N Puzzle A* Search Solver

Implemented Code & Detailed Analysis Documentation

Team: T028

Department: SC

Adnan Ahmad Dalain - 20191700804 - SC Rawan Mostafa Ramadan - 20191700800 - SC Demiana Esam Kamel - 201191700234 - SC

Functions Details & Code Analysis

1) Loading GUI Form: setting Test file names in the Compo_box O(1)

```
private void Form1_Load(object sender, EventArgs e)
           shortest path = new List<game State>();
           GUI puzzle btns = new List<Button>();
           file_path= "99 Puzzle - 1.txt";
           //Sample - Solvable
           puzzle path textBox.Text = file path;
           puzzle_path_textBox.Items.Add("--Sample Tests - Solvable--");
           puzzle path textBox.Items.Add("8 Puzzle (1).txt");
           puzzle_path_textBox.Items.Add("8 Puzzle (2).txt");
           puzzle_path_textBox.Items.Add("8 Puzzle (3).txt");
           puzzle_path_textBox.Items.Add("15 Puzzle - 1.txt");
           puzzle_path_textBox.Items.Add("24 Puzzle 1.txt");
           puzzle path textBox.Items.Add("24 Puzzle 2.txt");
           //Sample - unsolvable
           puzzle_path_textBox.Items.Add("--Sample Tests - Unsolvable--");
           puzzle_path_textBox.Items.Add("8 Puzzle - Case 1.txt");
           puzzle_path_textBox.Items.Add("8 Puzzle(2) - Case 1.txt");
           puzzle path textBox.Items.Add("8 Puzzle(3) - Case 1.txt");
           puzzle_path_textBox.Items.Add("15 Puzzle - Case 2.txt");
           puzzle_path_textBox.Items.Add("15 Puzzle - Case 3.txt");
           //Complete solvable Manhattan & Hamming
           puzzle path textBox.Items.Add("--Complete Tests - Solvable--");
           puzzle path textBox.Items.Add("50 Puzzle.txt");
           puzzle_path_textBox.Items.Add("99 Puzzle - 1.txt");
           puzzle_path_textBox.Items.Add("99 Puzzle - 2.txt");
           puzzle_path_textBox.Items.Add("9999 Puzzle.txt");
           //Complete solvable Manhattan Only
           puzzle_path_textBox.Items.Add("--Complete Tests - Manhattan Only--
                                                                       ");
           puzzle path textBox.Items.Add("15 Puzzle 1.txt");
           puzzle_path_textBox.Items.Add("15 Puzzle 3.txt");
           puzzle_path_textBox.Items.Add("15 Puzzle 4.txt");
           puzzle_path_textBox.Items.Add("15 Puzzle 5.txt");
           //Complete - unsolvable
           puzzle path textBox.Items.Add("--Complete Tests - Unsolvable--");
           puzzle_path_textBox.Items.Add("15 Puzzle 1 - Unsolvable.txt");
           puzzle_path_textBox.Items.Add("99 Puzzle - Unsolvable Case 1.txt");
           puzzle_path_textBox.Items.Add("99 Puzzle - Unsolvable Case 2.txt");
           puzzle_path_textBox.Items.Add("9999 Puzzle - Unsolvable Case.txt");
           //Complete - v Large
           puzzle_path_textBox.Items.Add("--Complete Tests - V.Large--");
           puzzle_path_textBox.Items.Add("TEST.txt");
           groupBox1.Controls.Add(this.Hamming_radio);
           groupBox1.Controls.Add(this.Manhattan_radio);
           Manhattan_radio.Checked = true;
                                                     }
```

2) Game State Class

Data Structure object which holds each state of the puzzle to be used by A* Search Algorithm during the solving process from Initial state to the Goal state

