Experiments

April 27, 2018

Table 1: Proportions of Interleaving with Different Occurrence Types

	*	<u> </u>
Index Abbr.	. Percentage	Explanation
1 & (a^b)	93.07% In	nterleaving cannot contain concatenation, disjunction or interleaving
2 &(.)	0.09%	Interleaving contains concatenation
3 &()	1.70%	Interleaving contains disjunction
4 (&)	0.18%	Concatenation contains interleaving
5 (&)	1.41%	Disjunction contains interleaving
6 &(&)	0.23%	Interleaving contains interleaving
7 &(.)	3.19%	Interleaving contains disjunction and concatenation
8 others	s 0.13%	other occurrence types

Table 2: Results of Inference Using Different Methods on **example1**

Sample Size	From	Element Name			
77624	Constructed Data	example1	ND	RE	CC
Method	Regi	ular Expression			
IntelliJ IDEA	$(a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4)^+ ($	$a_5 a_6 a_7 a_8 a_9 a_{10} a_{11} a_{12})^+$	1	29	
Liquid Studio	$(a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4 a_5)$	$a_6 a_6 a_7 a_8 a_9 a_{10} a_{11} a_{12})^+$	1	26	
	$a_7a_5a_8^+ a_4a_1 a_5(a_1)$	$ a_{1}a_{1}a_{1}a_{1}^{+}(a_{8}^{+} a_{7}^{+}(a_{9} a_{11})^{?}a_{8}^{+}) $			
	$a_9(a_8a_7 a_7a_8^?)^? a_8^+($	$(a_9a_7^? a_7^+(a_6^?a_9)^? a_6a_9)^? a_7^+(a_{10}^+)$			
Altova	$a_{11}a_8^+ a_9^+(a_{10}^+ a_8a_1^+)$	$ a_{10}^{*} ^{2} a_{8}^{+}(a_{7} (a_{6} a_{10}^{+})a_{9} a_{11}a_{8} a_{9} $	4	218	
XMLSpy	$ a_{10}^* ^2 a_6 a_8^2 a_9 ^2 a_6 ^2$	$(a_9(a_7 a_8)^? a_8^+(a_9 a_7^+a_9^?)^? a_7^+$	4	216	
	$(a_9a_8^* a_8^+a_9^?)))^? a_1($	$(a_4a_2^? a_3(a_2a_4^?)^? a_2(a_4 a_3a_4^?)^?)^?$			
Trang	$(a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4)^+ ($	$a_5 a_6 a_7 a_8 a_9 a_{10} a_{11} a_{12})^+$	1	29	
InstanceToSchema	$a_1^? \& a_2^? \& a_3^? \& a_4^? \& a_5^?$	$\&a_6^?\&a_7^*\&a_8^*\&a_9^*\&a_{10}^*\&a_{11}^*\&a_{12}^?$	1	35	479001600
Soa2Chare	$(a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4)^*(a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4)^*$	$a_5 a_6 a_7 a_8 a_9 a_{10} a_{11} a_{12})^*$	1	29	
GenEchare	$(a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4)^*(a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4)^*$	$_{5} a_{6} a_{7}^{+} a_{8}^{+} a_{9}^{+} a_{10}^{+} a_{11}^{+} a_{12})^{*}$	1	34	
$learn_{DME}^{+}$	$(a_{12}^? a_8^* a_4^?)\&(a_6^? a_2^?)$	$ a_{11}^*\rangle\&(a_3^? a_5^?)\&a_9^*\&a_7^*\&a_{10}^*\&a_1^?$	1	41	30240
conMiner	$a_1^? a_2^? a_5^? a_6^? a_1^*$	$a_1^* \& a_7^* a_{10}^* a_3^? a_4^? \& a_{12}^? a_8^*$	1	35	13860
GenESIRE	$a_3^? a_4^? \& a_1 a_2^? (a_8^*) $	$ a_{12}^{?})\&a_{5}(a_{11}^{*} a_{6})a_{9}^{*}\&a_{7}^{*}a_{10}^{*}$	1	40	246

