ACHIEVING EMOTIONS IN COLLECTIVE ACTION: EMOTIONAL PROCESSES AND MOVEMENT MOBILIZATION IN THE 1989 CHINESE STUDENT MOVEMENT

Guobin Yang
University of Hawai'i at Manoa

This article outlines an emotional achievement perspective for the study of emotions in social movements. Following Denzin's work on emotions, I consider emotions as self-feelings that are situated, interactional, and temporal in nature. The concept of emotions as achievement complements Hochschild's emotion management perspective. While management focuses on control, achievement emphasizes articulation and creativity. I argue that, although individuals may be compelled to suppress feelings in the organizational context, different social contexts and practices make it possible for individuals to pursue emotional fulfillment and self-realization. In social movements, the process of emotional achievement among participants unfolds as a process of mobilization. An analysis of the emotional dynamics of the 1989 Chinese student movement shows that emotions were inextricably intertwined with identities and action and that the emotional dynamics generated in this process significantly contributed to movement mobilization. The article concludes with a discussion of the theoretical contributions of the emotional achievement perspective.

Ten years ago, a group of scholars with diverse theoretical perspectives and empirical interests spelled out a broad range of research agendas for the burgeoning field of sociology of emotions (Kemper 1990a). One area was conspicuously missing: emotional experience in the context of social movements and collective action. The articles in the resulting volume converge in their emphasis on ways in which emotions are managed, controlled, or socialized to reduce social conflict, but there was no analysis of emotions under conditions of resistance or protest.

Social movement researchers duly responded to this lapse. Taking stock in the recent cultural critiques of the overemphasis on instrumental reason in social science research, they began to reintroduce emotions into the study of social movements. Many new avenues of empirical research have since been opened (for a review, see Goodwin, Jasper, and Polletta 2000). This resurgence of interest, however, betrays a tendency either to append emotions to some existent analytic categories in social movement theory (such as framing [Benford 1997]) or to borrow concepts from the sociology of emotions for

Direct all correspondence to Guobin Yang, Department of Sociology, University of Hawai'i at Manoa, Porteus Hall 247, 2424 Maile Way, Honolulu, HI 96822; e-mail: guobin@hawaii.edu

The Sociological Quarterly, Volume 41, Number 4, pages 593–614.

ISSN: 0038-0253

social movement analysis (e.g., the concept of emotion management [Groves 1995; Smith and Erickson 1997]). No coherent new perspectives or analytic concepts have been put forth.

In this article, I introduce the concept of emotional achievement into the analysis of social movement mobilization. I argue that emotional processes influence microlevel mobilization and that they do so because individuals actively seek emotional achievement through action—in this case, collective action. By emotional achievement, I mean the attainment of self-validating emotional experiences and expressions through active and creative pursuits. This concept contrasts with Arlie Russell Hochschild's notion of emotion management. While Hochschild (1979, p. 551) argues that emotion "can be and often is subject to acts of management" and that emotion management often produces negative sociopsychological effects, I will show that individuals also pursue self-enriching and satisfying emotional experiences and expressions.

My approach to the study of emotions is guided by theoretical assumptions borrowed from Norman K. Denzin's (1984) work. Emotions are understood as (1) self-feelings, (2) situational, (3) interactional and (4) temporal. Thus, I assume emotions are achieved in social interactions shaped by time and place. Also central to the notion of emotional achievement is the concept of emotions as self-feelings. As I will explain later, this concept recognizes the intrinsic connection between emotions and self-identity, a link that is crucial to the analysis of emotional processes in social movements and collective action.

Social movements are defined broadly as "those forms of action analytically implying conflict, solidarity and a breaching of the system limits" (Melucci 1996, p. 30). Consistent with this definition, social movements are also seen as liminal phenomena in social processes (Yang 2000a). As such, they may provide emotional experiences unavailable in ordinary times or within system limits.

The concept of emotional achievement clarifies the relationship between emotions and movement mobilization in the following way: Given that individuals actively seek emotional achievement and that social movements provide unique avenues for such explorations, the dynamics of microlevel movement mobilization may be seen as a function of the emotional processes of the movement. Furthermore, because emotions are defined as self-feelings, the achievement of emotions may also be considered as the achievement of identity. This concept links my approach to the identity-oriented paradigm in the social movement literature, which treats the process of movement mobilization as the process of the construction and transformation of identity (Cohen 1985; Calhoun 1991).

These theoretical arguments will be developed through an empirical analysis of the emotional dynamics of an important contemporary movement—the Chinese student movement in 1989. I will show that, in the initial period of the movement, shame, anger, and outrage arose in students' interactions with state actors, creating an emotional climate in which the largest demonstration of this period took place (on April 27). The exuberance generated by this demonstration then set the stage emotionally for launching the hunger strike. As the central event in the middle phase of the movement, the hunger strike led to large-scale popular mobilization because it generated feelings of pride and compassion. Finally, mixed feelings of fear and hope, joy and anger dominated the last period of the movement. But at the moment of military repression, core activists held their ground, demonstrating the great personal moral strength that had been built in the course of the movement.

Before turning to the case study, I will first explain my theoretical assumptions about emotions, elaborate on the concept of emotional achievement, discuss its relevance to the analysis of social movement emotions, and describe my data and methodology.

THEORETICAL ASSUMPTIONS ABOUT EMOTIONS

Denzin (1984, p. 49) defines emotions as "temporally embodied, situated self-feelings that arise from emotional and cognitive social acts that people direct to self or have directed toward them by others." He writes that emotion is an experience that "is felt in and runs through a body, and, in the process of being lived, plunges the person and his associates into a wholly new and transformed reality—the reality of a world that is being constituted by the emotional experience" (p. 66). Of the complex set of assumptions underlying these definitions, four directly inform my approach to emotions.

First, emotions are situational—they arise "out of and in situations" (Denzin 1984, p. 76). Denzin's discussion of situations is explicitly phenomenological, emphasizing how individuals enter into situations and how situations define people. However, to the extent that situations anchor individuals and emotions, Denzin's explication invites a symbolic interactionist extension. A symbolic interactionist approach highlights the ways in which individuals act toward situations. In emotional situations, Denzin explains (1984, p. 78), "I pursue emotional purpose, or emotional intentionality, hoping to achieve . . . an emotional expression and display that meet or fulfill my purposes-at-hand." Social movements abound with emotionally rich situations.

Second, emotions are interactional—they arise out of individuals' interactions with themselves and others. In this article, I emphasize interactions between and among individuals or groups of individuals, with little attention to self-interactions. In social movements, these interactions produce both positive and negative emotions among movement participants, with direct consequences for action and mobilization. For example, indifference on the part of the challenged party is likely to arouse anger and protest among challengers.

Third, emotions are temporal. As Denzin (1984, p. 79) puts it, "Although single emotional experiences appear to have beginnings and ends, they actually occur as a succession of events within the continuity of time." This suggests that an analysis of social movement emotions should be sensitive to their temporal order.

Finally, emotions are self-feelings in three senses: they are felt by the self; they arise from self or social interactions and refer back to the self; and they are components of the self (Denzin 1984, pp. 49–51).[1] For example, I may feel ashamed of myself because of my being negatively evaluated by others or myself. At this point, the feeling of shame enters my self-conception and becomes part of the meaning I attach to my self. This implies that emotion as self-feeling is intrinsic to my sense of identity—of who I am as an individual and as a social (hence moral) being and of what course of action to follow under specific conditions.

