Filomeno V. Aguilar, Jr. Clash of Spirits: The History of Power and Sugar Planter Hegemony on a Visayan Island. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press. 1998. Pp. xiii, 313. Cloth $4...

Article *in* The American Historical Review · October 2000

DOI: 10.1086/ahr/105.4.1279

CITATIONS
0

READS
151

1 author:

Greg Bankoff
University of Hull
87 PUBLICATIONS **1,774** CITATIONS

SEE PROFILE

Identification as survivors is especially controversial in the case of Koreans, with the numbers of killed ranging between 5,000 and 50,000. The complications are many, including the issue of Koreans in Japan and animosity between South and North Korea. Here, as in other aspects, Yoneyama enlarges questions of Hiroshima to the wider issue of what she calls the nationalization of memory, not only for Koreans but for Japan as well where the "Japanization" of the atomic bomb experience has made the Japanese nation a victim. Such appropriation of the past is also seen as a continuing threat, certain official memories causing others to be forgotten.

Until recently, research published in languages other than Japanese on Hiroshima and Nagasaki has largely been positivistic. Yoneyama's research on memory and Hiroshima adds considerably to our understanding of what shapes our perceptions of the atomic age. Both in subject matter and in method, she breaks new ground, relevant also in the larger framework of Hiroshima's importance in a post-Cold-War global perspective.

MONICA BRAW
European Institute of Japanese Studies, Stockholm School of Economics

FILOMENO V. AGUILAR, JR. *Clash of Spirits: The History of Power and Sugar Planter Hegemony on a Visayan Island*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press. 1998. Pp. xiii, 313. Cloth $49.00, paper $28.95.

This book is truly a fabulous tale in all the senses of the word. Here the Filipino past is transformed into an exotic landscape peopled by indigenous spirits, one where chance determines a person's fate, and life is one long colossal gamble whose outcome is largely the result of dare and the agency of one's *dungan* or spirit companion. The world that Filomeno V. Aguilar, Jr., conjures up, however, is one of conflict and opposition between the local and the foreign, the indigenous and the Spanish, two irreconcilable forces at play within the political, social, and belief structures of colonial society. There is apparently no room for syncretism, amalgamation, or appropriation of cultures here but, instead, "two colliding worlds," two realities, two constructions, two powers at war with one another (p. 46).

Aguilar situates himself in what is fast becoming a growing historiographic tradition that eschews a purely economic determination to social formation in Filipino colonial structures. Instead, he sets out to rediscover the "historic role of culture" and how it is inseparable from class structuring and state formation. As such, he is following along the path previously beaten by both Reynaldo Ileto (*Pasyon and Revolution: Popular Movements in the Philippines, 1840–1910* [1979]) and Vincente Rafael (*Contracting Colonialism: Translation and Christian Conversion in Tagalog Society under Early Spanish Rule* [1988]) in writing histories that can be both understood on their own terms and yet still satisfy the standards of Western historiography. But the "clash of spirits" is equally within the inner world of the author's own mind. Aguilar is only too aware of the dilemmas posed by attempting to recover such a vision of the past through the lens of a Western-style education and a profoundly Christian upbringing. He confronts these difficulties by drawing on oral tradition as well as written sources to create folk-historic categories of analysis that weave luck and gambling, spirit and power encounters, social reciprocity and rank, and the idea of capital as evil into an historical narrative (p. 11).

Although the study is primarily about social formation on the Central Philippine sugar island of Negros during the Spanish and American colonial regimes, a period that spans from the mid-nineteenth to the early twentieth centuries, its initial chapters present a reinterpretation of the broad sweep of Philippine history. Aguilar first reconstructs the cosmological perspective and social structure of the preconquest inhabitants and then charts how these were shattered by the processes of colonization. This would be the subject of a very interesting book in its own right, but, in the present study, it serves merely as an introduction to the primary focus of the work. The second and more substantial part of the book begins with a discussion of the establishment of sugar *haciendas* on Negros and the origins and changing relationships between planters and farm workers. Subsequent chapters deal with the rivalry between these sugar hacenderos and native shamans over leadership and the competition between the former and colonial administrators over economic policy. Rather than presenting these struggles as purely political and economic ones, Aguilar, also explains them in terms of strategies of resistance, games of chance, the creation of atavistic charismas, and battles for spiritual supremacy that cast new light on the relative power of social groups in relation to one another and to the state. Colonial relations between colonized and colonizers are shown to be much more complex and far less one-sided than previously described.

Given the contradictions and dilemmas that he recognizes in his own background, ones that imply a hybrid or syncretic perspective, it is surprising that Aguilar denies the same ability to people in the past but persists in portraying their world purely in terms of irreconcilable opposites, the native counterpoised against the foreign, the clash of spirits. Ironically, it is in the very "catholicness" of the author's own viewpoint, one that sees the world only in terms of opposites rather than as characterized by syncretic adaptation and amalgamation, that the greatest unresolved dilemma of a Western legacy is most apparent. In the end, perhaps, Aguilar is himself unselfconsciously striving to create another version of a "usable past," one that identifies a Filipino culture essentially unsullied by external influences and one that persists into the present. There is, of course, nothing amiss with such an aim, but it does tend to depict the external

Other (the colonizing powers) without sufficient nuance, a sort of reversed Orientalism. In particular, Spanish colonialism is depicted as a fixed and unchanging monolith, a degenerate church and a debilitated and virtually irrelevant state (pp. 81, 93, 148).

