

Center for the Victims of Torture

Torture, Former Combatants, Political Prisoners, Terror Suspects, & Terrorists

<https://www.justsecurity.org/79382/the-biden-administrations-moment-of-truth-on-torture-evidence/>

Public Facing Advocacy Writing

by [David Luban](#), [Scott Roehm](#), [Claire O. Finkelstein](#), [Karen J. Greenberg](#), [Lisa Hajjar](#), [Jonathan Hafetz](#), [Elisa Massimino](#) and [Gabor Rona](#)

December 1, 2021

[Al-Nashiri](#), [Committee Against Torture](#), [Military Commissions](#), [Military Commissions Act](#), [torture](#)

by [David Luban](#), [Scott Roehm](#), [Claire O. Finkelstein](#), [Karen J. Greenberg](#), [Lisa Hajjar](#), [Jonathan Hafetz](#), [Elisa Massimino](#) and [Gabor Rona](#)

December 1, 2021

Abd Al-Rahim Hussein Al-Nashiri is headed to federal court to prevent the U.S. government from using torture-derived evidence in his capital prosecution before the Guantanamo military commissions. As discussed in detail in these [previous posts](#), prosecutors claimed the authority to use such evidence in certain circumstances in his case, and the military commission judge signed off.

On Oct. 15, Al-Nashiri filed a [petition](#) for a writ of mandamus in the United States Court of Appeals for the District of Columbia Circuit seeking to enjoin the government from offering, and the military commission judge from considering, torture-derived evidence. We are among a group of scholars, former United Nations Special Rapporteurs on torture, retired military and intelligence officers, and human rights advocates who filed an [amicus brief](#) in support of Al-Nashiri's petition. Our brief opens as follows:

There can be no doubt that torture-derived evidence is inadmissible in any American legal proceeding at any time, for any purpose, except against alleged torturers. After Petitioners counsel learned that prosecutors in this case had relied upon his torture-derived statements in a discovery proceeding before the military commission judge, the prosecutors scrambled to withdraw those statements, but did not disclaim the authority to use such evidence again in similar circumstances. Instead, they argued that, as a matter of law, torture-derived evidence is admissible to resolve interlocutory questions such as discovery disputes. The military commission judge agreed.

Respectfully, prosecutors and the military commission judge are wrong and grant of Petitioners extraordinary writ is necessary for myriad reasons. Amici focus here on prosecutors and the military commission judges implausible interpretation of a statute that the United States has long assured the international community means *precisely what Petitioner says it means*, and the grave consequences that would flow from endorsing their interpretation.

The government has not yet responded to Al-Nashiri's petition, which provides an opportunity for it to course-correct for consistency with U.S. legal obligations and related public commitments.

On June 26, [President Joe Biden](#) reaffirm[ed] the United States unequivocal ban on torture and opposition to all forms of inhumane treatment; acknowledged that torture is prohibited universally, and violates U.S. and international law; and pledge[d] the full efforts of the United States to eradicate torture in all its forms. In a subsequent [submission](#) to the body that monitors compliance with the United Nations Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, the United States not only echoed the Presidents statements, but also explicitly rejected the argument that prosecutors made and on which the military commission judge relied to use torture-derived evidence in Al-Nashiri's case:

[T]he Military Commissions Act of 2009 (MCA 2009) prohibits admission of any statement obtained by the use of torture or by cruel, inhuman, or degrading treatment, as defined by the Detainee Treatment Act of 2005, in a military commission proceeding, except against a person accused of torture or such treatment as evidence that the statement was made. No other exception to this prohibition on admissibility of such statements is permitted in the rules governing admission of hearsay evidence or otherwise.

If the President and senior administration officials mean what they have said, the government will join in Al-Nashiri's petition rather than contest it.

[Al-Nashiri](#), [Committee Against Torture](#), [Military Commissions](#), [Military Commissions Act](#), [torture](#)

All-source, public repository of congressional hearing transcripts, government agency documents, digital forensics, social media analysis, public opinion surveys, empirical research, more.

by [Brianna Rosen](#)

Oct 25th, 2022

by [Ambassador Juan Manuel Gmez-Robledo Verduzco](#)

Oct 24th, 2022

by [Cathryn Grothe](#)

Oct 21st, 2022

by [Steven J. Barela](#)

Oct 20th, 2022

by [Douglas London](#)

Oct 18th, 2022

by [Luke Hartig](#)

Oct 17th, 2022

by [Jonathan Leader Maynard](#)

