# **Duality**

### 5.3

Lagrangian function:

$$L(x,\lambda) = c^T x + \lambda f(x)$$

**Dual function:** 

$$egin{aligned} g(\lambda) &= \inf_x \left( L(x,\lambda) 
ight) \ &= \inf_x \left( c^T x + \lambda f(x) 
ight) \ &= egin{cases} -\lambda \sup\left( -rac{c^T}{\lambda} x - f(x) 
ight), \lambda > 0 \ -\infty, \lambda &= 0 \end{cases} \ &= egin{cases} -\lambda f^*(-rac{c}{\lambda}), \lambda > 0 \ -\infty, \lambda &= 0 \end{cases} \end{aligned}$$

Dual problem:

$$egin{array}{ll} \max_x & -\lambda f^*(-rac{c}{\lambda}) \ \mathrm{s.t.} & \lambda > 0 \end{array}$$

Since  $h(c, -\lambda) = -\lambda f^*(-\frac{c}{\lambda})$  is the perspective function of convex function  $f^*(c)$ , the dual problem is convex.

## 5.4

(a) Let  $c^T = \lambda_1 w^T A$ , then:

$$\inf_{x}\left(c^{T}x
ight) = egin{cases} \lambda_{1}w^{T}b, \lambda_{1} \leq 0 \ -\infty, ext{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

(b)

$$egin{array}{ll} \max & \lambda_1 w^T b \ & ext{s.t.} & w \succeq 0, \lambda_1 \leq 0 \ & c = \lambda_1 A^T w \end{array}$$

(c) Lagrangian function:

$$L(x,\lambda_2) = c^T x + \lambda_2^T (Ax - b)$$

Dual function:

$$\begin{split} g(\lambda) &= \inf_{x} \left( c^T x + \lambda_2^T (Ax - b) \right) \\ &= \inf_{x} \left( (c^T 1 + \lambda_2^T A) x - \lambda_2^T b \right) \\ &= \begin{cases} -\lambda_2^T b, (c^T 1 + \lambda_2^T A) = 0 \\ -\infty, \text{ otherwise} \end{cases} \end{split}$$

Dual problem:

$$egin{array}{ll} \max & -\lambda_2^T b \ \mathrm{s.t.} & (c^T 1 + \lambda_2^T A) = 0 \ \lambda_2 \succ 0 \end{array}$$

Denote  $\lambda^T=-\lambda_2^T=\lambda_1 w^T$  , then the two problems above becomes the same:

$$egin{array}{ll} \max & \lambda^T b \\ \mathrm{s.t.} & c = A^T \lambda, \lambda \preceq 0 \end{array}$$

### 5.6

(a) Given the fact that  $||z||_{\infty} \leq ||z||_2, ||z||_2 \leq \sqrt{m}||z||_{\infty}$ :

$$\|Ax_{ls} - b\|_{\infty} \le \|Ax_{ls} - b\|_{2} \le \|Ax_{ch} - b\|_{2} \le \sqrt{m} \|Ax_{ch} - b\|_{\infty}$$

(b)

$$egin{aligned} x_{ls} &= (A^TA)^{-1}A^Tb \ \Rightarrow &r_{ls} &= b - A(A^TA)^{-1}A^Tb \ \Rightarrow &A^Tr_{ls} &= A^Tb - A^TA(A^TA)A^Tb = 0 \ \Rightarrow &A^T\hat{
u} &= A^T\tilde{
u} &= 0 \end{aligned}$$

and  $\|\hat{
u}\|_1 = \|\tilde{
u}\|_1 = 1 \leq 1$ , hence they're both feasible.

$$b^T ilde{
u} = rac{b^Tr_{ls}}{\|r_{ls}\|_1} = rac{b^Tr_{ls} - ((A^Tr_{ls})^Tx_{ls})^T}{\|r_{ls}\|_1} = rac{(b - Ax_{ls})^Tr_{ls}}{\|r_{ls}\|_1} = rac{\|r_{ls}\|_2^2}{\|r_{ls}\|_1} \ b^T\hat{
u} = -b^T ilde{
u} = -rac{\|r_{ls}\|_2^2}{\|r_{ls}\|_1} < b^T ilde{
u}$$

 $b^T ilde{
u}$  is the better bound.