Class Code:

```
class game State
      public game State parent;
       public int[,] game_matrix;
       public int x blank;
       public int y blank;
       public int Heuristic Cost; //Total cost (sum of Hamming & Manhattan)
       public int Expansion Level;
       public int from;
       private int Hamming_priority;
       private int Manhattan_priority;
       private int size;
       //implementation of Swap function
      static void Swap(ref int x, ref int y) O(1)
          int temp = x;
          x = y;
          y = temp;
       }
                                                                                   O(1)
       //Root constructor (without X & Y blank of child)
       public game_State(int size, game_State parent, int[,] game_matrix,
                           int x_blank, int y_blank, int Expansion_order)
       {
          this.from = -1;
          this.size = size;
          this.parent = parent;
          this.game_matrix = game_matrix.Clone() as int[,];
          this.x_blank = x_blank;
          this.y_blank = y_blank;
          this.Expansion_Level = Expansion_order; //Level
          this.Hamming_priority = -1;
          this.Manhattan_priority = -1;
          this.Heuristic_Cost = int.MaxValue;
       }
       //New game states Constructor (to be used during search with new X & Y Blank values)
       public game_State(int size, game_State parent, int[,] game_matrix, int x_blank, int y_blank,
                           int x_blank_child, int y_blank_child, int Expansion_order)
          this.from = -1;
          this.size = size;
          this.parent = parent;
          this.game_matrix = new int[size, size];
          this.Expansion_Level = Expansion_order;
          this.Hamming_priority = -1;
          this.Manhattan_priority = -1;
          this.Heuristic Cost = int.MaxValue;
```

```
//copying Game matrix from parameters to the object variable
                                          O(S)
    for (int i = 0; i < size; i++)</pre>
    {
        for (int j = 0; j < size; j++)</pre>
        {
            this.game_matrix[i, j] = game_matrix[i, j];
        }
    }
    //sliding a value to generate the new state of puzzle
    Swap(ref this.game_matrix[x_blank, y_blank], ref this.game_matrix[x_blank_child,
                                                                      y_blank_child]);
    //Update the indices of blank value in the new game state object
    this.x_blank = x_blank_child;
    this.y_blank = y_blank_child;
}
//calculate and set Total (Heuristic) cost
                                                                                     O(1)
public void set_Heuristic_Cost(int Hamming, int Manhattan, int priority_fn)
{
    this.Hamming_priority = Hamming;
    this.Manhattan_priority = Manhattan;
    if (priority_fn == 1)
        Heuristic_Cost = Hamming + Expansion_Level;
    }
    else
    {
        Heuristic_Cost = Manhattan + Expansion_Level;
    }
}
                                   O(1)
public bool is_solved()
    if (Hamming_priority == 0 || Manhattan_priority == 0)
    {
        return true;
    }
    return false;
}
                                   O(S)
public void display_state()
    for (int i = 0; i < size; i++)</pre>
    {
        Console.Write("[");
        for (int j = 0; j < size; j++)</pre>
        {
            if (j == (size - 1))
                Console.Write(game_matrix[i, j] + " ");
            else
                Console.Write(game_matrix[i, j] + " ,");
        Console.Write("]");
        Console.WriteLine();
    }
}
```

}

}

3) Is Solvable() & Calculate Inversion() $O(S^2)$

(Where "S" is the puzzle size)

We can determined if a puzzle is solvable or not by calculating Inversions and then check if it's odd or even

```
static bool is_solvable(int[,] game_matrix)
            int Count = calc_Inversions(game_matrix);
            if (Matrix_Size % 2 != 0 && Count % 2 == 0)
                return true;
                                                          O(1)
            Else
                int pos = Matrix Size - x blank;
                if (pos % 2 != 0)
                     return Count % 2 == 0;
                    return Count % 2 != 0;
            }
static int calc_Inversions(int[,] game_matrix)
            List<int> one_D_arr = new List<int>();
                                                          O(S)
            for (int i = 0; i < Matrix_Size; i++)</pre>
                for (int j = 0; j < Matrix_Size; j++)</pre>
                    if (game_matrix[i, j] != 0)
                         one_D_arr.Add(game_matrix[i, j]);
                }
            int Count = 0 , list_size = one_D_arr.Count;
            for (int i = 0; i < list_size - 1; i++)</pre>
                for (int j = i + 1; j < list_size; j++)</pre>
                     if (one_D_arr[i] > one_D_arr[j])
                         Count++;
                }
            return Count;
        }
```

4) Calculate Heuristic Cost() O(S)