The concept of emotions as self-feelings has two direct implications for the theoretical and empirical arguments here. First, because emotions are intrinsic to a person's notion of self and identity, the analysis of emotional processes in social movements can be taken as an analysis of identity processes. In fact, because emotions are more readily observable than identity, analyzing emotions partly resolves a major difficulty involved in the empirical study of identity. Second, to the extent that emotions are a social expe-

rience (Denzin 1984, p. 93), the analysis of emotions in collective action may proceed under the assumption that the achievement of emotions among individuals both reflects and contributes to the achievement of collective identity.

THE CONCEPT OF EMOTIONAL ACHIEVEMENT

In contradistinction to Hochschild's notion of emotion management, I have defined emotional achievement as the attainment of self-validating emotional experiences and expressions through active and creative pursuits. This concept differs from Hochschild's perspective in three ways. First, Hochschild (1990, p. 122) emphasizes the management of emotions by following the guidance of feeling rules, defined as "rules about what feeling is or isn't appropriate to a given social setting." In contrast, emotional achievement highlights emotional creativity, that is, "expressing oneself in new and unique ways, such that one's personal horizons are expanded and interpersonal relationships enhanced" (Averill and Nunley 1992, p. 121). Second, Hochschild (1983, p. 54) is concerned with the negative sociopsychological consequences of emotional labor, questioning what will happen when emotions become "part of what we sell to an employer in return for a day's wage." As her study of emotional labor in the airline service industry shows, one result is emotional impoverishment or "deadness."[2] The concept of emotional achievement highlights what is opposite to commercialized human feelings. It emphasizes the articulation of emotions and the attainment of satisfying, self-fulfilling emotional experiences. Such experiences often involve moral choices at times of crisis (such as how to respond to a daunting opponent in a social movement). Because of the necessity of making these choices, emotions help to define individual identities and their relations to society. Finally, Hochschild develops her theory of emotion management in the context of organizations. Her central argument is that organizational forces compel individuals to manage or suppress their emotions. In comparison, the emotional achievement perspective emphasizes cultural and relatively nonroutine practices. Such practices are more likely to take place outside of an institutional domain. They may be oppositional and involve personal risks. Examples of such practices include action as Erving Goffman (1967) defines it, edgework (Lyng 1990), adventure leisure activities (Holyfield 1997), and collective action.

Goffman (1967) argues that in modern societies some individuals are in constant search for action and its concomitant emotional excitement and moral challenge as a way of achieving character. For Goffman (1967, p. 185), action refers to "activities that are consequential, problematic, and undertaken for what is felt to be their own sake." Such action is not an expression of impulsiveness or irrationality but "a means for the maintenance and acquisition of character" (p. 238). By character, Goffman means a conglomeration of moral values associated with a sense of the self.

In a similar vein, Stephen Lyng (1990) considers voluntary risk-taking activities as experiences of self-realization. Conceptualizing these activities as "edgework," Lyng lists as examples dangerous sports such as skydiving, hang gliding, rock climbing, motorcycle racing, and downhill ski racing, as well as dangerous occupations such as fire fighting, test piloting, combat soldiering, movie stunt work, and police work. Particularly relevant for my purpose is Lyng's discussion of "edgework sensations," which include a sense of self-realization and a specific sequence of emotions (p. 860). In a synthesis of Marxist views on social structures and Meadian perspectives on the genesis of the self,

Lyng argues that "the dearth of possibilities for spontaneous and self-realizing action in the economic and bureaucratic spheres can be compensated for in the leisure-time pursuit of play, particularly those forms of play that involve both risk and skill" (pp. 870–871). Thus the experience of the self in edgework becomes "the direct antithesis of that under conditions of alienation and reification" (p. 878).

Lori Holyfield's (1997) study of emotional experiences in adventure recreation (in this case, a ropes course) is consonant with Lyng's study of edgework. She shows that while the participants' emotional experiences are largely controlled by the recreation companies, there are momentary interruptions or breaks "when feeling rules simply could not be internalized or superimposed upon *felt* emotions" (p. 274). Because these moments allow individuals to "glimpse at something authentic and *felt*" (p. 276), individuals return again and again to have their emotions stirred and to get "a taste of the heroic" (p. 278).

While activities like edgework are sought for the particular kinds of emotional experiences they generate, other more complex social processes contain possibilities for a wider range of emotional experiences and all manner of achieving them. In these processes, individuals or groups may create settings to generate particular kinds of emotions among themselves or others; extraordinary situations may emerge that call forth extraordinary emotions; and feeling rules functional in an institutional domain may be ignored, challenged, or thwarted. The emotions in these processes are volatile and complex. Those "moments of madness" (Zolberg 1972) found in collective action involve such dynamic processes. In the ebb and flow of social processes, these are the liminal moments that separate individuals from the daily routine and provide them with new experiences (Yang 2000a).

In collective action, the expression of emotions assumes great prominence. In their introduction to the influential collection *Social Movements and Culture* (1995), Hank Johnston and Bert Klandermans call for more attention to the role of "high culture" in movement mobilization, emphasizing how poetry and literature created the imagination of great nationalist movements. In Benedict Anderson's (1991, p. 4) study of nationalism, a key puzzle is why the nation commands such "profound emotional legitimacy." Not surprisingly, much of his analysis focuses on poetry and songs and shows how powerful language can be as a source of emotional solidarity among people wholly unknown to each other. Most recently, Francesca Polletta (1998) has shown how stories told in public settings help to constitute "student activist" as a new collective identity and to make high-risk activism attractive. These studies are instructive from the perspective of emotional achievement, because they analyze narratives imbued with emotions–that is, the narratives both express and create emotions.

STUDYING SOCIAL MOVEMENT EMOTIONS

That emotions are constitutive of identity has received increasing recognition in the social movement literature. Alberto Melucci (1996, p. 71), for example, explicitly argues that collective identity has an emotional component: "Passions and feelings, love and hate, faith and fear are all part of a body acting collectively." James M. Jasper suggests ways in which emotions undergird various dimensions of collective protest. Of the emotional constitution of collective identity, Jasper (1998, p. 415) wrote:

> Participation in social movements can be pleasurable in itself, independently of the ultimate goals and outcomes. Protest becomes a way of saying something about oneself and one's morals, and of finding joy and pride in them. One can also have negative emotions about one's identity, such as shame or guilt; many movements are motivated precisely to fight stigmatized identities.

An increasing number of empirical works have studied social movement emotions in one way or another. Of those that focus on the relationship between emotions and movement mobilization, we should take note of Thomas Scheff's (1994) study of shame and organized aggression, Julian McAllister Groves's (1995) study of the process of becoming an activist through the management of emotions, Jeff Goodwin's (1997) work on the demobilizing effects of affective ties, Deborah A. Smith and Rebecca J. Erickson's (1997) study of emotional labor in a social movement organization, and Christian Smith's (1996) and James Jasper's (1997) discussions of the mobilizing effects of moral outrage. Yet, insightful and instructive as these works are, they neither conceive of emotions as achievements nor provide an approach for the study of emotional achievement.[3] In fact, some works (e.g., Smith and Erickson 1997) strictly follow Hochschild's emotion management perspective and study social movement emotions (SMEs) in the context of social movement organizations (SMOs). In assuming a fundamental similarity between SMOs and the bureaucratic organizations of Hochschild's concern, such an approach elides those powerful emotional processes found in collective action but not in SMOs. To capture these emotional processes and to reveal their relationship with movement mobilization requires a different approach. By focusing on the analysis of emotions as achievement, this article provides such an approach.