The bound in part (a) is  $\frac{\|Ax_{ls}-b\|_\infty}{\sqrt{m}}=\frac{\|r_{ls}\|_\infty}{\sqrt{m}}\leq \frac{\|r_{ls}\|_2}{\sqrt{m}}\leq \frac{\|r_{ls}\|_2^2}{\|r_{ls}\|_1}=b^T\tilde{\nu}.$ 

## 5.7

(a) Lagrangian function:

$$L(x,\lambda) = \max_i \left(y_i
ight) + \sum_i \lambda_i (a_i^T x + b_i - y_i)$$

**Dual function:** 

$$egin{aligned} g(\lambda) &= \inf_{x,y} \left( \max_i \left( y_i 
ight) + \sum_i \lambda_i (a_i^T x + b_i - y_i) 
ight) \ &= \left\{ egin{aligned} \inf_y \left( \max_i \left( y_i 
ight) + \lambda^T b - \lambda^T y 
ight), \sum_i \lambda_i a_i = 0 \ -\infty, ext{otherwise} \end{aligned} 
ight. \ &= \left\{ egin{aligned} \lambda^T b, \sum_i \lambda_i a_i = 0, \lambda \succeq 0, 1^T \lambda = 1 \ -\infty, ext{otherwise} \end{aligned} 
ight. \end{aligned}$$

Dual problem:

$$egin{array}{ll} \max & \lambda^T b \ \mathrm{s.t.} & \sum_i \lambda_i a_i = 0 \ \lambda \succeq 0, 1^T \lambda = 1 \end{array}$$

(b)

$$egin{array}{ll} \max & y \ ext{s.t.} & a_i^T x + b_i - y \leq 0, i = 1,...,m \end{array}$$

**Dual function:** 

$$g(\lambda) = \inf_{x,y} \left( y + \sum_i \lambda_i (a_i^T x + b_i - y) 
ight)$$

Dual problem:

$$egin{array}{ll} \max & \lambda^T b \ ext{s.t.} & \sum_i \lambda_i a_i = 0 \ \lambda \succeq 0, 1^T \lambda = 1 \end{array}$$

The LP dual is equal to the dual obtained in part (a).

(c) Let  $b^T 
u^* - \sum_i 
u_i^* \log 
u_i^*$  be the optimal value of the dual GP, then

$$egin{aligned} p_{gp}^* &= b^T 
u^* - \sum_i 
u_i^* \log 
u_i^* \leq p_{pwl}^* - \sum_i 
u_i^* \log 
u_i^* \\ &\Rightarrow p_{gp}^* - p_{pwl}^* \leq - \sum_i 
u_i^* \log 
u_i^* \leq \log m \end{aligned}$$

Therefore,  $0 \leq p_{gp}^* - p_{pwl}^* \leq \log m$ .

(d) Lagrangian function:

$$L(x,y,z) = rac{1}{\gamma} \log \sum_i \exp(\gamma y_i) + z^T (Ax + b - y)$$

Dual function:

$$g(z) = egin{cases} \inf rac{1}{\gamma} \log \sum_i \exp(\gamma y_i) + z^T (b-y), A^T z = 0 \ -\infty, ext{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

Let  $rac{drac{1}{\gamma}\log\sum_{i}\exp(\gamma y_{i})+z^{T}(b-y)}{dy}=0$ , then we get  $rac{e^{\gamma y_{i}}}{\sum_{i}e^{\gamma y_{i}}}=z_{i}$  for all i.

That is solvable only when  $1^Tz=1, z\succeq 0$ .

