

Problem 1

(a) Find the $\mathbb{E}[\bar{X}(N)]$ analytically. Does it really estimate the mean of X ?

We have that

$$\bar{X}(N) = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N X_i, \quad X_i \sim \text{Uniform}(0, 1).$$

We first compute the expectation of X_i . We have

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbb{E}[X_i] &= \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} x \cdot p(X=x) \, dx \\ &= \int_0^1 x \cdot p(X=x) \, dx \\ &= \int_0^1 x \cdot \frac{1}{1-0} \, dx \\ &= \int_0^1 x \, dx \\ &= \left[\frac{1}{2}x^2 \right]_0^1 \\ &= \frac{1}{2}(1^2 - 0^2) \\ &= \frac{1}{2} \end{aligned} \tag{1}$$

Therefore, we can compute the expectation of $\bar{X}(N)$ as follows:

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbb{E}[\bar{X}(N)] &= \mathbb{E}\left[\frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n X_i\right] \\ &= \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n \mathbb{E}[X_i] \\ &\stackrel{(1)}{=} \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n \frac{1}{2} \\ &= \frac{1}{n} \cdot n \cdot \frac{1}{2} \\ &= \frac{1}{2} \end{aligned}$$

Therefore, the expected value of $\mathbb{E}[\bar{X}(N)]$ estimates the true mean of X .

(b) Find the $\text{Var}(\bar{X}(N))$ analytically. Hint: find the variance of a single X_i first.

Let us first compute the expectation of $\mathbb{E}[X_i^2]$:

$$\begin{aligned}
 \mathbb{E}[X_i^2] &= \int_0^1 x^2 \cdot p(X = x) \, dx \\
 &= \int_0^1 x^2 \cdot \frac{1}{1-0} \, dx \\
 &= \int_0^1 x^2 \, dx \\
 &= \left[\frac{1}{3} \cdot x^3 \right]_0^1 \\
 &= \frac{1}{3}(1 - 0) \\
 &= \frac{1}{3}
 \end{aligned} \tag{2}$$

We can now compute the variance of a X_i as follows:

$$\begin{aligned}
 \text{Var}(X_i) &= \mathbb{E}[(X_i - \mathbb{E}[X_i])^2] \\
 &= \mathbb{E}\left[(X_i - \frac{1}{2})^2\right] \\
 &= \mathbb{E}\left[X_i^2 + \frac{1^2}{2^2} - 2 \cdot X_i \cdot \frac{1}{2}\right] \\
 &= \mathbb{E}\left[X_i^2 + \frac{1^2}{2^2} - X_i\right] \\
 &= \mathbb{E}[X_i^2] + \mathbb{E}\left[\frac{1}{4}\right] - \mathbb{E}[X_i] \\
 &= \mathbb{E}[X_i^2] + \frac{1}{4} - \frac{1}{2} \\
 &\stackrel{(2)}{=} \frac{1}{3} + \frac{1}{4} - \frac{1}{2} \\
 &= \frac{4}{12} + \frac{3}{12} - \frac{6}{12} \\
 &= \frac{1}{12}.
 \end{aligned}$$

We can now compute the variance of $\bar{X}(N)$ as follows:

$$\begin{aligned}
 \text{Var}(\bar{X}(N)) &= \text{Var}\left(\frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N X_i\right) \\
 &= \frac{1}{N^2} \cdot \text{Var}\left(\sum_{i=1}^N X_i\right) \\
 &= \frac{1}{N^2} \cdot \sum_{i=1}^N \text{Var}(X_i) \\
 &= \frac{1}{N^2} \cdot \sum_{i=1}^N \frac{1}{12} \\
 &= \frac{1}{N^2} \cdot N \cdot \frac{1}{12} \\
 &= \frac{1}{N} \cdot \frac{1}{12}
 \end{aligned} \tag{3}$$

where Equation 3 holds as each drawing X_i is independent of each other drawing X_j ($\Pr(X_i | X_j) = \Pr(X_i)$), and we can therefore use the property of the variance for i.i.d. variables $\text{Var}(X + Y) = \text{Var}(X) + \text{Var}(Y)$.