Calculating Hamming or Manhattan Priority of each Game State to be used in f(n)=h+g as a Heuristic Cost

```
static void calculate_Heuristic_Cost(game_State current_state)
          int Manhattan = int.MaxValue;
           int Wrong Positions = int.MaxValue;
           if (funtion selected == 1)
               Wrong Positions = 0;
               // Hamming
               for (int i = 0; i < Matrix Size; i++)</pre>
                   for (int j = 0; j < Matrix_Size; j++)</pre>
                       if (current_state.game_matrix[i, j] != Goal[i, j] &&
                           current_state.game_matrix[i, j] != 0)
                       {
                           Wrong_Positions++;
                   }
               }
           if(funtion_selected == 2)
               Manhattan = 0;
               //manhattan
               for (int k = 0; k < Matrix_Size; k++)</pre>
                   for (int n = 0; n < Matrix_Size; n++)</pre>
                       if (current_state.game_matrix[k, n] != Goal[k, n] &&
                            current_state.game_matrix[k, n] != 0)
                       {
                            int real_J = (current_state.game_matrix[k, n] - 1) % Matrix_Size;
                            int real_i = (current_state.game_matrix[k, n] - 1) / Matrix_Size;
                           Manhattan += (Math.Abs(real_i - k) + Math.Abs(real_J - n));
                       }
                   }
               }
           }
           current_state.set_Heuristic_Cost(Wrong_Positions, Manhattan, funtion_selected);
       }
```

5) Solve() O(E log(V))

```
(Where "E" is the total # of moves & "V" is states # to Goal)
```

This function makes the actual solving by applying Modified version of A* Search Algorithm with Hamming or Manhattan Priority to Initiate a Graph that simulates the states of games and trying to solve it using Heuristic Cost function to reach the selected Goal State

```
static void solve(int[,] initial_mat, int Matrix_Size, int x_blank, int y_blank)
            PriorityQueue<game State, int> qu = new PriorityQueue<game State, int>();
            game_State initial_State = new game_State(Matrix_Size, null, initial_mat, x_blank,
                                                                        y_blank, 0);
            calculate_Heuristic_Cost(initial_State);
            qu.Enqueue(initial_State, initial_State.Heuristic_Cost);
            // bottom, left, top, right
            int[] move_Directions = { 1, 0, -1, 0, 0, -1, 0, 1 };
            int x_move_safty = 0;
            int y move safty = 0;
                                                                               O(E \log(V))
            while (qu.TryDequeue(out game_State current_Game_state, out int H_cost))
                if (current Game state.is solved())
                    solver_Stopwatch.Stop();
                    printPath(current_Game_state);
                    Console.WriteLine("Number of moves: " + (moves_counter - 1));
                    CreateFile();
                    return;
                for (int i = 0; i < 4; i++)
                {
                    x_move_safty = current_Game_state.x_blank + move_Directions[i];
                    y_move_safty = current_Game_state.y_blank + move_Directions[i + 4];
                    if (x move safty >= 0 && x move safty < Matrix Size && y move safty >= 0 &&
                          y move safty < Matrix Size && current Game state.from != i)</pre>
                    {
                        game_State next_Move = new game_State(Matrix_Size, current_Game_state,
                                              current_Game_state.game_matrix,
                                              current_Game_state.x_blank,
                                              current_Game_state.y_blank, x_move_safty,
                                       y_move_safty, (current_Game_state.Expansion_Level + 1));
                        next\_Move.from = (i + 2) % 4;
                        calculate_Heuristic_Cost(next_Move);
                                                                               O(log(V))
                        qu.Enqueue(next_Move, next_Move.Heuristic_Cost);
                    }
                          }
                                 }
                                       }
```

6) printPath() O(M S)

```
(Where "S" is the puzzle size & M # of S-Path movments)
```

After completing the solving process and reaching Goal state, This function is called to print the shortest path from the initial state to the goal, move by move as a result in the console in case of using "Console Solver" or preparing the path as a list to be displayed in the GUI Form in case of using "GUI Solver"

Also it calculates the # of moves of shortest path

```
static void printPath(game_State goal State)
            if (goal_State == null)
                return;
            //Print the path from root to Goal
            printPath(goal_State.parent);
            Console.WriteLine("Move #" + moves_counter);
            if (is_Console)
            {
                                                O(S)
                goal_State.display_state();
            }
                                                O(1)
            shortest_path.Add(goal_State);
            moves counter++;
            Console.WriteLine();
        }
```

7) CreateFile() O(M S)

```
(Where "S" is the puzzle size & M # of S-Path movments)
```

