

CSCI 512 Design and Implementation of Computer Programming Languages

Winter, 2017

Denotational Semantics for PostFix

Semantic Domains

$t \in \text{StackTransform} = \text{Stack} \rightarrow \text{Stack}$
 $s \in \text{Stack} = \text{Value}^* + \text{Error}$
 $d \in \text{Dictionary} = \text{Ident} \rightarrow (\text{Value} + \{\text{unbound}\})$
 $v \in \text{Value} = \text{Ident} + \text{Int} + \text{StackTransform}$
 $r \in \text{Result} = \text{Value} + \text{Error}$
 $a \in \text{Answer} = \text{Int} + \text{Error}$
 $\text{Error} = \{\text{error}\}$
 $n \in \text{Ident} = \{ "", "a", "b", \dots, "ab", \dots \}$
 $i \in \text{Int} = \{ \dots, -2, -1, 0, 1, 2, \dots \}$
 $b \in \text{Bool} = \{\text{true}, \text{false}\}$

Constants and Functions on PostFix Semantic Domains

$\text{errorResult} : \text{Result}$

An error in the domain *Result*.

$\text{errorAnswer} : \text{Answer}$

An error in the domain *Answer*.

$\text{errorStack} : \text{Stack}$

The distinguished error stack.

$\text{unbound} : \text{Dictionary}$

A token representing an unbound identifier in the domain *Dictionary*.

$\text{ErrorTransform} : \text{StackTransform}$

A transform that maps all stacks to *errorStack*.

$\text{push} : \text{Result} \rightarrow \text{StackTransform}$

Given a result value v , return a transform that pushes v onto a stack; otherwise return *errorTransform*.

$\text{pop} : \text{StackTransform}$

For a nonempty stack s , return the stack resulting from popping the top value; otherwise return *errorStack*.

$\text{top} : \text{Stack} \rightarrow \text{Result}$

Given a nonempty stack s , return a result that is the top element of s ; otherwise return *errorResult*.

$\text{intAt} : \text{Int} \rightarrow \text{Stack} \rightarrow \text{Result}$

Given the integer i_{index} and a stack whose i_{index} th element (starting from 1) is the integer i_{result} , return i_{result} ; otherwise return *errorResult*.

arithop : $(Int \rightarrow Int \rightarrow Result) \rightarrow StackTransform$

Let $f : Int \rightarrow Int \rightarrow Result$ be the functional argument to *arithop*. Return a transform with the following behavior: if the given stack has two integers i_1 and i_2 followed by s_{rest} , then return a stack whose top value v_{result} is followed by s_{rest} , where $(Value \mapsto Result\ v_{result})$ is the result of the application $(f\ i_1\ i_2)$. If the given stack is not of this form or if the result of applying f is *errorResult*, then return *errorStack*.

transform : $Result \rightarrow StackTransform$

Given a result that is a stack transform, return it; otherwise return *errorTransform*.

resToAns : $Result \rightarrow Answer$

Given a result that is an integer, return it as an answer; otherwise return *errorAnswer*.

bind : $Ident \rightarrow Value \rightarrow Dictionary$

Given a name, n , and a value, v , update the dictionary object, d , with a mapping between the n and v added to any existing bindings; if the name is already bound in the given dictionary, the new binding replaces the previous.

Valuation functions for PostFix

The signatures of the valuation functions provide insight into the meaning of the language elements.

$\mathcal{P} : Prog \rightarrow Int^* \rightarrow Answer$

$\mathcal{Q} : CommandSeq \rightarrow StackTransform$

$\mathcal{C} : Command \rightarrow StackTransform$

$\mathcal{A} : ArithmeticOperator \rightarrow (Int \rightarrow Int \rightarrow Result)$

$\mathcal{R} : RelationalOperator \rightarrow (Int \rightarrow Int \rightarrow Bool)$

$\mathcal{N} : IntLit \rightarrow Int$

$\mathcal{I} : Identifier \rightarrow Ident$

The meaning of a program (**postfix** $N_{numargs}\ Q$) is a function that transforms an initial stack consisting of the integers in the argument sequence via the transform $\mathcal{Q}[\![Q]\!]$ and returns the top integer of the resulting stack.

