	over the past number of years going from my
24	position as a staffer to being a member of

1	City	Council	at	Large	capacity.
---	------	---------	----	-------	-----------

So it's been a true pleasure to
work with the Ethics Board over these years
in helping to continue the work that we
both mutually agree upon that needs to be
done in our city to improve ethics and how
we function both as elected officials, City
employees and the public at large.

As you all know, I was a draft of legislation that was recently passed and then voted by the voters in the City of Philadelphia regarding political activity.

This was something that came to me based on commentary with various City employees regarding their concern regarding the tension between first amendment activities and their status as a City employee.

So we tried to strike a balance between the two which led us to legislation that was introduced and approved by voters of this city.

For today's testimony, my main point is regarding 8.5(d) in reference to

1	posting social media.	We	are	living	in	a
2	very unusual time.					

We're in fact having this hearing in a platform, which is Zoom, that if you would have asked people back in January what is Zoom, some of you would have said that's a song by the Commodores. We got a little levity on the morning.

But Zoom and Skype and Webex, all these different platforms that we're currently engaging with as a way to communicate during this Covid-19 pandemic.

And so from my perspective, doing some type of post as a City employee to their social media when they are doing this in their volunteer time, using their own personal computer or laptop or iPhone or android and they're not divulging or including information in their post identifying themselves as a City employee and allowing them to post information in reference to their first amendment rights, I think are the real crux and the context of the legislation that was passed in the

1 City Council and approved by the voters.

However, the perspective of requiring City employees to change their profile status I think is a step beyond the intent of the legislation, especially in this time period of Covid-19 when we can't engage like we normally would in better settings.

And so my perspective, my hope, is that the Ethics Board will reflect the times, the context of the legislation and the spirit of the legislative intent when the legislation was passed in City Council as well as the spirit and the perspective of the voters of the City of Philadelphia that they should be able to, as a City employee, be able to engage in this type of activity as long as they are not presenting or providing information in their post itself that they are a City employee.

And I think that's the balance that we had tried to strike between first amendment rights and someone's activity as a City employee, keeping those separate.

15
And I think they should be able
to make those posts in their own volunteer
time, on their own personal devices in a
capacity as an individual, not informing
anyone that they are a City employee. But
that's a separate perspective than having
to change their profile in their social
media accounts.
So that's my purpose of coming in
for today's hearing, to offer those
comments and my perspectives. I thank the
Ethics Board for the opportunity to present
this information and my perspective as the
scrutiny of this legislation.
And I think this helps to provide
some perspective on what I believe is the
spirit and the perspective of the voters in
the City of Philadelphia so thank you.
MR. REED: Thank you. This is
Chair Reed. I want to thank my friend,
fellow fraternity brother, Councilman Green
for the reform that he authored and the
support that he's given to the Board and to
ethics enforcement in the City during his

	HEARING
	16
1	various service in both as a council person
2	and before.
3	And we appreciate this testimony
4	and will give it, you know, very, very
5	serious consideration.
6	MR. MCHALE: Thank you, Chair
7	Reed. Thank you, Councilman. Sarah
8	Stevenson.
9	MS. STEVENSON: Hello, everyone,
10	can you hear me? Thank you.
11	Okay. So I have some testimony
12	that I will be transmitting to the Board
13	PDF shortly just after I deliver it here.
14	It's on my screen, so I'm going to read it.
15	On behalf of the Kenney
16	administration, I want to thank you for the
17	opportunity to provide comment on the
18	proposed revisions to Reg 8. I am Sarah
19	Stevenson, Chief Integrity Officer for the
20	City of Philadelphia. Joining me today is
21	Krystle Baker, Deputy Chief Integrity
22	Officer.
23	First, I'd like to thank the

Board and staff for the tremendous work

24

1	completed so far so quickly on this
2	project, particularly, under the current
3	work conditions.
4	In general, the proposed
5	revisions to Reg 8 align with the Charter
6	amendment approved by Philadelphia voters
7	on June 2, 2020 and we generally support
8	the proposed regulation.
9	However, I'd like to offer
10	comment on the following four sections:
11	First, 8.5(d), the use of an employee's
12	title on social media profile; 8.8,
13	clarifying temporary assignment to a
14	restricted agency; 8.7(b), prohibiting
15	substantial input into strategy: and

First, I want to echo Councilman Green's sentiments that we believe that the administration suggests amending proposed section 8.5(d) to eliminate the blanket restriction on an employee's title and social media profile and returning to the Board's existing narrower interpretation. This would still align with the plain

8.12(c), the gift/compensation provision.

	18
1	language of the recently adopted Charter
2	section 10-107(4)(c).
3	I'm embarrassed that I had to do
4	this, but I did get into this dictionary
5	use of the term use and you can see it in
6	the written comments.
7	But, you know, the term use is
8	really about active engagement, active
9	employment of a title, so which the
10	Charter section so I'll read the Charter
11	section.
12	No appointed officer or employee
13	of the City shall use a City title when
14	engaged in political activity.
15	So I think that the passive
16	existence of a title on a static profile
17	page would be okay as long as that profile
18	does not carry through into the post.
19	In other words, we'd like see the
20	current rule stand where the employee
21	cannot post using the title or if, as in
22	the current example with the LinkedIn
23	profile, it's a profile entitled carry into
24	the post, then that would also be

_						-
1	~~	C	+~	-	cte	_
_	. TE	3	-	_	いして	=4.

