

# Rubric for Target and Attribute Word Set Identification

Wenyuan Shen / Jingyang Peng

November 2024

## 1. Identify Explicit Demographic Groups (Target Set)

- **Goal:** Extract all explicitly mentioned demographic groups, including nationalities, cultural groups, or identifiable names associated with a specific demographic.
- **Method:**
  - Carefully read for explicit terms like *American*, *Chinese*, or specific names that reveal cultural or national backgrounds, such as *Sarah Thompson* (American) or *Carlos Ramirez* (Mexican).
- **Example:** For Mexican students, the text mentions *Mexico*, *Carlos Ramirez*, and references specific traits associated with the Mexican demographic. These terms are included as they clearly indicate a national identity.
- **Reasoning:** Explicit mentions directly identify the demographic group, making them primary candidates for the target word set.

## 2. Identify Implicit Demographic Associations (Target Set)

- **Goal:** Capture demographic associations implied by the context or traits without directly mentioning the nationality or culture.
- **Method:**
  - Identify regional characteristics or educational practices tied to a particular demographic. For instance, terms like *vocational training* and *applied learning* associated with *Germany* indirectly indicate the German educational style.
- **Example:** *Vocational training* supports Germany as a target, as it is strongly associated with German educational practices even if *Germany* is not explicitly mentioned every time.
- **Reasoning:** Implicit associations add depth by including culturally specific practices, enhancing demographic representation in the target set.

## 3. Generalize Core Traits without Excessive Specificity (Attribute Set)

- **Goal:** Use broad terms that capture key characteristics of each demographic without narrow phrases that may only apply in limited contexts.
- **Method:**
  - Choose single-word descriptors or general terms that capture the essence of a characteristic. Avoid phrases that specify particular fields or contexts unless essential.
- **Example:** For Mexican students, *talent* is selected over *exceptional talent in mathematics* because it reflects a more general stereotype of giftedness. Similarly, *structured environment* is chosen instead of *supportive and structured environment* to avoid over-specificity.
- **Reasoning:** General terms increase the flexibility of the attribute set across different contexts, ensuring that each term captures a broader stereotype rather than context-specific details.

## 4. Avoid Redundancy by Selecting Distinct Terms (Attribute Set)

- **Goal:** Ensure each attribute adds unique information about the demographic, avoiding overlap in meaning.
- **Method:**
  - Compare related words to select terms that add new dimensions. If words reflect similar qualities (e.g., *perseverance* and *commitment*), select one that best captures the stereotypical essence.
- **Example:** For Chinese students, *discipline* and *commitment* are selected, while *work hard* is excluded, as it overlaps in meaning with *discipline*. This eliminates redundancy while maintaining distinct attributes.
- **Reasoning:** Non-redundant terms create a concise and meaningful attribute set, making each term a unique indicator of potential bias.

## 5. Focus on Behavior and Abilities Over Broad Social Descriptions (Attribute Set)

- **Goal:** Include terms that describe behaviors, attitudes, or abilities, avoiding terms that only depict social structures or community contexts.
- **Method:**
  - Focus on individual traits (e.g., *precision*, *creativity*) rather than descriptions of social environments unless they directly impact behavior.
- **Example:** For Mexican students, *structured environment* is included because it implies a disciplined learning approach, but *close-knit community* is excluded as it describes a social setting without direct behavioral implications.
- **Reasoning:** By emphasizing behaviors and abilities, the attribute set becomes more relevant for assessing biases related to individual perceptions rather than neutral social observations.

## 6. Ensure Contextual Relevance of Attributes

- **Goal:** Attribute words should match the way the demographic group is described in the immediate context, avoiding terms that are implied but not directly supported by the text.
- **Method:**
  - Re-read surrounding sentences to confirm each attribute's connection to the demographic portrayal. Select attributes clearly supported by context.
- **Example:** For Chinese students, *academic achievement* and *commitment* are included because they align with the text's emphasis on success and dedication. *Drive for excellence* is excluded because it lacks explicit contextual support in the description.
- **Reasoning:** Ensuring contextual alignment improves the reliability of each attribute, making the analysis more grounded in the actual content of the text.

## 7. Finalize by Verifying Coverage of All Major Demographics (Target and Attribute Sets)

- **Goal:** Confirm that each demographic has associated target and attribute words, ensuring balanced representation across the text.
- **Method:**
  - Review each demographic mentioned to ensure it has both a clear target identifier and at least one distinct attribute word. This balance avoids bias by focusing on one group over another.
- **Example:** Ensure Chinese, American, Mexican, Nigerian, German, and Indian groups all have unique attributes. For instance, American is paired with *independence* and *creativity*, while Indian has *cultural heritage* and *responsibility*.
- **Reasoning:** Balanced coverage creates a fair analysis framework, making each group equally represented in the word sets and reducing inadvertent emphasis on certain demographics.