Oct 14th, 2022

by [Oona A. Hathaway](#)

Oct 11th, 2022

by [Amanda L. White Eagle](#)

Oct 10th, 2022

by [Muhammad Kamal](#)

Oct 7th, 2022

by [Richard Dicker](#) and [Paloma van Groll](#)

Oct 6th, 2022

by [Naomi Kikoler](#) and [Sarah McIntosh](#)

Oct 6th, 2022

by [Jens Iverson](#)

Oct 5th, 2022

by [Jens Iverson](#)

Oct 5th, 2022

by [John K. Glenn](#)

Oct 4th, 2022

by [Ryan Goodman](#) and [Clara Apt](#)

Sep 29th, 2022

by [Jennifer Trahan](#)

Sep 26th, 2022

by [Jennifer Trahan](#)

Sep 26th, 2022

by [Norman L. Eisen](#) and [Fred Wertheimer](#)

Sep 26th, 2022

by [Just Security](#)

Sep 24th, 2022

by [Astrid Reisinger Coracini](#)

Sep 23rd, 2022

by [Astrid Reisinger Coracini](#)

Sep 23rd, 2022

by [Ambassador H.E. Juan Ramn de la Fuente](#) and [Pablo Arrocha Olabuenaga](#)

Sep 23rd, 2022

by [Katherine Fang](#) and [Clara Apt](#)

Sep 22nd, 2022

by [E. Danya Perry](#), [Joshua Stanton](#) and [Norman L. Eisen](#)

Sep 21st, 2022

by [Ambassador John E. Herbst](#)

Sep 21st, 2022

by [Richard Gowan](#)

Sep 20th, 2022

by [Richard Gowan](#)

Sep 20th, 2022

by [Oona A. Hathaway](#)

Sep 20th, 2022

by [Oona A. Hathaway](#)

Sep 20th, 2022

by [Marc Sommers](#)

Sep 19th, 2022

by [Ambassador Thomas Graham Jr.](#)

Sep 16th, 2022

by [Aryeh Neier](#)

Sep 14th, 2022

by [Eian Katz](#)

Sep 13th, 2022

by [Sam Cohen](#)

Sep 12th, 2022

by [Just Security](#)

Sep 10th, 2022

by [Michael Stern](#)

Sep 9th, 2022

by [Tess Bridgeman](#) and [Brian Finucane](#)

Sep 8th, 2022

by [Sophie Richardson](#)

Sep 8th, 2022

by [Ryan Goodman](#) and [Justin Hendrix](#)

Sep 7th, 2022

by [Laurence H. Tribe](#), [Philip Lacovara](#) and [Dennis Aftergut](#)

Sep 6th, 2022

by [Just Security](#)

Sep 3rd, 2022

by [Jumaina Siddiqui](#)

Sep 2nd, 2022

by [Peter Devine](#)

Sep 1st, 2022

by [Shaharзад Akbar](#)

Aug 31st, 2022

by [Ambassador M. Ashraf Haidari](#)

Aug 30th, 2022

by [George Croner](#)

Aug 29th, 2022

by [Douglas London](#)

Aug 29th, 2022

by [Michael Stern](#)

Aug 28th, 2022

by [Just Security](#)

Aug 27th, 2022

by [Virginia Canter](#) and [Gabe Lezra](#)

Aug 26th, 2022

by [Fionnuala N Aolin](#)

Aug 25th, 2022

by [Gaiane Nuridzhanian](#)

Aug 24th, 2022

by [Ezequiel Heffes](#)

Aug 24th, 2022

by [Gaiane Nuridzhanian](#)

Aug 24th, 2022

by [James A. Goldston](#)

Aug 23rd, 2022

by [Ambassador \(ret.\) Lee Wolosky](#)

Aug 22nd, 2022

by [Just Security](#)

Aug 20th, 2022

by [Ximena Casas Isaza](#) and [Catalina Martinez](#)

Aug 19th, 2022

by [Ryan Goodman](#)

Aug 18th, 2022

by [William S. Dodge](#)

Aug 18th, 2022

by [Faiza Patel](#) and [Spencer Reynolds](#)

Aug 17th, 2022

by [J. William Leonard](#)

Aug 16th, 2022

by [Genevieve Nadeau](#) and [Helen White](#)

Aug 16th, 2022

by [Albert W. Alschuler](#)

Aug 16th, 2022

by [Shabana Basij-Rasikh](#)