2 Social media profiles do not
3 uniformly appear immediately next to posts.
4 In the case where it does not, unless the
5 reader took the extra step of viewing the
6 profile, the reader would be unaware of the
7 City title. Just as a reader could take
8 any extra step to research the author of
9 any post, so too must the reader take an
10 additional step to find the City employee's

title on a profile.

Therefore, we feel this blanket restriction falls outside the plain meaning of the Charter and employees could inadvertently get caught in this restriction.

We would like to suggest that, as
I mentioned, leaving the existing rule and
returning to the issue, the Board and staff
returning to the issue in the future, if
you do see a need to impose a broader
restriction because of abuses of this -keeping the current role in place.

24 Second, with respect to temporary

1	assignment, the administration suggests
2	that "the duration of assignment" be the
3	calendar day in which the employee actually
4	works in the restricted agency.
5	And by restricted agency, I mean
6	those five or six agencies that are outside
7	of the broadened political activity rules,
8	police, Commissioner's Office, so on and so
9	forth.
10	This clear demarcation allows
11	departments to plan ahead without burdening
12	the rights of those employees otherwise
13	permitted to engage in political activity.
14	For example, this is just a for
15	instance, on October 1st, at the request of
16	the City Commissioners, the administration

instance, on October 1st, at the request of the City Commissioners, the administration makes the call for volunteer assignment to the Commissioners for Election Day on November 3rd. A volunteer employee signs up on November 2nd. What I'm suggesting is that the volunteer employee may engage in otherwise permissible political activity except from midnight to 11:59 p.m. on November 3rd, Election Day.

	21
1	If the assignment period extends
2	too far beyond the time parameter, employee
3	willingness to volunteer might diminish or
4	result in last-minute volunteering - both
5	are problematic for administering the
6	election in this example. Additionally,
7	the calendar day rule allows for some
8	cooling period around actual hours worked.
9	I know that was part of the
10	discussion the last voting Board meeting.
11	Third, we also recommend that the
12	Board review references to the development
13	of strategy. For example, 8.7(b) prohibits
14	responsibility for or substantial input
15	into strategy. This rule makes it sound
16	like some participation is permissible, but
17	the accompanying example does not allow for
18	any flexibility. The example states that
19	an employee may not participate in the
20	development or directing of campaign
21	strategies such as public relations and
22	data analytics. This conflict continues in
23	8.12(b) that prohibits a non-local campaign
24	task that involves strategy.

	22
1	To remedy any confusion, we
2	recommend revising the example along the
3	lines of an employee may participate in
4	conversations to develop campaign policy
5	positions but may not direct campaign
6	strategies. Alternatively, the Board could
7	strike the word substantial from 8.7(b).
8	Finally, we recommend including
9	an example that correlates corresponds
10	with 8.12(c)(ii) that does not permit an
11	employee to seek or accept any compensation
12	for his or her participation beyond what
13	would reasonably be provided to volunteers
14	by a campaign in the ordinary course of its
15	activities.
16	Again, I will be providing this
17	in writing, so you can read it.
18	It would be helpful to understand
19	what the Board deems is reasonable under
20	the context of this rule. For example, if
21	a campaign provides pizza to a group of
22	volunteers for their work, may the City
23	employee enjoy a slice of pizza without
24	running afoul of this provision?

	23
1	This concludes our prepared
2	remarks. And I want to thank you again for
3	the opportunity to testify. And again,
4	kudos to the Board and staff on this
5	really, really important work and having
6	done so in these current work conditions.
7	Thank you.
8	MR. REED: Thank you, Ms.
9	Stevenson. Krystle, are you going to
10	testify?
11	MS. BAKER: No. No. Sarah is
12	just testifying.
13	MR. REED: I'd like to thank
14	Ms. Stevenson and Ms. Baker for their
15	appearance and providing their input and we
16	will certainly give it very, very serious
17	consideration.
18	MS. STEVENSON: Thank you.
19	MR. REED: And by the way, any
20	other Board members is free to chime in,
21	just remember to unmute if you desire to do
22	so.
23	MR. MCHALE: Thank you, Chair
24	Reed. Thank you, Sarah and Krystle.

	24
1	Mary McDaniel, do you have any
2	testimony?
3	MS. MCDANIEL: I do have some
4	testimony. Thank you.
5	I'm Mary McDaniel. I am the
6	chief ethics officer for City Council. And
7	I too appreciate your quick turnaround and
8	your guidance on this recently passed law
9	which Councilman Green championed and was
10	passed by the voters.
11	I just have a couple quick
12	questions that have come to me from our
13	employees. We're in kind of a unique
14	position. Because prior to this law, the
15	Council employees were permitted to do this
16	activity on 8.5(d), use of the title. And
17	that's the biggest change for Council
18	employees.
19	And just some things that have
20	come up, since they were allowed to do it,
21	the question about old postings has come
22	up. If you continue to use your title but
23	stop doing any political posting, does that
24	now create the impression that the old

	23
1	postings are not legal, not permissible?
2	I would argue that the timeline
3	should be from when the law passed and
4	anything you did in the past is okay.
5	Because otherwise, we're going to have to
6	go through all their old postings, try and
7	clean them.
8	I don't even know if that's
9	possible. I'm not a social media person.
10	Again, I've talked to the people who are
11	social media, and that would be Lauren
12	Parrish.
13	I agree with Councilman Green and
14	the Kenney administration that the use
15	should be active use. That question has
16	also been raised by some of our people.
17	Some of the issues they've raised
18	are a lot of them are known to the media.
19	And if they have a post where they don't
20	identify themselves as a City employee but
21	everyone knows they're a City employee, are
22	they still in violation of the rule. I
23	would argue that they are not, but that I
24	believe needs to be clarified.

