Forth Standards Committee

Hamburg, Germany

11–13 September 2019

Draft Minutes

1 Participants

WB	Willem Botha	CCS	South Africa	
JD	Jermain Davies	CCS	South Africa	
AE	M. Anton Ertl	Technische Universität Wien	Austria	
UH	Ulrich Hoffmann	FH Wedel	Germany	
PK	Peter Knaggs	Independent, Trowbridge	England	(Editor)
HO	Howerd Oakford	Inventio Software Ltd	Germany	
BP	Bernd Paysan	Net2o	Germany	(Treasurer)
SP	Stephen Pelc	MPE	England	(Chair)
LW	Leon Wagner	FORTH, Inc.	USA	
GW	Gerald Wodni	Independent, Wien	Austria	(Technical)

- Sergey Baranov has not attended two consecutive meetings and is deemed to have resigned from the committee.

- Andrew Haley and Paul Bennett will be deemed to have resigned from the committee should they fail to attend the next meeting.

- Remote attendance for committee members was allowed (9/0/0)

- Remote attendance of observers was not allowed (9/0/0)

  Action: UH

2 Review of procedures

1. Draft minutes where accepted as an accurate account of the previous meeting (7/0/2)

2. A request for more details minutes was noted. There where no volunteers. These minutes are significantly more detailed that those of the X3J14 committee.

3. The meeting agenda/minutes to be published on www.forth-standard.org, see 3.3.

4. Moving other actions to www.forth-standard.org, see 3.3.

5. Update proposal process will be included in the 2020.1 release.

3 Reports

3.1 Chair

1. The www.forth-standard.org does not publish items in a easy to find manner (see 3.3).

2. It has also generated a much larger number of items than the previous comp.lang.forth mechanism.

3. Call for Forth-Standard contributors to provide real names.

3.2 Editor

1. Results of the last meeting (2018) has not yet been published, and will be published in conjunction with the results of the current meeting (2019) ready for the next meeting (2020).

2. The published standard is now available on GitHub (https://github.com/Forth-Standard/forth-standard).

3. The old forth200x.org site has been copied onto GitHub (https://github.com/Forth-Standard/forth200x).

3.3 Technical

1. The ideas expressed in the www.forth-standard.org workshop in the last meeting have not yet been implemented due to issues with the server infrastructure   **Action: GW**.

2. A new GitHub organisation has been created (https://github.com/Forth-Standard).

3.4 Treasurer

Current balance: 0, no income, no outgoings, no bank account. Creating a bank account in Germany would require translating the founding documents into German. This should be done once the need for a bank account is established.

4 Review of proposals and activities

#	Proposal	Comments	Vote	**Action**
—	Recognisers	Matthias Trute can not proceed with this proposal, BP to take over.	10/0/0	**BP**
67	Multi-Tasking	User values discussed, AH to take to vote.	10/0/0	**SP**
—	External functions	Moved to workshop on SWIG		**GW**
—	BL Rationale	Rationale not valid, in need of rewording	10/0/0	**GW**
—	./ in path name	Source files relative to the current file, Moved to workshop		**GW**
—	Internationalisation	Discussion of Dev/OS/App character sets, *lang* and *country* values.		**SP**
70	`ALSO sans VOCABULARY`	*I have no idea*		**UH/AE**
72	Find `TO`	This relates to AE's Clarify `FIND` proposal. AE to propose fix to xt execution		**AE**
114	Case insensitivity	Take proposal to CfV		**AE**
54	`[ELSE]` sans `[IF]`	Revise rationale, `[ELSE]` without `[IF]` not recommended	10/0/0	**PK**

74	[IF] white space	The reference implementations of [IF] and [ELSE] are very simple. Revise rational	10/0/0	**PK**
75	F>R and R>F	Please servery existing system, take into a proposal	10/0/0	**AE**
83	Execute EXIT	This feed into the clarify FIND discussion		**NFA**
115	[DEFINED]	Revise definition of [DEFINED] to allow use on systems with no search order	10/0/0	**PK**
87	COMPILE,	Make a new proposal to make appending to the current definition when not in compilation mode an ambiguous condition		**AE**
82	name space	Ask ruv to make proposal to rename "name space" to "header space"		**AE**
98	POSTPONE ambiguous condition	It was felt that dual semantics words are not sufficiently common to allow the removal of this ambiguous condition.		**PK**
104	RESTRICT	While some variation of this is quite common, finding a consensus would be difficult. This also feeds into the dual semantics discussion.		**PK**
—	CS-DROP	Move to CfV		**UH**
75	local floats	The {: mechanism was designed to allow typed locals. Make a proposal to allow local floats.		**SP**
76	QUIT	The reference implementation is incorrect as is the proposal replacement. A new reference implementation to be provided		**BP**
77	ACCEPT	Responses reviewed	10/0/0	**NFA**
78	CHAR	Make a new proposal to make this an error	10/0/0	**AE**
80	+LOOP	Responses reviewed	10/0/0	**NFA**
81	+	Responses reviewed	10/0/0	**NFA**
84	numbers	Responses reviewed	10/0/0	**NFA**
85	UNESCAPE	Responses reviewed	10/0/0	**NFA**

