

ON THE USE OF ENGLISH DEMONSTRATIVE “THAT” (PARTITIONING)

[The online survey tool used in this study can be accessed here: <http://kognilab.pl/ls3/index.php/776326?newtest=Y&lang=en>]

You are being invited to take part in a research study. This study consists of 3 scenarios and 3 closed-ended survey questions following the scenarios about the use of the English demonstrative expression “that”. The study should take approximately 5 minutes to complete.

Before beginning the study, however, please read the following Information and Consent Form.

If you agree to participate, please give us your consent (by checking the box below) and click “Next” to begin.

Subject Information and Consent Form

Introduction

You are being invited to take part in a research study. This research will study how native English speakers use the demonstrative expression “that” and how they judge the influential thought experiment discussed in the philosophical literature concerned with the semantics of demonstratives. It is **your choice** if you want to participate in this study or not. **You can withdraw from the study at any time.** By participating in this study, you are agreeing to provide the most honest answers you can. Any responses you provide will be **anonymized** so that neither the researcher nor anyone who might be helping the researcher to analyze and compile the results will know which responses are yours. The (anonymized) research data collected in this study will be **available under the terms of a free license** and will serve as a basis for reviewed publications in the field of semantics. This study has not been designed to commercialize the results or the collected data.

What Is the Purpose of This Study?

The main reason for conducting this study is to help answer the following research questions: what are the key elements that need to be considered when developing a cognitively plausible semantics of the English determiner/pronoun “that” and what cognitive factors are involved in judging the thought experiments presented in the study? The study is designed to monitor changes that might occur when the target of demonstrative “that” is presented as valuable/valueless in the given context.

Who Can Take Part in This Study?

To take part in this study you must be a native English speaker. You should not take part in this study if you do not meet all of the following requirements.

You **cannot** participate in this study if:

- You are younger than 18 or you are older than 35
- You are not a native speaker of English
- You have language-related disorders, such as dyslexia (problems with reading or spelling words) or aphasia (problems with comprehending or formulating language)

- You are viewing this study on a mobile device with a screen smaller than 11 inches—it is recommended that you open this study on your personal computer (laptop or desktop) with a screen greater than or equal to 11 inches

I agree to participate in the research study.

Prolific ID

Please, use the form and provide your unique Prolific ID.

Gender

What is your gender?

- Male
- Female
- Other
- No answer

Age

How old are you?

Years of Superior Education

How many years have you been studying to earn a higher education degree (bachelor's, master's or doctoral degree) in total? The question is about the highest degree you have earned.

Intro

In what follows, you will see a scenario in which David (the protagonist of the scenario) utters a sentence containing the English demonstrative expression “**that**”. The demonstrative expression is **marked in red**. Please, read the scenario carefully for at least 30 seconds (at least 30 seconds must pass before you are able to proceed) and click “Next” to proceed. Follow the instructions on-screen to complete the survey.

On the last screen, you will receive a unique Completion Code to prove you completed the study.

Primed condition

Initial scenario

Suppose that, without turning and looking, David points to the place on his wall which has long been occupied by a picture of Rudolf Carnap, a famous philosopher, and he says:

“**That** is a picture of one of the greatest philosophers of the twentieth century”.

But unbeknownst to David, someone has replaced his picture of Carnap with one of Elvis Presley, a famous singer but not a philosopher at all.

Question following the initial scenario

When David uses the expression “**That**”, is he talking about:

- (A) The picture of Rudolf Carnap?
- (B) The picture of Elvis Presley?

Training 1/3: if the participant answers (A)

Some people share your opinion. You can find an explanation that these people offer below.

Some people believe, just as you do, that David is talking about the picture of Rudolf Carnap when he uses the expression “**That**”. These people offer the following explanation: David meant to say something about the picture of Rudolf Carnap because Rudolf Carnap, and not Elvis Presley, is a famous philosopher. Some of these people would then ask you to consider the following scenario in which, according to them, David probably would never mean anything other than the picture of Rudolf Carnap.

