

You are kindly requested to fill in the following form. The form consists of 26 scenarios and 1 closed-ended survey question following each scenario. In each scenario, an utterance of a demonstrative sentence is made; that is, a sentence containing the demonstrative determiner/pronoun “this” or “that”. The demonstrative expression is marked in red. Your task is to apply the following concept of *possible discrepancy* [+d] to answer the question about the nature of the scenarios.

- *Possible discrepancy* [+d] *between actual demonstration and intended referent*: a scenario is of type [+d] if more than one reading of the demonstrative sentence is possible on its basis; i.e., if on one reading, the demonstrative sentence is about the individual (person or object) that is the target of the actual demonstration while, on the other reading, it can be about some other individual—the person or object the speaker has or had in mind (i.e., the intended referent).
- *No discrepancy* [-d] *between actual demonstration and intended referent*: a scenario is of type [-d] if only one reading of the demonstrative sentence is possible on its basis; i.e., if the demonstrative sentence is about the individual that is the target of the actual demonstration.

Please, check the relevant boxes to answer the questions. Use the “Comments” section after each scenario to leave feedback on the given scenario.

Scenario 1

Suppose that I suddenly realize that I have left my keys on the desk in my (shared) office. I return to my office, where I find the desk occupied by my officemate. I then spot my keys, sitting there on the desk, alongside my officemate's keys. I then make a grab for my keys, saying just as I mistakenly grab my officemate's keys:

“**These** are mine”.

Is this a *no discrepancy* [-*d*] or *possible discrepancy* [+*d*] type of scenario in your opinion?

no discrepancy [-*d*]

☐

possible discrepancy [+*d*]

☐

Comments:

Scenario 2

Someone utters the sentence in a dialect of Nebraska:

“**That** fish was yea big”

which differs from English as a global language only in that the Nebraska dialect contains the expression “yea”, which conventionally refers to the distance between the hands of the speaker. While uttering the expression, the speaker is making a suitable gesture.

Is this a *no discrepancy* [-d] or *possible discrepancy* [+d] type of scenario in your opinion?

no discrepancy [-d]

☐

possible discrepancy [+d]

☐

Comments:

Scenario 3

You are a salesman in a tie store. By reaching past an opaque door into a display case, you put your hand on a blue silk tie. At the same time, another salesman is reaching through the cabinet and touching a red silk tie. Through the glass top of the cabinet, you can see the red tie being held by the other salesman, whose arm looks like yours. You mistake his hand for yours and you believe that you are the one touching the red tie. You say to a customer, who was looking in another direction for a red silk tie

“**This** one is red”.

Is this a *no discrepancy* [-*d*] or *possible discrepancy* [+*d*] type of scenario in your opinion?

no discrepancy [-*d*]

☐

possible discrepancy [+*d*]

☐

Comments:

Scenario 4

Emma is looking through a transparent medium that alters the path of light in such a way that the real position of objects seen through it is three feet to the right of their apparent position. Emma knows the medium to have this property. She wishes to refer to a penny which she does not perceive but which she knows to be in a certain place, just the place in fact at which a penny she does perceive appears illusorily to be. To fulfill her intention she points to just the place where the second penny appears to be, but is not, and says:

“**That** penny will appear to be three feet to the left of where it really is”.

Is this a *no discrepancy* [-*d*] or *possible discrepancy* [+*d*] type of scenario in your opinion?

no discrepancy [-*d*]



possible discrepancy [+*d*]



Comments:

Scenario 5

Suppose that Harry and Sally are at a department store and Harry is trying on ties. Harry has wrapped a garish pink-and-green tie around his neck and is looking at himself in a mirror. Sally is standing next to the mirror gazing toward the tie around Harry's neck and says:

“**That** matches your new jacket”.

As a matter of fact, Sally has been contemplating in thought the tie that Harry tried on two ties back. At first, she thought she did not like it, but then it occurred to her that it would look good with Harry's new jacket. We can even suppose that in saying “that” what she intended to refer to was the tie two ties back. But under the circumstances, Harry is in no position to realize that the tie she intended to refer to was the tie two ties back.

Is this a *no discrepancy* [-*d*] or *possible discrepancy* [+*d*] type of scenario in your opinion?

no discrepancy [-*d*]

☐

possible discrepancy [+*d*]

☐

Comments:

Scenario 6

One day when Father Butler was hearing the four pages of Roman History clumsy Leo Dillon was discovered with a copy of *The Halfpenny Marvel*.