	26
1	And the third issue is since our
2	employees did not have to follow this in
3	the past, they're not really clear what
4	they're allowed to do, what they're not
5	allowed to do. Their jobs are to promote
6	their bosses who are politicians every four
7	years, most of them, if they seek
8	reelection.
9	So the question is where's the
10	line. I'd like to see some examples on
11	that. Maybe we can discuss that further.
12	But they are
13	And I have contacted your office
14	and you've been very helpful in scheduling
15	training and advice. But I think they're
16	looking for a little more guidance on what
17	exactly they're allowed to do and what
18	they're not allowed to do.
19	And those are my comments.
20	Again, I thank you. This has been tough on
21	all of us. You guys have done a great job
22	and I appreciate all your help. And
23	hopefully, we can work together to get
24	these things straightened out. That's all

27 I have. 1 MR. REED: Mary, thank you for 2 your testimony and we will certainly give 3 serious consideration to your suggestions. 4 5 The floor is open to -- I want to 6 confirm that Mary's grandchild is still doing very well and then I will open up the 7 floor to the rest of the Board if they have 9 any comments for Mary. 10 MS. MCDANIELS: My grandchild is doing great. In fact, she is a little girl 11 12 but she's off the charts tall. Her -- my 13 son-in-law is 6'5" and my daughter is 14 normal size, 5'5". But the baby is like in the 90th 15 percentile already. She's in 6-month 16 17 clothes being a 3-month old, so she's doing very well. Thank you. 18 19 MR. REED: Future basketball. 20 MR. MCHALE: Thank you, Chair Reed. 21 Thank you, Mary. 22 Adam Bonin is next. Do you have 23 any testimony today?

MR. BONIN: Thank you, Bryan.

24

	28
1	submitted my testimony in writing in
2	advance of the hearing. I really don't
3	have much to say.
4	I share in the suggestions of
5	Council Member Green and others with
6	regards to the profile. I generally think
7	the Board did a great job.
8	The only two points which I
9	raised in my written testimony, and I'm
10	happy to just rely upon that because it was
11	brief anyway, is the more examples the
12	better, and in particular, examples
13	pertaining to the presidential campaign,
14	because that is what most Council most
15	City employees are going to care about this
16	year, would be welcome.
17	And as before, you know, whether
18	those examples live in, you know, the
19	regulations or in a constantly changing
20	appendix, just the more information, the
21	more examples, the better.
22	The only change that I had
23	suggested was to one of the examples
24	provided with regards to the definitions of
I	

	29
1	what it counts to be in a managerial role
2	for a campaign. Data analytics was
3	suggested as one of those things which
4	brings one into the managerial role.
5	And just based on my experience,
6	it is not necessarily the case that an
7	outside, you know, volunteer who, you know,
8	is good with Excel, you know, and provided
9	data to the campaign that that by itself
10	puts that person into a managerial role.
11	It could just as easily just be an outside
12	role whereas the actual managers decide
13	what to do with that data.
14	That's all I have and I
15	appreciate the opportunity to testify.
16	MR. REED: As usual, we thank
17	Bryan I'm sorry, Adam for his appearance
18	and his testimony.
19	We will certainly give due
20	consideration to his recommendations. The
21	floor is open to the rest of the Board for
22	any questions or comments for Mr. Bonin.
23	Hearing none, I'm turning it back
24	over to the chancellor, the host

	31
1	who have any final comments or questions.
2	And hearing none, I would declare
3	the public hearing on Board Regulation 8
4	closed and thank everyone for attending.
5	(Hearing concluded at 1:28 p.m.)
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
i	

	32		
1	CERTIFICATE		
2			
3	I, CAROL NEALIS, Court Reporter, certify that		
4	the foregoing is a true and accurate transcript of		
5	the foregoing deposition, that the witness was first		
6	sworn by me at the time, place and on the date		
7	herein before set forth.		
8	I further certify that I am neither attorney nor		
9	counsel for, not related to nor employed by any of		
10	the parties to the action in which this deposition		
11	was taken; further, that I am not a relative or		
12	employee of any attorney or counsel employed in this		
13	case, nor am I financially interested in this		
14	action.		
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			
20			
21	Carol Nealis		
22	Notary Public # 1261298 County of Philadelphia		
23	My commission expires 3/22/2023		
24			