Training 2/3: if the participant answers (A)

Suppose that, without turning and looking, David points to the place on his wall which has long been occupied by a picture of Rudolf Carnap, a famous philosopher, and he says:

“**That** is a picture of one of the greatest philosophers of the twentieth century, and now it is yours—it is your birthday present”.

But unbeknownst to David, someone has replaced his picture of Carnap with a cheap and nasty picture of you that has been photoshopped to show you in a patently offensive way. You have never seen anything that would look so offensive hanging on someone’s wall. Indeed, no one has such pictures in their homes in the town where David lives. The picture is so offensive that you can’t help but wonder why anyone would produce such an image in the first place.

Training 3/3: if the participant answers (A)

Do you agree with people who say that the above is a reason why David is nevertheless talking about the picture of Carnap when he uses “**That**”?

- Yes
- No

If the participant answers the last question with “No”

Sorry, your response was incorrect. We need you to understand that this is a reason why David is nevertheless talking about the picture of Carnap when he uses “**That**”!

Please, try again.

Training 1/3: if the participant answers (B)

Some people share your opinion. You can find an explanation that these people offer below.

Some people believe, just as you do, that David is talking about the picture of Elvis Presley when he uses the expression “**That**”. These people offer the following explanation: David said something about

the picture of Elvis Presley because his picture, and not the picture of Rudolf Carnap, is the picture at which he pointed at in practice. Some of these people would then ask you to consider the following scenario in which, according to them, you would have a very good reason to think that David is doing you a great favor.

Training 2/3: if the participant answers (B)

Suppose that, without turning and looking, David points to the place on his wall which has long been occupied by a picture of Rudolf Carnap, a famous philosopher, and he says:

“**That** is a picture of one of the greatest philosophers of the twentieth century, and now it is yours—it is your birthday present”.

But unbeknownst to David, someone has replaced his picture of Carnap with a valuable portrait of Marquis de Lafayette, a French aristocrat, a general in the American Revolutionary War, and a dignified figure but not a philosopher at all. You have seen paintings that look so valuable hanging on people’s walls. Indeed, many people have such paintings in their homes in the town where David lives. Lafayette is an important figure in the history of the town—wounded during a battle near the town, he still managed to organize a successful retreat saving many lives—and many people in the town display his portrait to this day.

Training 3/3: if the participant answers (B)

Do you agree with people who say that the above is a reason why David is nevertheless talking about the portrait of Marquis de Lafayette when he uses “**That**”?

- Yes
- No

If the participant answers the last question with “No”

Sorry, your response was incorrect. We need you to understand that this is a reason why David is nevertheless talking about the picture of Carnap when he uses “**That**”!

Please, try again.

Transfer 1/3: if the participant answers (A)

Some people, however, do not share your opinion. You can find an explanation that these people offer below.

Contrary to your belief, some people believe that David is talking about the picture of Elvis Presley when he uses the expression “**That**”. These people offer the following explanation: David said something about the picture of Elvis Presley because his picture, and not the picture of Rudolf Carnap, is the picture at which he pointed at in practice. Some of these people would then ask you to consider the following scenario in which, according to them, you would have a very good reason to think that David is doing you a great favor.

Transfer 2/3: if the participant answers (A)

Suppose that, without turning and looking, David points to the place on his wall which has long been occupied by a picture of Rudolf Carnap, a famous philosopher, and he says:

“**That** is a picture of one of the greatest philosophers of the twentieth century, and now it is yours—it is your birthday present”.

But unbeknownst to David, someone has replaced his picture of Carnap with a valuable portrait of Marquis de Lafayette, a French aristocrat, a general in the American Revolutionary War, and a dignified figure but not a philosopher at all. You have seen paintings that look so valuable hanging on people’s walls. Indeed, many people have such paintings in their homes in the town where David lives. Lafayette is an important figure in the history of the town—wounded during a battle near the town, he still managed to organize a successful retreat saving many lives—and many people in the town display his portrait to this day.

Transfer 3/3: if the participant answers (A)

Do you agree with people who say that the above is a reason why David is nevertheless talking about the portrait of Marquis de Lafayette when he uses “**That**”?

- Yes
- No

If the participant answers the last question with “No”

Sorry, your response was incorrect. We need you to understand that this is a reason why David is nevertheless talking about the portrait of Marquis de Lafayette when he uses “**That**”!

Please, try again.

Transfer 1/3: if the participant answers (B)

Some people, however, do not share your opinion. You can find an explanation that these people offer below.

Contrary to your belief, some people believe that David is talking about the picture of Rudolf Carnap when he uses the expression “**That**”. These people offer the following explanation: David meant to say something about the picture of Rudolf Carnap because Rudolf Carnap, and not Elvis Presley, is a famous philosopher. Some of these people would then ask you to consider the following scenario in which, according to them, David probably would never mean anything other than the picture of Rudolf Carnap.

Transfer 2/3: if the participant answers (B)

Suppose that, without turning and looking, David points to the place on his wall which has long been occupied by a picture of Rudolf Carnap, a famous philosopher, and he says:

“**That** is a picture of one of the greatest philosophers of the twentieth century, and now it is yours—it is your birthday present”.

But unbeknownst to David, someone has replaced his picture of Carnap with a cheap and nasty picture of you that has been photoshopped to show you in a patently offensive way. You have never seen anything that would look so offensive hanging on someone’s wall. Indeed, no one has such pictures in their homes in the town where David lives. The picture is so offensive that you can’t help but wonder why anyone would produce such an image in the first place.

Transfer 3/3: if the participant answers (B)

Do you agree with people who say that the above is a reason why David is nevertheless talking about the picture of Carnap when he uses “**That**”?

- Yes
- No

If the participant answers the last question with “No”

Sorry, your response was incorrect. We need you to understand that this is a reason why David is nevertheless talking about the picture of Carnap when he uses “**That**”!

Please, try again.

Final screen

Please, consider the scenario with which we started the study one last time and answer the questions below.

Suppose that, without turning and looking, David points to the place on his wall which has long been occupied by a picture of Rudolf Carnap, a famous philosopher, and he says:

“**That** is a picture of one of the greatest philosophers of the twentieth century”.

But unbeknownst to David, someone has replaced his picture of Carnap with one of Elvis Presley, a famous singer but not a philosopher at all.

When David uses the expression “**That**”, is he talking about:

- (A) The picture of Rudolf Carnap?
- (B) The picture of Elvis Presley?

How good or bad is it that someone has replaced David's picture of Carnap with one of Elvis Presley?

[Slider; scale: 0 = “Bad”; 100 = “Good”]

What are the chances that someone could replace David's picture of Carnap with one of Elvis Presley in reality?

[Slider; scale: 0 = “0%”; 100 = “100%”]

Unprimed condition

Initial scenario

Suppose that, without turning and looking, David points to the place on his wall which has long been occupied by a picture of Rudolf Carnap, a famous philosopher, and he says:

“**That** is a picture of one of the greatest philosophers of the twentieth century”.

But unbeknownst to David, someone has replaced his picture of Carnap with one of Elvis Presley, a famous singer but not a philosopher at all.

Training 1/3: if the participant is assigned to the answer “David is talking about the picture of Carnap” at random

There is some doubt as to whether David is talking about the picture of Rudolf Carnap or the picture of Elvis Presley when he uses “**That**” in the preceding scenario.

Some people believe that David is talking about the picture of Rudolf Carnap when he uses the expression “**That**”. These people offer the following explanation: David meant to say something about the picture of Rudolf Carnap because Rudolf Carnap, and not Elvis Presley, is a famous philosopher. Some of these people would then ask you to consider the following scenario in which, according to them, David probably would never mean anything other than the picture of Rudolf Carnap.

Training 2/3: if the participant is assigned to the answer “David is talking about the picture of Carnap” at random

Suppose that, without turning and looking, David points to the place on his wall which has long been occupied by a picture of Rudolf Carnap, a famous philosopher, and he says:

“**That** is a picture of one of the greatest philosophers of the twentieth century, and now it is yours—it is your birthday present”.

But unbeknownst to David, someone has replaced his picture of Carnap with a cheap and nasty picture of you that has been photoshopped to show you in a patently offensive way. You have never seen anything that would look so offensive hanging on someone’s wall. Indeed, no one has such pictures in their homes in the town where David lives. The picture is so offensive that you can’t help but wonder why anyone would produce such an image in the first place.

Training 3/3: if the participant is assigned to the answer “David is talking about the picture of Carnap” at random

Do you agree with people who say that the above is a reason why David is nevertheless talking about the picture of Carnap when he uses “**That**”?

- Yes
- No

If the participant answers the last question with “No”

Sorry, your response was incorrect. We need you to understand that this is a reason why David is nevertheless talking about the picture of Carnap when he uses “**That**”!

Please, try again.

Training 1/3: if the participant is assigned to the answer “David is talking about the picture of Elvis” at random

There is some doubt as to whether David is talking about the picture of Rudolf Carnap or the picture of Elvis Presley when he uses “**That**” in the preceding scenario.

Some people believe that David is talking about the picture of Elvis Presley when he uses the expression “**That**”. These people offer the following explanation: David said something about the picture of Elvis Presley because his picture, and not the picture of Rudolf Carnap, is the picture at which he pointed at

in practice. Some of these people would then ask you to consider the following scenario in which, according to them, you would have a very good reason to think that David is doing you a great favor.

Training 2/3: if the participant is assigned to the answer “David is talking about the picture of Elvis” at random

Suppose that, without turning and looking, David points to the place on his wall which has long been occupied by a picture of Rudolf Carnap, a famous philosopher, and he says:

“**That** is a picture of one of the greatest philosophers of the twentieth century, and now it is yours—it is your birthday present”.

But unbeknownst to David, someone has replaced his picture of Carnap with a valuable portrait of Marquis de Lafayette, a French aristocrat, a general in the American Revolutionary War, and a dignified figure but not a philosopher at all. You have seen paintings that look so valuable hanging on people’s walls. Indeed, many people have such paintings in their homes in the town where David lives. Lafayette is an important figure in the history of the town—wounded during a battle near the town, he still managed to organize a successful retreat saving many lives—and many people in the town display his portrait to this day.

Training 3/3: if the participant is assigned to the answer “David is talking about the picture of Elvis” at random

Do you agree with people who say that the above is a reason why David is nevertheless talking about the portrait of Marquis de Lafayette when he uses “**That**”?

- Yes
- No

If the participant answers the last question with “No”

Sorry, your response was incorrect. We need you to understand that this is a reason why David is nevertheless talking about the picture of Carnap when he uses “**That**”!

Please, try again.

Transfer 1/3: if the participant is assigned to the answer “David is talking about the picture of Carnap” at random

Some people, however, have different opinion. You can find an explanation that these people offer below.

Some people believe that David is talking about the picture of Elvis Presley when he uses the expression “**That**”. These people offer the following explanation: David said something about the picture of Elvis Presley because his picture, and not the picture of Rudolf Carnap, is the picture at which he pointed at in practice. Some of these people would then ask you to consider the following scenario in which, according to them, you would have a very good reason to think that David is doing you a great favor.

Transfer 2/3: if the participant is assigned to the answer “David is talking about the picture of Carnap” at random

Suppose that, without turning and looking, David points to the place on his wall which has long been occupied by a picture of Rudolf Carnap, a famous philosopher, and he says:

“**That** is a picture of one of the greatest philosophers of the twentieth century, and now it is yours—it is your birthday present”.

But unbeknownst to David, someone has replaced his picture of Carnap with a valuable portrait of Marquis de Lafayette, a French aristocrat, a general in the American Revolutionary War, and a dignified figure but not a philosopher at all. You have seen paintings that look so valuable hanging on people’s walls. Indeed, many people have such paintings in their homes in the town where David lives. Lafayette is an important figure in the history of the town—wounded during a battle near the town, he still managed to organize a successful retreat saving many lives—and many people in the town display his portrait to this day.

Transfer 3/3: if the participant is assigned to the answer “David is talking about the picture of Carnap” at random

Do you agree with people who say that the above is a reason why David is nevertheless talking about the portrait of Marquis de Lafayette when he uses “**That**”?

