Guidance for Human Evaluators

File format

The attached excel file contains:

- 1. url: you can accessed the news article by clicking the url in the first column. Useful for understanding the key ideas.
- 2. reference: news highlights written by professional editors. They serve as a golden standard for evaluation.
- 3. Outputs of four models, A,B,C,D: sentences extracted as summary by the models. The sentences are separated by "".

Evaluation

- 1. Informative ranking: whether the summary includes key points of the news article.
- 2. Coherence **ranking**: please compare the four outputs, and assign rank 1 to the most **coherent** summary, rank 2 to the second best, rank 3 to the third best and rank 4 to the worst. We especially care about the coherence between adjacent sentences. If two adjacent sentences is unlikely to appear together, they are considered as not coherent. The more non-coherent sentence pairs are, the less coherent the summary is. Coherence is *irrelevant* to length of summary.
 - o Examples:
 - Not coherent, because it looks like there should be another sentence before the first sentence
 - " McGuire , 25 , said . She and Rogers , 34 , own the Breckenridge Cannabis Club , a recreational marijuana dispensary in the historic and scenic ski town of Breckenridge , Colorado . The two said they brought in more than \$47,000 in sales , roughly 30 times their normal daily sales of medical marijuana .
 - Not coherent, because we don't know what "it" refers to. It applies to other pronouns as well.
 - It comes in a yellow labeled bottle with a fire breathing demon on it .It tastes like Big Red chewing gum .It 's Fireball Cinnamon Whisky , and lately it 's been as hot as its name ." Fireball is number one , definitely .On an average night , we probably go through three or four bottles . "Fireball , which did n't exist in its current form a decade ago , is the fastest growing big brand of liquor in America .
 - Coherent, "(CNN)" or other "(XXXX)" like headings indicates this is the first sentence of the news. We can understand who "He" is referring to, and the logic flow is natural.
 - (CNN) James Best , best known for his portrayal of bumbling sheriff Rosco P. Coltrane on TV 's " The Dukes of Hazzard , " died Monday after a brief illness .He was 88 .Best died in hospice in Hickory , North Carolina , of complications from pneumonia , said Steve Latshaw , a longtime friend and Hollywood colleague .
- 3. Overall ranking: rank according to how satisfied you are with the summary.

Notice:

- 1. You could give the same rankings to multiple models. For examples, if model B and C's output are identical, you could give rankings like: A=3, B=1, C=1, D=2. If you believe two outputs have the same quality although they are different, you can also give them the same rankings.
- 2. The sentences are segmented with nltk package, which may not starts or ends properly. "" only serves as a sentence separator, which do not have any semantic meaning.