88	NAME>INTERPRET	Responses reviewed	10/0/0	**NFA**
89	natation	Responses reviewed	10/0/0	**NFA**
90	BUFFER: rational	The rational is confusing, but accurate. The proposed rational is incorrect.	0/7/2	**NFA**
91	BUFFER: result	A definition for *image*, *run* and *save* are required to answer this correctly. However, the answer is no. A revised rational for BUIFFER: is required.	10/0/0	**SP**
92	PARSE-NAME	Responses reviewed	10/0/0	**NFA**
93	POSTPONE [IF]	The reference implementation of [IF] is rather simple and would not allow this. BP to respond.	10/0/0	**BP**
94	POSTPONE	Add ambiguous condition for "appending any semantics to the current definition if there is no current definition".	9/0/1	**PK**
95	' TO	Responses reviewed	10/0/0	**NFA**
96	' interpret only words			**??**
97	CATCH			**??**
99	Test BL	F.3 states quit clearly that all test are in hexadecimal. As we now have the $ prefix the test has been updated	10/0/0	**PK**
101	."R	Responses reviewed	10/0/0	**NFA**
102	>IN test	The test cases should be updated to include Gerry Jacksons 0.13 test suite	10/0/0	**PK**
103	Nesting source-id in EVALUATE	Responses reviewed	10/0/0	**NFA**
105	BLK	Responses reviewed	10/0/0	**NFA**
106	LOAD	LOAD, LIST and THRU can all effect the address returned by BLOCK and BUFFER. A new proposal is required to this effect.	10/0/0	**HO**
108	LOAD	Responses reviewed	10/0/0	**NFA**

109	Definition of nt	Move definition of nt from 15.3 to 15.2	8/0/0	**PK**
110	`>IN`	Responses reviewed	10/0/0	**NFA**
111	`REFILL`	Responses reviewed	10/0/0	**NFA**
112	`IMMEDIATE`	The committee sees no ambiguity	10/0/0	**BP**

5 Workshops

5.1 Recognisers

Matthias Trute is no longer able to support this proposal. BP has agreed to revert back to the original proposal with minor updates. **Action: BP**

5.2 Dual semantic words

The author was encouraged to bring this forward as an experimental proposal. **Action: SP**

5.3 Multi-tasking

Discussion of user values (`UVALUE`) initialised by cloning existing tasks. SP to contact author (AH) **Action: SP**

5.4 Source-relative filenames

The use of "`./`" at the start of a path name to indicate the path is relative to the current source file. This has been agreed and a proposal is required. **Action: GW**

5.5 Internationalisation

The discussion of Developer, Operating System, and Application character sets was considered obsolete. The definition of *lang* and *country* was discussed. The proposal should be submitted to www.forth-standard.org. **Action: SP**

5.6 Clarify find

Anton's proposal to clarify `FIND` should be moved to the call for votes stage. **Action: AE**

5.7 Header flags

The idea of providing a standard method for accessing header flags has proposed and fairly quickly dismissed.

5.8 forth-standard.org

Ways of avoiding the overloading of the committee were discussed. Separating a comment from a request for clarification or a proposal are required.

An issue (comment of request for clarification) can be closed by a member of the committee prior to the standards meeting. If the user felt that the committee did not answer the question to there satisfaction they should be allowed to reopen the issue. Similar to the GitHub issue system. **Action: GW**

5.9 External functions

A review of the SWIG solution for access to external library was presented.

6 Matters Arising

1. Electronic meeting have not proved popular and are no longer to be pursued.

2. Meeting via email and web forum, complete with voting mechanism is preferred.
   Action: GW.

7 Any Other Business

None.

8 Date of Next Meeting

The next standards meeting will be held immediately before the next euroForth conference.