The 1989 Chinese student movement has become emblematic of contemporary social movements in non-Western societies. To the growing literature on this movement, sociologists have contributed multifaceted and powerful explanations, utilizing resource mobilization theory (Lin 1992), institutional and cultural analysis (Guthrie 1995), the framing perspective in social movement research (Zuo and Benford 1995), game theory (Deng 1997), ecological theory of social movements (Zhao 1998), and a synthesis of political process theory and identity-oriented theory (Calhoun 1994). With the exception of Calhoun's work, however, these studies have given little attention to the emotional dynamics of the movement. Subtly combining competing theoretical perspectives, Craig Calhoun's work offers an account that frequently identifies emotions in the course of events, thus implicitly relating emotions to movement dynamics. His work provides a starting point for a more systematic analysis of the emotional dynamics of the movement.

DATA AND METHODOLOGY

As a methodological strategy, I present an historical narrative of the emotional dynamics of the movement and its impact on mobilization. In its focus on the temporal unfolding of events, a narrative can best capture the processual and interactional nature of emotions. A narrative also helps conceptualize emotions and events as happenings connected by cause and effect (Abbott 1990; Griffin 1993).

Emotions may be observed in various forms–muscle movements, gestures, tones of speech, narratives of emotions, and many others. My analysis focuses on narratives of emotions, partly because the narrative expression of emotions is in itself a form of emo-

tional achievement (Taylor 1989), partly also because narratives are readily amenable to empirical analysis. With the exception of one retrospective account (Shen 1990), narratives of emotions analyzed in this article were all produced by participants in the course of the movement. They fall into two broad categories, public narratives and private ones. Public narratives of emotions include poems, wall posters, handbills, news stories and the like. In my research, I located these narratives in media materials and collections of movement documents (Han 1990; Yu and Harrison 1990; Ogden, Hartford, Sullivan, and Zweig 1992). Although these collections are mostly in English translations and thus may not be considered as primary materials in a strict sense, from my own memory of the documents I saw during the movement, it is clear these collections are wide-ranging in their coverage. For example, the collection edited by Suzanne Ogden and her colleagues (1992) contains both government and student documents.

Private narratives mainly include diaries that recorded and articulated emotions that the author either experienced or witnessed. The two diaries from which I quote quite extensively are primary documents in Chinese, although when they were published on the Internet, real names had been changed to guarantee anonymity of the individuals involved. One diary (Tianhua 1994) was written by a student in Qinghua University at the time the events happened. The other (Jiang 1997) was written by a medical professional who also experienced all stages of the movement. Again, based on my personal experience of the movement, I believe both diaries are valuable historical documents that record in detail the feelings and thoughts of many of those who were involved in the movement. Not infrequently, from these personal documents I read my own feelings and thoughts during those unforgettable days and nights.

THREE STAGES OF THE EMOTIONAL DYNAMICS OF THE 1989 CHINESE STUDENT MOVEMENT: A NARRATIVE ACCOUNT

Stage 1: Initial Mobilization

The movement was triggered by Hu Yaobang's unexpected death on April 15, 1989. A reform-oriented party leader, Hu had lost his position as general secretary of the Chinese Communist Party because of his sympathy for the student movement in 1986. Hu's death provided an occasion for grief, blame, and anger that led to the initial wave of protest.

Following Hu's death, wall posters mourning Hu's death appeared in large numbers on university campuses in Beijing.[4] Usually worded in simple language, these posters expressed, and appealed to, emotions. Sadness, anger, and shame abounded. The power of one poster comes from its brevity: "Yaobang, we are sad" (Tianhua 1994). Another appears in the form of a couplet: "Those who should have died still live, / Those who should have lived are dead." And a third is a poem:

> A star of hope has fallen—China meets with calamity;
> The ordinary people are angry; if they were not angry,
> what would be the way out?
> What a shame, what a shame! (Han 1990, p. 7)

From the outburst of such emotionally loaded narratives of mourning, it was only a small step to challenging the living. On April 18, 1989, a group of students attempted to

submit a list of demands to the government, asking for the reevaluation of Hu Yaobang, among other things. When students' demands were ignored, they responded with sit-ins and confrontations with police in front of Xinhuamen, the government compound, on April 19 and 20. Injuries occurred during these confrontations. As news of police brutality spread, feelings of shock and anger grew rapidly. Poetry, a powerful means of protest in modern Chinese history, was written to express students' anger and sense of fearless heroism (e.g., Han 1990, pp. 44–45). Many posters appeared on university campuses calling on students to protest against the brutality (Tianhua 1994). In this emotional climate, the first class boycott began on April 21, and the first movement organizations appeared at Beijing University and People's University. Also on April 21, an estimated two hundred thousand protesters and spectators gathered on Tiananmen Square, the largest outpouring of demonstrators since the beginning of the movement. Ignoring a government announcement to close the square, thousands of students camped there to wait for Hu's funeral, scheduled for the next morning. The following diary entry written by a student at Qinghua University illustrates the sense of the unbearable burden on self-identity induced by the feeling of insult, as well as the impetus to act upon this identity:

> April 21, 1989 Friday.
> Big-character posters continue to expose the "bloody incident," calling on people to rise up in protest, and demanding that the offenders be punished and the facts be clarified.
>
> Sure, in China, people are too often treated in such a crude and violent manner. We cannot do anything about it if we do not happen to know anything about it. This time such things are happening to us. Not to make any response would indicate we are swallowing too much insult. (Tianhua 1994)

The next event to shape emotions took place on April 22. Following Hu's funeral ceremony, crowds of students stood in front of the Great Hall of the People, where the funeral had taken place, demanding dialogue with government leaders. In the middle of this, three student representatives crossed the police line, walked up the stairs of the Great Hall, and knelt down to present a petition in the style of a courtier presenting a memorial to the emperor in earlier times. According to one witness,

> About ten government officials standing in front of the Great Hall totally disregarded them . . . and the policemen lining up were fully prepared to attack the defenseless students. More than twenty minutes passed, and three student representatives were still kneeling on the doorsteps. Yet no government official came to accept the petition letter. By now all the students felt humiliated and indignant. Some choked with tears. (Ogden et al. 1992, p. 104)

This act of self-humiliation sent multiple symbolic messages. On the one hand, by assuming the posture of a traditional courtier, the three student representatives clearly drew an analogy between current state leaders and the feudal rulers of the past. It was thus a deeply critical and embarrassing gesture to the authorities. Their disregard for the student representatives may just as well be interpreted as an indication that they had been temporarily deprived of the ability to respond in the face of such a symbolically challenging and emotionally explosive gesture. On the other hand, by assuming the posture of a traditional servile courtier, the student representatives also brought shame upon

themselves and their fellow students on the square. The emotional effect of this act of shaming was immediate, as shown in the same passage quoted above. The following diary entry indicates how shame and anger led to a firmer commitment to the movement:

> This was insolence toward the 20,000 students on the square. It was insolence toward the opinions of all the students, and even all the people! Such apathy and indifference—this has always been the bureaucrats' and leaders' attitude toward the people. If only for this one reason, this movement must be carried on! (Tianhua 1994)

The diarist was not alone in articulating his determination to carry on the movement. Shen Tong (1990, p. 187), a student from Beijing University, recalls:

> That afternoon, as my friends made their way back from the square, they told me angrily that the representatives had knelt for forty minutes, but no one had ever come out of the Great Hall. The officials had left through a back door. One of my old roommates said through clenched teeth, "If I had a cannon, I would have blown up the Great Hall of the People." Almost everyone who had been there was as angry as he was. The students had given a reasonable and patriotic request to the government, but the Party officials had completely ignored them. I noticed that many students who had never cared about politics and protest before were now raising their fists in the air. That day was one of the turning points of the movement.