At this moment,  $y_i = rac{\log(z_i \sum_j e^{\gamma y_j})}{\gamma}$ .

$$\Rightarrow g(z) = egin{cases} b^T z - rac{1}{\gamma} \sum_i z_i \log z_i, A^T z = 0, 1^T z = 1, z \succeq 0 \ -\infty, ext{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

Dual problem:

$$egin{array}{ll} \max & b^Tz - rac{1}{\gamma}\sum_i z_i \log z_i \ & ext{s.t.} & A^Tz = 0, 1^Tz = 1 \end{array}$$

Denote the optimal value of it as  $p_{qp}^*(\gamma)$ , then:

$$p^*_{gp}(\gamma) = b^T z^* - rac{1}{\gamma} \sum_i z^*_i \log z^*_i \leq b^T z^* + rac{1}{\gamma} \log m = p^*_{pwl} + rac{1}{\gamma} \log m$$

i.e. 
$$p_{gp}^*(\gamma) - p_{pwl}^* \leq rac{1}{\gamma} \log m$$

In conclusion, as we increase  $\gamma$  ,  $p_{gp}^*(\gamma)$  become closer to  $p_{pwl}^*$ 

5.9

(a)

$$egin{bmatrix} \sum_k a_k a_k^T & a_i \ a_i^T & 1 \end{bmatrix} = egin{bmatrix} \sum_{k 
eq i} a_k a_k^T & 0 \ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} + egin{bmatrix} a_i \ 1 \end{bmatrix} [a_i, 1] \succeq 0$$

Then the Schur complements of the top left block  $1-a_i^T(\sum_k a_k a_k^T)^{-1}a_i \geq 0$  i.e.  $a_i^T X_{sim}a_i \leq 1$ .

In conclusion,  $X_{sim}$  is feasible.

(b) Let  $\lambda=t1$ , then the problem becomes

$$egin{aligned} \max_t & \log \det \left( \sum_i a_i a_i^T 
ight) + n \log t - mt + n \ & ext{s.t.} \end{aligned}$$

Denote  $h(t)=\log\det\left(\sum_i a_i a_i^T\right)+n\log t-mt+n$ . Let h'(t)=0, we get  $t=rac{n}{m}$ , the optimal value of t

The dual objective at this  $\lambda$  is

$$g(\lambda) = \log \det \left( \sum_i a_i a_i^T 
ight) + n \log rac{n}{m} = \log \det \left( \sum_i a_i a_i^T \cdot \left(rac{n}{m}
ight)^n 
ight)$$

This is equal to the primal objective value for  $X=\left(rac{m}{n}
ight)^nX_{sim}$  but no more then the optimal value.

The volume of ellipsoid is proportional to  $e^{-\frac{F}{2}}$ , where F is the optimal value of the primal objective.

Therefore, the volume of the given ellipsoid is no more than  $\left(\frac{m}{n}\right)^{\frac{n}{2}}$  more than the volume of the minimum volume ellipsoid.

## 5.10

(a) Let  $X = \sum_i x_i v_i v_i^T$  , then the problem becomes:

$$egin{array}{ll} \max_x & \log \det(X^{-1}) \ \mathrm{s.t.} & X = \sum_i x_i v_i v_i^T \ & x \succeq 0, 1^T x = 1 \end{array}$$

Lagrangian function:

$$egin{aligned} L(x,U,u,w) &= \log \det(X^{-1}) + \mathbf{tr}(UX) - \sum_i x_i v_i^T U v_i - u^T x + w (1^T x - 1) \ &= \log \det(X^{-1}) + \mathbf{tr}(UX) - \sum_i x_i (v_i^T U v_i + u_i - w) - w \end{aligned}$$

**Dual function:** 

$$g(U,u,w) = egin{cases} \inf \left( \log \det(X^{-1}) + \mathbf{tr}(UX) - w 
ight), v_i^T U v_i + u_i - w = 0 ext{ for } i \in [1,p] \ -\infty, ext{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

Denote  $h(X) = \log \det(X^{-1}) + \mathbf{tr}(UX) - w$ , then

$$h'(X) = rac{d \log \det(X^{-1})}{d \det(X^{-1})} \cdot rac{d \det(X^{-1})}{dX^{-1}} \cdot rac{dX^{-1}}{dX^T} + Urac{d \ \mathbf{tr} X}{dX^T} = -X^{-1} + U$$

Let  $h^\prime(X)=0$ , then we get  $X=U^{-1}$ .

$$g(U,u,w) = egin{cases} \log \det U + p - w, v_i^T U v_i + u_i - w = 0 ext{ for } i \in [1,p] \ -\infty, ext{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