Table 3: Results of Inference Using Different Methods on www

Sample Size	From	Element Name				
2000226	DBLP	www	ND	RE	CC	
Method		Regular Expression				
Original Schema	$(a_1 a_2$	$ a_3 a_4 a_5 a_6 a_7 a_8 a_9 a_{10} a_{11} a_{12} a_{13}$	1	48		
Original Schema	$ a_{14} a$	$a_{15} a_{16} a_{17} a_{18} a_{19} a_{20} a_{21} a_{22} a_{23})^*$	1	40		
IntelliJ IDEA	$a_{19}^{?}$	$_{9}a_{2}^{*}(a_{1} a_{4} a_{16} a_{13} a_{18} a_{3} a_{12} a_{6})^{*}$	1	24		
Liquid Studio	$(a_1$	$ a_3 a_{12}^+ a_{18}^+ a_{16} a_2 a_6 a_{13} a_4 a_{19})^+$	2	24		
		$(a_6^?a_{12} a_1^+a_{12}^+a_{18}^+) a_2^+a_3(a_6a_{12} a_{13}a_6) (a_3a_{18}^? a_{18}^+a_3) a_3(a_4^?a_6a_{12} a_{12}^+(a_6 a_{18}^+$				
Altova	$(a_{12}^+ a_{16}^+$	$(a_{12}^*)^? a_{16}^+a_{18}^*)^? a_{18}^+(a_{12}^+((a_{16}^+ a_{18}^+)a_{12}^*)^? a_{18}^+a_{12}^+a_$	5	165		
XMLSpy	$a_{16}^{+}a_{12}^{+}$	$)^{?} a_{16}a_{12}^{*})^{?} a_{18}^{+}(a_{12}^{+}a_{3} a_{3}(a_{12}^{+}(a_{18}^{+}a_{12}^{?} \\a_{16}a_{12})^{?} a_{18}a_{12}^{*})^{?}))$				
Trang	$a_2^*(a$	$a_{19} (a_1 a_4 a_{16} a_{13} a_{18} a_3 a_{12} a_6)^+)$	1	25		
InstanceToSchema	$a_{13}^{?}\&a_{13}$	$_{18}^{*}\&a_{2}^{*}\&a_{6}^{?}\&a_{1}^{*}\&a_{16}^{*}\&a_{3}^{?}\&a_{4}^{?}\&a_{19}^{?}\&a_{12}^{*}$	1	29	$3.63*10^{6}$	
Soa2Chare	$(a_2^+ $	$(a_{19})^{?}(a_{13} a_{16} a_{6} a_{1} a_{12} a_{18} a_{3} a_{4})^{*}$	2	26		
GenEchare	$(a_2^+ a_2^- a_2$	$(a_{19})^{?}(a_{13} a_{16}^{+} a_{6} a_{1}^{+} a_{12}^{+} a_{18}^{+} a_{3} a_{4})^{*}$	2	30		
$learn_{DME}^{+}$	$(a_{18}^* a_6^? a_{19}^?)\&(a_{16}^* a_4^? a_{13}^?)\&(a_1^* a_2^*)\&a_3^*\&a_{12}^*$		1	35	$2.16*10^{3}$	
conMiner	$a_{19}^{?}a_{2}^{*}a_{3}^{*}a_{16}^{*}a_{4}^{?}a_{13}^{?}a_{6}^{?}\&a_{12}^{*}\&a_{1}^{*}a_{18}^{*}$		1	29	$3.60*10^{2}$	
GenESIRE	$(a_2^* a_2^* a_2$	$(a_{19}^?)(a_{18}^*\&a_3(a_{16}^* a_{13}^? a_4^?)a_6^?\&a_1^*a_{12}^*)^?$	2	35	$3.60*10^{2}$	

