

## C03 – Hoare Logic (cont.)

---

Program Verification

FMI · Denisa Diaconescu · Spring 2025

# Proof rules for Hoare logic

The assignment axiom:

$$\{Q(E)\} x := E \{Q(x)\}$$

Precondition Strengthening rule:

$$\frac{P_s \rightarrow P_w \quad \{P_w\} \mathbb{C} \{Q\}}{\{P_s\} \mathbb{C} \{Q\}}$$

Postcondition Weakening rule:

$$\frac{\{P\} \mathbb{C} \{Q_s\} \quad Q_s \rightarrow Q_w}{\{P\} \mathbb{C} \{Q_w\}}$$

Sequencing rule:

$$\frac{\{P\} \mathbb{C}_1 \{Q\} \quad \{Q\} \mathbb{C}_2 \{R\}}{\{P\} \mathbb{C}_1; \mathbb{C}_2 \{R\}}$$

Conditional rule:

$$\frac{\{P \wedge \mathbb{B}\} \mathbb{C}_1 \{Q\} \quad \{P \wedge \neg \mathbb{B}\} \mathbb{C}_2 \{Q\}}{\{P\} \text{ if } \mathbb{B} \text{ then } \mathbb{C}_1 \text{ else } \mathbb{C}_2 \{Q\}}$$

# Proof rule for While Loops

Suppose we want to prove

$$\{P\} \text{ while } \mathbb{B} \text{ do } \mathbb{C} \{Q\}$$

# Proof rule for While Loops

Suppose we want to prove

$$\{P\} \text{ while } \mathbb{B} \text{ do } \mathbb{C} \{Q\}$$

While rule:

$$\boxed{\frac{\{I \wedge \mathbb{B}\} \mathbb{C} \{I\}}{\{I\} \text{ while } \mathbb{B} \text{ do } \mathbb{C} \{I \wedge \neg \mathbb{B}\}}}$$

- $I$  is called **loop invariant**
- $I$  is true before we encounter the while statement, and remains true after each iteration of the loop (although not necessarily midway during execution of the loop body).
- If the loop terminates the loop condition must be false, so  $\neg \mathbb{B}$  appears in the postcondition.
- For the body of the loop  $\mathbb{C}$  to execute,  $\mathbb{B}$  needs to be true, so it appears in the precondition.

# Proof rule for While Loops

Suppose we want to prove

$$\{P\} \text{ while } \mathbb{B} \text{ do } \mathbb{C} \{Q\}$$

While rule:

$$\frac{\{I \wedge \mathbb{B}\} \mathbb{C} \{I\}}{\{I\} \text{ while } \mathbb{B} \text{ do } \mathbb{C} \{I \wedge \neg \mathbb{B}\}}$$

- $I$  is called **loop invariant**
- $I$  is true before we encounter the while statement, and remains true after each iteration of the loop (although not necessarily midway during execution of the loop body).
- If the loop terminates the loop condition must be false, so  $\neg \mathbb{B}$  appears in the postcondition.
- For the body of the loop  $\mathbb{C}$  to execute,  $\mathbb{B}$  needs to be true, so it appears in the precondition.
- **The most difficult part** is to come up with the **invariant**.
- This requires **intuition**. There is **no algorithm** that will find the invariant.

# Applying the while rule

How does the while rule helps to solve our problem?

$\{P\} \text{ while } B \text{ do } C \{Q\}$

$$\frac{\{I \wedge B\} C \{I\}}{\{I\} \text{ while } B \text{ do } C \{I \wedge \neg B\}}$$

# Applying the while rule

How does the while rule helps to solve our problem?

$\{P\} \text{ while } B \text{ do } C \{Q\}$

$$\frac{\{I \wedge B\} C \{I\}}{\{I\} \text{ while } B \text{ do } C \{I \wedge \neg B\}}$$

- The postcondition we get after applying our rule has the form  $I \wedge \neg B$ . This might not be the same as the postcondition  $Q$  we want!

