

Common Cause vs Union Of India . on 29 January, 2020

Bench: Chief Justice, B.R. Gavai, Surya Kant

1

ITEM NO.6

COURT NO.1

SECTION PIL-W

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS

Writ Petition(s)(Civil) No(s). 114/2014

COMMON CAUSE

Petitioner(s)

VERSUS

UNION OF INDIA & ORS.

Respondent(s)

(1. REPORT RECEIVED FROM COMMITTEE COMPRISING HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE G.S. SINGHVI AND HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ANIL R. DAVE
2. IA NO. 179704/2018 AND 54364/2019 (APPLNS. FOR DIRECTIONS AND PERMISSION TO FILE ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS ON B/O S.A. HALIM)
3. IA NO. 62602/2019, 62606/2019, 168557/2019, 168564/2019, 168569/2019, 168578/2019 (APPLNS. FOR DIRECTIONS ON B/O ORISSA MINERAL DEVELOPMENT CO. LTD.)
4. IA NO. 157635/2019 (APPL. FOR DIRECTION ON B/O ODISHA MINING CORPORATION LTD.
5. IA NOS. 131281/2019 AND 131288/2019 (APPLNS. FOR INTERVENTION AND DIRECTIONS ON BEHALF OF SURESH CHANDRA PADHEE)
6. IA NOS. 142745/2019 AND 142758//2019 (APPLNS. FOR INTERVENTION AND DIRECTIONS ON BEHALF OF GAURI SHANKAR CHOUBEY)
7. I.A. NOS. 7117, 7121 & 7829/2020
(APPLN.(S) FOR DIRECTIONS ON BEHALF OF M/S. Essel Mining & Industries LTD.)

Date : 29-01-2020 This matter was called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE THE CHIEF JUSTICE
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE B.R. GAVAI
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE SURYA KANT

Counsel for the parties :

Mr. H.N. Salve, Sr. Adv. (NP)
Ms. Aparajita Singh, Sr. Adv. (NP)
Mr. A.D.N. Rao, Adv. (AC)
Mr. Sidhharth Chowdhary, Adv. (AC)

Mr. Prashant Bhushan, AOR

Signature Not Verified

Mr. Hemanth Pothula, Adv.

Digitally signed by
CHARANJEET KAUR

Mr. Pranav Sachdeva, Adv.

Date: 2020.02.03

16:25:42 IST

Reason:

Mr. A.K. Ganguli, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Gaurav Kejriwal, AOR

Mr. Gaurav Choudhary, Adv.

Mr. Abdul Hamid, Adv.

2

Mr. B. Krishna Prasad, AOR

Mr. Sunil Dogra, Adv.

Mr. vivek Vishnoi, Adv.

Mr. Abhishek Sharma, AOR

Mr. Sunil Kumar Jain, AOR

Mr. Mukul Rohatgi, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Ajay Bhargava, Adv.

Ms. Vanita Bhargava, Adv.

Ms. Shweta Kabra, Adv.

For M/S. Khaitan & Co., AOR

Ms. Ruchi Kohli, AOR

Mr. Shibashish Misra, AOR

Mr. Ramendra Mohan Patnaik, AOR

Mr. E. C. Agrawala, AOR

Mr. Ashok Panigrahi, AOR

Mr. Himinder Lal, AOR

Mrs. Kirti Renu Mishra, AOR

Ms. Apurva Upmanyu, Adv.

Mr. Mukesh Kumar Maroria, AOR

Mr. Ashok Kumar Panda, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Tejaswi Kumar Pradhan, AOR

Mr. Satyabrata Panda, Adv.

Mr. Manoranjan Paikaroy, Adv.

Mr. Aniruddha Purushotham, Adv.

Mr. Rameshwar Prasad Goyal, AOR

M/S. Karanjawala & Co., AOR

Ms. Movita, AOR

Mr. Mukul Kumar, AOR

M/S. Aura & Co., AOR

Mr. Balaji Srinivasan, AOR

Ms. Udit Singh, Adv.

Ms. Shweta Priya, Adv.

Mr. Lakshmi Raman Singh, AOR

3

Mr. Saurabh Ajay Gupta, Adv.

Mr. Prabhat Kumar Rai, Adv.

Mr. Nitesh Bhandri, Adv.

Mr. Vinit Kumar, Adv.

Ms. Shreenu Verma, Adv.

Mr. Naveen Kumar, AOR

Mr. Mukul Rohatgi, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Raj Kumar Mehta, AOR

Ms. Himanshi Andley, Adv.

Mr. ANS Nadkarni, Ld. ASG

Ms. V. Mohana, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Atullesh Kumar, Adv.

Mr. R.R. Rajesh, Adv.