The meaning of a command sequence is the composition of the transforms of its component command. The order of the composition

$$\mathcal{Q}[\![Q]\!] \circ \mathcal{C}[\![C]\!] = \lambda s . (\mathcal{Q}[\![Q]\!] (\mathcal{C}[\![C]\!] s))$$

is crucial because it guarantees that the stack manipulations of the first command can be observed by subsequent commands.

$$\begin{aligned} \mathcal{P}[\![\text{postfix } N_{numargs}\ Q]\!] \\ &= \lambda i^* . \text{ if } (length\ i^*) =_{Int} \mathcal{N}[\![N_{numargs}]\!] \\ &\quad \text{ then } resToAns\ (top\ (\mathcal{Q}[\![Q]\!](Value^* \mapsto Stack\ (map\ Int \mapsto Value\ i^*)))) \\ &\quad \text{ else } errorAnswer \text{ end} \end{aligned}$$

$$\mathcal{Q}[\![C.Q]\!] = \mathcal{Q}[\![Q]\!] \circ \mathcal{C}[\![C]\!]$$

$$\mathcal{Q}[\![\]\!] = \lambda s . s$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\mathcal{C}[\![N]\!] &= \text{push } (Value \multimap Result \ (Int \multimap Value \ \mathcal{N}[\![N]\!])) \\
\mathcal{C}[\![I]\!] &= \text{push } (Value \multimap Result \ (Int \multimap Value \ \mathcal{I}[\![I]\!])) \\
\mathcal{C}[\![Q]\!] &= \text{push } (Value \multimap Result \ (StackTransform \multimap Value \ \mathcal{Q}[\![Q]\!])) \\
\mathcal{C}[\![\text{pop}]\!] &= \text{pop} \\
\mathcal{C}[\![\text{swap}]\!] &= \lambda s . (\text{push } (\text{top } (\text{pop } s)) \ (\text{push } (\text{top } s) \ (\text{pop } (\text{pop } s)))) \\
\mathcal{C}[\![\text{pair}]\!] &= \lambda s . (\text{push } \langle (\text{top } s) . (\text{top } (\text{pop } s)) \rangle \ (\text{pop } (\text{pop } s))) \\
\mathcal{C}[\![\text{fst}]\!] &= \lambda s . \text{ match } \text{top } s \\
&\quad \triangleright (Value^* \multimap Stack \ (\langle v_1, v_2 \rangle . v_{rest}^*)) \\
&\quad (\text{push } i_1 \ (\text{pop } s)) \\
&\quad \triangleright \text{ else } \text{errorStack} \text{ end} \\
\mathcal{C}[\![\text{snd}]\!] &= \lambda s . \text{ match } \text{top } s \\
&\quad \triangleright (Value^* \multimap Stack \ (\langle v_1, v_2 \rangle . v_{rest}^*)) \\
&\quad (\text{push } i_2 \ (\text{pop } s)) \\
&\quad \triangleright \text{ else } \text{errorStack} \text{ end} \\
\mathcal{C}[\![\text{for}]\!] &= \lambda s . \text{ match } \text{top } s \\
&\quad \triangleright (Value^* \multimap Stack \ (\langle (Int \multimap Value \ i), (Value^* \multimap StackTransform \ t^*) \rangle)) \\
&\quad \text{if } 1 \leq_{Int} i \\
&\quad \text{ then } (\text{push } (i . t^* @ \langle (i - 1) . t^* \rangle) \ (\text{pop } s)) \text{ end} \\
&\quad \triangleright (Value^* \multimap Stack \ (\langle (Int \multimap Value \ i), (Value^* \multimap StackTransform \ t^*) \rangle)) \\
&\quad \text{if } 0 =_{Int} i \\
&\quad \text{ then } (\text{pop } s) \text{ end} \\
&\quad \triangleright \text{ else } \text{errorStack} \text{ end} \\
\mathcal{C}[\![\text{nget}]\!] &= \lambda s . \text{ match } \text{top } s \\
&\quad \triangleright (Value \multimap Result \ (Int \multimap Value \ i)) \ \parallel (\text{push } (\text{intAt } i \ (\text{pop } s)) \ (\text{pop } s)) \\
&\quad \triangleright \text{ else } \text{errorStack} \text{ end} \\
\mathcal{C}[\![\text{sel}]\!] &= \lambda s . \text{ match } \text{top } (\text{pop } (\text{pop } s)) \\
&\quad \triangleright (Value \multimap Result \ (Int \multimap Value \ i)) \parallel \\
&\quad \text{push } (\text{if } i =_{Int} 0 \text{ then } \text{top } s \text{ else } \text{top } (\text{pop } s) \text{ end}) \\
&\quad (\text{pop } (\text{pop } (\text{pop } s))) \\
&\quad \triangleright \text{ else } \text{errorStack} \text{ end} \\
\mathcal{C}[\![\text{exec}]\!] &= \lambda s . (\text{transform } (\text{top } s) \ (\text{pop } s)) \\
\mathcal{C}[\![A]\!] &= \text{arithop } \mathcal{A}[\![A]\!] \\
\mathcal{C}[\![R]\!] &= \text{arithop } (\lambda i_1 i_2 . (Value \multimap Result \\
&\quad (Int \multimap Value \ (\text{if } (\mathcal{R}[\![R]\!] \ i_1 \ i_2) \text{ then } 1 \text{ else } 0 \text{ end})))) \\
\mathcal{C}[\![\text{ref}]\!] &= \lambda d . (\lambda s . \text{ match } \text{top } s \\
&\quad \triangleright (Value \multimap Result \ (Ident \multimap Value \ v_{name})) \parallel \\
&\quad \text{ then match } v_{name}
\end{aligned}$$

