

# **FUNDAMENTAL PROPERTIES**

## **ADVANCED TOPICS**

- **Asymptotic covariance expressions (for high model orders)**
- **Proof of a.s. convergence results**

## ASYMPTOTIC (IN MODEL ORDER) COVARIANCE EXPRESSIONS

**Reminder:** In SISO open loop,  $S \in \mathcal{M}$ , with  $G_\theta$  and  $H_\theta$  independently parameterized

$$\text{cov } \hat{G}_N(e^{j\omega}) \approx \frac{1}{N} \Gamma^H(e^{j\omega}) \left[ \frac{1}{2\pi} \int_{-\pi}^{\pi} \Gamma(e^{j\tau}) \Gamma^H(e^{j\tau}) \frac{\Phi_u(\tau)}{\Phi_v(\tau)} d\tau \right]^{-1} \Gamma(e^{j\omega})$$

where

$$\Gamma(e^{j\omega}) = \left. \frac{\partial G_\theta(e^{j\omega})}{\partial \theta} \right|_{\theta=\theta_0}$$

*Example:* For FIR models  $G_\theta(q) = b_1 q^{-1} + \dots + b_n q^{-n}$ , with  $\theta = [b_1 \ \dots \ b_n]^T$

$$\Gamma(z) = \begin{bmatrix} z^{-1} \\ \vdots \\ z^{-n} \end{bmatrix} \Rightarrow \frac{1}{2\pi} \int_{-\pi}^{\pi} \Gamma(e^{j\tau}) \Gamma^H(e^{j\tau}) \frac{\Phi_u(\tau)}{\Phi_v(\tau)} d\tau = \begin{bmatrix} r_0 & \cdots & r_{n-1} \\ \vdots & \ddots & \vdots \\ r_{n-1} & \cdots & r_0 \end{bmatrix} \text{ Toeplitz!}$$



## ASYMPTOTIC (IN MODEL ORDER) COVARIANCE EXPRESSIONS (CONT.)

Let's continue with the FIR case: If  $\Phi_u(\omega)/\Phi_v(\omega) = 1/|A(e^{j\omega})|^2$  (AR spectrum)

$$\tilde{\Gamma}(z) = \frac{1}{A(z)}\Gamma(z) \Rightarrow \text{cov } \hat{G}_N(e^{j\omega}) \approx \frac{|A(e^{j\omega})|^2}{N} \tilde{\Gamma}^H(e^{j\omega}) \underbrace{\left[ \frac{1}{2\pi} \int_{-\pi}^{\pi} \tilde{\Gamma}(e^{j\tau}) \tilde{\Gamma}^H(e^{j\tau}) d\tau \right]^{-1}}_M \tilde{\Gamma}(e^{j\omega})$$

Furthermore, this expression is invariant w.r.t.  $\tilde{\Gamma}(e^{j\omega}) \rightarrow T\tilde{\Gamma}(e^{j\omega})$  ( $T$  nonsingular)

Hence,  $\text{cov } \hat{G}_N(e^{j\omega})$  only depends on the space spanned by the rows of  $\tilde{\Gamma}(e^{j\omega})$

**Idea:** Choose  $T$  to make  $M = I$ !

I.e. Find an orthogonal basis for

$$\text{rowspace}\{\tilde{\Gamma}(z)\} = \left\langle \frac{z^{-1}}{A(z)}, \dots, \frac{z^{-n}}{A(z)} \right\rangle$$

## ASYMPTOTIC (IN MODEL ORDER) COVARIANCE EXPRESSIONS (CONT.)

If  $A(z) = (1 - p_1 z^{-1}) \cdots (1 - p_m z^{-m})$ , with  $m \leq n$ , then by the Gram-Schmidt method,

$$\mathcal{B}_k(z) = \frac{\sqrt{1 - |p_k|^2}}{z - p_k} \prod_{l=1}^{k-1} \frac{1 - \bar{p}_l z}{z - p_l}, \quad k = 1, \dots, n \quad (p_{m+1} = \cdots = p_n = 0)$$

are orthogonal functions which span  $\text{rowspace}\{\tilde{\Gamma}(e^{j\omega})\}$ . Then

$$\begin{aligned} \text{cov } \hat{G}_N(e^{j\omega}) &\approx \frac{|A(e^{j\omega})|^2}{N} [\overline{\mathcal{B}_1(e^{j\omega})} \quad \cdots \quad \overline{\mathcal{B}_n(e^{j\omega})}] \begin{bmatrix} \mathcal{B}_1(e^{j\omega}) \\ \vdots \\ \mathcal{B}_n(e^{j\omega}) \end{bmatrix} \\ &= \frac{1}{N} \frac{\Phi_v(\omega)}{\Phi_u(\omega)} \sum_{k=1}^n |\mathcal{B}_k(e^{j\omega})|^2 \\ &= \frac{1}{N} \frac{\Phi_v(\omega)}{\Phi_u(\omega)} \left[ \sum_{k=1}^m \frac{1 - |p_k|^2}{|e^{j\omega} - p_k|^2} + n - m \right] \end{aligned}$$