Therefore, in the limit, we have

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \text{Var}(\bar{X}(N)) = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{N} \cdot \frac{1}{12} = 0$$

with a linear convergence rate.

(c) The probability density function of $\hat{X}(N)$ is given as

$$f_{\hat{X}(N)}(x) = \binom{N}{\frac{N-1}{2}} \cdot \frac{N+1}{2} \cdot x^{\frac{N-1}{2}} \cdot (1-x)^{\frac{N-1}{2}}.$$

Let us now compute the expectation of $\hat{X}(N)$:

$$\begin{aligned}
 \mathbb{E}[\hat{X}(N)] &= \int_0^1 x \cdot f_{\hat{X}(N)}(x) \, dx \\
 &= \int_0^1 x \cdot \binom{N}{\frac{N-1}{2}} \cdot \frac{N+1}{2} \cdot x^{\frac{N-1}{2}} \cdot (1-x)^{\frac{N-1}{2}} \, dx \\
 &= \binom{N}{\frac{N-1}{2}} \cdot \frac{N+1}{2} \cdot \int_0^1 x \cdot x^{\frac{N-1}{2}} \cdot (1-x)^{\frac{N-1}{2}} \, dx \\
 &= \binom{N}{\frac{N-1}{2}} \cdot \frac{N+1}{2} \cdot \int_0^1 x^{\frac{N-1}{2}+1} \cdot (1-x)^{\frac{N-1}{2}} \, dx \\
 &= \binom{N}{\frac{N-1}{2}} \cdot \frac{N+1}{2} \cdot \int_0^1 x^{\frac{N+1}{2}} \cdot (1-x)^{\frac{N-1}{2}} \, dx \\
 &= \binom{N}{\frac{N-1}{2}} \cdot \frac{N+1}{2} \cdot \frac{\frac{N+1}{2}! \frac{N-1}{2}!}{(\frac{N+1}{2} + \frac{N-1}{2} + 1)!} \tag{4}
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 &= \binom{N}{\frac{N-1}{2}} \cdot \frac{N+1}{2} \cdot \frac{\frac{N+1}{2}! \frac{N-1}{2}!}{(\frac{N-1}{2} + \frac{N-1}{2} + 1 + 1)!} \\
 &= \binom{N}{\frac{N-1}{2}} \cdot \frac{N+1}{2} \cdot \frac{\frac{N+1}{2}! \frac{N-1}{2}!}{(2 \cdot \frac{N-1}{2} + 2)!} \\
 &= \binom{N}{\frac{N-1}{2}} \cdot \frac{N+1}{2} \cdot \frac{\frac{N+1}{2}! \frac{N-1}{2}!}{(N-1+2)!} \\
 &= \binom{N}{\frac{N-1}{2}} \cdot \frac{N+1}{2} \cdot \frac{\frac{N+1}{2}! \frac{N-1}{2}!}{(N+1)!} \\
 &= \binom{N}{\frac{N-1}{2}} \cdot \frac{1}{2} \cdot \frac{(\frac{N+1}{2})! \frac{N-1}{2}!}{N!} \\
 &= \frac{N!}{(\frac{N-1}{2})! (N - \frac{N-1}{2})!} \cdot \frac{1}{2} \cdot \frac{(\frac{N+1}{2})! \frac{N-1}{2}!}{N!} \\
 &= \frac{1}{(\frac{N-1}{2})! (N - \frac{N-1}{2})!} \cdot \frac{1}{2} \cdot \frac{(\frac{N+1}{2})! \frac{N-1}{2}!}{1} \\
 &= \frac{1}{(N - \frac{N-1}{2})!} \cdot \frac{1}{2} \cdot \frac{(\frac{N+1}{2})!}{1} \\
 &= \frac{1}{(\frac{N+1}{2})!} \cdot \frac{1}{2} \cdot \frac{(\frac{N+1}{2})!}{1} \tag{5} \\
 &= \frac{1}{2}
 \end{aligned}$$

where we used the given known integral rule to obtain Equation 4, and Equation 5 results from

$$\begin{aligned}
 N - \frac{N-1}{2} &= \frac{2N}{2} - \frac{N-1}{2} \\
 &= \frac{N+N-(N-1)}{2} \\
 &= \frac{N+1}{2}.
 \end{aligned}$$

Therefore, the expectation of the of $\hat{X}(N)$ is $\frac{1}{2}$, i.e., the true mean of X .

