

Here are some comments about problem A5 of the the 2018 Putnam exam.

Let us consider some features of a hypothetical counterexample f , i.e. a function defined and infinitely differentiable on the entire real line, for which both f and all its derivatives are everywhere non-negative, with $f(1)$ strictly positive but $f(0) = 0$.

If $a < 0$ then by the Mean Value Theorem there is a point c between a and 0 where $f'(c) = (f(0) - f(a))/(0 - a) = f(a)/a$; since f' is everywhere non-negative and a is negative this implies $f(a) \leq 0$. But we are told $f(a) \geq 0$ too, so we see $f(a) = 0$ for all $a < 0$.

Similarly if $a \in [0, 1]$ then the MVT assures us that $0 \leq f(a) \leq f(1) = 1$

I suspect that the way to get a contradiction would be to use the analogous theorem for higher-order derivatives, which is Lagrange's Theorem for Taylor series. From a putative counterexample f I would construct the Taylor series at 1, i.e. the formal power series

$$F(x) = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \frac{f^{(n)}(1)}{n!} (x-1)^n$$

(Incidentally the Taylor series at 0 would just be $0 + 0x + 0x^2 + \dots$!) This Taylor series does not necessarily converge at *any* x other than $x = 1$, but Lagrange helps us estimate the error: if $T_n(x)$ is the n th partial sum of this series, i.e. the degree- n Taylor Polynomial, then Lagrange shows there exists a number c between 1 and x where $F(x) = T_n(x) + \frac{f^{(n+1)}(c)}{(n+1)!} (x-1)^{n+1}$. In particular, if we suppose that all the derivatives of f are everywhere non-negative, this shows that $F(x) \geq T_n(x)$ for all n and all $x \geq 1$, as well as all $x < 1$ whenever n is odd, although $F(x) \leq T_n(x)$ for all $x < 1$ whenever n is even. This does tell us that all the derivatives of f are strictly positive at $x = 1$: if any of them were equal to zero then two consecutive Taylor polynomials would be identical, contradicting $T_{2k}(x) \leq 0 \leq T_{2k+1}(x)$ for all $x < 0$.

So we have a sequence of polynomials alternately greater than and less than $F(x)$ on $(0, 1)$; if we knew these polynomials converged pointwise to F here, I could get a contradiction, I think. But I don't know how to make any progress without knowing the Taylor series converges somewhere beside $x = 1$.

It is important to note that there ARE functions of this sort: they are infinitely differentiable, but not represented by power series. The classic example is

$$f(x) = \begin{cases} e^{-1/x} & \text{if } x > 0 \\ 0 & \text{if } x \leq 0 \end{cases}$$

One has to show that $f^{(n)}(0)$ exists for every n , but it does, and each of these derivatives is zero, which means that the Taylor series of f at the origin is $0 + 0x + 0x^2 + \dots$, which clearly does not converge to $f(x)$ for all x in a neighborhood of 0 (no matter how small)!

Of course there are others: the antiderivative $F(x) = \int_{-\infty}^x f(t) dt$ of such a function is another such function, and grows even faster than f . You can repeat this to get examples which grow faster than any quadratic polynomial, or faster than any cubic, or \dots

All these functions have one of their higher-order derivatives equal to that first example $f(x) = e^{-1/x}$, and a glance at the graph of this function shows it must have an inflection point, where $f''(c) = 0$. So none of these functions are counterexamples to problem A5, but they illustrate how close one may come to such a counterexample.

Also note that $g(x) = f(x)f(1-x)$ is positive for $x \in (0, 1)$ but positive everywhere else, and still infinitely differentially; the graph is a smooth “bump” over the real line. Such functions are extremely useful in Differential Geometry. We sometimes also use functions like $G(x) = \int_{-\infty}^x g(t) dt$ to create infinitely differentiable functions that transition from one constant value on $(-\infty, 0]$ to another on $[1, \infty)$. It’s not hard to show that the Taylor series of this G at $x = 1$ is just $G(1) + 0(x-1) + 0(x-1)^2 + \dots$, which does not converge to $G(x)$ for any $x < 1$, illustrating my frustration with my proposed method of proof.

(Functions of the form $G(ax+b)$ are similar but transition at other points besides $x = 0$ and $x = 1$.)

You might also like the bump function $h(x) = 1 - e^{-1/x^2}$ which is infinitely differentiable and everywhere positive and whose Taylor series at 0 again vanishes identically, but $h(x) \neq 0$ for every $x \neq 0$, so this Taylor series does not converge to $h(x)$ for *any* x except $x = 0$!