After printing the shortest path on the screen the result solution & solving time in ms and sec will be stored in a text file as "Solutions\fileName solution.txt"

```
static void CreateFile()
            string solved file path = @"Solutions\"+file path.Remove(file path.Length - 4)
+ " solution.txt";
            try
            {
                FileStream sb = new FileStream(solved_file_path, FileMode.OpenOrCreate);
                using (StreamWriter sr = new StreamWriter(sb))
                    int create counter = 0;
                    foreach (game_State s in shortest_path)
                         sr.WriteLine("Move #" + create_counter);
                                                                      O(S)
                        for (int i = 0; i < Matrix_Size; i++)</pre>
                             for (int j = 0; j < Matrix Size; j++)</pre>
                                 sr.Write(s.game matrix[i, j] + " ");
                             sr.WriteLine();
                        create_counter++;
                         sr.WriteLine();
                    sr.WriteLine("Total number of moves: " + (create_counter - 1));
                    sr.WriteLine("Solving time: " + solver_Stopwatch.ElapsedMilliseconds +
                                                  " + (solver_Stopwatch.ElapsedMilliseconds
                                                                / (float)1000) + " Sec");
                }
            }
            catch
                File.Delete(solved_file_path);
                MessageBox.Show("Error in saving Solution File");
            }
         }
```

8) GUI Solver or Console Solver functions() $O(S^2 + E log(V))$

They share the same purpose but in different way of displaying the results

This function can be considered as the main or entering point to the solver as it's Reading N-Puzzle from text file then find blank block position & Generate The Goal state Puzzle

Then, Check if the puzzle is solvable or not before calling Solve() function to solve the puzzle and Printing moves path & Solving Time In sec & ms

Console Function Code:

```
private void Console_solver_btn_Click(object sender, EventArgs e)
            [DllImport("kernel32.dll", SetLastError = true)]
            [return: MarshalAs(UnmanagedType.Bool)]
            static extern bool AllocConsole();
            is Console = true;
            GUI solver btn.Enabled = false;
            file path = puzzle path textBox.Text;
            try
            {
                FileStream file = new FileStream(file_path, FileMode.Open, FileAccess.Read); O(1)
                                                                      O(1)
                StreamReader s Reader = new StreamReader(file);
                string line;
                if (s_Reader == null) //if its not open
                    throw new Exception("Unable to open file.");
                //Open Console
                AllocConsole();
                //Read First Line to get Matrix Size
                line = s_Reader.ReadLine();
                Matrix_Size = int.Parse(line);
                Console.WriteLine("Matrix size: " + Matrix_Size + "\n");
                //To skip the empty line
                s_Reader.ReadLine();
                //declaring 2D array
                int[,] game_mat = new int[Matrix_Size, Matrix_Size];
                // reading data from text file
```

```
string[] temp row = new string[Matrix Size];
                                           O(S)
for (int i = 0; i < Matrix Size; i++)</pre>
  {
      line = s_Reader.ReadLine();
      temp_row = line.Split(" ");
      for (int j = 0; j < Matrix_Size; j++)</pre>
          game_mat[i, j] = int.Parse(temp_row[j]);
      }
  }
  //Closing file & stream reader
  s_Reader.Close();
  file.Close();
  //Generate Goal matrex
  Goal = new int[Matrix_Size, Matrix_Size];
  int temp_counter = 1;
  for (int i = 0; i < Matrix_Size; i++) O(S)</pre>
  {
      for (int j = 0; j < Matrix_Size; j++)</pre>
          if (i == (Matrix_Size - 1) && j == (Matrix_Size - 1))
               //to set the last value in the matrix (Blank value) = 0
               Goal[i, j] = 0;
              break;
          Goal[i, j] = temp_counter;
          temp_counter++;
      }
  }
  //Finding Blank value index in initial matrix
  bool position_found = false;
  for (int i = 0; i < Matrix_Size; i++) O(S)</pre>
      for (int j = 0; j < Matrix_Size; j++)</pre>
          if (game_mat[i, j] == 0)
          {
              x_blank = i;
              y_blank = j;
              position_found = true;
              break;
          }
      if (position_found)
          break;
  }
                                                          O(1)
  if (Hamming_radio.Checked)
      funtion_selected = 1;
  }
  else
  {
      funtion_selected = 2;
  if (funtion selected == 1)
  {
      Console.WriteLine("Selected Priority function: Hamming");
  }
```

```
else
        {
            Console.WriteLine("Selected Priority function: Manhattan");
        }
        //Time Measure to solve the puzzle using A^* algorithm
        solver_Stopwatch = Stopwatch.StartNew();
        if (is_solvable(game_mat))
        {
            Console.WriteLine("\nSolving Started: \n");
           solve(game_mat, Matrix_Size, x_blank, y_blank); O(E log(V) + M S)
        }
        else
        {
            Console.WriteLine("Puzzle is not solvable");
            return;
        Console.WriteLine("Solving Time is: " + (solver_Stopwatch.ElapsedMilliseconds) + "
            ms / " + (solver_Stopwatch.ElapsedMilliseconds / (float)1000) + " sec");
    }
    catch
    {
        MessageBox.Show("Invalid path, Please try again (.../fileName.txt)");
    }
}
```