## ASYMPTOTIC (IN MODEL ORDER) COVARIANCE EXPRESSIONS (CONT.)

When the model order  $n$  is large enough (but  $m$ , the order of  $A(q)$ , is fixed),

$$\boxed{\text{cov } \hat{G}_N(e^{j\omega}) \approx \frac{n}{N} \frac{\Phi_v(\omega)}{\Phi_u(\omega)}}$$

Since most smooth spectra  $\Phi_u/\Phi_v$  can be uniformly approximated by an AR spectrum, this formula holds under very general conditions, and for most standard model structures (but it requires  $\Phi_u(\omega)/\Phi_v(\omega)$  to be continuous and strictly above zero for all  $\omega$ )

## PROOF OF A.S. CONVERGENCE RESULTS

*How to prove a.s. convergence?*

- Method of subsequences
- Maximal inequalities
- Ergodic theorems
- Martingale theory
- “ODE” method
- $\vdots$

## PROOF OF A.S. CONVERGENCE RESULTS (CONT.)

**Borel-Cantelli Lemma:** Let  $\{A_k\}$  be a collection of events. Then

$$\sum_{k=1}^{\infty} P\{A_k\} < \infty \quad \Rightarrow \quad P\{\text{an infinite number of } A_k \text{'s occur}\} = 0$$

**Proof:**

$$P\{\text{infinite number of } A_k \text{'s occur}\} = P\{\text{for every } N \in \mathbb{N}, \text{ there is } k \geq N \text{ such that } A_k \text{ occurs}\}$$

$$= P\left\{\bigcap_{N=1}^{\infty} \{\text{there is } k \geq N \text{ such that } A_k \text{ occurs}\}\right\}$$

$$= P\left\{\bigcap_{N=1}^{\infty} \bigcup_{k=N}^{\infty} A_k\right\}$$

$$= \lim_{N \rightarrow \infty} P\left\{\bigcup_{k=N}^{\infty} A_k\right\}$$

$$\leq \lim_{N \rightarrow \infty} \sum_{k=N}^{\infty} P\{A_k\} = \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} P\{A_k\} - \lim_{N \rightarrow \infty} \sum_{k=1}^{N-1} P\{A_k\} = 0$$



## PROOF OF A.S. CONVERGENCE RESULTS (CONT.)

**Chebyshev's Inequality:** Let  $x$  be a random variable with d.f.  $F$ , and  $\varepsilon > 0$ . Then

$$P\{|x| > \varepsilon\} \leq \frac{E\{x^2\}}{\varepsilon^2}$$

**Proof:**

$$E\{x^2\} = \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} x^2 dF(x) \geq \int_{|x| > \varepsilon} x^2 dF(x) \geq \varepsilon^2 \int_{|x| > \varepsilon} dF(x) = \varepsilon^2 P\{|x| > \varepsilon\}$$

## PROOF OF A.S. CONVERGENCE RESULTS (CONT.)

**Idea of a convergence proof:** For fixed  $\varepsilon > 0$ , let  $A_k = \{|x_k| > \varepsilon\}$ . Then

$$\begin{aligned}\sum_{k=1}^{\infty} P\{A_k\} < \infty &\Rightarrow P\{|x_k| > \varepsilon \text{ for finite number of } k\text{'s}\} = 1 \\ &\Rightarrow P\{\text{there is } N \in \mathbb{N} \text{ such that for all } k \geq N, |x_k| > \varepsilon\} = 1 \\ &\Rightarrow P\{\lim_{k \rightarrow \infty} x_k = 0\} = 1 \\ &\Rightarrow x_k \xrightarrow[N \rightarrow \infty]{a.s.} 0\end{aligned}$$

We can bound  $P\{A_k\}$  by Chebyshev's inequality!