$\triangleright (\text{Value} \mapsto \text{Dictionary } ((\text{Ident} \mapsto \text{Value } v_{\text{name}}) (\text{Value} \mapsto \text{Result } v_{\text{val}}))) \parallel$
 $(\text{push } v_{\text{val}} (\text{pop } s))$
else *errorStack*
 \triangleright **else** *errorStack* **end**)

$\mathcal{C}[\text{def}] = \lambda d . (\lambda s . \text{match } s$
 $\triangleright (\text{Value}^* \mapsto \text{Stack } ((\text{Int} \mapsto \text{Value } v_1) . (\text{Ident} \mapsto \text{Value } v_2) . v_{\text{rest}}^*)) \parallel$
if $v_2 \notin \{\text{pop}, \text{swap}, \text{pair}, \text{fst}, \text{snd}, \text{for}, \text{nget}, \text{sel}, \text{exec},$
 $\text{add}, \text{sub}, \text{mul}, \text{div}, \text{rem}, \text{ref}, \text{def}\}$
then $(\text{bind } v_2 v_1) \wedge (\text{pop } (\text{pop } s))$ **end**
 \triangleright **else** *errorStack* **end**)

$\mathcal{A}[\text{add}] = \lambda i_1 i_2 . (\text{Value} \mapsto \text{Result } (\text{Int} \mapsto \text{Value } (i_1 +_{\text{Int}} i_2)))$

$\mathcal{A}[\text{sub}] = \lambda i_1 i_2 . (\text{Value} \mapsto \text{Result } (\text{Int} \mapsto \text{Value } (i_1 -_{\text{Int}} i_2)))$

$\mathcal{A}[\text{mul}] = \lambda i_1 i_2 . (\text{Value} \mapsto \text{Result } (\text{Int} \mapsto \text{Value } (i_1 \times_{\text{Int}} i_2)))$

$\mathcal{A}[\text{div}] = \lambda i_1 i_2 . \text{if } i_2 =_{\text{Int}} 0$
then *errorResult*
 $(\text{Value} \mapsto \text{Result } (\text{Int} \mapsto \text{Value } (i_1 \div_{\text{Int}} i_2)))$ **end**

$\mathcal{A}[\text{rem}] = \lambda i_1 i_2 . \text{if } i_2 =_{\text{Int}} 0$
then *errorResult*
 $(\text{Value} \mapsto \text{Result } (\text{Int} \mapsto \text{Value } (i_1 \%_{\text{Int}} i_2)))$ **end**

$\mathcal{R}[\text{lt}] = <_{\text{Int}}$

$\mathcal{R}[\text{eq}] = =_{\text{Int}}$

$\mathcal{R}[\text{gt}] = >_{\text{Int}}$

\mathcal{N} maps integer literals to the integer numbers that they denote.

\mathcal{I} maps name literals, except for PostFix command names (reserved words), to the alphabetic strings that they denote.

Semantic functions for PostFix

errorResult : *Result* = (*Error* \mapsto *Result* **error**)

errorAnswer : *Answer* = (*Error* \mapsto *Answer* **error**)

errorStack : *Stack* = (*Error* \mapsto *Stack* **error**)

errorTransform : *StackTransform* = $\lambda s . \text{errorStack}$

push : *Result* \rightarrow *StackTransform*

$= \lambda r . (\lambda s . \text{match } \langle r, s \rangle$
 $\triangleright \langle (\text{Value} \mapsto \text{Result } v), (\text{Value}^* \mapsto \text{Stack } v^*) \rangle \parallel (v . v^*)$
 \triangleright **else** *errorStack* **end**)

