

Structure of paper reviews

Follow the guidelines in sections 1-4 of “Reading a Computer Science Research Paper” by Philip W. L. Fong” to write your review. Write your reviews using a word-processor, and ensure that they are grammatically and syntactically correct. Your reviews should have the following structure.

Review of the paper “TITLE” by “AUTHORS”.

Reviewer: NAME

I. Comprehension.

Summarize the

- motivation and problem considered,
- innovations/contributions made,
- methods/arguments used or developed, and
- conclusions of the paper.

II. Critique.

Discuss 2-3 important points of disagreement with the paper. Carefully articulate your point of view, and provide support with appropriate technical/logical arguments and evidence.

- 1st point
- 2nd point
- 3rd point (optional)

III. Synthesis.

Propose 1-2 directions that the work can be further extended. Provide arguments to support your proposal. [eg motivate the proposal, discuss the significance of the contributions of the extension if successful, outline methods/approaches you would use to materialize your proposal]

- 1st proposal
- 2nd proposal (optional)

Grading rubric for paper reviews			
<i>Review section and their items</i>	<i>#pages</i>	<i>Weight</i>	<i>Characteristics</i>
I. Comprehension <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Motivation and problem statement 8% ○ Contributions 8% ○ Methodology/techniques 16% ○ Conclusions 8% 	2	40%	Concise, informative, accurate, covers key elements, insightful, coherent, logical structure and flow, accessible, and grammar/syntax.
II. Critique <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1st point • 2nd point • 3rd point (optional) 	1	30%	Concise, accurate, sound (justified/supported), significant, coherent, , logical structure and flow, accessible, and grammar/syntax.
III. Synthesis <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1st proposal • 2nd proposal (optional) 	1	30%	Concise, informative, insightful, logically structured, innovative, sound, coherent, and grammar/syntax.
Scoring of items <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Flawless [10 pts], • Few minor flaws [8-9 pts], • A major but non-fatal flaw or multiple minor flaws [6-7 pts] • Multiple major flaws [1-5 pts], • Helpless [0 pts]. 			