

## Advanced Databases - Exercise Sheet No. 1 Solutions

---

### Exercise I

1)  $BG \rightarrow DH \in F^+$

- Compute closure of BG:  $BG^+ = \{B, G\}$
- $B \rightarrow D \Rightarrow$  add D  $\rightarrow \{B, G, D\}$
- $G \rightarrow A \Rightarrow$  add A  $\rightarrow \{A, B, G, D\}$
- $AB \rightarrow C \Rightarrow$  add C  $\rightarrow \{A, B, C, D, G\}$
- $CD \rightarrow E \Rightarrow$  add E  $\rightarrow \{A, B, C, D, E, G\}$
- $CE \rightarrow GH \Rightarrow$  add H  $\rightarrow \{A, B, C, D, E, G, H\} = U$
- So,  $BG \rightarrow DH \in F^+$

2)  $CD \rightarrow B \notin F^+$

- Compute closure of CD:  $CD^+ = \{C, D\}$
- $CD \rightarrow E \Rightarrow$  add E  $\rightarrow \{C, D, E\}$
- $CE \rightarrow GH \Rightarrow$  add G, H  $\rightarrow \{C, D, E, G, H\}$
- $G \rightarrow A \Rightarrow$  add A  $\rightarrow \{A, C, D, E, G, H\}$
- No dependency adds B
- So,  $CD \rightarrow B \notin F^+$

3)  $ABC \rightarrow DEG \in F^+$

- Compute closure of ABC:  $\{A, B, C\}$
- $B \rightarrow D \Rightarrow$  add D  $\rightarrow \{A, B, C, D\}$
- $CD \rightarrow E \Rightarrow$  add E  $\rightarrow \{A, B, C, D, E\}$
- $G \rightarrow A \Rightarrow$  G not in closure yet
- $CE \rightarrow GH \Rightarrow$  C, E in closure  $\rightarrow$  add G, H  $\rightarrow \{A, B, C, D, E, G, H\} = U$
- So,  $ABC \rightarrow DEG \in F^+$

---

### Exercise II

1)  $CH \rightarrow AE$

- Compute closure of CH:  $\{C, H\}$
- $C \rightarrow E \Rightarrow \{C, H, E\}$
- $H \rightarrow B \Rightarrow \{C, H, E, B\}$

- $BC \rightarrow D \Rightarrow B, C$  in closure  $\rightarrow$  add  $D \rightarrow \{B, C, D, E, H\}$
- $DE \rightarrow G \Rightarrow D, E$  in closure  $\rightarrow$  add  $G \rightarrow \{B, C, D, E, H, G\}$
- $DG \rightarrow A \Rightarrow D, G$  in closure  $\rightarrow$  add  $A \rightarrow \{A, B, C, D, E, G, H\} = U$
- So,  $CH \rightarrow AE$  holds

## 2) $BC \rightarrow DEG$

- $BC^+ = \{B, C\}$
- $BC \rightarrow D \Rightarrow$  add  $D \rightarrow \{B, C, D\}$
- $C \rightarrow E \Rightarrow$  add  $E \rightarrow \{B, C, D, E\}$
- $DE \rightarrow G \Rightarrow D, E \rightarrow$  add  $G \rightarrow \{B, C, D, E, G\}$
- $DG \rightarrow A \Rightarrow D, G \rightarrow$  add  $A \rightarrow \{A, B, C, D, E, G\}$
- So,  $BC \rightarrow DEG$  holds

## 3) $ADEG \rightarrow BC$

- $ADEG^+ = \{A, D, E, G\}$
- $DE \rightarrow G \Rightarrow$  already have  $G$
- $DG \rightarrow A \Rightarrow$  already have  $A$
- The closure  $\{A, D, E, G\}$  doesn't contain  $B, C$
- So,  $ADEG \rightarrow BC$  does not hold

## Exercise III

### 1) Attribute $C$ must be in every key

- No FD in  $F$  has  $C$  on the right-hand side, so  $C$  is not derivable from any other attributes. Thus, any key  $K$  (with  $K^+ = U$ ) must contain  $C$ .

### 2) Keys of $R(U)$

- A key (candidate key) is a minimal set of attributes that can determine all other attributes in the relation.
- We can use the information from question 1 to narrow down our search for candidate keys: since  $C$  must be in every key, any candidate key must contain  $C$ .
- Let's check the possible combinations (always start with the minimal sets, which are singleton attributes):

- $\{C\}$

Since  $C \rightarrow D$  so,  $C^+ = \{CD\} \neq U$

Thus,  $C$  is not a super key.

- $\{A\}, \{B\}, \{D\}, \{E\}, \{G\}, \{H\}$  are not super keys because, from Question 1, every key of R must contain C.
- $\{A, C\}$

Check  $\{A, C\}$

Compute  $(AC)^+$ :

- Start:  $\{A, C\}$ .
- $C \rightarrow D \Rightarrow$  add  $D$ .
- $AC \rightarrow B \Rightarrow$  add  $B$ .
- $BD \rightarrow E$  (B and D present)  $\Rightarrow$  add  $E$ .
- $BE \rightarrow GH$  (B and E present)  $\Rightarrow$  add  $G, H$ .
- $G \rightarrow A$  already have A.

Result:  $(AC)^+ = \{A, B, C, D, E, G, H\} = U$ . So  $\{A, C\}$  is a superkey.

$\{A, C\}$  is then a key because neither  $\{A\}$  nor  $\{C\}$  is a super key.

$\{C\}^+ = \{C, D\} \neq U$  and  $\{A\}^+ = \{A\} \neq U$

- $\{B, C\}$

Compute  $(BC)^+$ :

- Start:  $\{B, C\}$ .
- $C \rightarrow D \Rightarrow$  add  $D$ .
- $BD \rightarrow E \Rightarrow$  add  $E$ .
- $BE \rightarrow GH \Rightarrow$  add  $G, H$ .
- $G \rightarrow A \Rightarrow$  add  $A$ .

Thus  $\{B, C\}^+ = U$ , so  $\{B, C\}$  is a super key

$\{C, B\}$  is then a key since neither  $\{C\}$ , nor  $\{B\}$  is a super key.

- $\{C, D\}$

$C \rightarrow D$  only

Thus  $\{C, D\}^+ = \{C, D\} \neq U$ , so  $\{C, D\}$  is not a super key.

- $\{C, E\}$

$C \rightarrow D$

$CE \rightarrow CED$  (since  $C \rightarrow D$ )

Thus  $\{C,E\}^+ = \{C,E,D\} \neq U$ , so  $\{C,E\}$  is not a super key.

- $\{C,G\}$

Compute  $(CG)^+$ :

- Start:  $\{C, G\}$ .
- $C \rightarrow D \Rightarrow$  add  $D$ .
- $G \rightarrow A \Rightarrow$  add  $A$ .
- $AC \rightarrow B$  (A and C present)  $\Rightarrow$  add  $B$ .
- $BD \rightarrow E \Rightarrow$  add  $E$ .
- $BE \rightarrow GH \Rightarrow$  add  $H$  (G already present).

Thus  $\{C,G\}^+ = U$ , so  $\{C,G\}$  is a super key.

$\{C,G\}$  is then a key since neither  $\{C\}$ , nor  $\{G\}$  is a super key.

- $\{C,H\}$

$CH \rightarrow CHD$  (since  $C \rightarrow D$ )

Thus  $\{C,H\}^+ = \{C,H,D\} \neq U$ , so  $\{C,H\}$  is not a super key.

- Since  $\{A, C\}$ ,  $\{B, C\}$ , and  $\{C, G\}$  are keys, any other key must include C but exclude A, B, and G; otherwise it would not be minimal.
- Therefore, any other key must be sought among the attributes  $\{C, D, E, H\}$ .
- Nevertheless,  $\{C,E,D,H\}^+ = \{C,E,D,H\} \neq U$ . Therefore, no other key exists.
- Thus, the only keys are  $\{A,C\}$ ,  $\{C,B\}$  and  $\{C,G\}$ .

---

## Exercise IV

We need to check whether  $F^+ \subseteq G^+$  and  $G^+ \subseteq F^+$

- **Check if  $F^+ \subseteq G^+$**

- $AB \rightarrow C$  is in both F and G
- $B \rightarrow A$  is in both F and G
- $AD \rightarrow E$  is in both F and G (since in G, we have  $AD \rightarrow E$ )
- $BD \rightarrow I$  is in both F and G (since in G, we have  $B \rightarrow A$  and  $AD \rightarrow E$ , thus, using pseudo-transitivity,  $BD \rightarrow EI$ , so, using decomposition rule,  $BD \rightarrow I$ )
- Therefore,  $F^+ \subseteq G^+$

▪ **Check if  $G^+ \subseteq F^+$**

- $AB \rightarrow C$  is in both  $F$  and  $G$
- $B \rightarrow A$  is in both  $F$  and  $G$
- $AD \rightarrow E$  ( $AD \rightarrow ADE$  since  $AD \rightarrow E$  and we can't add other attributes)
- Thus,  $\{A,D\}^+ = \{A,D,E\}$
- So,  $G^+ \not\subseteq F^+$