pop : *StackTransform*

$= \lambda s . \text{match } s$
 $\triangleright (\text{Value}^* \mapsto \text{Stack } (v_{\text{head}} . v_{\text{tail}}^*)) \parallel (\text{Value}^* \mapsto \text{Stack } v_{\text{tail}}^*)$
 \triangleright **else** *errorStack* **end**

```

top : Stack → Result
= λs . match s
  ▷ (Value* → Stack (vhead . vtail*)) [] (Value → Result vhead)
  ▷ else errorResult end

intAt : Int → Stack → Result
= λis . match s
  ▷ (Value* → Stack v*) []
  if 1 ≤Int i and i ≤Int (length v*)
    then match (nth i v*)
      ▷ (Int → Value iresult) [] (Value → Result (Int → Value iresult))
      ▷ else errorResult
    else errorResult end
  ▷ else ErrorResult end

arithop : (Int → Int → Result) → StackTransform
= λf . (λs . match s
  ▷ (Value* → Stack ((Int → Value i1) . (Int → Value i2) . vrest*)) []
  (push (f i2 i1) vrest*)
  ▷ else errorStack end)

transform : Result → StackTransform
= λr . match r
  ▷ (Value → Result (StackTransform → Value t)) [] t
  ▷ else errorTransform end

resToAns : Result → Answer
= λr . match r
  ▷ (Value → Result (Int → Value i)) [] (Int → Answer i)
  ▷ else ErrorAnswer end

bind : Ident → Value → Dictionary
= λIbind V D . λIref . if Ibind = Iref then V else (D Iref) end

```

Solutions

By applying the developed denotational semantics to the following PostFix programs, their meaning can be determined. The meaning of each program is an element of a function domain that maps the PostFix context domains to an answer that is either in the domain of integers or an error token.

Question 2.a.i

```

(IF ⟨(postfix 0 0 (for 11 (pop 2 add))), []⟩)
= ⟨0 (for 11 (pop 2 add)), []⟩
⇒ ⟨(for 11 (pop 2 add)), [0]⟩ [num]
⇒ ⟨11 pop 2 add (for 10 (pop 2 add)), [0]⟩ [for]
⇒ ⟨pop 2 add (for 10 (pop 2 add)), [11, 0]⟩ [num]
⇒ ⟨2 add (for 10 (pop 2 add)), [0]⟩ [pop]

```

$\Rightarrow \langle \text{add (for 10 (pop 2 add)), [2, 0]} \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle (\text{for 10 (pop 2 add)}, [2]) \rangle$	[arithop]
$\Rightarrow \langle 10 \text{ pop 2 add (for 9 (pop 2 add)), [2]} \rangle$	[for]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{pop 2 add (for 9 (pop 2 add)), [10, 2]} \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle 2 \text{ add (for 9 (pop 2 add)), [2]} \rangle$	[pop]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{add (for 9 (pop 2 add)), [2, 2]} \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle (\text{for 9 (pop 2 add)}, [4]) \rangle$	[arithop]
$\Rightarrow \langle 9 \text{ pop 2 add (for 8 (pop 2 add)), [4]} \rangle$	[for]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{pop 2 add (for 8 (pop 2 add)), [9, 4]} \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle 2 \text{ add (for 8 (pop 2 add)), [4]} \rangle$	[pop]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{add (for 8 (pop 2 add)), [2, 4]} \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle (\text{for 8 (pop 2 add)}, [6]) \rangle$	[arithop]
$\Rightarrow \langle 8 \text{ pop 2 add (for 7 (pop 2 add)), [6]} \rangle$	[for]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{pop 2 add (for 7 (pop 2 add)), [8, 6]} \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle 2 \text{ add (for 7 (pop 2 add)), [6]} \rangle$	[pop]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{add (for 7 (pop 2 add)), [2, 6]} \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle (\text{for 7 (pop 2 add)}, [8]) \rangle$	[arithop]
$\Rightarrow \langle 7 \text{ pop 2 add (for 6 (pop 2 add)), [8]} \rangle$	[for]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{pop 2 add (for 6 (pop 2 add)), [7, 8]} \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle 2 \text{ add (for 6 (pop 2 add)), [8]} \rangle$	[pop]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{add (for 6 (pop 2 add)), [2, 8]} \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle (\text{for 6 (pop 2 add)}, [10]) \rangle$	[arithop]
$\Rightarrow \langle 6 \text{ pop 2 add (for 5 (pop 2 add)), [10]} \rangle$	[for]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{pop 2 add (for 5 (pop 2 add)), [6, 10]} \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle 2 \text{ add (for 5 (pop 2 add)), [10]} \rangle$	[pop]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{add (for 5 (pop 2 add)), [2, 10]} \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle (\text{for 5 (pop 2 add)}, [12]) \rangle$	[arithop]
$\Rightarrow \langle 5 \text{ pop 2 add (for 4 (pop 2 add)), [12]} \rangle$	[for]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{pop 2 add (for 4 (pop 2 add)), [5, 12]} \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle 2 \text{ add (for 4 (pop 2 add)), [12]} \rangle$	[pop]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{add (for 4 (pop 2 add)), [2, 12]} \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle (\text{for 4 (pop 2 add)}, [14]) \rangle$	[arithop]
$\Rightarrow \langle 4 \text{ pop 2 add (for 3 (pop 2 add)), [14]} \rangle$	[for]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{pop 2 add (for 3 (pop 2 add)), [4, 14]} \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle 2 \text{ add (for 3 (pop 2 add)), [14]} \rangle$	[pop]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{add (for 3 (pop 2 add)), [2, 14]} \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle (\text{for 3 (pop 2 add)}, [16]) \rangle$	[arithop]
$\Rightarrow \langle 3 \text{ pop 2 add (for 2 (pop 2 add)), [16]} \rangle$	[for]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{pop 2 add (for 2 (pop 2 add)), [3, 16]} \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle 2 \text{ add (for 2 (pop 2 add)), [16]} \rangle$	[pop]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{add (for 2 (pop 2 add)), [2, 16]} \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle (\text{for 2 (pop 2 add)}, [18]) \rangle$	[arithop]
$\Rightarrow \langle 2 \text{ pop 2 add (for 1 (pop 2 add)), [18]} \rangle$	[for]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{pop 2 add (for 1 (pop 2 add)), [2, 18]} \rangle$	[num]