Table 4: Results of Inference Using Different Methods on article

Sample Size	From	Element Name			
1737265	DBLP	article	ND	RE	CC
Method		Regular Expression			
Original Schema		$(a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4 a_5 a_6 a_7 a_8 a_9 a_{10} a_{11} a_{12} a_{13}$	1	48	
T . W.T.TD.D.A	*	$ a_{14} a_{15} a_{16} a_{17} a_{18} a_{19} a_{20} a_{21} a_{22} a_{23}$		0.00	
IntelliJ IDEA	a ₂ ($(a_1 a_4 a_{14} a_{15} a_{18} a_{13} a_8 a_{11} a_{17} a_{10} a_5 a_{16} a_3 a_{12} a_9 a_6)^+$	1	37	
Liquid Studio		$a_{1}^{+} a_{3} a_{5} a_{14} a_{6} a_{9} a_{8} a_{10} a_{12} a_{15}^{+} a_{17} a_{11} a_{16} a_{18} a_{4} a_{2})^{+}$	2	38	
Altova XMLSpy	(a12 a a ² 5) a a ² 5) a a ² 5) a a ² 13a a12 a a6a13: a10a13 a10a13 a10a13 a8a10a a8a10a a8a13 (a13 a1 a13 a1 a13 a1 a13 a1 a11a1	$3a6a8a9 a_14a6a9a8a_{10} a_{12} a_{6}((a_5a8a9a_{11}a_{13} a_8a_{13}a_9)a_{12} a_9a_{10}(a_{12}((a_{14} a_{13})a_5^2 a_5a_{14}^2)^2 a_5(a_{12}a_{13} a_{13}a_{12}) a_{13}^+a_{12}a_5^2) a_{13}^+a_{12}\\ 5(a_6(a_9(a_{10}a8a_{13}^aa_{12} a_8(a_{12}(a_{13}a_{15}^2)^2 a_{10}(a_{12}(a_{14} a_{17} a_{13}^+a_{17}^2)^2 a_{12}a_{15}^2 a_{14}a_{12}) a_{13}(a_{12}a_{15}^2 a_{18}a_{12})) a_{10}a_{9}a_{8}a_{13}^2a_{12} a_{13}a_{9}a_{8}a_{10}\\ +13a6a_9a8a_{10}^2a_{12}a_{15}^2 a_{14}a_{6a}a_{9}a_{10}a_{12}a_{13}^2 a_{13}a_{12} a_{13}a_{9}a_{8}a_{10}\\ +12) a_{11}^+a_{5}a_{8}a_{11}a_{6}a_{9}a_{10}(a_{12}(a_{13}a_{14}^2)^2 a_{13}a_{12})) a_{17}a_{35}a_{6}a_{9}a_{8}\\ +12 a_{11}^+a_{5}a_{8}a_{11}a_{6}a_{9}a_{10}(a_{12}(a_{13}a_{14}^2)^2 a_{13}a_{12})) a_{17}a_{35}a_{6}a_{9}a_{8}\\ +12 a_{13}(a_{3}(a_{5}(a_{6}a_{9}a_{8}a_{10}a_{12}a_{14}^1 a_{14}a_{6}a_{9}a_{8}a_{10}a_{12}) a_{11}^+a_{6}a_{8}a_{9}a_{12}\\ +a_{9}a_{8}a_{10}a_{12} a_{11}^+a_{3}(a_{6}a_{9}a_{8}a_{10}a_{12}a_{14} a_{14}\\ +a_{9}a_{8}a_{10}a_{12} a_{11}^+a_{6}a_{9}a_{8}a_{10}a_{12}a_{13}^2 a_{11}^2 a_{14}^2\\ +a_{9}a_{9}a_{8}a_{10}a_{12} a_{11}^+a_{3}(a_{6}a_{9}a_{8}a_{10}a_{12}a_{13} a_{13}^2 a_{13}^$	4	1581	
Instance					
ToSchema		$a_{13}^* \& a_{17}^* \& a_2^* \& a_6^2 \& a_1^* \& a_3 \& a_{14}^2 \& a_1^2 \& a_9^2 \& a_1^2 \& a_2^2 \& a_8^2 \& a_1^2 \& a_1^2 \& a_{16}^2 \& a_1^2 \& a_4^2$	1	49	3.56 * 10 ¹
Soa2Chare		$(a_6 a_{13} a_3 a_{14} a_{12} a_9 a_{15} a_{10} a_5 a_8 a_{11} a_1 a_{16} a_{17} a_{18} a_4)^+$	1	38	
GenEchare	a*($a_{6} a_{13}^{+} a_{3} a_{14} a_{12} a_{9} a_{15}^{+} a_{10} a_{5} a_{8} a_{11} a_{1}^{+} a_{16} a_{17}^{+} a_{18} a_{4})^{+}$	2	41	
$_{\mathrm{learn}_{DME}}+$		$(a_{15}^* a_{11}^? a_{18}^? a_2^*)\&(a_{10}^? a_{16}^?)\&(a_8^? a_4^?)\&a_5^?$	1	55	7.66 * 10
conMiner	a	$\frac{\&a_{12}^2\&a_{14}^2\&a_{1}^2\&a_{17}^2\&a_{13}^2\&a_{6}^2\&a_{3}\&a_{6}^2}{\{a_{11}^2a_{14}^2a_{17}^2\&a_{6}^2\&a_{8}^2\&a_{3}^2\ a_{16}^2a_{15}^2\&a_{15}^2\&a_{9}^2\&a_{13}^2a_{13}^2\&a_{9}^2\&a_{13}^2\&a_{15}^2\&a_$	1	49	3.09 * 10 ¹
GenESIRE	·	$\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	1	55	1.21 * 10