		33
1	EXHIBIT-1	
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		

		34
1	EXHIBIT-2	
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		

		35
1	EXHIBIT-3	
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		

<b>A</b>
ability 10:10
able 14:16,17 15:1
abuses 19:22
accept 22:11
accompanying 21:17
accounts 15:8
accurate 32:4
action 6:3,12 7:15,17 32:10
32:14
active 18:8,8 25:15
activities 12:17 22:15
activity 1:4 4:11,13 5:7 11:8
11:20 12:12 14:18,23 18:14
20:7,13,22 24:16
actual 21:8 29:12
Adam 3:8,19 27:22 29:17
30:5
additional 19:10
Additionally 21:6
administering 21:5 administration 16:16 17:19
20:1,16 25:14
adopted 18:1
advance 28:2
advertised 6:1
advice 26:15
afoul 22:24
<b>afternoon</b> 4:5,22 8:11 30:9
agencies 20:6
agency 17:14 20:4,5
agenda 11:6
agree 12:5 25:13
<b>ahead</b> 20:11
align 17:5,24
<b>allow</b> 21:17
allowed 24:20 26:4,5,17,18
allowing 13:21
allows 20:10 21:7
Alternatively 22:6
amended 4:7 9:13
amending 17:19
amendment 12:16 13:22
14:23 17:6
amendments 4:12 5:6,8,14
5:16,20,21 6:2,5,8,12,15,17

7:1,7 analytics 21:22 29:2 android 13:18 anyway 28:11 appear 19:3 appearance 23:15 29:17 appendix 28:20 appointed 18:12 appreciate 16:3 24:7 26:22 29:15 approved 5:15 6:20 12:21 14:1 17:6 argue 25:2,23 **asked** 13:5 assignment 17:13 20:1,2,17 21:1 attach 9:10 ATTACHED 3:16 attending 31:4 **attorney** 32:8,12 author 19:8 authored 15:22 authority 5:22 available 5:9 aware 11:11 B **B** 2:3,3 3:14

## **baby** 27:15 back 13:5 29:23 Baker 2:12 16:21 23:11,14 balance 12:19 14:21 based 12:14 29:5 basketball 27:19 Beck 2:5 4:15 **behalf** 16:15

25:24 30:22 better 11:19 14:7 28:12,21 beyond 14:4 21:2 22:12

believe 9:21 15:16 17:18

biggest 24:17

**blanket** 17:20 19:12

board 1:3 4:10,12,15 5:6,11 5:15,21 6:2,7,11,17,18,21 6:21,24 7:5,7,23 10:1,6

11:12,22 12:3 14:10 15:12 15:23 16:12,24 19:19 21:10

21:12 22:6,19 23:4,20 27:8 28:7 29:21 30:24 31:3 **Board's** 5:10,22 6:10 17:23 BOEGCstaff@phila.gov 9:12 **Bonin** 3:8,19 27:22,24 29:22 **bosses** 26:6 **Brian** 2:5 4:16 **brief** 28:11 **brings** 29:4 broadened 20:7 broader 19:21 brother 15:21 Bryan 2:10 8:6 9:5,15 10:8 11:2 27:24 29:17 30:9 burdening 20:11 business 4:6

 $\mathbf{C}$ C 2:1 32:1.1 calendar 20:3 21:7 call 8:13 11:10 20:17 called 8:16,20 campaign 21:20,23 22:4,5,14 22:21 28:13 29:2,9 capacity 12:1 15:4 care 28:15 Carol 1:9 32:3,21 carry 18:18,23 case 19:4 29:6 30:11,20 32:13 **caught** 19:15 **certainly** 9:8 23:16 27:3 29:19 **certify** 32:3,8 **chair** 2:4 4:10 8:10 15:20 16:6 23:23 27:20 30:1,20 Chairman 10:12 championed 24:9 **chance** 11:21 **chancellor** 8:4 29:24 **change** 14:3 15:7 24:17 28:22 changing 28:19 Chapman 11:16