Dual problem:

$$egin{aligned} \max & \log \det U + p - w \ ext{s.t.} & v_i^T U v_i \leq w ext{ for } i \in [1,p] \end{aligned}$$

Simplified dual problem:

$$egin{aligned} \max & \log \det U' + p \log p \ ext{s.t.} & v_i^T U' v_i \leq 1 ext{ for } i \in [1,p] \end{aligned}$$

(b) Let  $X = \sum_i x_i v_i v_i^T$  , then the problem becomes:

$$egin{array}{ll} \max & \mathbf{tr}(X^{-1}) \ \mathrm{s.t.} & X = \sum_i x_i v_i v_i^T \ & x \succeq 0, 1^T x = 1 \end{array}$$

Lagrangian function:

$$egin{aligned} L(x,U,u,w) &= \mathbf{tr}(X^{-1}) + \mathbf{tr}(UX) - \sum_i x_i v_i^T U v_i - u^T x + w (1^T x - 1) \ &= \mathbf{tr}(X^{-1}) + \mathbf{tr}(UX) - \sum_i x_i (v_i^T U v_i + u_i - w) - w \end{aligned}$$

Dual function:

$$g(U,u,w) = egin{cases} \inf \left( \mathbf{tr}(X^{-1}) + \mathbf{tr}(UX) - w 
ight), v_i^T U v_i + u_i - w = 0 ext{ for } i \in [1,p] \ -\infty, ext{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

Denote 
$$h(X)=\mathbf{tr}(X^{-1})+\mathbf{tr}(UX)$$
 , then  $h'(X)=-X^{-2}+U$  .

Let 
$$h'(X)=0$$
, then we get  $X=U^{-\frac{1}{2}}, (U\in S^p_{++}).$ 

$$g(U,u,w) = egin{cases} 2 \ \mathbf{tr}(U^{rac{1}{2}}) - w, v_i^T U v_i + u_i - w = 0 \ ext{for} \ i \in [1,p], U \succ 0 \ -\infty, ext{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

Dual problem:

$$egin{aligned} \max \ & 2 \ \mathbf{tr}(U^{rac{1}{2}}) - w \ & ext{s.t.} & v_i^T U v_i \leq w \ ext{for} \ i \in [1,p] \ & U \succ 0 \end{aligned}$$

Simplified dual problem:

### 5.11

Let  $y_i = A_i x + b_i$ , then the problem becomes

$$egin{aligned} \min_{x,y} & \sum_i \lVert y_i 
Vert_2 + rac{\lVert x - x_0 
Vert_2^2}{2} \ ext{s.t.} & y_i = A_i x + b_i, i = 1,...,N \end{aligned}$$

Lagrangian function:

$$L(x,\lambda_1,\lambda_2,...,\lambda_N) = \sum_i \lVert y_i 
Vert_2 + rac{\lVert x - x_0 
Vert_2^2}{2} + \sum_i \lambda_i^T (y_i - A_i x - b_i)$$

**Dual function:** 

$$\begin{split} g(\lambda_1,\lambda_2,...,\lambda_N) &= \inf_{x,y} \left( \sum_i \|y_i\|_2 + \frac{\|x-x_0\|_2^2}{2} + \sum_i \lambda_i^T (y_i - A_i x - b_i) \right) \\ &= \inf_{x,y} \left( \sum_i (\|y_i\|_2 + \lambda_i^T y_i) + (\frac{\|x-x_0\|_2^2}{2} - \sum_i \lambda_i^T A_i x) - \sum_i \lambda_i^T b_i \right) \\ &\inf_y \left( \sum_i (\|y_i\|_2 + \lambda_i^T y_i) \right) = \inf_y \left( \sum_i \|y_i\|_2 (1 + \frac{\lambda_i^T y_i}{\|y_i\|_2}) \right) = \begin{cases} 0, \|\lambda_i\|_2 \le 1 \text{ for } i \in [1, N] \\ -\infty, \text{ otherwise} \end{cases} \\ &\inf_x \left( \frac{\|x-x_0\|_2^2}{2} - \sum_i \lambda_i^T A_i x \right) = \left( \frac{\|x-x_0\|_2^2}{2} - \sum_i \lambda_i^T A_i x \right) \Big|_{x=x_0+\sum_j A_j^T \lambda} = -\frac{\|\sum_i A_i^T \lambda_i\|_2^2}{2} - \sum_i A_i x_0^T \lambda_i \\ &\Rightarrow g(\lambda_1, \lambda_2, ..., \lambda_N) = \begin{cases} -\frac{\|\sum_i A_i^T \lambda_i\|_2^2}{2} - \sum_i (A_i x_0 + b_i)^T \lambda_i, \|\lambda_i\|_2 \le 1 \text{ for } i \in [1, N] \\ -\infty, \text{ otherwise} \end{cases} \end{split}$$