# Applying the while rule

How does the while rule helps to solve our problem?

$\{P\} \text{ while } \mathbb{B} \text{ do } \mathbb{C} \{Q\}$

$$\frac{\{I \wedge \mathbb{B}\} \mathbb{C} \{I\}}{\{I\} \text{ while } \mathbb{B} \text{ do } \mathbb{C} \{I \wedge \neg \mathbb{B}\}}$$

- The postcondition we get after applying our rule has the form  $I \wedge \neg \mathbb{B}$ . This might not be the same as the postcondition  $Q$  we want!
- If  $(I \wedge \neg \mathbb{B}) \leftrightarrow Q$ , we can replace  $I \wedge \neg \mathbb{B}$  with  $Q$ .
- If  $(I \wedge \neg \mathbb{B}) \rightarrow Q$  we can use the [Postcondition weakening rule](#):

$$\frac{\frac{\{I \wedge \mathbb{B}\} \mathbb{C} \{I\}}{\{I\} \text{ while } \mathbb{B} \text{ do } \mathbb{C} \{I \wedge \neg \mathbb{B}\}} \quad I \wedge \neg \mathbb{B} \rightarrow Q}{\{I\} \text{ while } \mathbb{B} \text{ do } \mathbb{C} \{Q\}}$$



# Applying the while rule

How does the while rule helps to solve our problem?

$\{P\} \text{ while } \mathbb{B} \text{ do } \mathbb{C} \{Q\}$

$$\frac{\{I \wedge \mathbb{B}\} \mathbb{C} \{I\}}{\{I\} \text{ while } \mathbb{B} \text{ do } \mathbb{C} \{I \wedge \neg \mathbb{B}\}}$$

- Similarly,  $P$  and  $I$  might be different formulas.

# Applying the while rule

How does the while rule helps to solve our problem?

$\{P\} \text{ while } \mathbb{B} \text{ do } \mathbb{C} \{Q\}$

$$\frac{\{I \wedge \mathbb{B}\} \mathbb{C} \{I\}}{\{I\} \text{ while } \mathbb{B} \text{ do } \mathbb{C} \{I \wedge \neg \mathbb{B}\}}$$

- Similarly,  $P$  and  $I$  might be different formulas.
- If  $I \leftrightarrow P$ , we can replace  $I$  with  $P$  to complete our proof.
- If  $P \rightarrow I$  we can use the [Precondition strengthening rule](#):

$$\frac{P \rightarrow I \quad \{I\} \text{ while } \mathbb{B} \text{ do } \mathbb{C} \{Q\}}{\{P\} \text{ while } \mathbb{B} \text{ do } \mathbb{C} \{Q\}}$$

# Proof rule for While Loops

## Example

Suppose we want to find a precondition  $P$  such that

$$\{P\} \text{ while } (n > 0) \text{ do } n := n-1 \{n = 0\}$$

# Proof rule for While Loops

## Example

Suppose we want to find a precondition  $P$  such that

$$\{P\} \text{ while } (n > 0) \text{ do } n := n-1 \{n = 0\}$$

We want a loop invariant  $I$  such that

- if  $I$  is true initially
- $I$  remains true each time around the loop
- $I \wedge \neg(n > 0) \rightarrow (n = 0)$

# Proof rule for While Loops

## Example

Suppose we want to find a precondition  $P$  such that

$$\{P\} \text{ while } (n > 0) \text{ do } n := n-1 \{n = 0\}$$

We want a loop invariant  $I$  such that

- if  $I$  is true initially
- $I$  remains true each time around the loop
- $I \wedge \neg(n > 0) \rightarrow (n = 0)$

$I \equiv n \geq 0$  looks like a reasonable loop invariant.