Aug 16th, 2022

by [Nasir A. Andisha](#) and [Marzia Marastoni](#)

Aug 15th, 2022

by [Just Security](#)

Aug 13th, 2022

by [Karima Bennoune](#)

Aug 12th, 2022

by [Nicholas Rasmussen](#) and [Sarah Kenny](#)

Aug 12th, 2022

by [Liz Hempowicz](#)

Aug 11th, 2022

by [Asha Rangappa](#), [Norman L. Eisen](#) and [Bradley P. Moss](#)

Aug 9th, 2022

by [Julie Owono](#)

Aug 9th, 2022

by [Khalid Aljabri](#)

Aug 8th, 2022

by [Just Security](#)

Aug 4th, 2022

by [Clara Apt](#)

Aug 1st, 2022

by [Just Security](#)

Jul 30th, 2022

by [Sang-Min Kim](#)

Jul 29th, 2022

by [Joseph Nunn](#) and [Elizabeth Goitein](#)

Jul 28th, 2022

by [Lawrence Woocher](#)

Jul 25th, 2022

by [Viola Gienger](#)

Jul 23rd, 2022

by [Just Security](#)

Jul 23rd, 2022

by [Noah Bookbinder](#), [Norman L. Eisen](#), [Fred Wertheimer](#), [Donald Simon](#), [Jason Powell](#), [Debra Perlin](#), [Colby Galliher](#) and [Madison Gee](#)

Jul 21st, 2022

by [Albert W. Alschuler](#)

Jul 21st, 2022

by [Salah Ben Hammou](#) and [Avery Reyna](#)

Jul 20th, 2022

by [Dario Cristiani](#)

Jul 19th, 2022

by [Ryan Goodman](#)

Jul 19th, 2022

by [Norman L. Eisen](#), [Noah Bookbinder](#), [Fred Wertheimer](#), [Donald Simon](#), [Jason Powell](#), [Debra Perlin](#), [Colby Galliher](#), [Madison Gee](#) and [Taylor Redd](#)

Jul 18th, 2022

by [Ryan Goodman](#)

Jul 18th, 2022

by [Just Security](#)

Jul 16th, 2022

by [Douglas London](#)

Jul 15th, 2022

by [Nasir A. Andisha](#) and [Hamid A. Formuli](#)

Jul 14th, 2022

by [Tess Bridgeman](#)

Jul 13th, 2022

by [Kristine Beckerle](#) and [Ali Jameel](#)

Jul 13th, 2022

by [Ambassador P. Michael McKinley \(ret.\)](#)

Jul 12th, 2022

by [Ryan Goodman](#), [Justin Hendrix](#) and [Clara Apt](#)

Jul 11th, 2022

by [Bradley Honigberg](#)

Jul 8th, 2022

by [Alexandra Stark](#)

Jul 7th, 2022

by [W. Neil Eggleston](#)

Jul 5th, 2022

by [Just Security](#)

Jul 2nd, 2022

by [Karl Mihn](#), [Justin Cole](#), [Iva Petkova](#), [Margaret Shields](#), [Mari Dugas](#), [Nicholas Tonckens](#) and [Tess Bridgeman](#)

Nov 19th, 2021

by [Karl Mihn](#), [Jacob Apkon](#) and [Sruthi Venkatachalam](#)

Sep 29th, 2022

by [Tess Bridgeman](#) and [Brianna Rosen](#)

Mar 24th, 2022

by [Megan Corrarino](#)

Feb 18th, 2022

by [Mary B. McCord](#)

Jan 24th, 2022

by [Emily Berman](#), [Tess Bridgeman](#), [Megan Corrarino](#), [Ryan Goodman](#) and [Dakota S. Rudesill](#)

Jan 20th, 2022

by [Laura Brawley](#), [Antara Joardar](#) and [Madhu Narasimhan](#)

Oct 29th, 2021

by [Leila Nadya Sadat](#)

Sep 13th, 2021

by [Tess Bridgeman](#), [Rachel Goldbrenner](#) and [Ryan Goodman](#)

Sep 7th, 2021

by [Just Security](#)

Jul 19th, 2021

by [Kate Brannen](#)

Jun 30th, 2021

by [Fionnuala N Aolin](#) and [Kate Brannen](#)

Jun 14th, 2021

by [Steven J. Barela](#) and [Mark Fallon](#)

Jun 1st, 2021

by [Christine Berger](#)

May 29th, 2021

by [Beth Van Schaack](#)

Feb 1st, 2021

by [Beth Van Schaack](#) and [Chris Moxley](#)