Dual problem:

$$egin{aligned} \max_{\lambda_1,\lambda_2,...,\lambda_N} & -rac{\|\sum_i A_i^T \lambda_i\|_2^2}{2} - \sum_i (A_i x_0 + b_i)^T \lambda_i \ ext{s.t.} & \|\lambda_i\|_2 \leq 1, i = 1,...,N \end{aligned}$$

Let  $y_i = b_i - a_i^T x$ , then the problem becomes

$$egin{array}{ll} \min_{x,y} & -\sum_i \log(y_i) \ \mathrm{s.t.} & y = b - Ax \end{array}$$

Lagrangian function:

$$L(x,y,\lambda) = -\sum_i \log(y_i) + \lambda^T (y-b+Ax)$$

**Dual function:** 

$$egin{aligned} g(\lambda) &= \inf_{x,y} \left( -\sum_i \log(y_i) + \lambda^T (y-b+Ax) 
ight) \ &= \left\{ \sum_i \log \lambda_i + m - \lambda^T b, A^T \lambda = 0, \lambda \succ 0 \ -\infty, ext{otherwise} \end{aligned} 
ight.$$

Dual problem:

$$egin{array}{ll} \max_{\lambda} & \sum_{i} \log \lambda_{i} + m - \lambda^{T} b \ & ext{s.t.} & A^{T} \lambda = 0, \lambda \succ 0 \end{array}$$

#### 5.13

(a) Dual function:

$$\begin{split} g(\lambda, \nu) &= \inf_{x} \left( c^T x + \lambda^T (Ax - b) + \nu^T x - x^T \mathbf{diag}(\nu) x \right) \\ &= \inf_{x} \left( -x^T \mathbf{diag}(\nu) x + (c^T + \lambda^T A + \nu^T) x - \lambda^T b \right) \\ &= \begin{cases} \frac{1}{4} \sum_{i} \frac{(c_i + \lambda^T a_i + \nu_i)^2}{\nu_i} - \lambda^T b, \nu \leq 0 \\ -\infty, \text{ otherwise} \end{cases} \end{split}$$

Dual problem:

$$egin{aligned} \max_{\lambda,
u} & rac{1}{4} \sum_i rac{(c_i + \lambda^T a_i + 
u_i)^2}{
u_i} - \lambda^T b \ ext{s.t.} \ & \lambda \succeq 0, 
u \preceq 0 \end{aligned}$$

(b) Consider simplifying the dual problem in part (a):

Let 
$$f(
u_i)=rac{(c_i+\lambda^Ta_i+
u_i)^2}{
u_i}$$
, then  $f(
u_i)=egin{cases} 4(c_i+\lambda^Ta_i),c_i+\lambda^Ta_i\leq 0\ 0,c_i+\lambda^Ta_i>0 \end{cases}=\min\{0,4(c_i+\lambda^Ta_i)\}.$ 

Therefore, the dual problem can be simplified as:

$$egin{array}{ll} \max_{\lambda} & \sum_{i} \min\{0, (c_i + \lambda^T a_i)\} - \lambda^T b \ & ext{s.t.} & \lambda \succ 0 \end{array}$$

For the LP relaxation:

• Lagrangian function:

$$egin{aligned} L(x,u,v,w) &= c^T x + u^T (Ax-b) - v^T x + w^T (x-1) \ &= (c^T + u^T A - v^T + w^T) x - b^T u - 1^T w \end{aligned}$$