The Remaining function is out of scope as they are a part of GUI bones

GUI Form Code:

```
private void GUI solver btn Click(object sender, EventArgs e)
            file path = puzzle path textBox.Text;
            try
            {
                FileStream file = new FileStream(file_path, FileMode.Open, FileAccess.Read); O(1)
                                                                       O(1)
                StreamReader s_Reader = new StreamReader(file);
                string line;
                if (s_Reader == null) //if its not open
                    throw new Exception("Unable to open file.");
                //Read First Line to get Matrix Size
                line = s_Reader.ReadLine();
                Matrix_Size = int.Parse(line);
                Console.WriteLine("Matrix size: " + Matrix_Size + "\n");
                if (Matrix_Size > 10)
                {
                    s Reader.Close();
                    file.Close();
                    MessageBox.Show("Sorry, The Puzzle is too large to display- Please use Console
                                                                                            Solver.");
                    Application.Restart();
                    Environment.Exit(0);
                //To skip the empty line
                s_Reader.ReadLine();
                //declaring 2D array
                int[,] game_mat = new int[Matrix_Size, Matrix_Size];
                // reading data from text file
                string[] temp_row = new string[Matrix_Size];
                for (int i = 0; i < Matrix_Size; i++) O(S)</pre>
                    line = s_Reader.ReadLine();
                    temp_row = line.Split(" ");
                    for (int j = 0; j < Matrix_Size; j++)</pre>
                        game_mat[i, j] = int.Parse(temp_row[j]);
                    }
                }
                //Closing file & stream reader
                s_Reader.Close();
                file.Close();
                //Generate Goal matrex
                Goal = new int[Matrix_Size, Matrix_Size];
                int temp_counter = 1;
                for (int i = 0; i < Matrix_Size; i++) O(S)</pre>
                {
```

```
for (int j = 0; j < Matrix Size; j++)</pre>
        if (i == (Matrix_Size - 1) && j == (Matrix_Size - 1))
        {
            //to set the last value in the matrix (Blank value) = 0
            Goal[i, j] = 0;
            break;
        Goal[i, j] = temp_counter;
        temp_counter++;
    }
}
//Finding Blank value index in initial matrix
bool position_found = false;
for (int i = 0; i < Matrix_Size; i++)</pre>
{
    for (int j = 0; j < Matrix_Size; j++)</pre>
        if (game_mat[i, j] == 0)
        {
            x blank = i;
            y_blank = j;
            position_found = true;
            break;
        }
    if (position_found)
        break;
}
//set puzzle block size (Dynamically)
int button_size = 470 / Matrix_Size;
//selecting Priority function based on user choice
if (Hamming_radio.Checked)
    funtion_selected = 1;
    priority_label.Text = "Hamming priority";
}
else
{
    funtion selected = 2;
    priority_label.Text = "Manhattan priority";
solver Stopwatch = Stopwatch.StartNew();
if (is solvable(game mat))
{
    solve(game_mat, Matrix_Size, x_blank, y_blank);
}
else
{
    MessageBox.Show("This Puzzle is unsolvable");
    Application.Restart();
}
for (int i = 0; i < Matrix_Size; i++) O(S)</pre>
    for (int j = 0; j < Matrix_Size; j++)</pre>
        Create_block(((j * button_size) + 52), ((i * button_size) + 163),
                                                button_size, game_mat[i, j]);
    }
}
```

```
0(1)
```

Create block() Code:

}

This function creates a dynamic # of puzzle blocks base on Puzzle size

```
private void Create_block(int pos_x,int pos_y,int size,int text)
            Button puzzle_Block = new Button();
            GUI_puzzle_btns.Add(puzzle_Block);
            puzzle_Block.Height = size;
            puzzle_Block.Width = size;
            puzzle Block.BackColor = Color.AliceBlue;
            puzzle_Block.ForeColor = Color.Black;
            //puzzle Block.BackColor = Color.Black;
            //puzzle_Block.ForeColor = Color.White;
            puzzle_Block.Location = new Point(pos_x, pos_y);
            if(text!=0)
                puzzle_Block.Text = text.ToString();
            puzzle_Block.Name = "Dynamic_Puzzle_Button"+text;
            puzzle Block.Font = new Font("Georgia", 12);
            // Add Button to the Form. Placement of the Button
            // will be based on the Location and Size of button
            game_panel.Controls.Add(puzzle_Block);
        }
```

Restart btn() Code:

Used in the GUI as a restart Button to solve another N Puzzle

Next Move () Code:

Used in GUI Form to enable the user to trace the movements of solution step by step in a visual way

```
static int num_clicks = 1;
        private void Next_Move_Click(object sender, EventArgs e)
            if (num_clicks < moves_counter)</pre>
                 int counter = 0;
                 for (int i = 0; i < Matrix_Size; i++)</pre>
                     for (int j = 0; j < Matrix_Size; j++)</pre>
                         GUI puzzle btns[counter].Text = shortest path[num clicks].game matrix[i,
                             j] != 0 ? shortest_path[num_clicks].game_matrix[i, j].ToString() : "";
                         game_panel.Controls.Add(GUI_puzzle_btns[counter]);
                         counter++;
                     }
                 moves_num.Text = (num_clicks).ToString();
                 num_clicks++;
            }
            else
            {
                 solved_label.Text = "Puzzle Solved Successfully";
            }
        }
```

Auto solving () Code:

This Button is similar to the previous one but goes from initial state to Goal state step by step in a visual way automatically

```
Timer auto_solver_timer = new Timer();
private void auto_solving_Click(object sender, EventArgs e)
{
    auto_solver_timer.Interval = 250;
    EventHandler ev = new EventHandler(auto_Next_move_Tick);
    auto_solver_timer.Tick += ev;
    auto_solver_timer.Start();
}
private void auto_Next_move_Tick(object sender, EventArgs e)
{
    if (num_clicks == (moves_counter))
    {
        auto_solver_timer.Enabled = false;
    }
    Next_Move.PerformClick();
}
```

Hamming Priority Vs Manhattan Priority

Manhattan Priority

Test File Name	Min number of moves	Execution time
50 Puzzle	18	30 ms / 0.03 sec
99 Puzzle - 1	18	3 ms / 0.003 sec
99 Puzzle - 2	38	3 ms / 0.003 sec
9999 Puzzle	4	201 ms / 0.201 sec

Hamming Priority

Test File Name	Min number of moves	Execution time
50 Puzzle	18	270 ms / 0.27 sec
99 Puzzle - 1	18	3 ms / 0.003 sec
99 Puzzle - 2	38	4 ms / 0.004 sec
9999 Puzzle	4	199 ms / 0.199 sec

As shown in the comparison and another Puzzle test: Manhattan Priority is more powerful and effective than Hamming as it's applicable on almost all solvable N-Puzzle which Hamming priority fails sometimes in solving them.

Solvable Sample & Complete Tests Results

Samples with Hamming Priority

Test File Name	Min number of moves	Execution time
8 Puzzle (1)	8	3 ms / 0.003 sec
8 Puzzle (2)	20	9 ms / 0.009 sec
8 Puzzle (3)	14	3 ms / 0.003 sec
15 Puzzle - 1	5	3 ms / 0.003 sec
24 Puzzle 1	11	3 ms / 0.003 sec
24 Puzzle 2	24	3 ms / 0.003 sec

Complete with Manhattan Priority

Test File Name	Min number of moves	Execution time
50 Puzzle	18	30 ms / 0.03 sec
99 Puzzle - 1	18	3 ms / 0.003 sec
99 Puzzle - 2	38	3 ms / 0.003 sec
9999 Puzzle	4	201 ms / 0.201 sec
15 Puzzle 1	46	3115 ms / 3.115 sec
15 Puzzle 3	38	1100 ms / 1.1 sec
15 Puzzle 4	44	374 ms / 0.374 sec
15 Puzzle 5	45	14458 ms/ 14.458 sec

V Large Test

Test File Name	Min number of moves	Execution time
TEST	56	11291 ms / 11.291 sec