In the end, does he manage to pull it off? Nearly, but not quite. Maybe it is not really possible to convincingly reconstruct how historical actors perceived their world in the past. But, in attempting the virtually impossible, Aguilar combines innovation and sound scholarship to provide insights into another dimension of the Filipino past and substantially expands the conceptualization of "history from below." On these grounds alone, he deserves to be loudly applauded.

GREG BANKOFF
University of Auckland

NONICA DATTA. *Forming an Identity: A Social History of the Jats*. New York: Oxford University Press. 1999. pp. viii, 228. $26.95.

In late colonial India, diverse clans of agriculturists in southeast Punjab (present-day Haryana) developed their diffuse social and cultural traditions into the strongly self-defined Jat *qaum* (community). The process by which they, and their political and religious leaders, consolidated their syncretic cultures into a unified caste identity up through the 1930s forms the central narrative of Nonica Datta's well-researched book. While substantial parts of her evidence come from British colonial accounts of Jats, she attributes little of this identity construction to the British. Rather, drawing heavily on vernacular literature, supplemented by her interviews with Jat participants, she concentrates on the agency of Jats themselves. Her thoughtful work should cause scholars to reconsider the process of identity formation during the colonial period and will help us better understand subsequent social and political developments in Punjab.

Datta begins with a historical exploration of the variety of diverse and inclusive traditions followed by the social groups in Haryana who would become the Jats. She does not dwell on their movement into the region or their early sedentarization but rather focuses her narrative on the nineteenth century after they had become the dominant "warrior-cultivators and semi-pastoralists" (p. 11) there. Datta classifies their folk cultures into two distinct but overlapping types. *Kachha* traditions contained unorthodox and popular practices that centered on their "sense of common heroic descent" (p. 47) from—often martyred—nomadic warriors. Persistent in their identity was their distinctive practice of *karewa*, where widows or divorced wives cohabited with their brothers-in-law, thus retaining property within that male lineage. "Reformist" traditions stressed "purity, frugality, truthfulness and monotheism" (p. 39); here, women appeared dangerous to male religiosity. Both *kachha* and reformist traditions combined Islamic and Hindu beliefs but simultaneously defined Jats in opposition to Brahmans and other Hindu urban groups, especially merchant money lenders. While British colonial policies for military recruitment based on "martial race" theory enhanced the development of Jat identity, Datta argues that only with the coming of the Arya Samaj reform movement in the 1880s did Jats acquire the "textual sophistication, uniformity, and internal mechanisms for marshalling intellectual resources" (p. 48) into a unified community.

From that point into the early twentieth century, Datta convincingly explains, the Arya Samaj enabled Jat consolidation, but at the cost of distancing themselves from Muslims. Unlike many other scholars, Datta regards the Arya Samaj not as the product of, or reaction to, Western influence on Indian society but rather as an indigenous religious movement evolving from preexisting Jat *kachha* and reformist traditions. Arya Samaj leaders used print culture to produce Jat *qaumi* assertions of their Kshatriya and Arya status and created narratives about putative Jat historical unity.

Datta analyzes Jat political mobilization largely by following the careers of Jat leaders including Chhotu Ram (1881–1945) and Bhagat Phool Singh (1885–1942), both Arya Samajis. Chhotu Ram tried to make himself the "sole spokesman of Jat interests" (p. 93); his Zamindar League political party and his *Jat Gazette* newspaper sought to unite Jats through representing their common agriculturist interests to themselves and to the British colonial government. Datta traces how Chhotu Ram forged political alliances with Muslim leaders, expressed through the Punjab Unionist Party, to counterbalance the high-caste Hindu dominated Indian National Congress. Yet, the developing Jat popular identification of Muslims as "other," embodied in the career and reported martyrdom of Bhagat Phool Singh, ultimately shattered this Unionist political alliance. Datta ends her narrative before the partition of Punjab between the new nations of India and Pakistan in 1947 and long before independent India divided Punjab still further, separating the Jat-dominated state of Haryana from Sikh-dominated East Punjab in 1966.

A major strength of Datta's book is her synthesis of a variety of primary materials, including rarely used vernacular and oral sources, into a study of the formation of Jat identity from the perspective of the Jats themselves. In her introduction, she briefly surveys some variant interpretations of the social and political history of Punjab, but most of her analysis concentrates on her reading of her impressive sources. Comparative developments elsewhere in Punjab (such as Jat conversion to Islam or Sikhism), or in India generally, do not receive much attention. Nevertheless, scholars familiar with existing scholarship about identity formation in Punjab during the colonial period will appreciate how insightfully Datta has used her primary sources to make her distinctive argument. Scholars will