

of Northumberland the census gives figures as to the shipping of apples when the actual shipments from the railway station are three times as great. The figures which I have here and which the First Minister cannot contradict show the population as I have stated it. At any rate he can make no argument in favour of having these barren northern regions represented. What representation have the people round James Bay in the Ontario legislature? Look at his own beautiful beloved province of Quebec, and what representation have the people round the shores of James Bay above Lake St. John in the legislature of Quebec?

Mr. BRODEUR. They are represented.

Mr. SAM. HUGHES. Not at all. There is not one polling subdivision upon the shores of James Bay, and yet there are more white people living there than are living in Peace River and Athabaska.

Mr. PERLEY. The Minister of the Interior thought fit to make a little merry over the county I represent, and he is welcome to all the comfort he can get from that. He appears to be unable to answer the argument of the figures I gave last night, except by introducing these extraneous matters. It is quite true that there is a discrepancy between city constituencies and rural constituencies, but that has always been the case. The province of Alberta has practically the same conditions all over its extent; it has a few small towns but no large cities and no great urban populations as we understand it in this part of Canada. The city of Edmonton in the north and Calgary in the south are both small cities compared with the large cities of eastern Canada. But even in the eastern constituencies we have no such discrepancies as the minister would lead us to think. What constituency in this part of Canada has fifteen times as great a voting population as another constituency? The hon. gentleman proposes to give two members to Athabaska which according to the Prime Minister's own figures has only 342 voters while the town of Calgary with 2,653 voters only gets one member. A voter in Athabaska will have fifteen and a half times as much power as a voter in Calgary. The hon. gentleman further goes on to say there is only 10 per cent difference between the south and the north. That is true according to the figures of the eleven constituencies north and south of Red Deer, but in making the estimate the Minister of the Interior has—I do not know why he did it; I do not like to say he did it deliberately—

Mr. OLIVER. I did not make it; I took it from one of the gentlemen on the other side of the House. I did not think it worth my while to make such a foolish argument.

Mr. PERLEY. The Prime Minister has made exactly the same difference of 10 per cent between the eleven constituencies

north and south of Red Deer. This comparison cannot be made unless No. 24 and No. 25 are added. Otherwise it is impossible to calculate the average of population as between the south and the north. Now, I wish to say once more that the contention between the two sides of the House is practically with regard to Athabaska and Peace River. If these two constituencies were omitted, the difference between the two sides as to the other twenty-three constituencies would not be very great. Two seats are to be given to this district, where there are only 1,710 half-breeds and white people, which would mean only 342 voters. Why should these 342 voters, 90 per cent of whom are half-breeds, have the right to elect two members of this provincial legislature? That is practically the whole question.

Mr. SCOTT. What difference whether they are half-breeds or white men?

Mr. PERLEY. I am not suggesting that the half-breeds should not have equal rights with the whites, but what I want to know is why a half-breed should be given a vote fifteen and a-half times as potent as that of a white man?

Mr. SCOTT. If there is any man in the Northwest who should be considered as having a special right it is the native. I am surprised at the hon. gentleman so often repeating that so many of these people are half-breeds.

Mr. PERLEY. Does the hon. gentleman (Mr. Scott) claim that the half-breed has a right to fifteen and a-half times as many votes as a white man?

Mr. OLIVER. They are as much entitled to it as the hon. gentleman's (Mr. Perley's) constituents are entitled to three and a-half times as much representation in this House as the constituents of the hon. member for St. Antoine, Montreal (Mr. Ames).

Mr. PERLEY. The hon. minister's answer does not apply to the point under consideration. The contention on this side is that the half-breed is entitled to equal rights with the white man, but no more. Once more I wish to point out, as the leader of the opposition has done, that seven northern constituencies have one member for each 892 voters, whereas seven southern constituencies have one member for 1,540 voters. In other words, two constituencies have, in effect, been taken from the people of the south and given to 342 voters in the north.

Mr. COCKSHUTT. I know that in a matter of this kind there is great difficulty in arriving at a basis that will be satisfactory all round. I listened with pleasure to the Prime Minister (Sir Wilfrid Laurier) outlining the policy of the government in marking out these constituencies. I understood him to say two main considerations were population and geographical position