(d) Find the $\text{Var}(\hat{X}(N))$ analytically. Which distribution has the better variance $\bar{X}(N)$ or $\hat{X}(N)$?

We compute the expectation of $\hat{X}(N)^2$:

$$\begin{aligned}
 \mathbb{E}[\hat{X}(N)^2] &= \int_0^1 x^2 \cdot f_{\hat{X}(N)}(x) \, dx \\
 &= \binom{N}{\frac{N-1}{2}} \cdot \frac{N+1}{2} \cdot \int_0^1 x^2 \cdot x^{\frac{N-1}{2}} \cdot (1-x)^{\frac{N-1}{2}} \, dx \\
 &= \binom{N}{\frac{N-1}{2}} \cdot \frac{N+1}{2} \cdot \int_0^1 x^{\frac{N-1}{2}+2} \cdot (1-x)^{\frac{N-1}{2}} \, dx \\
 &= \binom{N}{\frac{N-1}{2}} \cdot \frac{N+1}{2} \cdot \int_0^1 x^{\frac{N+3}{2}} \cdot (1-x)^{\frac{N-1}{2}} \, dx \\
 &= \binom{N}{\frac{N-1}{2}} \cdot \frac{N+1}{2} \cdot \frac{\frac{N+3}{2}! \frac{N-1}{2}!}{(\frac{N+3}{2} + \frac{N-1}{2} + 1)!} \\
 &= \binom{N}{\frac{N-1}{2}} \cdot \frac{N+1}{2} \cdot \frac{\frac{N+3}{2}! \frac{N-1}{2}!}{(\frac{N-1}{2} + \frac{N-1}{2} + 1 + 2)!} \\
 &= \binom{N}{\frac{N-1}{2}} \cdot \frac{N+1}{2} \cdot \frac{\frac{N+3}{2}! \frac{N-1}{2}!}{(2 \cdot \frac{N-1}{2} + 3)!} \\
 &= \binom{N}{\frac{N-1}{2}} \cdot \frac{N+1}{2} \cdot \frac{\frac{N+3}{2}! \frac{N-1}{2}!}{(N-1+3)!} \\
 &= \binom{N}{\frac{N-1}{2}} \cdot \frac{N+1}{2} \cdot \frac{\frac{N+3}{2}! \frac{N-1}{2}!}{(N+2)!} \\
 &= \binom{N}{\frac{N-1}{2}} \cdot \frac{N+1}{2} \cdot \frac{\frac{N+3}{2}! \frac{N-1}{2}!}{(N+2) \cdot (N+1)!} \\
 &= \binom{N}{\frac{N-1}{2}} \cdot \frac{1}{2} \cdot \frac{\frac{N+3}{2}! \frac{N-1}{2}!}{(N+2) \cdot N!} \\
 &= \frac{N!}{(\frac{N-1}{2})! (N - \frac{N-1}{2})!} \cdot \frac{1}{2} \cdot \frac{\frac{N+3}{2}! \frac{N-1}{2}!}{(N+2) \cdot N!} \\
 &= \frac{1}{(\frac{N-1}{2})! (N - \frac{N-1}{2})!} \cdot \frac{1}{2} \cdot \frac{\frac{N+3}{2}! \frac{N-1}{2}!}{(N+2)} \\
 &= \frac{1}{(N - \frac{N-1}{2})!} \cdot \frac{1}{2} \cdot \frac{\frac{N+3}{2}!}{(N+2)} \\
 &= \frac{1}{\frac{N+1}{2}!} \cdot \frac{1}{2} \cdot \frac{\frac{N+3}{2}!}{(N+2)} \\
 &= \frac{1}{\frac{N+1}{2}!} \cdot \frac{1}{2} \cdot \frac{\frac{N+3}{2} \cdot (\frac{N+1}{2})!}{(N+2)} \\
 &= \frac{1}{2} \cdot \frac{\frac{N+3}{2}}{(N+2)} \\
 &= \frac{1}{2} \cdot \frac{\frac{N+3}{2} \cdot 2}{(N+2) \cdot 2} \\
 &= \frac{1}{2} \cdot \frac{N+3}{(N+2) \cdot 2} \\
 &= \frac{1}{2} \cdot \frac{N+2+1}{(N+2) \cdot 2} \\
 &= \frac{1}{2} \cdot \left(\frac{N+2}{(N+2) \cdot 2} + \frac{1}{(N+2) \cdot 2} \right)
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} &= \frac{1}{2} \cdot \left(\frac{1}{2} + \frac{1}{2N+4} \right) \\ &= \frac{1}{4} + \frac{1}{4N+8} \end{aligned}$$