# Proof rule for While Loops

While rule:

$$\frac{\{I \wedge B\} C \{I\}}{\{I\} \text{ while } B \text{ do } C \{I \wedge \neg B\}}$$

## Example (cont.)

Suppose we want to find a precondition  $P$  such that

$$\{P\} \text{ while } (n > 0) \text{ do } n := n-1 \{n = 0\}$$

We consider the loop invariant  $I \equiv n \geq 0$ . Let's try to find  $P$ .

$$1. \{n - 1 \geq 0\} n := n-1 \{n \geq 0\} \quad (\text{Assignment rule})$$

# Proof rule for While Loops

While rule:

$$\frac{\{I \wedge B\} C \{I\}}{\{I\} \text{ while } B \text{ do } C \{I \wedge \neg B\}}$$

## Example (cont.)

Suppose we want to find a precondition  $P$  such that

$$\{P\} \text{ while } (n > 0) \text{ do } n := n-1 \{n = 0\}$$

We consider the loop invariant  $I \equiv n \geq 0$ . Let's try to find  $P$ .

1.  $\{n - 1 \geq 0\} n := n-1 \{n \geq 0\}$  (Assignment rule)
2.  $\{n \geq 0 \wedge n > 0\} n := n-1 \{n \geq 0\}$  (1, Precond. Equiv.)

# Proof rule for While Loops

While rule:

$$\frac{\{I \wedge B\} C \{I\}}{\{I\} \text{ while } B \text{ do } C \{I \wedge \neg B\}}$$

## Example (cont.)

Suppose we want to find a precondition  $P$  such that

$$\{P\} \text{ while } (n > 0) \text{ do } n := n-1 \{n = 0\}$$

We consider the loop invariant  $I \equiv n \geq 0$ . Let's try to find  $P$ .

1.  $\{n - 1 \geq 0\} n := n-1 \{n \geq 0\}$  (Assignment rule)
2.  $\{n \geq 0 \wedge n > 0\} n := n-1 \{n \geq 0\}$  (1, Precond. Equiv.)
3.  $\{n \geq 0\} \text{ while } (n > 0) \text{ do } n := n-1 \{n \geq 0 \wedge \neg(n > 0)\}$  (2, While rule)



# Proof rule for While Loops

While rule:

$$\frac{\{I \wedge B\} C \{I\}}{\{I\} \text{ while } B \text{ do } C \{I \wedge \neg B\}}$$

## Example (cont.)

Suppose we want to find a precondition  $P$  such that

$$\{P\} \text{ while } (n > 0) \text{ do } n := n-1 \{n = 0\}$$

We consider the loop invariant  $I \equiv n \geq 0$ . Let's try to find  $P$ .

1.  $\{n - 1 \geq 0\} n := n-1 \{n \geq 0\}$  (Assignment rule)
2.  $\{n \geq 0 \wedge n > 0\} n := n-1 \{n \geq 0\}$  (1, Precond. Equiv.)
3.  $\{n \geq 0\} \text{ while } (n > 0) \text{ do } n := n-1 \{n \geq 0 \wedge \neg(n > 0)\}$  (2, While rule)
4.  $\{n \geq 0\} \text{ while } (n > 0) \text{ do } n := n-1 \{n = 0\}$  (3, Postcond. Equiv.)

So we take  $P$  to be  $n \geq 0$ .

# Proof rules for Hoare logic

The assignment axiom:

$$\{Q[x/E]\} \ x \ := \ E \ \{Q\}$$

Precondition Strengthening rule:

$$\frac{P_s \rightarrow P_w \quad \{P_w\} \mathbb{C} \{Q\}}{\{P_s\} \mathbb{C} \{Q\}}$$

Postcondition Weakening rule:

$$\frac{\{P\} \mathbb{C} \{Q_s\} \quad Q_s \rightarrow Q_w}{\{P\} \mathbb{C} \{Q_w\}}$$

Sequencing rule:

$$\frac{\{P\} \mathbb{C}_1 \{Q\} \quad \{Q\} \mathbb{C}_2 \{R\}}{\{P\} \mathbb{C}_1; \mathbb{C}_2 \{R\}}$$