Charter 5:13 17:5 18:1,10,10

19:14

**charts** 27:12

**chief** 16:19,21 24:6

**Cooke** 2:12 **chime** 23:20 devices 15:3 Christmas 2:15 30:6,8 cooling 21:8 dictionary 18:4 city 11:19 12:1,6,7,11,14,17 correlates 22:9 different 13:10 diminish 21:3 12:22 13:14,20 14:1,3,13,15 corresponds 22:9 14:16,20,24 15:5,18,24 council 11:17 12:1 14:1,13 direct 22:5 16:20 18:13,13 19:7,10 16:1 24:6,15,17 28:5,14 directing 21:20 20:16 22:22 24:6 25:20,21 Councilman 3:5 10:21 11:1,4 discuss 26:11 15:21 16:7 17:17 24:9 discussion 21:10 28:15 clarified 25:24 25:13 distribution 6:4 clarifying 17:13 counsel 32:9,12 divulging 13:18 clean 25:7 counts 29:1 document 7:10 8:23 9:3 clear 20:10 26:3 **County 32:22 documents** 3:17 7:5 **couple** 24:11 closed 31:4 doing 13:13,15 24:23 27:7,11 **course** 22:14 **clothes** 27:17 27:17 draft 11:18 12:9 come 24:12,20,21 court 1:21 7:3,17,18,21 32:3 coming 11:14 15:9 Covid-19 13:12 14:6 due 29:19 duration 20:2 commencing 1:12 Creamer 2:11 **comment** 16:17 17:10 create 24:24  $\mathbf{E}$ commentary 12:14 crux 13:23 E 2:1,1,3,3,9,9 3:1,14 32:1.1 comments 5:4 6:14 15:11 current 11:15 17:2 18:20,22 **easily** 29:11 18:6 26:19 27:9 29:22 31:1 19:23 23:6 echo 17:17 commission 32:22 currently 13:11 elected 12:7 Commissioner's 20:8 D election 20:18,24 21:6 Commissioners 20:16,18 **D** 2:3 3:1 electronically 5:9 Commodores 13:7 **Dani** 2:13 eliminate 17:20 communicate 13:12 data 21:22 29:2,9,13 email 6:4 9:2,12 compensation 22:11 date 32:6 emailed 9:1 completed 17:1 daughter 27:13 embarrassed 18:3 computer 13:17 **employed** 32:9,12 day 20:3,18,24 21:7 concern 12:15 decide 29:12 employee 12:18 13:14,20 concluded 31:5 declare 31:2 14:17,20,24 15:5 18:12,20 concludes 23:1 deems 22:19 20:3,19,21 21:2,19 22:3,11 **conditions** 17:3 23:6 definitions 28:24 22:23 25:20,21 32:12 conducted 5:1 **deliver** 16:13 **employee's** 17:11,21 19:10 **confirm** 27:6 demarcation 20:10 **employees** 12:8,15 14:3 conflict 21:22 19:14 20:12 24:13,15.18 department 4:19 5:17,19,24 confusion 22:1 26:2 28:15 7:6 consideration 16:5 23:17 departments 20:11 employment 18:9 27:4 29:20 deposition 32:5,10 enforcement 15:24 considered 6:20 **Deputy** 16:21 engage 14:7,17 20:13,21 constantly 28:19 **DEREK 3:5** engaged 11:11 18:14 contacted 26:13 **DESCRIPTION** 3:16 engagement 18:8 context 13:23 14:11 22:20 desire 23:21 engaging 13:11 continue 12:4 24:22 enhancing 10:10 **detail** 11:22 continues 21:22 develop 22:4 **enjoy** 22:23 control 9:16 development 21:12,20 entered 7:8 conversations 22:4

form 5:23 entitled 18:23 hearing 1:3,8 4:2,7,11 5:2 6:8 forth 20:9 32:7 6:9,13,13,19,22 7:4,9 8:8 Epps 2:6 4:17 **ERSA** 1:21 **found** 5:20 13:3 15:10 28:2 29:23 31:2 31:3.5 especially 14:5 four 17:10 26:6 ethics 1:3 4:10 11:12,20,22 **Frank** 2:14 **Hello** 16:9 12:3,6 14:10 15:12,24 24:6 fraternity 15:21 help 26:22 exactly 26:17 free 23:20 **helped** 11:17 friend 15:20 helpful 22:18 26:14 exalted 8:2 **example** 18:22 20:14 21:6,13 function 12:7 helping 12:4 21:17,18 22:2,9,20 further 4:18 26:11 32:8,11 helps 15:15 examples 26:10 28:11,12,18 **future** 6:21 19:20 27:19 **Home** 5:12 28:21,23 **hope** 14:9 G **Excel 29:8** hopefully 26:23 Gardner 2:13 exhibit 7:11 9:2,9 host 7:23,24 8:5 29:24 GCstaff 9:11 **hours** 21:8 Exhibit-1 3:17 7:9 33:1 GCstaff@phila.gov 9:4 Exhibit-2 3:18 34:1 general 17:4 Exhibit-3 3:19 35:1 generally 17:7 28:6 Iannuzzi 2:14 existence 18:16 gift/compensation 17:16 identification 7:11 existing 17:23 19:18 identify 25:20 Gillett 2:15 30:16,18 experience 29:5 girl 27:11 identifying 13:20 expires 32:22 give 8:6 16:4 23:16 27:3 immediately 19:3 explanation 8:7 29:19 important 23:5 extends 21:1 given 15:23 **impose** 19:21 extra 19:5,8 giving 6:4 impression 24:24 F **go** 25:6 improve 12:6 F 32:1 going 8:13 9:15 10:2 11:23 inadvertently 19:15 fact 11:14 13:3 27:11 16:14 23:9 25:5 28:15 **including** 7:6 13:19 22:8 fading 9:5 Gonzalez 2:6 4:16 7:14 10:12 indicate 9:2 falls 19:13 10:17 individual 15:4 far 17:1 21:2 **good** 4:5,21 8:11 9:22 29:8 **information** 13:19,21 14:19 feel 19:12 grandchild 27:6,10 15:13 28:20 **fellow** 15:21 great 26:21 27:11 28:7 informing 15:4 **filed** 7:5 Green 3:5 10:21 11:1,4 15:21 **input** 17:15 21:14 23:15 **final** 31:1 24:9 25:13 28:5 instance 20:15 Green's 17:18 Finally 4:23 22:8 **Integrity** 16:19,21 financially 32:13 Greenwald 2:11 intent 14:5,12 find 19:10 group 22:21 **interested** 5:3 32:13 first 4:6,10 9:14 10:22 12:16 guests 10:7 interpretation 17:23 13:22 14:22 16:23 17:11,17 **guidance** 24:8 26:16 **introduce** 9:16 10:23 32:5 guys 26:21 introduced 12:21 **five** 20:6 introducing 8:21 H flexibility 21:18 involves 21:24 H 3:14 floor 8:20 27:5,8 29:21 **iPhone** 13:17 Haddonfield 1:11 follow 26:2 issue 19:19,20 26:1 happy 28:10 **following** 5:11 17:10 **issues** 25:17 hear 10:10 11:2 16:10 foregoing 32:4,5 item 4:6 11:6