Sometimes Chebyshev's inequality is not strong enough, so we can only prove convergence for a *subsequence*  $\{x_{n_k}\}$ , but then we can use this to show that

$$\max_{n_k \leq i < n_{k+1}} |x_i| \xrightarrow[k \rightarrow \infty]{a.s.} 0$$

## PROOF OF A.S. CONVERGENCE RESULTS (CONT.)

**Thm (2B.1):** Let

- $\{G_\theta(q) : \theta \in D_\theta\}$ ,  $\{H_\theta(q, t) : \theta \in D_\theta, t \in \mathbb{N}\}$ ,  $\{M_\theta(q) : \theta \in D_\theta\}$  uniformly stable
- $\{w_t\}$  quasi-stationary and bounded by  $C_w$
- $v_t = H_\theta(q, t)e_t$ , where  $\{e_t\}$  are independent random variables with  $E\{e_t\} = 0$ ,  $E\{e_t e_t^T\} = \Lambda_t$  and bounded moments of order 4
- $s_t(\theta) = G_\theta(q)v_t + M_\theta(q)w_t$

Then

$$\sup_{\theta \in D_\theta} \left\| \frac{1}{N} \sum_{t=1}^N [s_t(\theta) s_t^T(\theta) - E\{s_t(\theta) s_t^T(\theta)\}] \right\| \xrightarrow[N \rightarrow \infty]{a.s.} 0$$

*Remark:* This shows that  $\sup_{\theta \in D_{\mathcal{M}}} \|V_N(\theta) - \bar{V}(\theta)\| \xrightarrow[N \rightarrow \infty]{a.s.} 0$ , thus establishing the a.s. convergence of PEM

## PROOF OF A.S. CONVERGENCE RESULTS (CONT.)

**Proof of Thm (2B.1):** Let  $r_t(\theta) := s_t(\theta)s_t^T(\theta) - E\{s_t(\theta)s_t^T(\theta)\}$ , and

$$R_r^N := \sup_{\theta \in D_\theta} \left\| \sum_{t=r}^N r_t(\theta) \right\|$$

We want to prove that  $(1/N)R_1^N \xrightarrow[N \rightarrow \infty]{a.s.} 0$ .

After long calculations (see Lemma 2B.2), we have, for some  $C > 0$ ,

$$E\{(R_r^N)^2\} \leq C(N-r)$$

Therefore

$$E\left\{\frac{1}{N^2}(R_1^N)^2\right\} \leq \frac{1}{N^2}C(N-1) = O\left(\frac{1}{N}\right) \quad \text{and} \quad \sum_{N=1}^{\infty} 1/N = \infty$$

$\Rightarrow$  Chebyshev+Borel-Cantelli cannot be directly used

## PROOF OF A.S. CONVERGENCE RESULTS (CONT.)

However,

$$E \left\{ \left( \frac{1}{N^2} R_1^{N^2} \right)^2 \right\} \leq O \left( \frac{1}{N^2} \right) \quad \Rightarrow \quad (1/N^2) R_1^{N^2} \xrightarrow[N \rightarrow \infty]{a.s.} 0$$

Let's study:

$$\max_{N^2 \leq k < (N+1)^2} \frac{1}{k} R_1^k$$

Then, if  $k_N \in [N^2, (N+1)^2)$  and  $\theta_N \in D_\theta$  maximize this quantity, we have

$$\begin{aligned} \max_{N^2 \leq k < (N+1)^2} \frac{1}{k} R_1^k &= \frac{1}{k_N} \left\| \sum_{t=1}^{k_N} r_t(\theta_N) \right\| \\ &\leq \frac{1}{k_N} \left\| \sum_{t=1}^{N^2} r_t(\theta_N) \right\| + \frac{1}{k_N} \left\| \sum_{t=N^2+1}^{k_N} r_t(\theta_N) \right\| \\ &\leq \underbrace{\frac{1}{N^2} R_1^{N^2}}_{\xrightarrow[N \rightarrow \infty]{a.s.} 0} + \frac{1}{N^2} R_{N^2+1}^{k_N} \end{aligned}$$

## PROOF OF A.S. CONVERGENCE RESULTS (CONT.)

Also,

$$\begin{aligned} E \left\{ \left( \frac{1}{N^2} R_{N^2+1}^{k_N} \right)^2 \right\} &\leq \frac{1}{N^4} E \left\{ \max_{N^2 \leq k < (N+1)^2} \left( R_{N^2+1}^k \right)^2 \right\} \\ &\leq \frac{1}{N^4} \sum_{k=N^2}^{(N+1)^2-1} E \left\{ \left( R_{N^2+1}^k \right)^2 \right\} \\ &\leq \frac{1}{N^4} \sum_{k=N^2}^{(N+1)^2-1} C(k - N^2 - 1) \\ &\leq \frac{C'}{N^4} N^2 = \frac{C'}{N^2} \end{aligned}$$

Hence, by Chebyshev+Borel-Cantelli,  $(1/N^2) R_{N^2+1}^{k_N} \xrightarrow[N \rightarrow \infty]{a.s.} 0$ , and so also  $\max_{N^2 \leq k < (N+1)^2} (1/k) R_1^k \xrightarrow[N \rightarrow \infty]{a.s.} 0$