We can finally compute the variance of $\hat{X}(N)$ as follows:

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Var}(\hat{X}(N)) &= \mathbb{E}[\hat{X}(N)^2] - \mathbb{E}[\hat{X}(N)]^2 \\ &= \mathbb{E}[\hat{X}(N)^2] - \left(\frac{1}{2} \right)^2 \\ &= \mathbb{E}[\hat{X}(N)^2] - \frac{1}{4} \\ &= \frac{1}{4} + \frac{1}{4N+8} - \frac{1}{4} \\ &= \frac{1}{4N+8} \end{aligned}$$

which, in the limit, converges to zero:

$$\lim_{N \rightarrow \infty} \text{Var}(\hat{X}(N)) = \lim_{N \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{4N+8} = 0$$

As the convergence rate of $\text{Var}(\hat{X}(N))$ is slower than $\text{Var}(\bar{X}(N))$, and that both have the same (correct) expectation, we can conclude that $\bar{X}(N)$ has the better variance, i.e., it is better to estimate the mean of a uniform distribution by using the mean of the samples instead of the median.

(e) See provided code.

Problem 2

(a) Show that if $E < 0$, then the game is losing in a long run and if $E > 0$, then the game is winning in a long run.

Let π be the stationary distribution of the Markov chain, and

$$E = \pi_0 \cdot (B1_+ - B1_-) + (\pi_1 + \pi_2) \cdot (B2_+ - B2_-).$$

We remark that E is composed of two sums, the first sum (which includes π_0) denotes the expected return when in state 0. As π is the stationary distribution, the state 0 is reached with π_0 probability at each time step in the long run. The $(B1_+ - B1_-)$ part is positive if probability of gaining one dollar is greater than losing one dollar when playing game B while in state 0.¹

Because the second part of the equation follows the same structure (one could multiply out $(\pi_1 + \pi_2)$ to obtain the same argument for the two remaining states of the Markov chain), we can conclude that E denotes the expected *gain* (or *return*) when playing game B in the long run.

Therefore, if the expected gain is negative, the game is losing in the long run. On the other hand, a positive expected gain would imply that the game is winning.

(b) We have three states in our Markov chain: 0, 1, and 2, which denotes the number that results from the current capital modulo 3. We now define the transition matrix P as follows:

$$P = \begin{pmatrix} 0.0 & 0.095 & 0.905 \\ 0.255 & 0.0 & 0.745 \\ 0.745 & 0.255 & 0.0 \end{pmatrix}$$

We remark that each play results in a win or a loss, and therefore a probability of 0.0 to stay in the same state after playing a round, hence, the diagonal elements of P are all 0.0.