Ms. Chinmayee Chandra, Adv.

Mr. Tarkeshwar Nath, Adv.

Ms. Saudamini Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Mahavir Singh Rawat, Adv.

Mr. Gurmeet Singh Makker, AOR

Mr. Satyabrata Panda, AOR

Ms. Uttara Babbar, AOR

Mr. Sandeep Devashish Das, AOR

Mr. Tushar Mehta, Ld. S.G.

Mr. Shovan Mishra, AOR

Mr. Aditya Mohapatra, Adv.

Ms. Aishwary Surana, Adv.

Mr. Preshit Vilas Surshe, AOR

Mr. Hitendra Nath Rath, AOR

Mr. Shadan Farasat, AOR

Mr. Dhananjaya Mishra, Adv.

4

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following
O R D E R

REPORT RECEIVED FROM COMMITTEE COMPRISING HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE G.S. SINGHVI AND HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ANIL R. DAVE Two issues were raised before this Court, one pertained to mining leases in excess to the statutory limits prescribed by Section 6 of the Mines and Minerals (Development and Regulation) Act, 1957. The other issue was transfer of interest held in mining leases effected contrary to Rule 37 of the Minerals Concession Rules, 1960.

In order to determine certain facts, this Court referred these issues to a Committee comprising Hon'ble Mr. Justice G.S. Singhvi and Hon'ble Mr. Justice Anil R Dave, former Judges of this Court. The Committee has submitted a report recording its opinion about whether particular mining lease-holders have violated the afore- mentioned statutory provisions. We find that some of the facts and conclusions stated by the Committee are in contention before us. In any case, any resultant action against mining lease-holders will depend on whether they appear to have violated the afore-mentioned statutory provisions.

In these circumstances, we consider it expedient to direct that the report be placed before the appropriate State Government for determining whether the facts and conclusions of the Committee disclose the necessity for taking appropriate action in respect of the particular mining lease- holders. It is, however, necessary to give an opportunity to the petitioner(s) who approached this Court to point out if particular mining lease- holder who has been exonerated by the Committee has indeed rendered himself/herself liable for action. Similarly, those found to have breached any of the Statutory provisions would also be entitled to be heard before any action is taken by the State Government on the report of the Committee.

We, accordingly, direct that the report be placed before the appropriate State Government. The State Government may issue notice to such mining lease-holders as may consider it necessary, but in any case such notice shall be issued to the petitioner(s). The State Government is entitled to take such action as it considers appropriate in exercise of powers under any law for the time being in force.

Order accordingly.

IA NO. 157635/2019 (APPL. FOR DIRECTION ON B/O ODISHA MINING CORPORATION LTD.

In view of the uncontroverted facts, the applicant Odisha Mining Corporation is permitted to commence the Mining Operations in the Tiringpahar Iron Ore Mines of OMC Ltd. In 79.30 Ha. Of

Forest land in terms of order dated 16.05.2014 passed by this Court.

IA NO. 157635/2019 is allowed accordingly.

IA NO. 179704/2018 AND 54364/2019 (APPLNS. FOR DIRECTIONS AND PERMISSION TO FILE ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTS ON B/O S.A. HALIM) IA NOS. 131281/2019 AND 131288/2019 (APPLNS. FOR INTERVENTION AND DIRECTIONS ON BEHALF OF SURESH CHANDRA PADHEE) IA NOS. 142745/2019 AND 142758//2019 (APPLNS. FOR INTERVENTION AND DIRECTIONS ON BEHALF OF GAURI SHANKAR CHOUBEY) Issue notice returnable in two weeks.

.....

I.A. NOS. 7117, 7121 & 7829/2020 (APPLN.(S) FOR DIRECTIONS ON BEHALF OF M/S. Essel Mining & Industries LTD.) Issut notice.

Tag with SLP(C) No. 2090/2020.

.....

IA NO. 62602/2019, 62606/2019, 168557/2019, 168564/2019, 168569/2019, 168578/2019 (APPLNS. FOR DIRECTIONS ON B/O ORISSA MINERAL DEVELOPMENT CO. LTD.)

(i) I.A. NOS. 62602/2019, 62606/2019 Learned Solicitor General appearing for the Orissa Minerals Development Company Ltd. States that all payments have been made.

This is confirmed by learned counsel for the State of Odisha.

Subject to clearances being obtained, the applicant(s) may be permitted to resume mining.

Applications stand disposed of.

(ii) I.A.Nos. 168557/2019, 168564/2019, 168569/2019, 168578/2019 List after one week.

[CHARANJEET KAUR] [INDU KUMARI POKHRIYAL] A.R.-CUM-P.S. ASSTT. REGISTRAR