J	lines 22:3	N
	LinkedIn 18:22	
January 13:5	list 6:4	N 2:1,9 3:1
<b>Jeff</b> 2:13 30:11	little 13:8 26:16 27:11	N/A 3:18,19
Jersey 1:11	live 28:18	name 4:9
<b>Joanne</b> 2:6 4:17		narrower 17:23
<b>job</b> 26:21 28:7	living 13:1	Nealis 1:9 32:3,21
<b>jobs</b> 26:5	long 14:18 18:17	necessarily 29:6
joined 4:15	looking 26:16	need 9:20 10:3 19:21
Joining 16:20	lot 25:18	needs 12:5 25:24
Jordana 2:11		neither 32:8
<b>Judge</b> 4:15		New 1:11
<b>Julie</b> 11:16	M 2:3,3	newspaper 6:10
<b>July</b> 1:12	main 12:23	non-local 21:23
jump 10:4	managerial 29:1,4,10	normal 27:14
June 5:17 17:7	managers 29:12	normally 14:7
	marked 3:16 7:9,11,19	Notary 1:10 32:21
K	<b>Mary</b> 3:7 24:1,5 27:2,9,21	note 4:14,18,24
keep 8:11	<b>Mary's</b> 27:6	notice 6:1,5,9
keeping 14:24 19:23	matter 10:9	notifying 6:3
<b>Keiffer</b> 2:14 4:19,21	McCormick 2:5 4:17	<b>November</b> 20:19,20,24
<b>Kenney</b> 16:15 25:14	<b>McDaniel</b> 3:7 24:1,3,5	number 3:16 11:12,23
kind 24:13	MCDANIELS 27:10	Nutter 11:17
Klemm 2:10	McHale 2:10 8:6,9,10 9:8,21	Nutter 11.17
know 8:1,3 9:24 12:9 16:4	9:24 10:15,20 11:3 16:6	0
18:7 21:9 25:8 28:17,18	23:23 27:20 30:1,5,10,15,20	O 2:3,9
29:7,7,8	mean 20:5	<b>observe</b> 30:14
known 25:18	meaning 19:13	October 20:15
knows 25:21	mechanics 8:7	offer 11:5 15:10 17:9 30:7,12
Krystle 2:12 16:21 23:9,24	mechanism 6:23	30:17,22
kudos 23:4	media 13:1,15 15:8 17:12,22	office 20:8 26:13
Kuu08 23.4	19:2 25:9,11,18	officer 16:19,22 18:12 24:6
L	meeting 4:24 5:18 6:21 8:5	officials 12:7
L 2:9	10:14,24 21:10	
language 18:1	member 7:24 11:17,24 28:5	okay 9:23 10:17 16:11 18:17 25:4
laptop 13:17	members 4:16 5:3 6:3,18	
large 12:1,8	10:6 23:20 30:24	old 24:21,24 25:6 27:17
last-minute 21:4	mentioned 19:18	open 27:5,7 29:21
Lauren 25:11	Michael 2:4,12 11:17	opportunity 5:2 6:14 11:5
law 4:19 5:19 24:8,14 25:3	midnight 20:23	15:12 16:17 23:3 29:15
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	Mike 4:9	order 8:11
leaving 19:18		ordinary 22:14
led 12:20	modifications 5:5 6:16	outside 19:13 20:6 29:7,11
legal 5:22 25:1	modify 6:24	p
legislation 11:18 12:10,20	morning 4:21 13:8	<u>P</u>
13:24 14:5,11,13 15:14	move 8:17	P 2:1,1,9
1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	1 may x x 4 0 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 /	L vo. vo. 1.10 00.00 01.5
legislative 14:12	mute 9:19 10:7	<b>p.m</b> 1:12 20:23 31:5
legislative 14:12 levity 13:8 line 26:10	mutually 12:5	PA 1:23 page 3:3,15,15 18:17