The stationary distribution of the Markov chain is denoted as

$$\pi := (\pi_0 \quad \pi_1 \quad \pi_2).$$

We now compute the stationary distribution from P by computing the stationary value for each π_i .

$$\begin{aligned} \pi_0 &= \pi_0 \cdot 0.0 + \pi_1 \cdot 0.255 + \pi_2 \cdot 0.745 \\ &= \pi_1 \cdot 0.255 + \pi_2 \cdot 0.745 \end{aligned} \tag{6}$$

¹See the definition of the states in (b).

$$\begin{aligned}
 \pi_1 &= \pi_0 \cdot 0.095 + \pi_1 \cdot 0.0 + \pi_2 \cdot 0.255 \\
 \pi_1 &= \pi_0 \cdot 0.095 + \pi_2 \cdot 0.255 \\
 \pi_1 &\stackrel{(6)}{=} (\pi_1 \cdot 0.255 + \pi_2 \cdot 0.745) \cdot 0.095 + \pi_2 \cdot 0.255 \\
 \pi_1 &= \pi_1 \cdot 0.255 \cdot 0.095 + \pi_2 \cdot 0.745 \cdot 0.095 + \pi_2 \cdot 0.255 && | - (\pi_1 \cdot 0.255 \cdot 0.095) \\
 \pi_1(1 - 0.024225) &= \pi_2 \cdot 0.745 \cdot 0.095 + \pi_2 \cdot 0.255 && | \div (1 - 0.024225) \\
 \pi_1 &= \frac{\pi_2 \cdot (0.255 + 0.070775)}{(1 - 0.024225)} \\
 \pi_1 &= \pi_2 \cdot \frac{0.325775}{0.975775} \\
 \pi_1 &= \pi_2 \cdot 0.333862827 && (7)
 \end{aligned}$$

Using the fact that $\pi_0 + \pi_1 + \pi_2 = 1$, we can now compute π_2 :

$$\begin{aligned}
 1 &= \pi_0 + \pi_1 + \pi_2 \\
 1 &\stackrel{(6)}{=} (\pi_1 \cdot 0.255 + \pi_2 \cdot 0.745) + \pi_1 + \pi_2 \\
 1 &= \pi_1 \cdot 1.255 + \pi_2 \cdot 1.745 \\
 1 &\stackrel{(7)}{=} (\pi_2 \cdot 0.333862827) \cdot 1.255 + \pi_2 \cdot 1.745 \\
 1 &= \pi_2 \cdot 0.4189978479 + \pi_2 \cdot 1.745 \\
 1 &= \pi_2 \cdot 2.1639978479 \\
 \pi_2 &= \frac{1}{2.1639978479} \\
 \pi_2 &= 0.4621076684
 \end{aligned}$$

from which we can infer

$$\begin{aligned}
 \pi_1 &= \pi_2 \cdot 0.333862827 \\
 &= 0.4621076684 \cdot 0.333862827 \\
 &= 0.1542805726
 \end{aligned}$$

and

$$\begin{aligned}
 \pi_0 &= \pi_1 \cdot 0.255 + \pi_2 \cdot 0.745 \\
 &= 0.1542805726 \cdot 0.255 + 0.4621076684 \cdot 0.745 \\
 &= 0.03934154601 + 0.344270213 \\
 &= 0.383611759 .
 \end{aligned}$$

Therefore, we have the stationary distribution

$$\pi = \begin{pmatrix} 0.383611759 & 0.1542805726 & 0.4621076684 \end{pmatrix}$$

with $\pi = \pi P$ and total sum of one ($0.383611759 + 0.1542805726 + 0.4621076684 = 1$).

Therefore, the expected gain when playing game B in the long run is

$$\begin{aligned} E &= \pi_0 \cdot (B1_+ - B1_-) + (\pi_1 + \pi_2) \cdot (B2_+ - B2_-) \\ &= \pi_0 \cdot (0.095 - 0.905) + (\pi_1 + \pi_2) \cdot (0.745 - 0.255) \\ &= 0.383611759 \cdot (-0.81) + (0.1542805726 + 0.4621076684) \cdot 0.49 \\ &= 0.383611759 \cdot (-0.81) + 0.616388241 \cdot 0.49 \\ &= -0.0086952867 \end{aligned}$$