$\Rightarrow \langle 2 \text{ add (for 1 (pop 2 add))}, [18] \rangle$	[pop]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{add (for 1 (pop 2 add))}, [2, 18] \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle (\text{for 1 (pop 2 add)}), [20] \rangle$	[arithop]
$\Rightarrow \langle 1 \text{ pop 2 add (for 0 (pop 2 add))}, [20] \rangle$	[for]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{pop 2 add (for 0 (pop 2 add))}, [1, 20] \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle 2 \text{ add (for 0 (pop 2 add))}, [20] \rangle$	[pop]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{add (for 0 (pop 2 add))}, [2, 20] \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle (\text{for 0 (pop 2 add)}), [22] \rangle$	[arithop]
$\Rightarrow \langle (), [22] \rangle \in \text{FC}$	[for]
$\Rightarrow (\text{OF } \langle (), [22] \rangle) = 22$	

Question 2.a.ii

(IF $\langle (\text{postfix 0 0 (for 6 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add))))) \rangle, [] \rangle$)	
$= \langle 0 \text{ (for 6 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [] \rangle$	
$\Rightarrow \langle (\text{for 6 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [0] \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle 6 \text{ pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)) (for 5 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [0] \rangle$	[for]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)) (for 5 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [6, 0] \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle (\text{for 7 (pop 1 add)) (for 5 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [0] \rangle$	[pop]
$\Rightarrow \langle 7 \text{ pop 1 add (for 6 (pop 1 add)) (for 5 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [0] \rangle$	[for]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{pop 1 add (for 6 (pop 1 add)) (for 5 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [7, 0] \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle 1 \text{ add (for 6 (pop 1 add)) (for 5 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [0] \rangle$	[pop]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{add (for 6 (pop 1 add)) (for 5 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [1, 0] \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle (\text{for 6 (pop 1 add)) (for 5 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [1] \rangle$	[arithop]
$\Rightarrow \langle 6 \text{ pop 1 add (for 5 (pop 1 add)) (for 5 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [1] \rangle$	[for]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{pop 1 add (for 5 (pop 1 add)) (for 5 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [6, 1] \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle 1 \text{ add (for 5 (pop 1 add)) (for 5 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [1] \rangle$	[pop]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{add (for 5 (pop 1 add)) (for 5 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [1, 1] \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle (\text{for 5 (pop 1 add)) (for 5 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [2] \rangle$	[arithop]
$\Rightarrow \langle 5 \text{ pop 1 add (for 4 (pop 1 add)) (for 5 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [2] \rangle$	[for]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{pop 1 add (for 4 (pop 1 add)) (for 5 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [5, 2] \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle 1 \text{ add (for 4 (pop 1 add)) (for 5 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [2] \rangle$	[pop]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{add (for 4 (pop 1 add)) (for 5 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [1, 2] \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle (\text{for 4 (pop 1 add)) (for 5 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [3] \rangle$	[arithop]
$\Rightarrow \langle 4 \text{ pop 1 add (for 3 (pop 1 add)) (for 5 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [3] \rangle$	[for]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{pop 1 add (for 3 (pop 1 add)) (for 5 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [4, 3] \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle 1 \text{ add (for 3 (pop 1 add)) (for 5 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [3] \rangle$	[pop]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{add (for 3 (pop 1 add)) (for 5 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [1, 3] \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle (\text{for 3 (pop 1 add)) (for 5 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [4] \rangle$	[arithop]
$\Rightarrow \langle 3 \text{ pop 1 add (for 2 (pop 1 add)) (for 5 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [4] \rangle$	[for]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{pop 1 add (for 2 (pop 1 add)) (for 5 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [3, 4] \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle 1 \text{ add (for 2 (pop 1 add)) (for 5 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [4] \rangle$	[pop]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{add (for 2 (pop 1 add)) (for 5 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [1, 4] \rangle$	[num]
$\Rightarrow \langle (\text{for 2 (pop 1 add)) (for 5 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [5] \rangle$	[arithop]
$\Rightarrow \langle 2 \text{ pop 1 add (for 1 (pop 1 add)) (for 5 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [5] \rangle$	[for]
$\Rightarrow \langle \text{pop 1 add (for 1 (pop 1 add)) (for 5 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))))}, [2, 5] \rangle$	[num]