Conditional rule:

$$\frac{\{P \wedge \mathbb{B}\} \mathbb{C}_1 \{Q\} \quad \{P \wedge \neg \mathbb{B}\} \mathbb{C}_2 \{Q\}}{\{P\} \text{ if } \mathbb{B} \text{ then } \mathbb{C}_1 \text{ else } \mathbb{C}_2 \{Q\}}$$

While rule:

$$\frac{\{I \wedge \mathbb{B}\} \mathbb{C} \{I\}}{\{I\} \text{ while } \mathbb{B} \text{ do } \mathbb{C} \{I \wedge \neg \mathbb{B}\}}$$

# A simple program

## Example

Consider the Program:

```
i := 0;  
s := 0;  
while (i != n) do  
  i := i+1;  
  s := s+(2*i-1)
```

Goal: prove  $\{\top\}$  Program  $\{s = n^2\}$

The sum of the first  $n$  odd numbers is  $n^2$ .

# A simple program

## Example (cont.)

Let us check some examples:

- $1 = 1 = 1^2$
- $1 + 3 = 4 = 2^2$
- $1 + 3 + 5 = 9 = 3^2$
- $1 + 3 + 5 + 7 = 16 = 4^2$

It looks OK. Let us see if we can prove it!

Goal: prove  $\{\top\}$  **Program**  $\{s = n^2\}$

# A simple program

## Example (cont.)

First we need a loop invariant  $I$ .

$$\boxed{\frac{\{I \wedge B\} \mathbb{C} \{I\}}{\{I\} \text{ while } B \text{ do } \mathbb{C} \{I \wedge \neg B\}}}$$

```
while (i != n) do  
    i := i+1;  
    s := s+(2*i-1)  
{s = n2}
```

From the while rule, we want  $I \wedge (i = n) \rightarrow (s = n^2)$  in order to be able to apply Postcond. Weak.

In the loop body, each time,  $i$  increments and  $s$  moves on the next square number.

# A simple program

## Example (cont.)

First we need a loop invariant  $I$ .

$$\boxed{\frac{\{I \wedge B\} \mathbb{C} \{I\}}{\{I\} \text{ while } B \text{ do } \mathbb{C} \{I \wedge \neg B\}}}$$

```
while (i != n) do  
    i := i+1;  
    s := s+(2*i-1)  
{s = n2}
```

From the while rule, we want  $I \wedge (i = n) \rightarrow (s = n^2)$  in order to be able to apply Postcond. Weak.

In the loop body, each time,  $i$  increments and  $s$  moves on the next square number.

Loop invariant  $I \equiv (s = i^2)$  seems plausible.

# A simple program

## Example (cont.)

We check that  $I \equiv (s = i^2)$  is an invariant. Let us prove  $\{I \wedge (i \neq n)\} \mathbb{C} \{I\}$ .

$$\frac{\{s = i^2 \wedge i \neq n\} i := i + 1 \{Q\} \quad \{Q\} s := s + (2 * i - 1) \{s = i^2\}}{\{s = i^2 \wedge i \neq n\} i := i + 1; s := s + (2 * i - 1) \{s = i^2\}}$$

# A simple program

## Example (cont.)

We check that  $I \equiv (s = i^2)$  is an invariant. Let us prove  $\{I \wedge (i \neq n)\} \mathbb{C} \{I\}$ .

$$\frac{\{s = i^2 \wedge i \neq n\} i := i + 1 \{Q\} \quad \{Q\} s := s + (2 * i - 1) \{s = i^2\}}{\{s = i^2 \wedge i \neq n\} i := i + 1; s := s + (2 * i - 1) \{s = i^2\}}$$

1.  $\{Q\} s := s + (2 * i - 1) \{s = i^2\}$

2.

3.  $\{s = i^2 \wedge i \neq n\} i := i + 1 \{Q\}$

4.  $\{s = i^2 \wedge i \neq n\} i := i + 1; s := s + (2 * i - 1) \{s = i^2\}$  (1,3, Seq.)



