

Ethics Case Study Class 10

25th August, 2024 at 9:00 AM

CASE STUDY 1 (08:05 AM)

Note: Refer to the uploaded handout for more details.

- You are a District Magistrate posted in a backward district of the country. You are responsible for getting an Atal Residential School built on the village land in your district. The contract for the construction of the school has been assigned to a popular local leader's son. This land is presently occupied by tribal communities but they cannot produce any ownership records. They claim that they have resided on the land for generations. They also allege that the administration is pressuring them to vacate their land to build the school and have assured that they will be relocated elsewhere. However, they are hesitant to do so as it will uproot them from their homes and will affect their livelihood. One of the prominent tribal leaders has highlighted this issue and it has caught the attention of the mainstream media.

In the light of the situation, answer the following:

(a) Identify the stakeholders involved in the case and their respective interests.

(b) Discuss the various ethical concerns in the given case.

(c) What are the options available to you and which of these options you will choose? Justify

- **Approach:**

- Briefly introduce the case study.
- Briefly highlight the key stakeholders & their interests associated with the case study.
- Bring out the ethical concerns in this situation.
- Evaluate your options with suitable arguments.
- Conclude appropriately.
- We should try to include the following keywords in the ethics answers:
 - Accountability
 - Transparency
 - Integrity
 - Rule of Law
 - Inclusivity
 - Consensus building
 - Participatory
 - Trust and faith
 - Justice
 - Efficiency or Effectiveness
 - Responsiveness
 - Conflict of Interest
 - Objectivity
 - Rationality
 - Honesty
 - Cooperation
 - Equity
 - Empathy

CASE STUDY 2 (09:32 AM)

- You are posted as the Sub-Divisional Magistrate in a backward district. Recently, a young couple belonging to different castes eloped from the village belonging to your sub-division. They wanted to marry but the caste conflict prevailing in the village was a big hurdle for them. So, they planned to get married secretly and then come back to the village. On account of their elopement, the girl's family, which belongs to the dominant landlord caste, filed a case of kidnapping against the boy and have riled up the villagers against him and his family. After their return to the village, the couple meet you before meeting their family members. On account of your official position, they request you to convince their family members and other members of the village to accept them. The village has witnessed many caste conflicts and honour killings in the past on account of such incidents and the present matter may aggravate caste-related tensions.
- Under these circumstances, answer the following questions:
- (a) Identify the stakeholders and associated issues in the given case.
- (b) What are the options that you have? Highlight your course of action and give suitable justification for the same.
- **Approach**
- Give a brief overview of the case.
- Mention the stakeholders along with associated issues in the given case.
- State the options you have in the scenario and discuss your course of action.
- Conclude on the basis of the above points.

CASE STUDY 3 (09:49 AM)

- You are waiting at a red light of a traffic signal while driving a car. A poor teenage boy, who is looking sick and weak, approaches you and starts begging for money. Looking at his situation, you out of compassion take out your wallet and start looking for some money to give it to him. But suddenly the boy, who was standing very near to you, snatched your wallet and started running. Another man standing next to your car watches this act and catches the boy. He starts beating him badly. Few other people also join him.
- (a) What are the issues involved in this case?
- (b) What course of action will you take and why?
- **Approach**
- Introduce by stating the gist of the given case.
- Discuss the issues involved in the case.
- Suggest a course of action that can be taken in the above situation.
- Conclude by giving a way forward.

CASE STUDY 4(09:56 AM)

- You are working as a District Magistrate in an aspirational district where women literacy and sex ratio is one of the lowest in the country. It is brought to your notice that a woman who has been elected as 'Sarpanch' on a seat reserved for women candidates in a panchayat in your district is head 'only on the paper'. All the work related to the panchayat is actually carried out by her husband. Even the flag hoisting ceremony on Independence Day is carried out by her husband. However, her husband happens to be a good administrator as indicated by that panchayat's performance on various developmental parameters as compared to other panchayats in the district. Also, her husband enjoys the support of the local people. Given the situation, answer the following:
 - (a) Identify the stakeholders and issues involved in this case.
 - (b) What options are available to you as the District Magistrate in such a scenario? Also, evaluate each option and indicate what option will you choose.

- **Approach**

- Give a brief description of the case study.
- Write about stakeholders such as Sarpanch, Husband, Villagers etc involved in the case and various issues that need to be considered in this case.
- Write some options that can be taken in such a scenario with the pros and cons of each option.
- Indicate which option you will choose.

CASE STUDY 5 (10:13 AM)

- In your personal life, you are a religious person and strongly believe in the preservation of socio-cultural beliefs. Your recent posting as an IPS officer has brought you to a district with a widely revered shrine. Shortly after you take charge, you find considerable tension building up in the district on the question of women's entry into the shrine. Against this backdrop, the Supreme Court has ruled in favour of women being allowed to enter the shrine.
You are aware that there is considerable resentment against the decision. Additionally, several political parties, religious bodies and groups have launched a campaign to defend the tradition. In a few weeks the traditional annual pilgrimage to the shrine is going to commence. You suspect that if the situation is not diffused it might lead to law and order problems.