• Dual function:

$$g(u,v,w) = egin{cases} -b^T u - 1^T w, c^T + u^T A - v^T + w^T = 0 \ -\infty, ext{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

• Dual problem:

$$egin{aligned} \max & -b^T u - 1^T w \ ext{s.t.} & u \succeq 0, v \succeq 0, w \succeq 0 \ c^T + u^T A - v^T + w^T = 0 \end{aligned}$$

• Another form of dual problem:

$$egin{aligned} \max_{u,v,w} & \mathbb{1}^T(c+A^Tu-v)-b^Tu \ & ext{s.t.} & u \succeq 0, v \succeq 0 \ & (c+A^Tu-v) \preceq 0 \end{aligned}$$

As we can see, the dual problem of Lagrangian relaxation and the dual problem of LP relaxation are the same. So the lower bounds obtained via them are the same.

### 5.21

(a) The constraint set is  $\{(x,y)|x=0,y>0\}$ , which is convex.

The objective function f(x,y) is convex since  $abla^2 f = egin{pmatrix} e^{-x} & 0 \ 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix} \succeq 0.$ 

Hence this is a convex optimization problem. The optimal value is obviously 1.

(b) Dual function:

$$g(\lambda) = \inf_{x,y>0} \left(e^{-x} + \lambda rac{x^2}{y}
ight) = egin{cases} 0, \lambda \geq 0 \ -\infty, \lambda < 0 \end{cases}$$

Dual problem:

$$\max_{\lambda} \quad 0$$
s.t.  $\lambda \succeq 0$ 

Obviously,  $\lambda^* \in \mathbb{R}, d^* = 0$ , and the optimal duality gap is  $p^* - d^* = 1$ .

(c) Slater's condition does not hold for this problem.

(d) 
$$p^*(u)=egin{cases} 1,u=0\ 0,u>0 \end{cases}$$

When u > 0, the dual problem is:

$$\max_{\lambda} \quad -\lambda u$$
s.t.  $\lambda \geq 0$ 

Then  $-\lambda^* u = 0$ . So the global sensitivity inequality does not hold.

### 5.27

Lagrangian function:

$$egin{aligned} L(x,
u) &= \|Ax - b\|_2^2 + 
u^T (Gx - h) \ &= x^T A^T A x + (G^T 
u - 2 A^T b)^T x - 
u^T h \end{aligned}$$

KKT conditions:

- 1. Primal constraints:  $Gx^* h = 0$
- 2. Dual constraints: None
- 3. Complementary slackness: None
- 4. Gradient of Lagrangian with respect to x vanishes:  $2A^TAx^*+G^T
  u-2A^Tb=0$

According to the KKT conditions, we can solve the equations and get:

$$u^* = 2(G(A^TA)^{-1}G^T)^{-1}(G(A^TA)^{-1}A^Tb - h)$$
  $x^* = (A^TA)^{-1}\left(G^T(G(A^TA)^{-1}G^T)^{-1}(h - G(A^TA)^{-1}A^Tb) + A^Tb\right)$ 

### 5.30

Lagrangian function:

$$L(X, \lambda) = \mathbf{tr} X - \log \det X + \lambda^T (Xs - y)$$

KKT conditions:

- 1. Primal constraints:  $X^*s=y, X^*\succ 0$
- 2. Dual constraints: None
- 3. Complementary slackness: None
- 4. Gradient of Lagrangian with respect to x vanishes:  $I-(X^*)^{-1}+rac{1}{2}(\lambda s^T+s\lambda^T)=0$

According to the KKT conditions:

$$(X^*)^{-1} = I + \frac{1}{2}(\lambda s^T + s\lambda^T)$$
  
 $\Rightarrow s = (X^*)^{-1}y = y + \frac{1}{2}(\lambda + (\lambda^T y)s)$   
 $\Rightarrow \lambda^T y + y^T y = 1$   
 $\Rightarrow \lambda = (1 + y^T y)s - 2y$   
 $\Rightarrow X^{-1} = I + (1 + y^T y)ss^T - ys^T - sy^T$   
 $\Rightarrow X^* = I + yy^T - \frac{1}{s^T s}ss^T$