Following the moral outrage on April 22, more movement organizations appeared on the campuses in Beijing. In Qinghua University, for example, a preparatory committee was formed on Sunday, April 23. Its first decision was to announce a formal class strike to start on Monday. Amid increasing student initiatives, the government made its first major public move. On the evening of April 25, a *People's Daily* editorial, slated to appear the next day, was broadcast on the central radio station. The editorial labeled the student movement a "turmoil," banned "illegal demonstrations" and "illegal organizations," and threatened to take immediate action against the movement. It struck fear into the hearts of many, but fear spread alongside anger, and anger fueled action. The following diary entry illustrates the process of this emotional response among students:

> I was struck with horror. It was as if I saw a heavy iron curtain slowly rising over the horizon, firmly crossing the skies, and closing down upon me! . . . Horror aside, I felt anger. First you ignored us. When the movement becomes too powerful to be ignored, you want to quench us with one strike. What is this? It is contumely towards the ordinary people. A counterattack must be launched against such nasty attitude! (Tianhua 1994)

The diarist further wrote of a classmate's response:

> I returned to Rm 200 after I heard the editorial. I saw Wan Yuan. He was all worked up. He picked up a microphone and ran out to protest the slanderous editorial. . . . After a while Wan Yuan came back. The three of us started to talk about the editorial. Suddenly the broadcast station outside again started broadcasting [the editorial]. Wan Yuan picked up the microphone, ran to the balcony and shouted back his retort. (Tianhua 1994)

At the same time, students began to call for demonstrations. Following the broadcasting of the editorial, the newly formed citywide movement organization, the Federa-

tion of All Beijing College Student Unions, called for a rally on April 27 (Shen 1990, p. 195). Student organizers, however, wavered in their determination. Some wanted to have a small-scale rally as a compromise to the government position; others wanted to cancel it altogether (Shen 1990, pp. 200–202). The movement organization at Qinghua University eventually decided not to participate (Tianhua 1994). In spite of this, the emotional power in the first ten days of the movement had emotionally prepared many students to carry on the movement. To retreat at the first sign of a major government threat would be too shameful. Added to this was the strong sense of indignation at the government's condemnation of the student movement as a "turmoil." As one student wrote: "This time, whatever happens, we are not going to yield without putting up a fight. Even if we lose, we will shout our cries of resistance! Better fight and lose than cower to live!" (Tianhua 1994). Thus, the demonstration took place amid government threats. It turned out to be an exhilarating success. After that, the government backed down from its position in the *People's Daily* editorial, and the movement entered a new stage.

Stage 2: High Tide

The high tide of the movement was May 13–19. On three consecutive days, May 16–18, the crowds on Tiananmen Square were estimated at one million daily, leaving no doubt that students had by now gained the full support of the public.

The single most important factor contributing to such large-scale mobilization was the hunger strike, which started on May 13. Participants and observers have emphasized various reasons for starting the hunger strike. One was that the hunger strikers considered their strategy necessary for securing a dialogue with the government. In addition, because of Mikhail Gorbachev's upcoming visit, it was believed that a hunger strike on Tiananmen Square would give students additional bargaining power. These factors may well have influenced the decision making behind the hunger strike, but they do not explain why individuals chose to join, especially when the results were unpredictable.

Individuals joined at least partly for emotional reasons. The historic demonstration on April 27 was emotionally cathartic. That morning, when students began to show up for the demonstration, fear and anxiety prevailed in the gathering crowds. No one knew what was going to happen. Many had expected repression. Some had written wills and were prepared for the worst. By the end of the day, when demonstrators found themselves safely on their way back to their campuses, the fear and anxiety had suddenly dissolved into the air, replaced by feelings of joy and triumph. One Qinghua University student recorded the emotional relief:

> By this time dusk had fallen stealthily. There were very little traffic and very few people. Students could no longer hold back their joy and excitement. The orderly procession of demonstrators suddenly dispersed on the road. There were no more marshals to keep order. Everyone shouted, screamed, sang, waved the flags in hand. (Tianhua 1994)

The power of the demonstration was transformative. If students had been uncertain about their power up to that point, they were now certain of it. Their fear of repression had evaporated.

We might imagine that without fear popular mobilization would be easily achieved. The emotional logic of the movement belies this presupposition. In fact, the movement began to slide to a quiet end after the sense of fear was gone. For many students who had experienced the joy of the April 27 demonstration, the two weeks after that felt like boredom. One major demonstration took place on May 4. Yet in the absence of a government threat, there was no sense of fear among the demonstrators, and success seemed to be too easily achieved to deliver much joy and excitement. After the May 4 demonstration, the class strike was declared over, and the usual hustle and bustle was back on many campuses. The movement seemed to be dwindling to an end, a prospect students could not accept emotionally:

> Although I feel . . . that a hunger strike will not bring advantage for the work of the dialogue delegation, and it will damage the current relatively calm atmosphere, yet on the other hand, when I find myself on the quiet campus, I feel that the whole movement is in fact marking steps. Everything is being delayed, with no foreseeable results. Thus a hunger strike could serve as a means of putting pressure on the government. (Tianhua 1994)

The hunger strike began in this climate of emotional yearning. The launch of the hunger strike stirred up new waves of emotions among both students and urban residents. It gave them something new to talk, think, and feel about. Common people felt proud to find themselves still capable of deep feelings of pity and sympathy. They told sad stories about students and urged the government to show pity. In the morning news of May 17, for example, several mothers were shown in tears, vehemently demanding the government to have an immediate dialogue with students in order to avoid the deterioration of the affair (Jiang 1997). A news report of the million-people march on May 17 tells the story of a compassionate peasant:

> The peasants came too. A man from Miyun County by the name of "Old Uncle" Liu told fellow travelers: "I am sixty-seven this year. In the past few days I have been watching television and have seen how the students are suffering. It was too pitiful; I had to come out." (Han 1990, p. 227)

Pride and compassion imbued a father's response to his hunger striking son:

> At 2:30 in the morning [on May 17], upon hearing that his son Mu Feng was one of the twelve who was refusing water, the venerable professor Mu Baisuo . . . rushed to the Square to see his son. He pointed to a student lying on the ground, third from the east, and said to us, "That's my son." At the same moment, Mu Feng lifted his head with great difficulty, and saw his white-haired father. Father and son clasped each other's hands.
> "I was too moved to say anything. I could only tell my son to listen to the doctors," Mu Baisuo told reporters. "Neither my wife nor I wants to see our son die. We have only two children! But I feel that the sacrifice of a son for a struggle for democracy is a worthy one!" (Han 1990, pp. 229–230)

Telling these pitiable tales was an emotional achievement. The act of telling was one of emotional expression. In many areas of modern life, the expression of emotions is becoming increasingly dictated by feeling rules and structured according to power and

status (Collins 1990; Kemper 1990b). Collective action, however, provides conditions for emotional expression that are unavailable in ordinary times. In 1989, the hunger strike created the conditions for achieving feelings of pride and compassion.

In terms of movement development, the feelings of pride and compassion moved people to act in ways that significantly contributed to movement mobilization. The power of the hunger strike came from its clarity: it showed to the world the students' self-sacrifice and the government's indifference. It gave various social groups the common language that Anderson (1991) associated with the emotional power of nationalism. For about a week, the hunger strike became the organizing principle of daily life for Beijing citizens. On university campuses, faculty and staff alike frequented the information bulletins to read the latest news.[5] In government offices, routine work became difficult to carry on, because people were either talking about the hunger strike or out in the streets to see what was happening (Jiang 1997). In addition, all state media began to cover the development of the hunger strike extensively, giving Chinese audiences a rare chance of following major political events in their immediacy. One witness records that, in the hunger strike period, people who had not been accustomed to watching morning news changed their daily schedule. While usually they would leave home for work in the morning rush, now the first thing they did was to turn on the television to check out the recent developments in the hunger strike (Jiang 1997). By May 17, the fifth day of the hunger strike, it seemed that all the residents of Beijing were out in the streets partaking of the rare excitement and satisfaction of an emotionally intense public life.[6] By then a general mood of emotional solidarity had emerged, as reported by Shen Tong (1990, p. 270):

> The *laobaixing*, the ordinary people, were now actively involved in the movement. I heard that even the city's thieves had agreed to go on a two-day strike to show their support for the students. In fact, the crime rate went down in May. People on the crowded buses were friendly to each other instead of fighting, as often happened. Everyone was concentrating on the student movement, and there was a great spirit of comradeship.

