

Rudin's PRINCIPLES OF MATHEMATICAL ANALYSIS, 3RD ED  
Connor Baker, June 2017

**Basic Topology: Selected Exercises**

5. Construct a bounded set of real numbers with exactly three limit points.

**Lemma 1.** *Consider the set  $E$ :*

$$E = \left\{ \frac{1}{n} : n \in \mathbb{N} \right\}.$$

*Claim:*  $|E| = |\mathbb{N}|$ .

*Let  $f : E \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$  where  $\frac{1}{n} \mapsto n$ . We will show that  $f$  is one-to-one.*

*Assume  $f(a) = f(b)$ . Then  $a = b$ , so  $f$  is one-to-one.*

*Choose  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ . Then there exists exactly one  $\frac{1}{n} \in E$  such that  $f(\frac{1}{n}) = n$  (since the reciprocal of any natural number is unique relative to the reciprocal of any other number in the naturals). As such,  $f$  is onto.*

*Since there is a one-to-one correspondence between  $E$  and  $\mathbb{N}$ ,  $|E| = |\mathbb{N}|$ .*

**CHECK ME.** Let  $E$  be the set of numbers such that:

$$E = \bigcup_{k=0}^2 A_k, \quad A_k = \left\{ \frac{1}{n} + k : n \in \mathbb{N} \right\}.$$

By Lemma 1, we know that  $A_0$  has the same cardinality as  $\mathbb{N}$ . Since  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{n} = 0$  the value of  $k$  allows us to change the value the limit approaches. As such, every value of  $A_1$  is one larger than the corresponding value of  $A_0$ , as is  $A_2$  with respect to  $A_1$ . The cardinality remains unchanged.

Since the cardinality of  $A_k$  is that of the naturals, the neighborhood  $N_r(k)$  for some  $r > 0$  intersect  $A_k$  is infinite. Therefore the set of limit points of  $E$  must contain at least the points 0, 1, and 2, and as such,  $\{0, 1, 2\} \subseteq E'$ .

We now show that  $E'$  contains only 0, 1, and 2.

Suppose that there is some limit point  $x \notin \{0, 1, 2\}$ . Let  $\epsilon = \min(d(x, 0), d(x, 1), d(x, 2))$  (we want the smallest radius possible). Then the neighborhood

$$N_{\frac{\epsilon}{2}}(x) = \left\{ y : d(x, y) < \frac{\epsilon}{2} \right\}$$

does not contain the set  $(0, \frac{\epsilon}{2}) \cup (1, 1 + \frac{\epsilon}{2}) \cup (2, 2 + \frac{\epsilon}{2})$ . Each interval in that union has no least lower bound, since  $\mathbb{N}$  is not bounded above, we can pick larger and larger  $n$  for  $\frac{1}{n}$ , which the interval is composed of. Since this portion of the interval is not included, the neighborhood is finite. Since the neighborhood is finite, the intersection with  $E$  is finite and therefore  $x$  is not a limit point.

As such,  $x \notin E'$ , and  $E' = \{0, 1, 2\}$ . □

6. Let  $E'$  be the set of all limit points of a set  $E$ . Prove that  $E'$  is closed. Prove that  $E$  and  $\bar{E}$  have the same limit points. (Recall that  $\bar{E} = E \cup E'$ .) Do  $E$  and  $E'$  always have the same limit points?

*Proof.* Prove that  $E'$  is closed.

The set  $E'$  is closed if it contains its own limit points.

Let  $x \in \bar{E}'$ .

□

*Proof.* Proof that  $E$  and  $\bar{E}$  have the same limit points.

By the previous proof,  $E'$  is closed and therefore contains its own limit points.

Let  $\bar{E}'$  be the set of all limit points of  $\bar{E}$ .

We begin by showing that  $E' \subseteq \bar{E}'$ .

Let  $x \in E'$ . Then  $x \in$

□

*CHECK ME.* Do  $E$  and  $E'$  always have the same limit points?

Consider the set

$$E = \left\{ \frac{1}{n} : n \in \mathbb{N} \right\}.$$

Since  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{n} = 0$ , and  $|E| = |\mathbb{N}|$  (by Lemma 1),  $N_r(0) \cap E$  has infinitely many points, zero must be a limit point of  $E$ , so  $E' = \{0\}$ .

However, the limit points of  $E'$  are the empty set, since no matter the point we pick to center the neighborhood, the intersection will contain at most one element (zero). As such,  $E$  and  $E'$  do not always have the same limit points.

□

7. Let  $A_1, A_2, A_3, \dots$  be subsets of a metric space.

- (a) If  $B_n = \cup_{i=1}^n A_i$ , prove that  $\bar{B}_n = \cup_{i=1}^n \bar{A}_i$ , for  $n = 1, 2, 3, \dots$ .
- (b) If  $B = \cup_{i=1}^\infty A_i$ , prove that  $\bar{B} \supset \cup_{i=1}^\infty \bar{A}_i$ .

Show, by an example, that this inclusion can be proper.