# A simple program

## Example (cont.)

Check  $I \equiv (s = i^2)$  is an invariant: prove  $\{I \wedge (i \neq n)\} \mathbb{C} \{I\}$

$$\frac{\{s = i^2 \wedge i \neq n\} i := i + 1 \{Q\} \quad \{Q\} s := s + (2 * i - 1) \{s = i^2\}}{\{s = i^2 \wedge i \neq n\} i := i + 1; s := s + (2 * i - 1) \{s = i^2\}}$$

$Q$  is  $\{s + (2 * i - 1) = i^2\}$

1.  $\{s + (2 * i - 1) = i^2\} s := s + (2 * i - 1) \{s = i^2\}$  (Assignment)

2.

3.  $\{s = i^2 \wedge i \neq n\} i := i + 1 \{Q\}$

4.  $\{s = i^2 \wedge i \neq n\} i := i + 1; s := s + (2 * i - 1) \{s = i^2\}$  (1,3, Seq.)

# A simple program

## Example (cont.)

Check  $I \equiv (s = i^2)$  is an invariant: prove  $\{I \wedge (i \neq n)\} \mathbb{C} \{I\}$

$$\frac{\{s = i^2 \wedge i \neq n\} i := i + 1 \{Q\} \quad \{Q\} s := s + (2 * i - 1) \{s = i^2\}}{\{s = i^2 \wedge i \neq n\} i := i + 1; s := s + (2 * i - 1) \{s = i^2\}}$$

$Q$  is  $\{s + (2 * i - 1) = i^2\}$

1.  $\{s + (2 * i - 1) = i^2\} s := s + (2 * i - 1) \{s = i^2\}$  (Assignment)

2.

3.  $\{s = i^2 \wedge i \neq n\} i := i + 1 \{s + (2 * i - 1) = i^2\}$

4.  $\{s = i^2 \wedge i \neq n\} i := i + 1; s := s + (2 * i - 1) \{s = i^2\}$  (1,3, Seq.)

# A simple program

## Example (cont.)

Check  $I \equiv (s = i^2)$  is an invariant:  $\text{prove } \{I \wedge (i \neq n)\} \mathbb{C} \{I\}$

$$\frac{\{s = i^2 \wedge i \neq n\} i := i + 1 \{Q\} \quad \{Q\} s := s + (2 * i - 1) \{s = i^2\}}{\{s = i^2 \wedge i \neq n\} i := i + 1; s := s + (2 * i - 1) \{s = i^2\}}$$

$Q$  is  $\{s + (2 * i - 1) = i^2\}$

1.  $\{s + (2 * i - 1) = i^2\} s := s + (2 * i - 1) \{s = i^2\}$  (Assignment)
2.  $\{s + (2 * (i + 1) - 1) = (i + 1)^2\} i := i + 1 \{s + (2 * i - 1) = i^2\}$   
(Assignment)
3.  $\{s = i^2 \wedge i \neq n\} i := i + 1 \{s + (2 * i - 1) = i^2\}$
4.  $\{s = i^2 \wedge i \neq n\} i := i + 1; s := s + (2 * i - 1) \{s = i^2\}$  (1,3, Seq.)

# A simple program

## Example (cont.)

Check  $I \equiv (s = i^2)$  is an invariant:  $\text{prove } \{I \wedge (i \neq n)\} \mathbb{C} \{I\}$

$$\frac{\{s = i^2 \wedge i \neq n\} i := i + 1 \{Q\} \quad \{Q\} s := s + (2 * i - 1) \{s = i^2\}}{\{s = i^2 \wedge i \neq n\} i := i + 1; s := s + (2 * i - 1) \{s = i^2\}}$$

$Q$  is  $\{s + (2 * i - 1) = i^2\}$

1.  $\{s + (2 * i - 1) = i^2\} s := s + (2 * i - 1) \{s = i^2\}$  (Assignment)
2.  $\{s + (2 * (i + 1) - 1) = (i + 1)^2\} i := i + 1 \{s + (2 * i - 1) = i^2\}$   
(Assignment)
3.  $\{s = i^2 \wedge i \neq n\} i := i + 1 \{s + (2 * i - 1) = i^2\}$  (2, Strength. Precond.)
4.  $\{s = i^2 \wedge i \neq n\} i := i + 1; s := s + (2 * i - 1) \{s = i^2\}$  (1,3, Seq.)