Nov 16th, 2020

by [Oona A. Hathaway](#), [Preston Lim](#), [Mark Stevens](#) and [Alasdair Phillips-Robins](#)

Nov 10th, 2020

by [Emily Berman](#), [Tess Bridgeman](#), [Ryan Goodman](#) and [Dakota S. Rudesill](#)

Oct 14th, 2020

by [Cristina Rodriguez](#) and [Adam Cox](#)

Oct 12th, 2020

by [Scott Roehm](#), [Rita Siemion](#) and [Hina Shamsi](#)

Sep 11th, 2020

by [Matiangai Sirleaf](#)

Jul 13th, 2020

by [Catherine O'Rourke](#)

Oct 21st, 2020

by [Sarah Knuckey](#) and [Jayne Huckerby](#)

May 27th, 2020

by [Tess Bridgeman](#) and [Ryan Goodman](#)

Sep 12th, 2019

by [Just Security](#)

Jan 28th, 2019

by [Marty Lederman](#)

Oct 25th, 2018

by [Erik Dahl](#)

Jun 7th, 2022

by [Justin Hendrix](#), [Nicholas Tonckens](#) and [Sruthi Venkatachalam](#)

Aug 29th, 2021

by [Ryan Goodman](#) and [Juilee Shivalkar](#)

Aug 8th, 2021

by [Kate Brannen](#) and [Ryan Goodman](#)

May 11th, 2021

by [Atlantic Council's DFRLab](#)

Feb 10th, 2021

by [Ryan Goodman](#), [Mari Dugas](#) and [Nicholas Tonckens](#)

Jan 11th, 2021

by [Ryan Goodman](#) and [Danielle Schulkin](#)

Nov 3rd, 2020

by [Chris Shenton](#)

Aug 24th, 2020

by [Ryan Goodman](#) and [Danielle Schulkin](#)

Jul 27th, 2020

by [Ryan Goodman](#) and [Julia Brooks](#)

Mar 11th, 2020

David Luben ([@DavidLuban](#)) is University Professor in Law and Philosophy at Georgetown and a member of the editorial board of Just Security.

Washington Director of the Center for Victims of Torture. Chair of the Board of Directors for Refugee Council USA.

Claire O. Finkelstein is the Algernon Biddle professor of law and professor of philosophy at the University of Pennsylvania, where she is the faculty director of the [Center for Ethics and the Rule of Law](#). Follow her on Twitter [@COFinkelstein](#).

Karen J. Greenberg is the Director of the Center on National Security at Fordham Law and the Editor-in-chief of the CNS/Soufan Group Morning Brief.

Lisa Hajjar is a professor of sociology at the University of California Santa Barbara.

Jonathan Hafetz ([@JonathanHafetz](#)) is a Professor of Law at Seton Hall University School of Law.

Elisa Massimino ([@ecmassimino](#)) is the Robert F. Drinan, S.J., Chair in Human Rights at Georgetown University Law Center, a Senior Fellow at the Center for American Progress, a former Senior Fellow with the Carr Center for Human Rights Policy at Harvards Kennedy School, a former Practitioner-in-Residence at Georgetown's Walsh School of Foreign Service, and the former President and CEO of Human Rights First.

Gabor Rona ([@GaborRona1](#)) is a former Legal Advisor in the Legal Division of the ICRC and former International Legal Director of Human Rights First. He now teaches law of armed conflict, international criminal law and international human rights law at Cardozo Law School.

[Send A Letter To The Editor](#)

by [Joseph Margulies](#)

Oct 13th, 2022

by [Terry Rockefeller](#)

Jul 1st, 2022

by [Nasir A. Andisha](#) and [Hamid A. Formuli](#)

Apr 22nd, 2022

by [Edgar Chen](#)

Mar 23rd, 2022

by [Edgar Chen](#)

Mar 23rd, 2022

by [Reed Brody](#) and [Salieu Taal](#)

Mar 14th, 2022

by [Joseph Margulies](#)

Mar 11th, 2022

by [Roger Lu Phillips](#) and [Aweiss Al Dobouch](#)

Feb 4th, 2022

by [Scott Roehm](#)

Feb 2nd, 2022

by [Tess Bridgeman](#)

Feb 1st, 2022

by [Shayana Kadidal](#)

Jan 11th, 2022

by [Ian Moss](#)

Jan 11th, 2022

Just Security is based at the Reiss Center on Law and Security at New York University School of Law.