**Task Description for Annotators:**

**Objective:**

The objective of this annotation task is to differentiate between Concerning Citations (CCs) and Non-Concerning Citations (NCCs) within a set of citation instances. This is crucial for investigating the potential of citations as a quality control mechanism for scientific literature.

**Concerning citations** refer to instances where the citing paper raises concerns or questions about the validity of a cited study. These concerns can be about various aspects such as the data, methodology, or any other notable flaw within the cited study.

**Non-Concerning Citations** (NCCs): Citations that discuss or critique a study without necessarily questioning its validity.

**Steps for Annotation:**

**Read the Citation Text:** Carefully read the citation provided in the context of the surrounding text. This includes reading a few sentences before and after the citation to understand the context fully.

**Identify Keywords and Cue Phrases:**

Look for verbs and phrases within the citation text that may indicate concerns about the cited study. Use the provided list of example verbs and cue phrases (see Table 2) to guide you:

Verbs: doubt, question, flaw, fail, neglect, etc.

Cue Phrases: However, we found..., raises concerns about..., it remains unclear..., etc.

**Contextual Analysis:**

Evaluate the citation context to determine whether the concern raised affects the overall validity of the cited work. For instance, questioning the methodology or data collection methods should be flagged as a CC.

Differentiating between mere criticism and validity concerns is crucial. For example, a statement like "the model could be improved" is a critical citation but does not imply a validity concern.

**Assign the citation to one of two categories:**

**Record Examples:**

Document examples of verbs and cue phrases that consistently indicate concerning citations. These examples will be used to train and improve future annotation processes.

**Quality Control:**

Two annotators will independently review the same set of citation instances to ensure accuracy and reliability. After annotation discussion is required to finalize the corpus.