“Now Dillon, up! What have you there in your pocket?”, Father Butler said.

Everyone’s heart palpitated as Leo Dillon handed up the paper and everyone assumed an innocent face. Father Butler turned over the pages, frowning.

“Is this what you read instead of studying your Roman History?” he said. “*The Apache Chief!* **This** is rubbish!”

Is this a *no discrepancy* [-d] or *possible discrepancy* [+d] type of scenario in your opinion?

no discrepancy [-d]

☐

possible discrepancy [+d]

☐

Comments:

Scenario 7

Suppose that without turning and looking David points to the place on his wall which has long been occupied by a picture of Rudolf Carnap, a famous philosopher, and he says:

“**That** is a picture of one of the greatest philosophers of the twentieth century”.

But unbeknownst to David, someone has replaced his picture of Carnap with one of Elvis Presley, a famous singer but not a philosopher at all.

Is this a *no discrepancy* [-*d*] or *possible discrepancy* [+*d*] type of scenario in your opinion?

no discrepancy [-*d*]

☐

possible discrepancy [+*d*]

☐

Comments:

Scenario 8

Theory learning thus presents children with a difficult joint inference task—a “chicken-and-egg” problem—of discovering two kinds of new knowledge, new concepts, and new laws, which can only be made sense of in terms of each other. The laws are defined over the concepts, but the concepts only get their meaning from the roles they play in the laws. If learners do not begin with either the appropriate concepts or the appropriate laws, how can they end up acquiring both successfully?

This is also essentially the challenge that philosophers have long studied of grounding meaning in the *conceptual role* or *inferential role* semantics.

Is this a *no discrepancy* [-*d*] or *possible discrepancy* [+*d*] type of scenario in your opinion?

no discrepancy [-*d*]

☐

possible discrepancy [+*d*]

☐

Comments:

Scenario 9

My horse *Doorlatch* is in a race. As the horses thunder past for the finish, *Doorlatch* in the lead, I point and say:

“**That** is my horse”!

Unfortunately, in my excitement, I have closed my eyes for an instant and my gesture has not quite kept track of the field. So, as I utter the sentence, my finger actually points to the leading contender, *Two-fingered Salute*.

Is this a *no discrepancy* [-d] or *possible discrepancy* [+d] type of scenario in your opinion?

no discrepancy [-d]

☐

possible discrepancy [+d]

☐

Comments:

Scenario 10

From the other end of the square was coming a tall Arab, thin, vigorous, wearing a sky-blue burnoose, soft brown boots and gloves, and bearing his bronzed aquiline face loftily. Nothing but the *cheche* that he was wearing swathed as a turban distinguished him from those French officers in charge of native affairs whom Janine had occasionally admired. He was advancing steadily toward them, but seemed to be looking beyond their group as he slowly removed the glove from one hand.

“Well”—said Marcel as he shrugged his shoulders—“there’s one who thinks he’s a general. Yes, they all here look proud; but **this** one, really, is going too far”.

Although they were surrounded by the empty space of the square, he was walking straight toward the trunk without seeing it, without seeing them. Then the distance separating them decreased rapidly and the Arab was upon them.

Is this a *no discrepancy* [-*d*] or *possible discrepancy* [+*d*] type of scenario in your opinion?

no discrepancy [-*d*]

☐

possible discrepancy [+*d*]

☐

Comments:

Scenario 11

Suppose that I win a contest, and, to select the prize, I am blindfolded, walked into a warehouse that I had never been in before, and about whose contents I know nothing. I am told to point in some direction or other. In order to get a prize, I must say

“Let **that** be my prize”.

Suppose that I manage to point at a car.

Is this a *no discrepancy* [-*d*] or *possible discrepancy* [+*d*] type of scenario in your opinion?

no discrepancy [-*d*]

☐

possible discrepancy [+*d*]

☐

Comments:

Scenario 12

You and I hear a painfully loud noise. I know that you must hear it, and you know that I must hear it, and so forth. Hence, I can say:

“I wish **that** would stop”

without making any sort of gesture (pointing, nodding, glancing, etc.).

