Table 1. Summarization of identifier splitting approaches

Category	Approach	Summary	Dataset	Performance	Tool Availability	Reference
		Search longest prefix/suffix in dictionary iteratively;	186 programs			
	Greedy	Do not discuss mix-case and digits;	O/O / Jorro/Ecutum	P: 81%	N/A	[65]
		Prone to over-split	C/C++/Java/rortran			
		Split mix-case and digit by heuristics;	1 000 0	E C	V	i L
	Samurai	Split same-case based on local/global word frequencies	9,000 Java programs	Acc: 97%	Yes	[çç]
Heuristic-based	Chinal	Split mix-case and digit by heuristics;	otociona nodtra	N/A	Voc	[81]
	Spirai	Split same-case based on global word frequencies	46,000 pytnon projects	N/A	Ies	[61]
		Compute all possible splits,				
	Frequency-based	and select splits based on word popularity	60 Java projects	Acc: 30%	N/A	[166]
		and co-occurrence computed by search engine				
		Search word using DTW algorithm;				
	TIDIER	Support transformed words splitting;	340 C programs	P: 54%	N/A	[119] [118] [71]
		Do not discuss digits				
	ConTost	Generate all possible splits and score each split	186 programs	D. 87%	N/A	[103]
	1631130	based on a set of metrics	C/C++/Java/Fortran	0/70.1	77/17	[cor]
	INITT	Split mix-case and digit by heuristic rules,	60 Totiona case	Δ 00: 070	Vac	[33] [30] [31]
	11411	and split same-case by greedier algorithm	oo java projects	ACC: 71.70	105	[16] [67] [66]
Learning-based	FANN-based	Train FANN neural network model	186 programs C/C++/Java/Fortran	P: 95%	N/A	[69]
	n-gram based	Train n-gram language model; Specialize in abbreviations and acronyms splitting	5 Java projects	Acc: 94%	N/A	[145]
	TRIS	Search words using heuristics and Dijkstra algorithm;	186 programs	P: 98% R· 94%	N/A	[72]
Graph-based		Specialize in abbreviations & acronyms splitting	C/C++/Java/Fortran	F: 96%		[70]
4	TINSEN	Search words using BYP and Dijkstra algorithm;	24 projects	P: 95%	N/A	[51]
	scriț	Specialize in abbreviations & acronyms splitting	C/C++/Java			,
	SCII7 to	Rank splits using word frequency and Dijkstra algorithm;	2 C projects	F: 95%	Yes	[39]
	mit	Specialize in abbreviations & acronyms splitting				

Note: For space limitation, only the best performance are presented here. The "P", "R", "F", "Acc" stand for Precision, Recall, F-measure, and Accuracy, respectively. tted to ACM

 Table 2. Summarization of abbreviation expansion approaches

Category	Approach	Summary	Dataset	Performance	Tool Availability	Reference
itted to A	Dictionary-based	Search word/phrase in comment, source code, stop-list, and dictionary by exploiting heuristics	158 projects C/C++/Java	P: 58%	N/A	[105]
Heuristic-based	AMAP	Search word/phrase in method, program, and software by exploiting heuristics;	5 Java projects	Acc: 59%	Yes	[77]
	Similarity-based	Select expansion based on word/phrase frequency  Expand abbreviations in parameters based on the lexical similarity between arguments and parameters	9 Java projects	P: 95% R: 65%	N/A	[87]
	TIDIER	Search expansion in contextual dictionaries by exploiting DTW string matching algorithm	340 C programs	P: 48%	N/A	[119] [118] citeSMR2013
Learning-based	Normalize	Search word/phrase in source code, domain documentation, and Google data set by exploiting maximum coherence model	2 C projects	Acc: 66%	N/A	[102]
Graph-based	SUIT	Represent abbreviations in a graph, and search expansion in domain dictionary and software artifacts based on word frequency and dictionary weights	2 C projects	F: 91%	Yes	[39]
	TRIS	Represent abbreviations in a tree, and search expansion in source code based on word frequency and transformation costs	186 projects C/C++/Java	P: 98% R: 94% F: 96%	N/A	[72]
	LINSEN	Represent abbreviations in a graph, and search expansion in comment, source code, and dictionary by exploiting BYP string matching algorithm	2 projects C/C++/Java	F: 62%	N/A	[51]

Note: For space limitation, only the best performance are presented here. The "P", "R", "F", "Acc" stand for Precision, Recall, F-measure, and Accuracy, respectively.

Table 3. Summarization of part of speech approaches

Approach	Summary	Dataset	Accuracy	Tool	Reference
			•	Availability	
Heuristic-based	Tag POS against naming conventions using heuristics	N/A	N/A	N/A	[110]
TreeTagger-based	Tag POS by providing guidance for TreeTagger	24 Java projects	Acc: 96%	N/A	[58]
Minipar-based	Tag POS by providing guidance for Minipar	1 C++ project	P: 86%	N/A	[9]
Stanford POS tagger-based	Tag POS by providing guidance for Stanford POS tagger	171 C++/Java projects	Acc: 88%	N/A	[22]
POSSE	Tag POS based on naming conventions and word frequency in software using heuristics	310 C++/Java programs	Acc: 91%	N/A	[74]
srcNLP	Tag POS based on stereotype data using finite state machine 5 C projects	5 C projects	Acc: 91%	N/A	[13] [12] [134]
S-POS	Train a maximum entropy Markov model	525 Stack Overflow posts	Acc: 93%	N/A	[181]

Note: For space limitation, only the best performance are presented here. The "P", "R", "F", "Acc" stand for Precision, Recall, F-measure, and Accuracy, respectively.

 ${\tt Table}\ 4.\ \ \textbf{Summarization}\ \ \textbf{opton-based renaming opportunity}\ \ \textbf{identification}\ \ \textbf{approaches}$ 

				[96]	[45]	[149]	[10]	[111]	[167]
N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Yes	N/A	Yes	N/A	N/A
N/A	P: 100%	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	Acc: 94%	Acc: 81%	P: 80% R: 75%
1 C project	2 C++ projects	171 programs C++ and Java	N/A	N/A	N/A	4 Java projects	10 Java projects	5 Java projects	1000 Java projects
Standardize the lexicon & syntax of identifiers	Identify lexicon bad smells using Minipar and PaWs	Constrain syntax rules on field names	Constrain syntax rules on class name	Constrain syntax rules on different identifier types	Constrain POS of prefix and first word in different identifier types	Train learning algorithms to mine naming conventions	Train n-gram based on sequences of tokens in source code; Recommend variable names	Train n-gram based on sequences of tokens in source code (excluding noisy data); Recommend parameters and local variables for methods	Train n-gram based on sequences of tokens from method names
Dictionary-based	LBSDetectors	POS-based	Nominal	POS-based	Smart Formatter	Bayes-based	NATURALIZE	LEAR	n-gram based
		Heuristic-based					Learning-based		
	Dictionary-based Standardize the lexicon & syntax of identifiers 1 C project N/A	Standardize the lexicon & syntax of identifiers 1 C project N/A Identify lexicon bad smells using Minipar and PaWs 2 C++ projects P: 100%	Dictionary-based Standardize the lexicon & syntax of identifiers 1 C project N/A  LBSDetectors Identify lexicon bad smells using Minipar and PaWs 2 C++ projects P: 100% Heuristic-based POS-based Constrain syntax rules on field names C++ and Java N/A	Dictionary-based       Standardize the lexicon & syntax of identifiers       1 C project       N/A         LBSDetectors       Identify lexicon bad smells using Minipar and PaWs       2 C++ projects       P: 100%         Heuristic-based       POS-based       Constrain syntax rules on field names       171 programs C++ and Java       N/A         Nominal       Constrain syntax rules on class name       N/A       N/A	Dictionary-based         Standardize the lexicon & syntax of identifiers         1 C project         N/A           LBSDetectors         Identify lexicon bad smells using Minipar and PaWs         2 C++ projects         P: 100%           Heuristic-based         POS-based         Constrain syntax rules on field names         171 programs C++ and Java         N/A           Nominal         Constrain syntax rules on class name         N/A         N/A           POS-based         Constrain syntax rules on different identifier types         N/A         N/A	Heuristic-based Standardize the lexicon & syntax of identifiers 1 C project N/A  LBSDetectors Identify lexicon bad smells using Minipar and PaWs 2 C++ projects P: 100%  Nominal Constrain syntax rules on field names C++ and Java N/A  POS-based Constrain syntax rules on different identifier types N/A N/A  Smart Formatter Constrain POS of prefix and first word in different identifier types N/A N/A N/A	Heuristic-based Standardize the lexicon & syntax of identifiers 1 C project N/A  LBSDetectors Identify lexicon bad smells using Minipar and PaWs 2 C++ projects P: 100%  Nominal Constrain syntax rules on field names C++ and Java N/A  POS-based Constrain syntax rules on different identifier types N/A N/A  POS-based Constrain syntax rules on different identifier types N/A N/A  Bayes-based Train learning algorithms to mine naming conventions 4 Java projects N/A	Heuristic-based Book Standardize the lexicon & syntax of identifiers 1 C project N/A  Heuristic-based PoS-based Constrain syntax rules on field names C++ and Java N/A  PoS-based Constrain syntax rules on different identifier types N/A N/A  Bayes-based Train learning algorithms to mine naming conventions A Java projects N/A  LEarning-based NATURALIZE Recommend variable names 1 C project N/A  Recommend variable names 1 Recommend variable names 1 Recommend variable names 1 Recommend N/A  Recommend variable names 1 C project N/A  Recommend variable names 1 Recommend variable names 1 Recommend variable names 1 Recommend N/A  Recommend variable names 1 Recommend variable names 1 Recommend N/A  Recommend N/A  Recommend N/A  Recommend N/A  Recommend variable names 1 Recommend N/A  Recommend N/A  Recommend N/A  Recommend N/A  Recommend variable names 1 Recommend N/A  Recommend N	Heuristic-based Standardize the lexicon & syntax of identifiers 1 C project N/A  Heuristic-based PoS-based Constrain syntax rules on field names C++ and Java C++ and Java N/A  Nominal Constrain syntax rules on class name N/A  PoS-based Constrain syntax rules on class name N/A  Nominal Constrain syntax rules on different identifier types N/A  Nominal Constrain syntax rules on different identifier types N/A  NATURALIZE Train learning algorithms to mine naming conventions A Java projects N/A  Recommend variable names  LEAR In source code (excluding noisy data):  Boictionary-based NATURALIZE Recommend parameters and local variables for methods  1 C project N/A  N/A  N/A  N/A  A Java projects Acc: 94%  Acc: 81%