Therefore,  $F^+ \neq G^+$

---

## Exercise V

$\text{ClientNum} \rightarrow \text{ClientName}$

$\text{ProductNum} \rightarrow \text{ProductName, VAT, UnitPrice}$

$(\text{ClientNum, ProductNum, Date}) \rightarrow \text{Number}$

- 1- A candidate key is a minimal attribute set whose closure contains all attributes. Single attributes obviously don't determine everything. Therefore, let's Compute closure of  $\{\text{ClientNum, ProductNum, Date}\}$

### Compute closure of $\{\text{ClientNum, ProductNum, Date}\}$ :

- It trivially contains  $\text{ClientNum, ProductNum, Date}$ .
- From  $\text{ClientNum} \rightarrow \text{ClientName}$  we get  $\text{ClientName}$ .
- From  $\text{ProductNum} \rightarrow \text{ProductName, VAT, UnitPrice}$  we get  $\text{ProductName, VAT, UnitPrice}$ .
- From  $(\text{ClientNum, ProductNum, Date}) \rightarrow \text{Number}$  we get  $\text{Number}$ .  
So  $\{\text{ClientNum, ProductNum, Date}\}^+$  contains every attribute  $\rightarrow$  it is a super key.

### Check minimality:

- $\{\text{ClientNum, ProductNum}\}$  does **not** determine  $\text{Number}$  or  $\text{Date}$ .
- $\{\text{ClientNum, Date}\}$  does **not** determine  $\text{ProductNum}$  (hence not product attributes or  $\text{Number}$ ).
- $\{\text{ProductNum, Date}\}$  does **not** determine  $\text{ClientNum}$  (hence not  $\text{ClientName}$  or  $\text{Number}$ ).

Therefore, the only candidate key (under these FDs) is:

**$(\text{ClientNum, ProductNum, Date})$ .**

- 2- The table COMMANDE is in 1NF because all attributes are atomic, and rows are uniquely identifiable.

The table though is not in 2NF because there are some non-key attributes that depend just on part of the primary key, e.g., ClientNum  $\rightarrow$  ClientName.

- 3- Decomposed table:

CLIENT(**ClientNum**, ClientName)

PRODUCT(**ProductNum**, ProductName, VAT, UnitPrice)

COMMANDE(**ClientNum**, **ProductNum**, **Date**, Number)

---

## Exercise VI

- 1- To check all the keys, we always start with the minimal sets, which are singleton attributes.

Compute closures:

- $A^+$ : from  $A \rightarrow BC$  get  $B, C$ . From  $C \rightarrow AD$  get  $D$  (and  $A$  already). From  $CD \rightarrow BEF$  get  $E, F$ . So  $A^+ = \{A, B, C, D, E, F\} = U. \Rightarrow A$  is a key.
- $C^+$ :  $C \rightarrow AD$  gives  $A, D$ . From  $A \rightarrow BC$  get  $B$ . From  $CD \rightarrow BEF$  get  $E, F$ . So  $C^+ = U. \Rightarrow C$  is a key.
- $E^+$ :  $E \rightarrow ABC$  gives  $A, B, C$ . From  $C \rightarrow AD$  get  $D$ . From  $CD \rightarrow BEF$  get  $E, F$ . So  $E^+ = U. \Rightarrow E$  is a key.
- $F^+$ :  $F \rightarrow CD$  gives  $C, D$ . From  $C \rightarrow AD$  get  $A$ . From  $A \rightarrow BC$  get  $B$ . From  $CD \rightarrow BEF$  get  $E$ . So  $F^+ = U. \Rightarrow F$  is a key.

No smaller subset than a single attribute can be a key, and we found these four single-attribute keys.

$B^+ \neq U$  and  $D^+ \neq U$  so, neither  $B$  or  $D$  is super key.

Thus, all candidate keys are:  $A, C, E, F$ .

- 1-  $R$  is in 3NF because:

- $R$  is in 2NF: the keys of  $R$  are single attributes, and the non-key attributes  $B$  and  $D$  therefore cannot depend on any proper subset of a key.
- $R$  is in 3NF: About  $D$  and  $B$ :  $D$  (respectively  $B$ ) can only be determined by a set of attributes that contains  $B$  (respectively  $D$ ) and is not a super key, but such a set would have to be exactly  $\{B\}$  (respectively  $\{D\}$ ).
- In other words, there is no attribute set  $K$  such that  $K$  is not a super key and  $K \rightarrow D$  (respectively  $K \rightarrow B$ ).