Is this a *no discrepancy* [-*d*] or *possible discrepancy* [+*d*] type of scenario in your opinion?

no discrepancy [-*d*]

☐

possible discrepancy [+*d*]

☐

Comments:

Scenario 13

Noah is a factory inspector certifying cars as roadworthy as they come off an assembly line. His job is to say, as successive cars pass by,

“**That** car is certified as roadworthy”.

Normally, he looks at each car and utters his incantation while gesturing in the appropriate direction; but on this occasion he absentmindedly looks away as a new car arrives before him, while uttering his usual sentence accompanied by his usual gesture.

Is this a *no discrepancy* [-*d*] or *possible discrepancy* [+*d*] type of scenario in your opinion?

no discrepancy [-*d*]

☐

possible discrepancy [+*d*]

☐

Comments:

Scenario 14

A dog named Spot has been making himself especially noticeable by barking raucously and dashing in front of Jane and Peter. But Jane hasn't noticed any of this and her attention has been caught by another dog—a dog way off in the distance—who seems to resemble remarkably her own dog Fido. Jane comes out with an utterance accompanied by a pointing gesture in a general direction in front of her:

“**That** dog looks just like Fido”.

It would be natural to suppose that Jane believes—mistakenly—that Fido is also the focus of Peter's attention. However, the most noticeable dog appears to be Spot.

Is this a *no discrepancy* [-*d*] or *possible discrepancy* [+*d*] type of scenario in your opinion?

no discrepancy [-*d*]

☐

possible discrepancy [+*d*]

☐

Comments:

Scenario 15

Greg has just gotten back a math test on which he scored very poorly. Greg knows on completely general grounds that exactly one male received a score of one hundred on the exam—Greg’s evil but scrupulously honest teaching assistant told Greg this as he tossed Greg his failing effort. Reflecting on the difficulty of the exam, Greg says:

“**That** guy who scored one hundred on the exam is a genius”.

Is this a *no discrepancy* [-*d*] or *possible discrepancy* [+*d*] type of scenario in your opinion?

no discrepancy [-*d*]

☐

possible discrepancy [+*d*]

☐

Comments:

Scenario 16

Somewhere in the monastery at Podolin there is, or was, an old painting, showing a shaggy-haired figure with a wild upcurled mustache; a thick beard, red as a woman's hair; two big round eyes with elongated pale blue pupils; and a complexion as ruddy as the color on a white tablecloth when light passes through a full wine glass on a sunny winter noon.

“**This** man was Prince Lubomirski”, said Sindbad looking at the painting.

The time is uncertain but the place is precise and the view is clear.

Is this a *no discrepancy* [-d] or *possible discrepancy* [+d] type of scenario in your opinion?

no discrepancy [-d]

☐

possible discrepancy [+d]

☐

Comments:

Scenario 17

Suppose that two dogs—Fido and Spot—are dashing about. In response to a query of “Which dog is Fido?”, the speaker comes out with an utterance of

“**This** dog is Fido”.

As the speaker utters this, he opens his arms to embrace Fido. But Fido, we may suppose, suddenly zooms off in the opposite direction. And into the arms of the speaker rushes Spot—just as the speaker comes out with his utterance.

Is this a *no discrepancy* [-*d*] or *possible discrepancy* [+*d*] type of scenario in your opinion?

no discrepancy [-*d*]

☐

possible discrepancy [+*d*]

☐

Comments:

Scenario 18

Suppose that you and I are in the park, observing the antics of several neighborhood dogs, one of whom I recognize as my dog Fido. Suppose further, that I wish to inform you of the fact that Fido is among this canine group, and that I thus say to you

“**That** dog is Fido”,

but fail to accompany my utterance with any sort of gesture (pointing, nodding, glancing, etc.), due to some sort of sudden, momentary, paralysis. Suppose that, though my intention was to point at Fido, I suddenly found myself (in the midst of my utterance) unable to do so. Suppose further that I was unable to demonstrate Fido via any sort of glance or stare in his direction, as my eyes, frozen in their sockets, had shifted from Fido to my addressee, and could not (due to the paralysis) be shifted back to Fido.