*CHECK ME.* Note that:

$$\begin{aligned}\bar{B}_n &= B_n \cup B'_n \\ \bigcup_{i=1}^n \bar{A}_i &= \bigcup_{i=1}^n \{A_i \cup A'_i\} =\end{aligned}$$

Claim:  $\bar{B}_n \subseteq \cup_{i=1}^n \bar{A}_i$ .

Assume  $x \in \bar{B}_n$ .

Case 1:  $x \in B_n$ .

Since  $B_n \subseteq \cup_{i=1}^n A_i$ , and  $x \in B_n$ ,  $x \in \cup_{i=1}^n A_i \subseteq \cup_{i=1}^n \bar{A}_i$ . Therefore  $x \in \cup_{i=1}^n \bar{A}_i$ .

Case 2:  $x \in B'_n$ .

Since  $B_n = \cup_{i=1}^n A_i$ , and  $x \in B'_n$ , then  $x$  must be a limit point of some  $A_i$  in  $\cup_{i=1}^n A_i$ , so  $x \in A'_i$ , and as such is in the union  $\cup_{i=1}^n A'_i$ . Therefore  $x \in \cup_{i=1}^n \bar{A}_i$ .

As such,  $\bar{B}_n \subseteq \cup_{i=1}^n \bar{A}_i$ .

Claim:  $\cup_{i=1}^n \bar{A}_i \subseteq \bar{B}_n$ .

Assume  $y \in \cup_{i=1}^n \bar{A}_i$ .

Case 1:  $y \in \cup_{i=1}^n A_i$ .

Since  $B_n = \cup_{i=1}^n A_i$ ,  $y \in B_n$ .

Case 2:  $y \in \cup_{i=1}^n A'_i$ .

Since  $B_n = \cup_{i=1}^n A_i$ , they must have the same limit points. As such,  $y \in B'_n$ .

As a result,  $\cup_{i=1}^n \bar{A}_i \subseteq \bar{B}_n$ .

Therefore,  $\bar{B}_n = \cup_{i=1}^n \bar{A}_i$ . □

8. Is every point of every open set  $E \subset \mathbb{R}^2$  a limit point of  $E$ ? Answer the same question for closed sets in  $\mathbb{R}^2$ .

*CHECK ME.* Since  $E$  is open, all elements of  $E$  are interior points.

Let  $p \in E$ . Choose  $r > 0$ , and let  $N_r(p)$  be a neighborhood of  $p$ . Since  $p$  is an interior point,  $\exists \delta > 0 : N_\delta(p) \subseteq E$ .

Choose  $0 < \epsilon \leq \min(r, \delta)$ . Then,  $N_\epsilon(p) \subseteq N_\delta(p) \subseteq E$ . Since  $N_\epsilon(p)$  contains infinitely many points of  $E$ , and  $N_\epsilon(p) \subseteq N_r(p)$ ,  $N_r(p)$  does as well.

Closed sets, by definition contain all of their own limit points, so any closed subset of  $\mathbb{R}^2$  will contain its own limit points. However, it is not the case that any finite set of  $E$  will have limit points since the neighborhood intersect  $E$  will be finite.  $\square$

9. Let  $E^\circ$  denote the set of all interior points of a set  $E$ .

- (a) Prove that  $E^\circ$  is always open.
- (b) Prove that  $E$  is open if and only if  $E^\circ = E$ .
- (c) If  $G \subset E$  and  $G$  is open, prove that  $G \subset E^\circ$ .
- (d) Prove that the complement of  $E^\circ$  is the closure of the complement of  $E$ .
- (e) Do  $E$  and  $\bar{E}$  always have the same interiors?
- (f) Do  $E$  and  $E^\circ$  always have the same closures?

*Proof.* Prove that  $E^\circ$  is always open.

$$E^\circ = \{p : N_r(p) \subseteq E \text{ for some } r\}.$$

□

*CHECK ME.* Prove that  $E$  is open if and only if  $E^\circ = E$ .

Assume that  $E^\circ = E$ . Then,  $E$  is the set of all interior points of  $E$ . Since every point of  $E$  is an interior point,  $E$  is open. □

*CHECK ME.* If  $G \subset E$  and  $G$  is open, prove that  $G \subset E^\circ$ .

Since  $G$  is open, every point of  $G$  is an interior point of  $G$ . Since  $G \subseteq E$ ,  $G$  is a set of some number of interior points of  $E$ , so  $G \subseteq E^\circ$ . □

*Proof.* Prove that the complement of  $E^\circ$  is the closure of the complement of  $E$ .

$$(E^\circ)^c = \bar{E}^c = (E^c \cup E'^c)?$$

□

*Proof.* Do  $E$  and  $\bar{E}$  always have the same interiors? □

*Proof.* Do  $E$  and  $E^\circ$  always have the same closures?

Since  $\bar{E} = E \cup E'$ , and  $\bar{E}^\circ = E^\circ \cup E'^\circ$ , we must show that  $\bar{E} \subset \bar{E}^\circ$  and  $\bar{E}^\circ \subset \bar{E}$ .

$$\bar{E} \subset \bar{E}^\circ:$$

$$\bar{E}^\circ \subset \bar{E}:$$

□