Note: For space limitation, only the best performance are presented here. The "P", "R", "F", "Acc" stand for Precision, Recall, F-measure, and Accuracy, respectively.

Table 5. Summarization of inconsistency-based renaming opportunity identification approaches

Category	Approach	Summary	Dataset	Performance	Tool Availability	Reference
	DD	Identify semantic inconsistency based on bijective mapping between concepts and identifiers	N/A	N/A	N/A	[49] [146] [50]
	CodeAmigo	Identify semantic and syntactic inconsistency based on WordNet and lexical similarity	7 Java projects	P: 85% R:84%	Yes	[96]
	Vaci	Identify semantic inconsistency based on transitive closures and method clustering	N/A	N/A	N/A	[68]
Inconsistency hotwoon identifiers	Syntax-based	Identify syntactic inconsistency based on syntax rules	2 programs C/C++	P: 76%	N/A	[104]
	CA-RENAMING	Identify semantic inconsistency based on variable assignment and type information	7 Java projects	P: 66%	N/A	[170]
	Graph-based	Suggest consistent names by extracting concept ontology from source code	6 projects (C++/Java)	P: 80%	N/A	[7]
	JSNice	Predict syntactic names using CRFs graphical model & MAP techniques	10,567 Javascript projects	Acc: 63%	N/A	[148]
	CP-Miner	Identify inconsistency among clones by mapping identifiers based on frequency	4 C projects	N/A	N/A	[109]
	Clone-based	Identify inconsistency among clones by traversing identifiers in clone AST Filter out false positive using heuristics	2 C/Java projects	N/A	N/A	[98]
	ABCD	Identify inconsistency among clones by exploiting neural network technique	12 Java projects	P: 84% R: 75% F: 81%	N/A	[176]
	MPANalyzer	Identify inconsistency across revisions based on modification patterns	2 C projects	P: 89%	Yes	[100] [75]
	SPA	Identify inconsistency across revisions by analyzing commits and dataflow	4 Java projects	P: 73% R: 90%	N/A	[147]
	COCONUT	Inconsistency between artifacts and source code	4 Java projects	P: 50%	N/A	[47]
ed to ACM	RenameExpander	Identify inconsistency between the renamed entity and its related entities	4 Java projects	P: 82%	N/A	[114]

Table 5. Summarization of inconsistency-based renaming opportunity identification approaches (Continued)

·C							
	Category	Approach	Summary	Dataset	Performance	Tool Availability	Reference
itted to		Similarity-based	Identify inconsistency between actual argument and formal parameter	14 Java programs	P: 83%	N/A	[115]
	I A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A	Lancelot	Identify inconsistency between method name and method implementation	100 Java projects	P: 70%	Yes	[78] [79] [80] [91]
⊒ .¥ ———		Micro-pattern based	Identify inconsistency between the suffix of class name and implementation of the class	9 Java projects	Acc: 75%	N/A	[161]
		Association rule-based	Identify inconsistency between method name and method implementation	6 Java projects	P: 60%	N/A	[93] [92]
		LAPD	Identify inconsistency among method names, documentations, and behaviors	4 Java projects	P: 72%	N/A	[19]
		Learning-based	Train a SVM classifier to suggest method names	3 Java projects	P: 70%	N/A	[182]
		Learning-based	Train a log-bilinear neural network to suggest method and class names	20 Java projects	F: 50%	N/A	[11]
		Learning-based	Train a CNN model to suggest method names	430 Java projects	F: 68%	N/A	[116]

Note: For space limitation, only the best performance are presented here. The "P", "R", "F", "Acc" stand for Precision, Recall, F-measure, and Accuracy, respectively.