Is this a *no discrepancy* [-*d*] or *possible discrepancy* [+*d*] type of scenario in your opinion?

no discrepancy [-*d*]

☐

possible discrepancy [+*d*]

☐

Comments:

Scenario 19

Julia is teaching a class on ontology. She is presenting her own view that objects made up of natural materials are more than mere collections of atoms. She is agnostic about objects made up of artificial materials, and, unless pressed, she prefers not to discuss them. She starts the class by announcing that she will defend the view that some medium-size objects are more than mere collections of atoms. To her right, among the clearly visible objects are a wooden chair, the only natural-material object in the room, and many other chairs, all obviously made of plastic. Vaguely pointing to her right, and giving little thought to the membership of her audience, she says

“**That** is more than the sum of its atoms”.

Is this a *no discrepancy* [-*d*] or *possible discrepancy* [+*d*] type of scenario in your opinion?

no discrepancy [-*d*]

☐

possible discrepancy [+*d*]

☐

Comments:

Scenario 20

The people in Salzburg have always been dreadful, like their climate, and when I entered the town today not only was my judgment confirmed, everything was even more dreadful. And I thought to myself:

“To study with Horowitz precisely in **this** town, the sworn enemy of culture and art, was surely the greatest advantage”.

And I continued: “We study better in hostile surroundings than in hospitable ones, a student is always well advised to choose a hostile place of study rather than a hospitable one, for the hospitable place will rob him of the better part of his concentration”.

Is this a *no discrepancy* [-d] or *possible discrepancy* [+d] type of scenario in your opinion?

no discrepancy [-d]

☐

possible discrepancy [+d]

☐

Comments:

Scenario 21

I am sitting on Venice beach on a crowded holiday looking south, with swarms of people in sight. I fix my attention on a woman in the distance, and, intending to talk about her and gesturing vaguely to the south, say

“**That** woman is athletic”.

Is this a *no discrepancy* [-*d*] or *possible discrepancy* [+*d*] type of scenario in your opinion?

no discrepancy [-*d*]

☐

possible discrepancy [+*d*]

☐

Comments:

Scenario 22

Stephen bent forward and peered at the mirror held out to him, cleft by a crooked crack.

“Who chose this face for me?”—he wondered—“**This** dogsbody to rid of vermin. It asks me too”.

Is this a *no discrepancy* [-*d*] or *possible discrepancy* [+*d*] type of scenario in your opinion?

no discrepancy [-*d*]

☐

possible discrepancy [+*d*]

☐

Comments:

Scenario 23

Someone says:

“**This** is my favorite color”,

indicating a red object (lighting is normal, etc.). At the same time, imagine that the addressee (but not the speaker) of the statement does not distinguish between any colors except black and white: the addressee suffers from achromatopsia—total color blindness.

Is this a *no discrepancy* [-*d*] or *possible discrepancy* [+*d*] type of scenario in your opinion?

no discrepancy [-*d*]

☐

possible discrepancy [+*d*]

☐

Comments:

Scenario 24

James and Mary are at a party. At one point, Mary points at a man standing in the corner and says to James:

“**That** man is a spy”.

Only one man is standing in the corner.

Is this a *no discrepancy* [-*d*] or *possible discrepancy* [+*d*] type of scenario in your opinion?

no discrepancy [-*d*]

☐

possible discrepancy [+*d*]

☐

Comments:

Scenario 25

There are many people at a party of abstainers. Everyone toasts with mineral water. Without knowing it and thinking that there is martini in the glasses, Oliver points to the person sitting at the piano, who has just finished the concert, and says:

“**This** martini drinker is a good pianist”.

In fact, one person at the party has secretly brought a martini with them and is now drinking it.

Is this a *no discrepancy* [-*d*] or *possible discrepancy* [+*d*] type of scenario in your opinion?

no discrepancy [-*d*]

☐

possible discrepancy [+*d*]

☐

Comments:

Scenario 26

Suppose I believe that George W. Bush is the greatest president in US history, and I wish to express this belief by saying

“**This** is the greatest president in US history”

in a situation in which you and I have just turned on the television late at night, and a very Dubbya-looking fellow has appeared on our screen, making very Dubbya-like expressions and gestures. But it isn't really George W. Bush; it is the George W. Bush mimic that appears every so often on Jay Leno's Tonight Show.

Is this a *no discrepancy* [-*d*] or *possible discrepancy* [+*d*] type of scenario in your opinion?

no discrepancy [-*d*]

☐

possible discrepancy [+*d*]

☐

Comments: