Review Decision of JMLR-07-240-1

I regret to inform you that your submission "Let's Have a party! An Open-Source Toolbox for Recursive Partytioning" has been rejected from publication at JMLR Track for Machine Learning Open Source Software. However I encourage you to resubmit this work once the issues listed below and the points raised by the reviewers are addressed and appropriately resolved. Please indicate in your resubmission that it is a follow up of this one.

First I would like to applaud your efforts on producing a good piece of software. The reviewers agree that from the code point of view, it is a good project. Further, implementations of methods, such as decision trees, in computing environments, such as R, are the types of software projects which would make the MLOSS track a good one. However, the reviewers raised several important weaknesses of the overall submission. I point out the main areas below in no particular order.

4 page description

The 4 page description should be restructured and improved. All the reviewers were disappointed with this.

Developer documentation

While the description claims that the project "provides basic infrastructure", it is not clear how this infrastructure should/can be used by another R programmer. The reviewers agree that the developer documentation is poor. For example, it would be difficult to work out how to implement a different recursive partitioning algorithm, or to create a direct analogue of `rpart`. In addition, Reviewer 4 raised an important question about modularity should be addressed in the developer documentation.

Comparison with previous methods

I am assuming that the journal publications contain the comparison details for run time, memory and accuracy, and hence I suggest referring to them in your description.

User documentation

Do not assume that your user is familiar with R. Some basic pointers about how to install your package and how to access user documentation should be put in an obvious README. Note that the user may download the source directly from the JMLR site.

I look forward to your resubmission.

Best regards,
Cheng Soon Ong
Action Editor, Journal of Machine Learning Research