Table 5: Results of Inference Using Different Methods on Entry

Sample Size
50000
Method
IntelliJ
IDEA
Liquid
Studio
Liquid

Table 6: Results of Inference Using Different Methods on Entry

Sample Size	From	Element Name			
50000	SwissPort	Entry	ND	RE	CC
Method		Regular Expression	<u></u>		<u> </u>
Altova	a15 a ⁺ ₁₃ a1 a12 a ² ₁₅ a ² ₁ a18 (a ₁ a ² ₁₅ a ² ₁ a18 (a ₁ a ² ₁₅ a ² ₁₆ (a ⁺ ₁ a ² ₁₅ a ² ₁₆ (a ⁺ ₁ a ² ₁₅ a ² ₁₆ (a ⁺ ₁ a ² ₁₅ a ² ₁₆ (a ⁺ ₁ a ² ₁₆ (a ⁺ ₁ a ² ₁₆ (a ⁺ ₁ a ² ₁₆ (a ⁺ ₁₆ a ²	12(a; 1; a;	11	12749	

Table 7: Results of Inference Using Different Methods on Entry

	e 7: Results of Inference Using Different Methods on Entry			
Sample Size	From Element Name			
50000	SwissPort Entry	N D	RE	CC
Method	Regular Expression			
Altova XMLSpy	0.156.1,014.101.2,016.1,127.1,128.1,121.1,	5 4 -8) ++ 13	12749	