[illegible]

⇒ ⟨1 add (for 0 (pop 1 add)) (for 4 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [13]⟩	[pop]
⇒ ⟨add (for 0 (pop 1 add)) (for 4 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [1, 13]⟩	[num]
⇒ ⟨(for 0 (pop 1 add)) (for 4 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [14]⟩	[arithop]
⇒ ⟨(for 4 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [14]⟩	[for]
⇒ ⟨4 pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [14]⟩	[for]
⇒ ⟨pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [4, 14]⟩	[num]
⇒ ⟨(for 7 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [14]⟩	[pop]
⇒ ⟨7 pop 1 add (for 6 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [14]⟩	[for]
⇒ ⟨pop 1 add (for 6 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [7, 14]⟩	[num]
⇒ ⟨1 add (for 6 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [14]⟩	[pop]
⇒ ⟨add (for 6 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [1, 14]⟩	[num]
⇒ ⟨(for 6 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [15]⟩	[arithop]
⇒ ⟨6 pop 1 add (for 5 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [15]⟩	[for]
⇒ ⟨pop 1 add (for 5 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [6, 15]⟩	[num]
⇒ ⟨1 add (for 5 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [15]⟩	[pop]
⇒ ⟨add (for 5 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [1, 15]⟩	[num]
⇒ ⟨(for 5 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [16]⟩	[arithop]
⇒ ⟨5 pop 1 add (for 4 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [16]⟩	[for]
⇒ ⟨pop 1 add (for 4 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [5, 16]⟩	[num]
⇒ ⟨1 add (for 4 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [16]⟩	[pop]
⇒ ⟨add (for 4 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [1, 16]⟩	[num]
⇒ ⟨(for 4 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [17]⟩	[arithop]
⇒ ⟨4 pop 1 add (for 3 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [17]⟩	[for]
⇒ ⟨pop 1 add (for 3 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [4, 17]⟩	[num]
⇒ ⟨1 add (for 3 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [17]⟩	[pop]
⇒ ⟨add (for 3 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [1, 17]⟩	[num]
⇒ ⟨(for 3 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [18]⟩	[arithop]
⇒ ⟨3 pop 1 add (for 2 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [18]⟩	[for]
⇒ ⟨pop 1 add (for 2 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [3, 18]⟩	[num]
⇒ ⟨1 add (for 2 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [18]⟩	[pop]
⇒ ⟨add (for 2 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [1, 18]⟩	[num]
⇒ ⟨(for 2 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [19]⟩	[arithop]
⇒ ⟨2 pop 1 add (for 1 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [19]⟩	[for]
⇒ ⟨pop 1 add (for 1 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [2, 19]⟩	[num]
⇒ ⟨1 add (for 1 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [19]⟩	[pop]
⇒ ⟨add (for 1 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [1, 19]⟩	[num]
⇒ ⟨(for 1 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [20]⟩	[arithop]
⇒ ⟨1 pop 1 add (for 0 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [20]⟩	[for]
⇒ ⟨pop 1 add (for 0 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [1, 20]⟩	[num]
⇒ ⟨1 add (for 0 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [20]⟩	[pop]
⇒ ⟨add (for 0 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [1, 20]⟩	[num]
⇒ ⟨(for 0 (pop 1 add)) (for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [21]⟩	[arithop]
⇒ ⟨(for 3 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [21]⟩	[for]
⇒ ⟨3 pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)) (for 2 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add)))), [21]⟩	[for]