Table 6. Summarization of renamings execution approaches

			Applied	Tool	,
Category	Approach	Summary	Language	Availability	Reference
	AST-based	Based on semantic verification of AST transformation	C	N/A	[43]
Precondition-based	Go Doctor	Check transformation validity by parsing ASTs of dependent files	Go	N/A	[27]
	Differential-based	Guerantee name binding by differential precondition checking	Independent	N/A	[141] [142]
	funGL	Based on dataflow analysis & graph searching	Independent	N/A	[175]
	BeneFactor	Based on tracking workflow patterns	N/A	N/A	[99]
	CReN	Track references within clones based on AST analysis	Java	N/A	[83]
	I ove I d	Track references within clones based on AST analysis	TOYYO	V/N	[64]
	техта	Support renaming part of identifiers	Java	V/N	[04]
D. C	Annotation-based	Bind reference to declaration by assigning globally unique name	Java	N/A	[73]
neierence-basen	beach noitetour	Bind reference to declaration	Torro	٧\ <u>٦</u>	[153]
	Amiotanon-based	by creating symbolic name and inverted name lookup	Java	W/W	[133]
	Annotation-based	Bind references to declaration by creating qualified name	Independent	N/A	[46]
	TCP of actor	Rename dynamic type languages	LavaSonint	Vec	[09]
	Jorganio	based on static point-to and type inference analysis	Javascripi	103	[61]
	GRF-Refactoring	Rename Groovy elements in Java program	Java & Groowy	A/N	[95]
	Sur company or o	by defining a search engine and generating corresponding edits	January Caroon J	1	
	Pattern-based	Rename multi-language applications	HSS exel	A/N	[41]
	i attein pased	based on references recorded in XML and Observer design pattern	Java 9911	11/11	[11]
	Annotation-based	Rename multi-language applications	Hihernate	A/N	[156]
	Time constant	by adding annotations to restore object relational mapping			[155]
	I omic-based	Rename multi-language applications based on	Multi-language	δ/N	[124]
	rogic pasca	binding logic of each framework	mangaage	11/11	[123]
	$R_{o}h_{o}ID_{o}f$	Rename multi-language web applications	HTMI & DHD	V/N	[127]
	Dubearej	based on symbolic execution and D-Model tree	11 11/11 & 11111	11/11	[10/]

Li and Liu, et al.

Table 7. Summarization of renamings detection approaches

Approach	Summary	Dataset	Performance	Tool Availability	Referenc
Similarity-based	Detect renamed functions by computing similarities across revisions	2 C projects	Acc: 91%	N/A	[67]
AST-based	Detect renamed global variables, types, and functions based on partial AST matching	5 C projects	N/A	N/A	[132]
CHANGEDISTILLER	Detect renamed methods and fields by exploiting differencing algorithm on source code	3 Java projects	P: 66%	N/A	[63]
AST-based	Detect renamed classes, methods, and fields by exploiting differecing algorithm on revision histories	7 Java projects	P: 99%	N/A	[94]
renaming detector	Detect renamed variables by exploiting differencing algorithm on tokens	77 Java files	P: 100% R: 85%	N/A	[120]
REPENT	Detect and classify renamings based on differencing and data-flow analysis	5 Java projects	P: 88% R: 92%	N/A	[57] [20] [56]
Commit-based	Detect and classify renamings based on commit message	3,795 Java systems	N/A	N/A	[144]
Differential-based	Generic refactoring detection based on differencing analysis	N/A	N/A	N/A	[178] [179]
RefactorMiner	Generic refactoring detection based on differential analysis	N/A	N/A	N/A	[160]
Original analysis-based	Generic refactoring detection based on original analysis	N/A	N/A	N/A	[89]
Heuristic-based	Generic refactoring detection based on heuristics	N/A	N/A	N/A	[174]
Signature-based	Generic refactoring detection based on signature analysis	N/A	N/A	N/A	[177]
RefactoringCrawler	Generic refactoring detection based on semantic analysis	3 Java projects	Acc: 85%	N/A	[23]
RefacLib	Generic refactoring detection based on semantic analysis	5 Java projects	F: 96%	N/A	[169]
RFM-based	Generic refactoring detection based on RFM technique	N/A	N/A	N/A	[14]

Note: For space limitation, only the best performance are presented here. The "P", "R", "F", "Acc" stand for Precision, Recall, F-measure, and Accuracy, respectively.