

Dear Dr. Robinson,

Thank you for your consideration of our manuscript. We have revised the paper in accord with your comments, and hope that these changes address your concerns.

Our responses to specific comments are shown below in italics. Should you have other editorial comments, or questions, please do not hesitate to contact us.

Sincerely,
Joseph D. Warren

Editor in Chief comments:

The keywords repeat words in the title, but they shouldn't. To maximise the chance of readers finding your paper, please delete all keywords that appear in the title and choose new keywords that do not appear in the title.

We have selected new keywords which do not overlap with the title.

Abstract needs attention. Specifically:

1) no aim or objective or reason is given for doing this study. Please write a new point 1 that outlines the aim and reason for the study, then renumber existing points as 2 onwards.

We have added a point 1 giving the context and justification for the study.

2) Please use the word 'autumn' instead of 'fall', here and throughout the ms. Freshwater Biology is an international journal and autumn is more widely understood especially in the many places where leaves do not fall in the autumn.

We have replaced all occurrences of “fall” with “autumn.”

Discussion

Results figures and tables should not be cited in the Discussion. Sometimes, if these citations exist they indicate that important results have not been presented in the Results section. Please ensure that all results discussed are stated clearly in the Results section. If results have been reported in the Results section, then it is not necessary to repeat them in the Discussion, so the references to figures and tables are not necessary and can be deleted.

line 483 - please remove the reference to table 4 here.

line 517 - ditto. please remove the reference to table 2.

line 528 - ditto. please remove the reference to figure 5.

line 561 - ditto. remove reference to figure 7

We felt these table and figure references were helpful to guide the reader to the points under discussion, but have removed them per the editor's request.

Greyscale version of figure 3 - i suggest that the substratum of the lake should be presented in black so that it contrasts with the symbols in the water column that are in grey

The substratum color has been changed to black.