⇒ ⟨add (for 5 (pop 1 add)) (for 0 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add))))⟩, [1, 36]⟩	[num]
⇒ ⟨(for 5 (pop 1 add)) (for 0 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add))))⟩, [37]⟩	[arithop]
⇒ ⟨5 pop 1 add (for 4 (pop 1 add)) (for 0 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add))))⟩, [37]⟩	[for]
⇒ ⟨pop 1 add (for 4 (pop 1 add)) (for 0 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add))))⟩, [5, 37]⟩	[num]
⇒ ⟨1 add (for 4 (pop 1 add)) (for 0 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add))))⟩, [37]⟩	[pop]
⇒ ⟨add (for 4 (pop 1 add)) (for 0 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add))))⟩, [1, 37]⟩	[num]
⇒ ⟨(for 4 (pop 1 add)) (for 0 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add))))⟩, [38]⟩	[arithop]
⇒ ⟨4 pop 1 add (for 0 (pop 1 add)) (for 0 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add))))⟩, [38]⟩	[for]
⇒ ⟨pop 1 add (for 3 (pop 1 add)) (for 0 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add))))⟩, [4, 38]⟩	[num]
⇒ ⟨1 add (for 3 (pop 1 add)) (for 0 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add))))⟩, [38]⟩	[pop]
⇒ ⟨add (for 3 (pop 1 add)) (for 0 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add))))⟩, [1, 38]⟩	[num]
⇒ ⟨(for 3 (pop 1 add)) (for 0 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add))))⟩, [39]⟩	[arithop]
⇒ ⟨3 pop 1 add (for 2 (pop 1 add)) (for 0 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add))))⟩, [39]⟩	[for]
⇒ ⟨pop 1 add (for 2 (pop 1 add)) (for 0 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add))))⟩, [3, 39]⟩	[num]
⇒ ⟨1 add (for 2 (pop 1 add)) (for 0 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add))))⟩, [39]⟩	[pop]
⇒ ⟨add (for 2 (pop 1 add)) (for 0 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add))))⟩, [1, 39]⟩	[num]
⇒ ⟨(for 2 (pop 1 add)) (for 0 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add))))⟩, [40]⟩	[arithop]
⇒ ⟨2 pop 1 add (for 1 (pop 1 add)) (for 0 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add))))⟩, [40]⟩	[for]
⇒ ⟨pop 1 add (for 1 (pop 1 add)) (for 0 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add))))⟩, [2, 40]⟩	[num]
⇒ ⟨1 add (for 1 (pop 1 add)) (for 0 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add))))⟩, [40]⟩	[pop]
⇒ ⟨add (for 1 (pop 1 add)) (for 0 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add))))⟩, [1, 40]⟩	[num]
⇒ ⟨(for 1 (pop 1 add)) (for 0 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add))))⟩, [41]⟩	[arithop]
⇒ ⟨1 pop 1 add (for 0 (pop 1 add)) (for 0 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add))))⟩, [41]⟩	[for]
⇒ ⟨pop 1 add (for 0 (pop 1 add)) (for 0 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add))))⟩, [1, 41]⟩	[num]
⇒ ⟨1 add (for 0 (pop 1 add)) (for 0 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add))))⟩, [41]⟩	[pop]
⇒ ⟨add (for 0 (pop 1 add)) (for 0 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add))))⟩, [1, 41]⟩	[num]
⇒ ⟨(for 0 (pop 1 add)) (for 0 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add))))⟩, [42]⟩	[arithop]
⇒ ⟨(for 0 (pop (for 7 (pop 1 add))))⟩, [42]⟩	[for]
⇒ ⟨(), [42]⟩ ∈ FC	[for]
⇒ (OF ⟨(), [42]⟩) = 42	

Question 2.b

Proof: To prove the termination property of PostFix does not change, we show that every transition reduces the energy of a configuration. First, we know that the energy of a configuration, sequence, or stack is greater than or equal to the sum of the energy of its components. By considering the rewrite rules of *for*, it is possible to see that the energy strictly decreases with each transition. The energy of the *for* command is defined as follows:

$$\begin{aligned}
E_{config} \llbracket \langle (\text{for } N(Q_{\text{for}})) \cdot Q_{\text{rest}}, S \rangle \rrbracket \\
&= E_{seq} \llbracket \langle \text{for} \cdot N \cdot (Q_{\text{for}}) \rrbracket + E_{stack} \llbracket Q_{\text{rest}} \cdot S \rrbracket \\
&= 1 + E_{com} \llbracket \text{for} \rrbracket + E_{com} \llbracket N \rrbracket + E_{com} \llbracket (Q_{\text{for}}) \rrbracket + E_{seq} \llbracket Q_{\text{rest}} \rrbracket + E_{stack} \llbracket S \rrbracket \\
&= 2 + E_{com} \llbracket N \rrbracket + E_{seq} \llbracket Q_{\text{for}} \rrbracket + E_{seq} \llbracket Q_{\text{rest}} \rrbracket + E_{stack} \llbracket S \rrbracket \\
&= 2 + E_{config} \llbracket \langle N \cdot Q_{\text{for}} @ ((N - 1) \cdot Q_{\text{for}}), S \rangle \rrbracket
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& E_{config} \llbracket \langle (\text{for } N(Q_{for})) \cdot Q_{rest}, S \rangle \rrbracket \\
&= E_{seq} \llbracket \langle \text{for} \cdot N \cdot (Q_{for}) \rrbracket + E_{stack} \llbracket Q_{rest} \cdot S \rrbracket \\
&= 1 + E_{com} \llbracket \text{for} \rrbracket + E_{com} \llbracket N \rrbracket + E_{com} \llbracket (Q_{for}) \rrbracket + E_{seq} \llbracket Q_{rest} \rrbracket + E_{stack} \llbracket S \rrbracket \\
&= 2 + E_{com} \llbracket N \rrbracket + E_{seq} \llbracket Q_{for} \rrbracket + E_{seq} \llbracket Q_{rest} \rrbracket + E_{stack} \llbracket S \rrbracket \\
&= 2 + E_{seq} \llbracket Q_{for} \rrbracket + E_{seq} \llbracket Q_{rest} \rrbracket + E_{stack} \llbracket S \rrbracket \\
&= 2 + E_{config} \llbracket \langle Q_{rest}, S \rangle \rrbracket
\end{aligned}$$

Thus, since we know that executing a command consumes at least one unit of energy, the termination property of PostFix does not change with the introduction of the *for* command.

Question 3.a.i

The following program returns the average of the values 3 and 7, which is 5.

(postfix 0 average (add 2 div) def 3 7 average ref exec) $\xrightarrow{[]}$ average (add 2 div) def 3 7 average ref exec

\Rightarrow average (add 2 div) def 3 7 average ref exec \rightarrow [], []
 \Rightarrow (add 2 div) def 3 7 average ref exec \rightarrow [average], [] [ident]
 \Rightarrow def 3 7 average ref exec \rightarrow [(add 2 div)], [] [seq]
 \Rightarrow 3 7 average ref exec \rightarrow [], [(average = (add 2 div))] [def]
 \Rightarrow 7 average ref exec \rightarrow [3], [(average = (add 2 div))] [num]
 \Rightarrow average ref exec \rightarrow [7, 3], [(average = (add 2 div))] [num]
 \Rightarrow ref exec \rightarrow [average, 7, 3], [(average = (add 2 div))] [ident]
 \Rightarrow exec \rightarrow [(add 2 div), 7, 3], [(average = (add 2 div))] [ref]
 \Rightarrow () \rightarrow [5], [(average = (add 2 div))] [exec]
 $= 5$

Question 3.a.ii

The following program returns an error on the second *def* command since the second value on the stack, 5, is not an identifier.

(postfix 0 a 5 def a ref 7 def b ref) $\xrightarrow{[]}$ a 5 def a ref 7 def b ref

\Rightarrow a 5 def a ref 7 def b ref \rightarrow [], []
 \Rightarrow 5 def a ref 7 def b ref \rightarrow [a], [] [ident]
 \Rightarrow def a ref 7 def b ref \rightarrow [5, a], [] [num]
 \Rightarrow a ref 7 def b ref \rightarrow [], [(a = 5)] [def]
 \Rightarrow ref 7 def b ref \rightarrow [a], [(a = 5)] [ident]
 \Rightarrow 7 def b ref \rightarrow [5], [(a = 5)] [ref]
 \Rightarrow def b ref \rightarrow [7, 5], [(a = 5)] [num]
 $= \text{error}$

Question 3.a.iii

The following program returns an error on the *ref* command since the first value on the stack, d, is not bound in the dictionary.

(postfix 0 c 4 def d ref 1 add)	$\xrightarrow{[]}$	c 4 def d ref 1 add
\Rightarrow c 4 def d ref 1 add	\rightarrow	[], []
\Rightarrow 4 def d ref 1 add	\rightarrow	[c], []
\Rightarrow def d ref 1 add	\rightarrow	[4, c], []
\Rightarrow d ref 1 add	\rightarrow	[], [(c = 4)]
\Rightarrow ref 1 add	\rightarrow	[d], [(c = 4)]
= error		

[ident]
[num]
[def]
[ident]