pandemic 13:12 police 20:8 put 10:7 11:18 puts 29:10 pantheon 8:3 policy 22:4 parameter 21:2 political 1:4 4:13 5:7 11:7,20 0 Parrish 25:12 12:12 18:14 20:7,13,22 question 10:13 24:21 25:15 24:23 **part** 21:9 26:9 participate 8:13,18 21:19 politicians 26:6 questions 6:18 10:2 24:12 22:3 position 11:24 24:14 29:22 31:1 participates 30:21 positions 11:15 22:5 quick 24:7,11 possible 8:12 25:9 participation 21:16 22:12 quickly 17:1 post 13:14,19,21 14:19 18:18 particular 28:12 18:21,24 19:9 25:19 particularly 17:2 R posting 5:16 13:1 24:23 parties 5:4 32:10 **R** 2:1,3,3,9 32:1 postings 24:21 25:1,6 passed 12:10 13:24 14:13 raised 25:16,17 28:9 posts 15:2 19:3 24:8,10 25:3 read 16:14 18:10 22:17 practice 9:22 passive 18:15 reader 19:5,6,7,9 Pat 2:15 30:6 prepared 23:1 real 13:23 Patty 2:15 30:16 present 4:20,20 7:3 15:12 really 18:8 23:5,5 26:3 28:2 **PDF** 9:3 16:13 presenting 14:18 reason 9:6 pending 7:2 presidential 28:13 reasonable 22:19 prior 11:14 24:14 people 11:9 13:5 25:10,16 reasonably 22:13 percentile 27:16 proactively 6:7 recommend 21:11 22:2,8 problematic 21:5 perfect 10:20 recommendations 5:5 6:16 proceed 8:8 10:13,24 period 14:6 21:1,8 29:20 permissible 20:22 21:16 25:1 process 5:12 8:12 record 4:14,18,24 7:8 8:22,24 **permit** 22:10 **Professional** 1:10 9:10,13 permitted 20:13 24:15 profile 14:4 15:7 17:12,22 recorded 5:1 10:14 18:16,17,23,23 19:6,11 28:6 person 16:1 25:9 29:10 **Records** 5:17,24 7:6 personal 13:17 15:3 profiles 19:2 **Reed** 2:4 4:5,9,23 7:12,16,20 perspective 13:13 14:2,9,14 prohibiting 17:14 7:22 8:11 9:5,15,23 10:5,16 **prohibits** 21:13,23 15:6,13,16,17 10:19 15:19,20 16:7 23:8,13 perspectives 15:11 project 17:2 23:19,24 27:2,19,21 29:16 pertaining 28:13 promote 26:5 30:2,3,21,23 Philadelphia 1:23 5:12 12:12 proper 5:23 reelection 26:8 14:15 15:18 16:20 17:6 proposed 4:12 5:6,8,14,15,20 reference 11:7 12:24 13:22 32:22 5:20 6:2,5,8,12,15,17,24 7:7 references 21:12 Phyllis 2:5 16:18 17:4,8,19 reflect 14:10 **provide** 5:4 15:15 16:17 pizza 22:21,23 **reform** 15:22 **provided** 6:9 22:13 28:24 place 11:19 19:23 32:6 **Reg** 16:18 17:5 plain 17:24 19:13 29:8 regarding 11:6,20 12:12,15 provides 22:21 **plan** 20:11 12:15,24 platform 13:4 providing 14:19 22:16 23:15 regards 28:6,24 platforms 13:10 **provision** 17:16 22:24 regulation 1:4 4:8,12 5:6,21 **Plaza** 1:22 **public** 1:3,10 4:7,11 5:3,16 6:17 7:1,7 11:7 17:8 31:3 please 8:16,21 9:1,7,11 5:18 6:1,14 12:8 21:21 31:3 regulations 28:19 32:21 pleasure 12:2 related 32:9 point 12:24 purpose 15:9 relations 21:21 points 28:8 purposes 10:1

relative 32:11 **Second** 19:24 **strategies** 21:21 22:6 section 5:13 17:20 18:2,10,11 strategy 17:15 21:13,15,24 relevant 6:3 rely 28:10 sections 17:10 Street 1:22 see 8:14 18:5,19 19:21 26:10 strike 12:19 14:22 22:7 remarks 23:2 seek 22:11 26:7 **submit** 8:24 remedy 22:1 remember 23:21 send 9:12 submitted 28:1 repeat 9:7 sent 9:11 substantial 17:15 21:14 22:7 sentiments 17:18 report 6:20,22 suggest 19:17 reporter 1:10 7:3,17,18,21 separate 14:24 15:6 suggested 28:23 29:3 32:3 serious 16:5 23:16 27:4 suggesting 20:20 REPORTERS 1:21 service 16:1 **suggestions** 27:4 28:4 set 32:7 request 10:5 20:15 suggests 17:19 20:1 require 7:14 settings 14:8 **Suite** 1:22 **Shane** 2:11 support 15:23 17:7 required 5:12 requires 7:16 **share** 28:4 sure 10:18 requiring 14:3 **shortly** 16:13 sworn 32:6 signs 20:19 research 19:8 T respect 19:24 **simple** 8:12 T 2:9 3:14 32:1,1 **simply** 10:9 respond 6:22 take 6:11 7:23 9:16 19:7,9 responsibility 21:14 six 20:6 taken 1:9 32:11 rest 8:8 27:8 29:21 size 27:14 talked 25:10 restricted 17:14 19:1 20:4,5 **Skype** 13:9 tall 27:12 restriction 17:21 19:13,16,22 slice 22:23 task 21:24 result 21:4 social 13:1,15 15:7 17:12,22 tells 30:3 returning 17:22 19:19,20 19:2 25:9,11 temporary 17:13 19:24 **review** 21:12 someone's 14:23 **tension** 12:16 reviewed 5:19 son-in-law 27:13 term 18:5,7 revising 22:2 song 13:7 testify 8:14 10:22 23:3,10 revisions 16:18 17:5 soon 4:20 29:15 sorry 29:17 right 10:14 testifying 23:12 rights 13:22 14:23 20:12 sound 21:15 testimony 3:3 4:2 6:23 7:23 Robert 2:14 4:19 **South** 1:22 8:15,17,19 10:24 12:23 16:3 role 19:23 29:1,4,10,12 speak 9:20 16:11 24:2,4 27:3,23 28:1,9 rule 5:13 18:20 19:18 21:7,15 speaking 10:9 29:18 30:7,12,17,22 **spirit** 14:12,14 15:17 22:20 25:22 thank 7:20 8:10 10:18 11:1,4 rules 20:7 staff 7:24 9:1 10:6 11:22 15:11,18,19,20 16:6,7,10,16 16:24 19:19 23:4 running 22:24 16:23 23:2,7,8,13,18,23,24 staffer 11:24 24:4 26:20 27:2,18,20,21,24 stand 18:20 S 2:1,3,9,9 3:14 29:16 30:1,5,9,10,13,15,19 states 21:18 **Sanjuanita** 2:6 4:16 30:23 31:4 **static** 18:16 **Sarah** 3:6,18 16:7,18 23:11 thing 9:7,18 status 8:2 12:17 14:4 23:24 things 24:19 26:24 29:3 step 14:4 19:5,8,10 think 11:18 13:23 14:4,21 scheduled 6:7 **Stevenson** 3:6,18 16:8,9,19 scheduling 26:14 15:1,15 18:15 26:15 28:6 23:9,14,18 screen 16:14 third 21:11 26:1 stop 24:23 scrutiny 15:14 Thomas 2:10 straightened 26:24

