

Realm: Ocean Bio Geo Chemsitry					
Date	Reviewer's Name	Reviewer's Institution	Component	Comment	ES-DOC Response (include the date, the responder's name, and the new version number if implementing any changes)
Pre-stage 3	Roland Séférian	CNRM	model family	unclear if this refers to model complexity (relate to marine biology) or internal structure e.g., Monod, Quota...	Change to "model type" and enum provided [EG 8/11/17]
Pre-stage 3			basic assumption	unclear whether this refers to mass conservation of some tracers or to the assumptions in terms of redfield ratio. It might be redundant with "model family" in someways when considering Redfieldian and non-Redfieldian model...	Modified to be "elemental stoichiometry" [EG 8/11/17]
Pre-stage 3	John Dunne	GFDL	Gas Exchange	I see entries for CO - Carbon monoxide - which I am not certain any groups are modeling, but I do not see entries for CFC11, CFC12, SF6, 13CO2 and 14CO2 which many groups are modeling except to be input as "other gases"	CO removed and 5 others added [EG 8/11/17]
Pre-stage 3	John Dunne	GFDL	Tracers	I do not see a way to enter whether the model is calculating "natural", "abiotic" and isotopic "13C", "14C" carbon cycles which will be part of OMIP. This might be helpful to ad as only some models will be able to implement these	Section on "DIC and alcalinity" added in tracers [EG 8/11/17]
Pre-stage 3	John Dunne	GFDL	Key Properties	I find the example in parentheses for 'Name of ocean biogeochemistry model code (PISCES 2.0,...)' to be extremely helpful. It would be great if the other questions also gave examples... I'm not sure what the scope of anser is requested for 'Model Family' for example.	More details given - see above comment 1
2017-12-18	Jerry Tjiputra	MET Norway	Key Properties	In the Ocean biogeochemistry table (https://view-specializations.es-doc.org/?target=cmip6.ocnbgchem&client=esdoc-url-rewrite), it is not clear to me what is meant by 'Damping' tracer (i.e., describe any tracer damping used)? Would be good to have this clarified.	Help text clarified [v 0.5.0]
2018-02-09	Andrew Yool	NOC	Key Properties	Topic Property asks for: List of all diagnostic tracer variables in the ocean biogeochemistry component. Question: Not 100% what these are; would DIP count?; we don't have phosphate in the model, but in the CMIP6 diagnostics we do produce it by dividing nitrogen numbers by 16 (this approach is sanctioned by OMIP). Need better clarification on what should be included under this topic.	Help text clarified [v 1.0.0]
2018-02-09	Andrew Yool	NOC	Ecosytem	Topic Property asks: Definition of upper trophic level (e.g. based on size) ? Question: Need better clarification on what should be included under this topic.	Help text clarified [v 1.0.0]
2018-02-09	Andrew Yool	NOC	Ecosystem	Topic Property asks: Define how upper trophic level are treated Question: Need better clarification on what should be included under this topic.	Help text clarified [v 1.0.0]
2018-02-09	Andrew Yool	NOC	Particules	Topic Property asks: How is particulate carbon represented in ocean biogeochemistry? This is an enum 1.1. Question: This section requires the model to be one of two things whereas our model does both - Diagnostic and Diagnostic Ballast. Can enum be changed to 1. N?	Cardinality changed to 1.N [v 1.0.0]