- Yes
- No

If the participant answers the last question with “No”

Sorry, your response was incorrect. We need you to understand that this is a reason why David is nevertheless talking about the portrait of Marquis de Lafayette when he uses “**That**”!

Please, try again.

Transfer 1/3: if the participant is assigned to the answer “David is talking about the picture of Elvis” at random

Some people, however, have different opinion. You can find an explanation that these people offer below.

Some people believe that David is talking about the picture of Rudolf Carnap when he uses the expression “**That**”. These people offer the following explanation: David meant to say something about the picture of Rudolf Carnap because Rudolf Carnap, and not Elvis Presley, is a famous philosopher. Some of these people would then ask you to consider the following scenario in which, according to them, David probably would never mean anything other than the picture of Rudolf Carnap.

Transfer 2/3: if the participant is assigned to the answer “David is talking about the picture of Elvis” at random

Suppose that, without turning and looking, David points to the place on his wall which has long been occupied by a picture of Rudolf Carnap, a famous philosopher, and he says:

“**That** is a picture of one of the greatest philosophers of the twentieth century, and now it is yours—it is your birthday present”.

But unbeknownst to David, someone has replaced his picture of Carnap with a cheap and nasty picture of you that has been photoshopped to show you in a patently offensive way. You have never seen anything that would look so offensive hanging on someone’s wall. Indeed, no one has such pictures in their homes in the town where David lives. The picture is so offensive that you can’t help but wonder why anyone would produce such an image in the first place.

Transfer 3/3: if the participant is assigned to the answer “David is talking about the picture of Elvis” at random

Do you agree with people who say that the above is a reason why David is nevertheless talking about the picture of Carnap when he uses “**That**”?

- Yes
- No

If the participant answers the last question with “No”

Sorry, your response was incorrect. We need you to understand that this is a reason why David is nevertheless talking about the picture of Carnap when he uses “**That**”!

Please, try again.

Final screen

Please, consider the scenario with which we started the study one last time and answer the questions below.

Suppose that, without turning and looking, David points to the place on his wall which has long been occupied by a picture of Rudolf Carnap, a famous philosopher, and he says:

“**That** is a picture of one of the greatest philosophers of the twentieth century”.

But unbeknownst to David, someone has replaced his picture of Carnap with one of Elvis Presley, a famous singer but not a philosopher at all.

When David uses the expression “**That**”, is he talking about:

- (A) The picture of Rudolf Carnap?
- (B) The picture of Elvis Presley?

How good or bad is it that someone has replaced David's picture of Carnap with one of Elvis Presley?

[Slider; scale: 0 = “Bad”; 100 = “Good”]

What are the chances that someone could replace David's picture of Carnap with one of Elvis Presley in reality?

[Slider; scale: 0 = “0%”; 100 = “100%”]

Control condition

Initial scenario

Suppose that, without turning and looking, David points to the place on his wall which has long been occupied by a picture of Rudolf Carnap, a famous philosopher, and he says:

“**That** is a picture of one of the greatest philosophers of the twentieth century”.

But unbeknownst to David, someone has replaced his picture of Carnap with one of Elvis Presley, a famous singer but not a philosopher at all.

Training 1/3: if the participant is assigned to the answer “David is talking about the picture of Carnap” at random

There is some doubt as to whether David is talking about the picture of Rudolf Carnap or the picture of Elvis Presley when he uses “**That**” in the preceding scenario.

Some people believe that David is talking about the picture of Rudolf Carnap when he uses the expression “**That**”. These people offer the following explanation: David meant to say something about the picture of Rudolf Carnap because Rudolf Carnap, and not Elvis Presley, is a famous philosopher. Some of these people would then ask you to consider the following scenario in which, according to them, David probably would never mean anything other than the picture of Rudolf Carnap.

Training 2/3: if the participant is assigned to the answer “David is talking about the picture of Carnap” at random

Suppose that, without turning and looking, David points to the place on his wall which has long been occupied by a picture of Rudolf Carnap, a famous philosopher, and he says:

“**That** is a picture of one of the greatest philosophers of the twentieth century, and now it is yours—it is your birthday present”.