(a) What are the key issues at stake here?

(b) Do you see any dilemmas in the unfolding situation?

(c) In this context, what steps would you take to discharge your duties?

- **Approach**

- Briefly highlight the key stakeholders involved in the case study.
- Discuss the key issues involved in the case study.
- Discuss the ethical dilemmas involved in the case study.
- Discuss the steps which you would take to discharge your duties.

CASE STUDY 6(10:27 AM)

- You are appointed as the principal of a school, which is located in a backward district. A colleague brings to your attention that a group of boys indulge in smoking during school hours within the vicinity of the school. The same group has also repeatedly been caught consuming alcohol in the school premises. No form of punishment seems to be effective while dealing with this particular group. Upon investigation, you find that the boys belong to low-income families and have picked up the habits from elders at home and neighbours. The teachers are concerned about the effect it will have on other students. You also realise that this problem has to be addressed as quickly as possible.

- In this context, answer the following questions:

(a) Identify the factors that make young people take up such harmful habits. What is the role of educational institutions in inculcating right habits among the students?

(b) How would you address the immediate issue? Analyse the options available to you in this regard.

(c) How will you bring about a behavioural change among students in this case?

- **Approach**

- State the factors that make young people take up harmful habits
- Mention the role of educational institutions in inculcating the right habits among students:
- Discuss how you would address the immediate issue as a principal and assess the options
- Discuss ways to bring about a behavioural change among students in this case

CASE STUDY 7(10:44 AM)

- You are the District Magistrate in a district where a significant number of transgenders reside. While discrimination against the community is well known, commuters increasingly complain of harassment at their hands, especially at traffic junctions where transgenders are mostly involved in begging. This, at times, also leads to traffic management issues. You have received a number of complaints in this regard and have to act quickly to resolve it. However, a group of transgender associations argue that begging is their only source of livelihood.

Given the situation, answer the following questions:

- (a) Describe the ethical issues involved in this case. Discuss the attitude of people towards transgenders in general and the reasons for the same.
- (b) What possible courses of action can be undertaken in such situations? Discuss their merits and demerits.

- **Approach**

- Discuss the ethical issues involved and the reasons for the differential attitude of people towards transgenders.
- Discuss possible course of action with merits and demerits. You may conclude by suggesting a long-term solution/elaborating on your solution.

CASESTUDY8 (11:10 am)

- Recently you were posted as a District Magistrate of a predominantly agricultural district, which has been one of the best performers in agriculture since the last decade. In one of your field visits, you find that the large landowners, who are a socially, politically and economically powerful group, employ domestic help and agriculture labourers who are informally tied to them and have been working there for generations. In return, these workers are provided basic amenities like food and shelter apart from some money. However, you do sense a violation of basic human rights in this situation.

In light of the above case, answer the following questions:

- (a) Identify the stakeholders, their interests and ethical issues involved in the case.
- (b) How does denial of choice amount to a violation of human rights?
- (c) What course of action would you take? Give reasons.

- **Approach**

- Briefly highlight the key stakeholders, their interests and ethical issues associated with the case study.
- Discuss how denial of choice violates basic human rights.
- List the ethical dilemma and course of action.

CASESTUDY9 (11:30 am)

- You are the Managing Director of a multinational company that prides itself on hiring people from diverse backgrounds. The company also chooses multiple projects under Corporate Social Responsibility that are geared towards social inclusion and empowerment of vulnerable sections of society. Miss 'X' who works in your office tells you that she has been diagnosed with HIV. It happened due to malpractice by a medical practitioner who re-used a contaminated syringe that led Miss 'X' to contract the disease. The company has strict policies about tolerance and you ensure Miss 'X' that she can continue with her job in the company without facing any form of discrimination. A few days after the revelation, Miss 'X' angrily submits her resignation letter. She states that she has faced discrimination at the workplace every day after the revelation. Her colleagues are hesitant to eat lunch with her, they make sure they do not drink water from the same source and the females in the office comment on her marital status. She is also asked to sit separately during departmental discussions. She intends to sue the company for mental harassment. If she takes the step, the public image of the company will be maligned and its non-discriminatory policies will be questioned. The following are some suggested options for you to deal with the situation as a Managing Director of the company. Evaluate the merits and demerits of each of the options:
 - (a) You accept her resignation and suggest a compensation package so that she refrains from suing the company.
 - (b) You persuade her not to submit her resignation and transfer her to another department.
 - (c) You ask her to continue with her job and take strict action against the colleagues who discriminated against herAlso, state (without necessarily restricting to the above options) your course of action, giving proper reasons.

- **Approach**
- Introduction: The case involves addressing workplace discrimination against an HIV-positive employee, Miss X, while ensuring a supportive and non-discriminatory environment.
- Assess the given options and state their merits and demerits, with reasons.
- State your preferred course of action in the situation. Substantiate it with reasons.

THE SYLLABUS OF THE ETHICS CASE STUDY IS COMPLETED.