So far, so good.

# A simple program

## Example (cont.)

Completing the proof of  $\{\top\}$  Program  $\{s = n^2\}$

1. We have

$$\{(s = i^2) \wedge (i \neq n)\} \text{ i := i+1; s := s+(2*i-1) } \{s = i^2\}$$

# A simple program

## Example (cont.)

Completing the proof of  $\{\top\}$  Program  $\{s = n^2\}$

1. We have

$$\{(s = i^2) \wedge (i \neq n)\} \text{ i := i+1; s := s+(2*i-1) } \{s = i^2\}$$

2. Apply the While rule and Postcondition Weakening rule since

$$(s = i^2) \wedge (i = n) \rightarrow s = n^2$$

$$\{s = i^2\} \text{ while } \dots \text{ s:=s+(2*i-1) } \{s = n^2\}$$

# A simple program

## Example (cont.)

Completing the proof of  $\{\top\}$  Program  $\{s = n^2\}$

1. We have

$$\{(s = i^2) \wedge (i \neq n)\} \text{ i := i+1; s := s+(2*i-1) } \{s = i^2\}$$

2. Apply the While rule and Postcondition Weakening rule since

$$(s = i^2) \wedge (i = n) \rightarrow s = n^2$$

$$\{s = i^2\} \text{ while ... s:=s+(2*i-1) } \{s = n^2\}$$

3. Check that the initialization establishes the invariant:

$$\frac{\{0 = 0^2\} \text{ i := 0 } \{0 = i^2\} \quad \{0 = i^2\} \text{ s := 0 } \{s = i^2\}}{\{0 = 0^2\} \text{ i := 0; s := 0 } \{s = i^2\}}$$

# A simple program

## Example (cont.)

Completing the proof of  $\{\top\}$  Program  $\{s = n^2\}$

1. We have

$$\{(s = i^2) \wedge (i \neq n)\} \text{ i := i+1; s := s+(2*i-1) } \{s = i^2\}$$

2. Apply the While rule and Postcondition Weakening rule since

$$(s = i^2) \wedge (i = n) \rightarrow s = n^2$$

$$\{s = i^2\} \text{ while } \dots \text{ s:=s+(2*i-1) } \{s = n^2\}$$

3. Check that the initialization establishes the invariant:

$$\frac{\{0 = 0^2\} \text{ i := 0 } \{0 = i^2\} \quad \{0 = i^2\} \text{ s := 0 } \{s = i^2\}}{\{0 = 0^2\} \text{ i := 0; s := 0 } \{s = i^2\}}$$

4.  $(0 = 0^2) \leftrightarrow \top$ , so putting it all together with Sequencing we have

$$\{\top\} \text{ i:=0; s:=0; while (i != n) do S } \{s = n^2\}$$



# Verifying programs with Hoare Logic

## Exercise:

Consider the program **Factorial**:

```
y := 1;  
z := 0;  
while (z != x) do  
  z := z+1;  
  y := y*z
```

Goal: prove  $\{\top\}$  **Program**  $\{y = x!\}$

# Verifying programs with Hoare Logic

## Exercise:

Consider the program **Factorial**:

```
y := 1;  
z := 0;  
while (z != x) do  
  z := z+1;  
  y := y*z
```

Goal: prove  $\{\top\}$  **Program**  $\{y = x!\}$

**Hint!** Use the loop invariant  $I \equiv y = z!$

Quiz time!



<https://tinyurl.com/FMI-PV2023-Quiz3>