Table 8: Results of Inference Using Different Methods on Entry

	i	lts of Inference Using Different Methods on Entry	1	1	1	
Sample Size	From	Element Name				
50000	SwissPort	Entry	N D	RE	CC	
Method	$\begin{array}{c} a_{15}^* \\ a_{13}^* \\ a_{13}^* \\ a_{13}^* \\ a_{13}^* \\ a_{14}^* \\ a_{14}^* \\ a_{14}^* \\ a_{14}^* \\ a_{22}^* \\ a_{11}^* \\ a_{14}^* \\ a_{13}^* \\ a_{15}^* \\ a_{1$	$\begin{array}{c} \textbf{Regular Expression} \\ a_{13}^{+}a_{14} a_{13}^{+}(a_{15}^{+}a_{13}^{+}a_{14} a_{13}^{-}a_{14}^{+})) a_{13}^{+}a_{14}^{+} a_{13}^{+}a_{14}^{+} a_{15}^{+}a_{13}^{+}a_{14}^{+} a_{15}^{+}a_{15}^{+}a_{15}^{+}a_{15}^{+}a_{13}^{+}a_{14}^{+} a_{15}^{+}a_{15}^{+}a_{15}^{+}a_{15}^{+}a_{15}^{+}a_{13}^{+}a_{14}^{+} a_{15}^{+}a_$	11	12749		
Instance ToSchema		$ \begin{array}{c} a_{18}a_{15}a_{13}^{+}a_{14} a_{13}^{+}a_{14}^{+}))))) \\ a_{11}^{*}\&a_{33}^{*}\&a_{10}^{?}\&a_{32}^{*}\&a_{13}^{*}\&a_{35}^{*}\&a_{12}^{*}\&a_{34}^{*}\&a_{15}^{*}\&a_{37}^{*}\&a_{14}^{?}\&a_{36}^{?}\&\\ a_{17}^{*}\&a_{39}^{*}\&a_{16}^{*}\&a_{38}^{*}\&a_{19}^{*}\&a_{18}^{*}\&a_{40}^{*}\&a_{20}^{*}\&a_{42}^{*}\&a_{41}^{*}\&a_{22}^{*}\&a_{21}^{*}\&\\ a_{43}^{*}\&a_{24}^{*}\&a_{23}^{*}\&a_{26}^{?}\&a_{25}^{*}\&a_{28}^{*}\&a_{27}^{*}\&a_{29}^{?}\&a_{1}^{+}\&a_{2}^{+}\&a_{3}^{+}\&a_{4}^{*}\&\\ a_{5}^{+}\&a_{6}^{*}\&a_{7}^{+}\&a_{8}^{+}\&a_{9}^{*}\&a_{31}^{?}\&a_{30}^{?} \end{array}$	1	131	3.48 * 10 ⁵⁵	
Soa2Chare	a ₂₆	$\begin{bmatrix} a_4^* a_5^+ a_6^+ a_7^+ a_8^+ a_{16}^* (a_{42} a_{20} a_{10} a_{40} a_{24} a_{12} a_{36} a_{34} a_{22} a_{32} a_{28} a_{38} a_{18} a_{41} \\ a_{35} a_{23} a_{11} a_{33} a_{43} a_{21} a_{17} a_{39} a_{27} a_{29} a_{15} a_{37} a_{25} a_{19} a_{31} a_{30} \rangle^* a_{13}^* a_{14}^2 \end{bmatrix}$	1	100		
GenEchare	$\begin{vmatrix} a_1^+ a_2^+ a_3^+ \\ a_{41}^+ a_2 \end{vmatrix}$	$a_3^+ a_4^+ a_5^+ a_6^+ a_7^+ a_8^+ a_1^* a_{16}^+ (a_{42}^+ a_2^+ a_{10} a_{10}^+ a_2^+ a_{12}^+ a_{36}^+ a_3^+ a_{24}^+ a_{12}^+ a_{36}^+ a_{34}^+ a_{22}^+ a_{32}^+ a_{38}^+ a$	2	125		
$_{\mathrm{learn}_{DME}}^{+}$		$(a_{29}? a_{6}^{*} a_{20}^{*} a_{30}^{*} a_{38}^{*} a_{41}^{*} a_{39}^{*} a_{35}^{*} a_{31}^{*} a_{40}^{*} a_{30}^{*} a_{33}^{*}\rangle\&(a_{36}^{*} a_{25}^{*} a_{21}^{*} \\a_{23}^{*} a_{19}^{*} a_{37}^{*}\rangle\&(a_{42}^{*} a_{32}^{*} a_{17}^{*} a_{34}^{*}\rangle\&(a_{27}^{*} a_{10}^{*})\&a_{43}^{*}\&a_{22}^{*}\&a_{28}^{*}\&a_{24}^{*}\&a_{9}^{*}\&\\a_{4}^{*}\&a_{1}^{+}\&a_{1}^{+}\&a_{5}^{+}\&a_{13}^{*}\&a_{18}^{*}\&a_{15}^{*}\&a_{17}^{+}\&a_{17}^{+}\&a_{18}^{+}\&a_{12}^{*}\&a_{16}^{*}\&a_{11}^{*}\&a_{11}^{*}\\a_{10}^{*}a_{27}^{*}a_{34}^{*}a_{25}^{*}a_{38}^{*}a_{11}^{*}a_{12}^{*}a_{18}^{*}a_{15}^{*}\&a_{1}^{+}a_{1}^{+}a_{2}^{+}a_{3}^{+}\&a_{18}^{*}a_{13}^{*}$	1	136	1.48 * 10 ²⁵	
conMiner		$\begin{smallmatrix} a^+ a^+ a^+ a^+ a^+ a^+ a^+ a^+ a^+ a^+$	1	128	5.64 * 10 ⁸	
GenESIRE		$a_{1}^{+}a_{2}^{+}a_{3}^{+}a_{4}^{+}a_{5}^{+}a_{6}^{+}a_{1}^{+}a_{9}^{+}a_{16}^{+}(a_{10}^{2}\&(a_{27}^{*} a_{30}^{2})(a_{41}^{*} a_{35}^{*} a_{36}^{2} a_{34}^{*} \\ a_{43}^{*})(a_{20}^{*} a_{24}^{*} a_{23}^{*} a_{39}^{*} a_{19}^{*})(a_{33}^{*} a_{21}^{*} a_{17}^{*} a_{37}^{*} a_{25}^{*})a_{29}^{2}a_{11}^{*}\\ a_{12}^{*}a_{18}^{*}a_{15}^{*}\&(a_{42}^{*} a_{40}^{*} a_{26}^{*} a_{22}^{*} a_{32}^{*} a_{38}^{*} a_{31}^{2})a_{28}^{*})^{?}a_{13}^{*}a_{14}^{?}$	2	140	1.16 * 10 ⁶	