Stage 3: Achieving Heroism

The final stage of the movement opened with determined countermaneuvers by the state. On Friday, May 19, rumors began to circulate among students about an imminent government crackdown. Fear, suspense, and anxiety were strong among students. On Tiananmen Square, a desolate feeling filled the air. Movement organizers were inclined to withdraw, while students hesitated to join those already on the square. Then, at midnight of May 19, the central television station showed Li Peng, the premier of the state council, and Yang Shangkun, the president, announcing martial law. The idea of martial law in Beijing sounded bizarre to its residents—after all, Beijing has had a history of peace even in times of war. Yet the reality of martial law was only too true, with the nonstop broadcasting of the speeches by Li and Yang. The moment of shock was accompanied by fear, shame, and anger. Calhoun (1991, p. 65) vividly captures students' emotional responses to martial law:

> On the night of May 19, I watched students dither in uncertainty about whether it was prudent to march yet again to Tiananmen Square only to be galvanized into immediate action by Li Peng's speech declaring martial law. Amid their tears and

> shouts, they repeated over and again their sense of anger and outrage at his insulting tone. "He lectures us like naughty children." "He speaks like a bad, old-fashioned teacher." "He is so arrogant."

As Calhoun noted elsewhere (1994), these same students had been debating for three hours that night about whether they should go to the square. After Li and Yang spoke, it took three hundred students "less than ten minutes to achieve unanimity and depart amid tears of anger into the face of what they were sure was imminent military repression" (Calhoun 1994, p. 88). This show of support was crucial for the continuation of the movement. So many students from universities in Beijing left for Tiananmen, all in response to the declaration of martial law, that they had to wait to enter the square. Once there, very few left. Most stayed for the night. In the growing crowds, the initial upsurges of anger that had galvanized the action were turning into a strong sense of solidarity. The square came alive in the chilly night.

As morning came, students on the square began to gather into squared formations, as if taking up battle positions. Students spread the word, however, that they should all remain nonviolent in case of government attacks. At 11 A.M., one hour after martial law came into effect, helicopters hovered over the square. All activities among students, joking or laughing, froze. Students held their ground in spite of their fear. The helicopters hovered and left. Many students sighed in relief, but the atmosphere remained tense throughout the day.

The students' bravery was matched by citizens' extraordinary acts. As soldiers began to move into Beijing to enforce martial law, citizens rushed to all major passageways to block them from entering the city. The initial success of these efforts created high hopes among students, leading to demonstrations of a scale similar to those in the previous stages of the movement. However, with martial law in force, repression loomed near. The general mood of the movement was dominated by a mixture of hopes and fears, anger and anxiety, "an emotional roller coaster," as Calhoun (1994, p. 111) put it. This emotional roller coaster took its toll on the movement. On May 20, the first day of martial law, two hundred thousand students were on the square. On May 23, probably the high tide in the final stage of the movement, over a million paraded in the streets of Beijing in celebration of the successful blocking of the advancing soldiers. By May 29, the numbers on Tiananmen Square had dwindled to less than ten thousand. Even so, by the night of June 3, the final, deadly night of the movement, between three thousand and five thousand were still on the square, refusing to retreat in the face of death. Why?

There is no simple answer to this question. Fang Deng (1997) argues that students did not believe the government would resort to military repression. In this sense, students were victims of their own miscalculation. It is true that even at the last moment, people still doubted whether the bullets were real. Yet a calculating person had no compelling reason to risk life on this basis. More compelling seems to be the yearning for emotional achievement (and relatedly, moral grandeur). Goffman argues that individuals in modern societies pursue character by undertaking risky activities. Lyng shows that individuals undertake edgework in search of self-realization. In both cases, individuals embrace risky activities in order to glimpse the authentic and heroic. In the same way, it could be argued, Chinese students on the night of June 3 knowingly risked their lives because of an emotional yearning to experience and demonstrate the heroic.

It would be impossible to comprehend the power of this death-defying passion without following through the emotional journey of the students. In 1989, Chinese students

experienced shame, anger, and indignation when the government repeatedly ignored their petitions and demands, labeled their movement a "turmoil," and declared martial law. They experienced pride and joy when they were able to defend their honor. During their triumphant moments, students sought higher levels of emotional achievement by mounting more radical forms of protest. Thus, the launching of the hunger strike took place among vows of heroism and self-sacrifice. The "Hunger Strikers' Statement," read and posted on the day the hunger strike started, proclaimed the will to face death: "To die, hoping for the widest echo, an eternal echo. . . . Farewell, love, take care! I cannot bear to leave you, yet it must come to an end" (Han 1990, p. 201).

This determination to defy death, once declared, could not be easily retracted. For a week after the hunger strike started, there was no need to live up to this death vow. The hunger strike helped achieve popular mobilization, and the fear of repression was almost forgotten. Hunger strikers' heroic embrace of self-sacrifice, however, aroused the compassion of the general public, who heaped praises on these self-sacrificial acts. Public glorification of heroism intensified the potential shame participants would have experienced if they were to back down. On the part of the participants, the emotions they had experienced in the process had transformed them such that, by the last stage of the movement, many had become so committed as to be willing to face grave danger. On the first evening after martial law was enforced, students on Tiananmen Square felt the imminence of repression. In this atmosphere, two friends had the following conversation:

> My mind drifted back to what might happen now that martial law was in effect.
> "I'm not afraid of death," I said, breaking the silence.
> Lao He stopped, grabbed my arm, and said, "Are you sure?"
> I thought long and hard about it and answered, "Yes, I'm sure."
> "I'm not afraid either," he said. "If we need to die today, I am ready." (Shen 1990, p. 300)

In fact, talk about the inevitability of death and the will to face death was so pervasive in the last days of the movement that in terms of the emotional development of the movement, there was no easy way for a retreat. Retreat would appear to be an unbearable shame in light of heroic death vows such as the following:

> We may die, our blood may flow, but freedom and democracy cannot be lost. We will give up our blood and lives in exchange for a beautiful tomorrow for the republic! (Ogden et al. 1992, p. 278)

> It is not unlikely that we may suffer a defeat, but we really have no room for maneuver.... We can only fight to win or die. (Ogden et al. 1992, p. 294)

With these solemn declarations circulating among the participants, with the public glorification of heroic self-sacrifice, and above all with weeks of escalating emotional experiences, when the time came to live up to these death vows, students did so without hesitation.

DISCUSSION

The above account demonstrates the emotional dynamics of the movement and its impact on movement mobilization. To highlight the main features of the emotional achieve-

ment perspective, I now turn to a focused analysis of movement emotions in terms of the four theoretical assumptions about emotions outlined at the beginning of this article.

First, emotions are situational. They happen "out of and in situations." In the Chinese student movement, events constantly occurred that called on students and the general public to respond. These responses often took emotional forms, for example, emotional narratives. At the same time, the intensity of emotions that were expressed and the ways in which emotions were articulated would be hard to imagine in ordinary times. A good example is the story of the peasant, cited above, who said that he was taking part in the demonstration because he felt pity for the students. In Chinese culture, the peasant is not the ideal-typical figure associated with such emotional moments, yet the particular situation in 1989 made this possible.