time 7:4,10 13:2,16 14:6 15:3	17:6 24:10	1
21:2 32:6	voting 21:10	1
timeline 25:2	Voting 21.10	17:11
times 14:11	W	1:00 1:12
	want 15:20 16:16 17:17 23:2	<b>1:28</b> 31:5
timing 10:21	27:5	<b>10-107(4)(c)</b> 18:2
title 17:12,21 18:9,13,16,21	wanted 10:18	11 3:5
19:7,11 24:16,22		<b>11:59</b> 20:23
today 4:11 16:20 27:23 30:7	way 7:24 13:11 23:19	<b>1261298</b> 32:21
30:12,17	we're 13:3,10 24:13 25:5	<b>15</b> 1:12
today's 5:2 11:6 12:23 15:10	Webex 13:9	<b>1520</b> 1:22
tough 26:20	website 5:10 6:6,10	<b>16</b> 3:6
training 26:15	Websters 8:1	<b>17th</b> 1:22
transcribe 7:4	Wednesday 1:11	<b>19103</b> 1:23
transcript 1:8 32:4	weigh 10:2	1st 20:15
transmitting 16:12	welcome 4:23 7:21 28:16	
tremendous 16:24	willingness 21:3	2
tried 12:19 14:22	wise 9:19	<b>2</b> 17:7
true 12:2 32:4	wish 6:19 8:23	<b>2020</b> 1:12 5:18 17:7
try 25:6	witness 32:5	<b>215</b> 1:23
turnaround 24:7	witnesses 6:19 9:17 10:9	<b>24</b> 3:7 5:17
turning 29:23	wondering 9:18	<b>27</b> 3:8
two 12:20 28:8	word 22:7	<b>2nd</b> 20:20
type 13:14 14:17	words 11:6 18:19	
	work 11:11,21 12:3,4 16:24	3
U	17:3 22:22 23:5,6 26:23	3-month 27:17
unaware 19:6	worked 21:8	<b>3/22/2023</b> 32:23
understand 22:18	working 11:16	<b>30</b> 1:22
uniformly 19:3	works 20:4	<b>33</b> 3:17
unique 24:13	Wright 2:13	<b>34</b> 3:18
United 1:22	writing 22:17 28:1	<b>35</b> 3:19
unmute 10:3,22 23:21	written 18:6 28:9	<b>3rd</b> 20:19,24
unusual 13:2		
use 17:11 18:5,5,7,13 24:16	X	4
24:22 25:14,15	<b>X</b> 3:1,14	
usual 29:16		5
	Y	<b>5'5</b> 27:14
V	<b>Yeah</b> 10:5	<b>564-1233</b> 1:23
various 12:14 16:1	year 28:16	
Vice-Chair 4:15	years 11:13,23 12:3 26:7	6
viewing 19:5	<b>Yep</b> 10:19	<b>6'5</b> 27:13
violation 25:22		<b>6-month</b> 27:16
<b>volunteer</b> 13:16 15:2 20:17	Z	<u> </u>
20:19,21 21:3 29:7	<b>Zeman</b> 2:13 30:11,13	7
volunteering 21:4	<b>Zoom</b> 1:11 5:1 7:23,24 8:5	<b>7</b> 3:17
volunteers 22:13,22	10:23 13:4,6,9	
voted 12:11		8
voters 12:11,21 14:1,15 15:17	0	<b>8</b> 1:4 4:8,12 5:6,21 6:17 7:7
10015 12.11,21 17.1,13 13.17		16:18 17:5 31:3
	ı	ı

8-407 5:13 8.12(b) 21:23 8.12(c) 17:16 8.12(c)(ii) 22:10 8.5(d) 12:24 17:11,20 24:16 8.7(b) 17:14 21:13 22:7 8.8 17:12 9 90th 27:15	