But unbeknownst to David, someone has replaced his picture of Carnap with a cheap and nasty picture of you that has been photoshopped to show you in a patently offensive way. You have never seen anything that would look so offensive hanging on someone’s wall. Indeed, no one has such pictures in their homes in the town where David lives. The picture is so offensive that you can’t help but wonder why anyone would produce such an image in the first place.

Training 3/3: if the participant is assigned to the answer “David is talking about the picture of Carnap” at random

Do you agree with people who say that the above is a reason why David is nevertheless talking about the picture of Carnap when he uses “**That**”?

- Yes
- No

If the participant answers the last question with “No”

Sorry, your response was incorrect. We need you to understand that this is a reason why David is nevertheless talking about the picture of Carnap when he uses “**That**”!

Please, try again.

Training 1/3: if the participant is assigned to the answer “David is talking about the picture of Elvis” at random

There is some doubt as to whether David is talking about the picture of Rudolf Carnap or the picture of Elvis Presley when he uses “**That**” in the preceding scenario.

Some people believe that David is talking about the picture of Elvis Presley when he uses the expression “**That**”. These people offer the following explanation: David said something about the picture of Elvis Presley because his picture, and not the picture of Rudolf Carnap, is the picture at which he pointed at in practice. Some of these people would then ask you to consider the following scenario in which, according to them, you would have a very good reason to think that David is doing you a great favor.

Training 2/3: if the participant is assigned to the answer “David is talking about the picture of Elvis” at random

Suppose that, without turning and looking, David points to the place on his wall which has long been occupied by a picture of Rudolf Carnap, a famous philosopher, and he says:

“**That** is a picture of one of the greatest philosophers of the twentieth century, and now it is yours—it is your birthday present”.

But unbeknownst to David, someone has replaced his picture of Carnap with a valuable portrait of Marquis de Lafayette, a French aristocrat, a general in the American Revolutionary War, and a dignified figure but not a philosopher at all. You have seen paintings that look so valuable hanging on people’s walls. Indeed, many people have such paintings in their homes in the town where David lives. Lafayette is an important figure in the history of the town—wounded during a battle near the town, he still managed to organize a successful retreat saving many lives—and many people in the town display his portrait to this day.

Training 3/3: if the participant is assigned to the answer “David is talking about the picture of Elvis” at random

Do you agree with people who say that the above is a reason why David is nevertheless talking about the portrait of Marquis de Lafayette when he uses “**That**”?

- Yes
- No

If the participant answers the last question with “No”

Sorry, your response was incorrect. We need you to understand that this is a reason why David is nevertheless talking about the picture of Carnap when he uses “**That**”!

Please, try again.

Final screen

Please, consider the scenario with which we started the study one last time and answer the questions below.

Suppose that, without turning and looking, David points to the place on his wall which has long been occupied by a picture of Rudolf Carnap, a famous philosopher, and he says:

“**That** is a picture of one of the greatest philosophers of the twentieth century”.

But unbeknownst to David, someone has replaced his picture of Carnap with one of Elvis Presley, a famous singer but not a philosopher at all.

When David uses the expression “**That**”, is he talking about:

(C) The picture of Rudolf Carnap?

(D) The picture of Elvis Presley?

How good or bad is it that someone has replaced David's picture of Carnap with one of Elvis Presley?

[Slider; scale: 0 = “Bad”; 100 = “Good”]

What are the chances that someone could replace David's picture of Carnap with one of Elvis Presley in reality?

[Slider; scale: 0 = “0%”; 100 = “100%”]

Feedback

This concludes the study. Please use the form below if you would like to leave feedback on the study. In particular, let us know whether the instructions and the task were clear and easy to understand. When you fill in the feedback form, click “Submit” to send us your responses. **On the next screen, you will receive a unique Completion Code to prove you completed the study.**

Use the form below if you would like to leave feedback on the study.

Closing Message

Thank you for your participation!

The unique Completion Code is: 8EDECA8A