Second, emotions are interactional. My narrative account shows that students felt and expressed a wide range of emotions in the movement. Among the most common were anger, outrage, shame, fear, joy, compassion, and pride. Anger, outrage, shame and fear may be considered negative emotions. They are "primarily reactive" (Jasper 1998, p. 406), in the sense that they arise most likely in response to some event or information. In this case, these emotions grew out of the challengers' interactions with the challenged. For example, students were angry when they heard news of police brutality on April 20; they felt shame when government leaders would not accept a petition presented by three student representatives on their knees on the stairs of the Great Hall of the People on April 22; they experienced outrage and fear after learning that the *People's Daily* editorial on April 26 had labeled their movement as a "turmoil" and hearing on May 19 that the government had declared martial law.

In the course of the movement, students also experienced positive emotions such as joy, compassion, and pride. These emotions are positively related to identity and are likely to produce a sense of self-realization. In this sense, they resemble those "emotional sensations" that edgeworkers pursue (Lyng 1990). Examples of positive emotions include the joyful feelings that followed the triumph of the demonstration on April 27, feelings of compassion produced by the hunger strike, and pride in the ability to face grave personal dangers. These same examples also indicate that positive emotions among movement participants were more likely to arise out of intragroup interactions. Being together with those whom Denzin calls one's emotional associates was a source of emotional solidarity and strength.

Third, emotions are temporal. In collective action, emotional processes are dynamic and follow a sequential order. One event may give rise to a particular emotion, say anger, which then becomes crucial to subsequent action. Thus in the initial stage of the Chinese student movement, Hu's death gave occasion to a torrent of elegiac narratives expressing feelings of sorrow and anger. These feelings influenced the rise of the first wave of demonstrations and petitioning, which provided the material for the next wave of emotional narratives, which in turn articulated feelings of outrage against police brutality, which then inspired more protest activities. Linking emotions and events in their temporal sequences helps reveal how emotions shaped movement mobilization, even as mobilization also affected emotions. In this sense, a nuanced narrative of the emotional dynamics in collective action adds power to causal explanation.

The final but key theoretical assumption about emotion is that it is integral to identity. My narrative shows that in experiencing either positive or negative emotions, students did not resort to the methods of management common in the emotion management

perspective. They did not follow the feeling rules that would have normally structured the interactions between students and government authorities in Chinese culture. Instead they let their feelings overflow and expressed them publicly in narrative form. Tears were shed in abundance on some occasions; angry denunciations were heard on others; emotional poems were read publicly in moving cadences; and a sense of enthusiasm and excitement permeated Tiananmen Square day and night. In this respect, the narrative expression of emotions is particularly notable. I had occasion to cite several narratives on the subject of death. Because the idea of death is loaded with emotions, narratives of death articulated particularly powerful emotions—anger and outrage in cases concerning Hu's death and students' bloodshed in initial confrontations with police, compassion for the self-sacrifices of hunger strikers, and pride in the courage to face death.

If individuals did not attempt to suppress their emotions, it is because to do so would violate the sense of identity that had developed in the course of the movement. My narrative of the emotional dynamics of the movement reveals the contours of this identity. In the initial emotional surges of the movement, students who had never cared about politics or protest joined in. Once they got involved, their identity as students began to gain a new dimension, that of political activists ready to fight. As the movement escalated, this activist identity strengthened, eventually to the degree of extraordinary kinds of commitments. Calhoun (1994, p. 267) captures this transformation well in explaining why students were able to face death:

> Martyrdom became plausible because they had thrown their identities so completely into the movement. Little of them was invested in other relationships, in everyday activities, or at least these other investments seemed to pale beside the magnitude of their cause and the radical commitment they made to it through weeks of fasting, shouting, living fear and excitement and trying on the idea of being a hero.

Importantly, this transformation of identity went hand in hand with the emotions achieved in the course of the movement. Thus when students heard about police brutality, they felt compelled to join in protest, because not to do so would indicate "we are swallowing too much insult," as one student wrote. When they saw their representatives ignored by government officials, they felt humiliated and indignant and became more committed to the movement, because they could not bear "insolence toward the opinions of the students." Repeated government condemnation of the movement as a "turmoil" and threats of repression failed to stop students from taking part, because it was precisely this kind of labeling that hurt their feelings. It is unsurprising, then, that the most powerful moments of mobilization in the movement followed government acts of labeling or threat (the demonstration on April 27 and students' eruptions into the Tiananmen Square on the night of May 19 are the most important examples). This is because these were emotionally the most unbearable moments for students. They expressed their emotions by participating in protest and demonstrations. In this connection, it is worth noting that an important feature of the movement was that, probably more concretely than anything else, students wanted recognition and autonomy. They named their organizations Students' Autonomous Preparatory Committee and Federation of Autonomous Students Associations. They demanded recognition of their organizations as legitimate student organizations, of themselves as legitimate participants in the political process, and of their movement as a patriotic one. When such recognition was with-

held by the government, students were prepared to fight for it by means of protest, even if protest became increasingly dangerous. Thus the movement gathered its emotional power.

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION

Although much attention has been devoted to emotions in recent studies of social movements, no coherent theoretical perspective has been developed for the analysis of the relationship between emotional processes and movement mobilization. In this article, I introduced the concept of emotional achievement as the basis of an approach that tackles the impact of emotional dynamics on mobilization. I argued that, although organizational structures often compel individuals to control their emotions, other social processes, particularly collective action, provide conditions for the active pursuit of emotional experiences and expressions. Following Denzin's definition of emotions as "self-feelings," I further suggested that emotional achievement entails an achievement of identity. Along this line, I developed the thesis that the dynamics of microlevel mobilization may be understood as a function of its emotional processes, which are shaped by individuals' pursuits of emotional fulfillment.

Guided by these theoretical arguments, I presented a narrative account of the emotional dynamics in the 1989 Chinese student movement. My narrative shows that in all three movement stages, emotional dynamics played a central role in shaping microlevel mobilization. Thus shame, anger, and outrage shaped mobilization in the first stage; pride and compassion (generated by the hunger strike) influenced mobilization in the second; and the cumulative emotional effects of five weeks of movement experience pushed core activists to achieve heroic self-sacrifice on the deadly night of June 3. On the basis of my narrative account, I revisited my theoretical assumptions about emotions and linked them directly to the major empirical issues addressed here. This focused analysis shows that conceptualizing emotions as situational, interactional, and temporal self-feelings helps to understand the process whereby participants in the Chinese student movement achieved emotions and attained heroic action and large-scale mobilization.

The concept of emotional achievement may be used to study a wide range of social movements, not just the intensely emotional ones such as the case examined here. To the extent that social movements involve moral protest, and moral issues are entangled with issues of emotions and identity, emotions will always play an important role in shaping mobilization processes. Consequently, understanding mobilization processes requires an analysis of the emotional dynamics. The concept of emotional achievement lends itself to such an analysis.

Furthermore, allowing for historical and cultural variations in the forms and meanings of emotions (Swidler 1980; Stearns and Stearns 1986; Lutz 1988; Denzin 1990), I would like to propose that the concept of emotional achievement may be applicable to the analysis of social movement emotions in a wide range of cultural and historical settings. Here I must quote the words of one blockader in the 1985 Columbia University antiapartheid divestment protest, which Eric L. Hirsch (1990, p. 248) quoted to illustrate how group processes influenced mobilization. The blockader said,

> The fasters were doing something that personally took a lot of willpower for them, and that gave you a little extra willpower. To have to go into the hospital because you

> were off food for fifteen days and the Trustees won't even speak to you. It really made me angry at the Trustees, so I was determined that this was not something that was just going to whimper off. At least I was going to be there, and I know others felt the same way.

How remarkably similar to the emotional processes Chinese students experienced in 1989! My point is not that there is a limit to cultural and historical forms and meanings of emotions (although that is entirely possible) or that this limit gives the concept of emotional achievement some general purchase. Rather, whatever degree of generalizability the concept of emotional achievement may have derives from its central theoretical underpinning, and that is, that everywhere social life is fundamentally characterized by social conflict. Under conditions of social conflict, as my detailed case analysis shows, feeling rules may be challenged or thwarted, resulting in the achievement of other emotions. All accounts that focus on emotion management, regulation and socialization are oriented to the maintenance of social order. My account begins with the assumption of social conflict.

The concept of emotional achievement opens new avenues for future theoretical explorations and empirical research, in both the social movement field and the sociology of emotions. In social movement research, for example, the concept may be extended to the conceptualization and analysis of the biographical consequences of movement participation. Existing studies of these issues have revealed close relations between movement experience and sustained commitment to political activism (Rupp and Taylor 1987; McAdam 1988; 1989; Whittier 1995; 1997). Various factors have been offered to explain this relationship, yet little attention has been given to the long-term impact of the emotional experiences of movement participation. Nevertheless, if emotional achievement is conducive to immediate movement mobilization, no stretch of the imagination is needed to see that such achievement may also produce long-term consequences. We need empirical research to establish this theoretical possibility.

In addition, future research may study the pursuits of particular kinds of self-validating emotions in different social processes and explore the conditions of such pursuits and their meanings for the emotional experiences and identities of the individuals or social groups involved. One specific type of self-validating emotional experience I studied in my recent research is nostalgia (Yang, 2000b). Traditionally, nostalgia has been viewed as a "modern malaise" that alienates people from the present (Lowenthal 1985, p. 13). Fred Davis (1979) rejected this view but continued to admit the relatively passive character of nostalgia—passive in the sense that it is primarily a reactive experience. In my study of the nostalgic experiences of China's Red Guard generation in the 1990s, I found that nostalgia is neither a "malaise" nor a passive emotion. Rather, my analysis of interview data and narratives of nostalgia shows that nostalgia is an emotional experience actively sought, articulated, and shared by members of the Red Guard generation. For these individuals, now typically in their fifties, nostalgia is an emotional achievement that connects them with their past, helps them resist the alienating market forces of the present, and gives continuity, expression, and meaning to personal and collective identities.

The idea of resistance brings me back to a key point I made at the beginning of this article. The point is that the many ways of emotional achievement can best be explored under conditions of resistance, as a means of resistance. Hochschild's emotion management perspective reveals the ways in which social structural forces penetrate and colo-

nize individuals' intimate emotional experiences. A new approach built on the concept of emotional achievement can better show how individuals aspire to and struggle for an emotionally creative life.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This article was first presented at the Conference on Emotions and Social Movements, February 1999, New York University. It was written under the encouragement of the conference organizers—Jeff Goodwin, James Jasper, and Francesca Polletta. A revised version was presented at the Conference on Master Trends in Politics, Culture, and Economy, June 1999, the New School for Social Research. David Franks, Linda Francis, and Dawn Robinson—the 1999 Graduate Student Paper Award Committee of the ASA Section on the Sociology of Emotions—not only honored me with the award but gave me helpful feedback. Tina Fetner, Debbie Gould, Doug Guthrie, Doyle McCarthy, Charles Tilly, Rhys Williams and the TSQ editor, associate editors, and two anonymous reviewers provided valuable written comments. As always, Craig Calhoun shared his enthusiasm and insights. To all, my thanks.

NOTES

1. My concept of the self follows Denzin's (1984, p. 51) definition, which incorporates the psychological views of William James, the sociopsychological views of Mead, and the phenomenological views of Heidegger. Its sociological core, however, is consistent with Mead's and Blumer's notions of the self: the self is an object of reflection and subject of action and it is emergent and mutable in social processes. As Blumer (1969, p. 12) phrases it, the self "means merely that a human being can be an object of his own action . . . he acts toward himself and guides himself in his actions toward others on the basis of the kind of object he is to himself."

2. Hochschild's approach has significantly influenced the empirical analysis of emotions. Most empirical studies have focused on emotional labor at the workplace and reached conclusions similar to Hochschild's. For two recent literature reviews of works on emotional labor, see Tracy and Tracy (1998) and Steinberg and Figart (1999).

3. Jasper's (1997) work on moral protest is an exception. His focus on the *art* of such protest is compatible with an approach oriented to emotions as achievement.

4. As a repertoire of protest, wall posters were associated with the rebellious activities of Red Guards during the Cultural Revolution period. Wall posters were the dominant form of protest in the Tiananmen incident on April 5, 1976, as well as in the democracy wall movement of 1978–1979. After the 1982 Constitution removed articles about the use of wall posters, they became an illegal form of protest action. Thus, in 1989 the large numbers of wall posters on university campuses took on significant symbolic meaning as a form of protest.

5. It should be remembered that in Chinese universities, faculty and staff usually had on-campus housing.

6. On the emotional satisfactions of involvement in public life, see Hirschman's classic study (1982).

REFERENCES

Abbott, Andrew. 1990. "Conceptions of Time and Events in Social Science Methods: Causal and Narrative Approaches." *Historical Methods* 23:140–150.

Anderson, Benedict. 1991. *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism.* Rev. ed. London: Verso.

Averill, James R., and Elma P. Nunley. 1992. *Voyages of the Heart: Living an Emotionally Creative Life.* New York: The Free Press.

Benford, Robert D. 1997. "An Insider's Critique of the Social Movement Framing Perspective." *Sociological Inquiry* 67:409–430.

Blumer, Herbert. 1969. *Symbolic Interaction: Perspectives and Method.* Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall.

Calhoun, Craig. 1991. "The Problem of Identity in Collective Action." Pp. 51–75 in *Macro-Micro Linkages in Sociology,* edited by J. Huber. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.

———. 1994. *Neither Gods nor Emperors: Students and the Struggle for Democracy in China.* Berkeley: University of California Press.

Cohen, Jean L. 1985. "Strategy or Identity: New Theoretical Paradigms and Contemporary Social Movements." *Social Research* 52:663–716.

Collins, Randall. 1990. "Stratification, Emotional Energy, and the Transient Emotions." Pp. 27–57 in *Research Agendas in the Sociology of Emotions,* edited by Kemper.

Davis, Fred. 1979. *Yearning for Yesterday: A Sociology of Nostalgia.* New York: Free Press.

Deng, Fang. 1997. "Information Gaps and Unintended Outcomes of Social Movements: The 1989 Chinese Student Movement." *American Journal of Sociology* 102:1085–1112.

Denzin, Norman K. 1984. *On Understanding Emotion.* San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

———. 1990. "On Understanding Emotion: The Interpretive-Cultural Agenda." Pp. 85–116 in *Research Agendas in the Sociology of Emotions,* edited by Kemper.

Franks, David D., Rebecca J. Erickson, and Beverley Cuthertson-Johnson, eds. 1997. *Social Perspectives on Emotion.* Greenwich, CT: JAI Press.

Goffman, Erving. 1967. *Interaction Ritual.* Garden City, NY: Anchor.

Goodwin, Jeff. 1997. "The Libidinal Constitution of a High-Risk Social Movement: Affectual Ties and Solidarity in the Huk Rebellion, 1946 to 1954." *American Sociological Review* 62:53–69.

Goodwin, Jeff, James M. Jasper, and Francesca Polletta. 2000. "The Return of the Repressed: The Fall and Rise of Emotions in Social Movement Theory." *Mobilization* 5(1):65–84.

Griffin, Larry J. 1993. "Narrative, Event-Structure Analysis, and Causal Interpretation in Historical Sociology." *American Journal of Sociology* 98:1094–1133.

Groves, Julian McAllister. 1995. "Learning to Feel: The Neglected Sociology of Social Movements." *Sociological Review* 43:435–461.

Guthrie, Doug. 1995. "Political Theater and Student Organizations in the 1989 Chinese Movement: A Multivariate Analysis of Tiananmen." *Sociological Forum* 10:419–454.

Han, Minzhu (pseud.), ed. 1990. *Cries for Democracy: Writings and Speeches from the 1989 Chinese Democracy Movement.* Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Hirsch, Eric L. 1990. "Sacrificing for the Cause: Group Processes, Recruitment, and Commitment in a Student Social Movement." *American Sociological Review* 55:243–254.

Hirschman, Albert O. 1982. *Shifting Involvements: Private Interest and Public Action.* Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Hochschild, Arlie Russell. 1979. "Emotion Work, Feeling Rules and Social Structure." *American Journal of Sociology* 85:551–575.

———. 1983. *The Managed Heart: The Commercialization of Human Feeling.* Berkeley: University of California Press.

———. 1990. "Ideology and Emotion Management: A Perspective and Path for Future Research." Pp. 117–142 in *Research Agendas in the Sociology of Emotions,* edited by Kemper.

Holyfield, Lori. 1997. "Generating Excitement: Experienced Emotion in Commercial Leisure." Pp. 257–282 in *Social Perspectives on Emotion,* edited by Franks, Erickson and Cuthbertson-Johnson.

Jasper, James M. 1997. *The Art of Moral Protest: Culture, Biography, and Creativity in Social Movements.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

———. 1998. "The Emotions of Protest: Reactive and Affective Emotions in and around Social Movements." *Sociological Forum* 13:397–424.

Jiang Dong (pseud.). 1997. "Yinhong de liuyue." (Blood-red June: A Diary). Http://www.cnd.org/HXWZ/ZK97/zk124-1.hz8.htm (accessed 10/8/98). Http://www.cnd.org/HXWZ/ZK97/zk124-2.hz8.htm (accessed 10/8/98). Http://www.cnd.org/HXWZ/ZK97/zk124-3.hz8.htm (accessed 10/8/98).

Johnston, Hank, and Bert Klandermans. 1995. "The Cultural Analysis of Social Movements." Pp. 3–24 in *Social Movements and Culture.* Edited by Hank Johnston and Bert Klandermans. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Kemper, Theodore D., ed. 1990a. *Research Agendas in the Sociology of Emotions.* New York: SUNY Press.

———. 1990b. "Social Relations and Emotions: A Structural Approach." Pp. 207–237 in *Research Agendas in the Sociology of Emotions*, edited by Kemper.

Lin, Nan. 1992. *The Struggle for Tiananmen: Anatomy of the 1989 Mass Movement.* Westport, CT: Praeger.

Lowenthal, David. 1985. *The Past Is a Foreign Country.* London: Cambridge University Press.

Lutz, Catherine A. 1988. *Unnatural Emotions: Everyday Sentiments on a Micronesian Atoll and Their Challenge to Western Theory.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Lyng, Stephen. 1990. "Edgework: A Social Psychological Analysis of Voluntary Risk Taking." *American Journal of Sociology* 95:851–886.

McAdam, Doug. 1988. *Freedom Summer.* New York: Oxford University Press.

McAdam, Doug. 1989. "The Biographical Consequences of Activism." *American Sociological Review* 54:744–760.

Melucci, Alberto. 1996. *Challenging Codes: Collective Action in the Information Age.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Ogden, Suzanne, Kethleen Hartford, Lawrence Sullivan, and David Zweig, eds. 1992. *China's Search for Democracy: The Student and the Mass Movement of 1989.* New York: M. E. Sharpe.

Polletta, Francesca. 1998. "'It Was Like a Fever . . .': Narrative and Identity in Collective Action." *Social Problems* 45:137–159.

Rupp, Leila J., and Verta Taylor. 1987. *Survival in the Doldrums: The American Women's Rights Movement, 1945 to the 1960s.* New York: Oxford University Press.

Scheff, Thomas. 1979. *Catharsis in Healing, Ritual, and Drama.* Berkeley: University of California Press.

———. 1994. "Emotions and Identity: A Theory of Ethnic Nationalism." Pp. 277–303 in *Social Theory and the Politics of Identity*, edited by Craig Calhoun. Oxford: Basil Blackwell.

Shen, Tong, with Marianne Yen. 1990. *Almost a Revolution.* New York: Houghton Mifflin.

Smith, Christian. 1996. *Resisting Reagan: The Central America Peace Movement.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Smith, Deborah A., and Rebecca J. Erickson. 1997. "For Love or Money? Work and Emotional Labor in a Social Movement Organization." Pp. 317–346 in *Social Perspectives on Emotion*, edited by Franks, Erickson and Cuthbertson-Johnson.

Stearns, Carol Zisowitz, and Peter Stearns. 1986. *Anger: The Struggle for Emotional Control in America's History.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Steinberg, Ronnie J., and Deborah M. Figart. 1999. "Emotional Labor since *The Managed Heart.*" *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science* 561:8–26.

Swidler, Ann. 1980. "Love and Adulthood in American Culture." Pp. 120–147 in *Themes of Work and Love in Adulthood*, edited by N. J. Smelser and E. H. Erikson. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Taylor, Charles. 1989. *Sources of the Self: The Making of the Modern Identity.* Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Tianhua (pseud.). 1994. "Bajiu xueyun de riri yeye–yiwei Qinghua xuezi de jingli, jianwen" (The days and nights of the 89 student movement, as experienced and seen by a Qinghua University Student). Http://www.cnd.org/HXWZ/ZK94/zk39-1.hz8.htm (accessed 6/2/98). Http://www.cnd.org/HXWZ/ZK94/zk39-2.hz8.htm (accessed 6/2/98). Http://www.cnd.org/HXWZ/ZK94/zk39-3.hz8.htm (accessed 6/2/98). Http://www.cnd.org/HXWZ/ZK94/zk39-4.hz8.htm (accessed 6/2/98).

Tracy, Sarah J., and Karen Tracy. 1998. "Emotion Labor at 911: A Case Study and Theoretical Critique." *Journal of Applied Communication Research* 26:390–411.

Whittier, Nancy. 1995. *Feminist Generations: The Persistence of the Radical Women's Movement.* Philadelphia, PA: Temple University Press.

———. 1997. "Political Generations, Micro-cohorts, and the Transformation of Social Movements." *American Sociological Review* 62:760–778.

Yang, Guobin. 2000a. "The Liminal Effects of Social Movements: Red Guards and the Transformation of Identity." *Sociological Forum* 15(3):379–406.

Yang, Guobin. 2000b. "Emotional Memories: Nostalgia and Identity among China's Red Guard Generation in the 1990s." Paper presented at the annual meeting of the American Sociological Association, Washington, DC.

Yu, Mok Chiu, and J. Frank Harrison, eds. 1990. *Voices from Tiananmen Square: Beijing Spring and the Democracy Movement.* Montreal: Black Rose Books.

Zhao Dingxin. 1998. "Ecologies of Social Movement: Student Mobilization during the 1989 Prodemocracy Movement in Beijing." *American Journal of Sociology* 103:1493–1529.

Zolberg, Aristide R. 1972. "Moments of Madness." *Politics and Society* 3(Winter):183–207.

Zuo Jiping, and Robert D. Benford. 1995. "Mobilization Processes and the 1989 Chinese Democracy Movement." *The Sociological Quarterly* 36:131–156.