```
1 [
                                        MODULE syncCon3
    Synchronized consensus
5 EXTENDS Integers, Sequences, FiniteSets, TLC
   Constants N, FAILNUM
    Assume N \leq 5 \wedge 0 \leq \mathit{FAILNUM} \wedge \mathit{FAILNUM} \leq 4
    Nodes \triangleq 1 \dots N
   --algorithm syncCon3
11
    \{ \text{ variable } FailNum = FAILNUM, \text{ Initialization block } \}
12
               up = [n \in Nodes \mapsto TRUE]; nodes are up
13
               pt = [n \in Nodes \mapsto 0]; nodes are at round 0
14
               t = [n \in Nodes \mapsto FALSE]; nodes are not terminated
15
               d = [n \in Nodes \mapsto -1]; nodes are not decided
16
               mb = [n \in Nodes \mapsto \{\}]; nodes have mailbox as emptyset
17
19
       define {
       SetMin(S) \stackrel{\triangle}{=} CHOOSE \ i \in S : \forall j \in S : i \leq j
20
21
       macro MaybeFail( ) {
23
            if ( FailNum > 0 \land up[self] )
24
              { either
25
                  \{ up[self] := FALSE; FailNum := FailNum - 1; \} Node may fail
26
                 or skip; }; or not
27
        }
28
       fair process ( n \in Nodes )
30
       variable pmb = \{\}, Q = \{\};
31
32
    P: while ( up[self] \land \neg t[self] ) {
33
          if ( d[self] = -1 ) d[self] := self; vote is set
34
          Q := Nodes;
35
    PS: while (up[self] \land Q \neq \{\}) send vote to mb[p] one by one; this node can fail in between
36
              with ( p \in Q ) {
37
                mb[p] := mb[p] \cup \{d[self]\};
                                                         skip for attacking generals impossibility
38
                 Q := Q \setminus \{p\};
39
                MaybeFail();
40
               };
41
            } ; end_while
42
            if ( up[self] ) pt[self] := pt[self] + 1; move to next round
43
           await (up[self] \land (\forall k \in Nodes : up[k] \Rightarrow pt[k] = pt[self])); wait for others to move
    PR:
44
            d[self] := SetMin(mb[self]);
45
           if ( pmb = mb[self] ) t[self] := TRUE;
46
           pmb := mb[self];
47
           mb[self] := \{\};
48
         } ; end_if
49
```

```
}
           process
50
51
      \* Remove up in PR label, to show the FLP result with asynchronous rounds!
      BEGIN TRANSLATION
    VARIABLES FailNum, up, pt, t, d, mb, pc
      define statement
58
     SetMin(S) \stackrel{\Delta}{=} CHOOSE \ i \in S : \forall j \in S : i \leq j
    Variables pmb, Q
61
    vars \stackrel{\Delta}{=} \langle FailNum, up, pt, t, d, mb, pc, pmb, Q \rangle
     ProcSet \stackrel{\Delta}{=} (Nodes)
     Init \stackrel{\Delta}{=} Global variables
67
                \land FailNum = FAILNUM
68
                \land up = [n \in Nodes \mapsto TRUE]
69
                \land pt = [n \in Nodes \mapsto 0]
70
                \land t = [n \in Nodes \mapsto FALSE]
71
                \land d = [n \in Nodes \mapsto -1]
72
                \land mb = [n \in Nodes \mapsto \{\}]
73
                 Process n
74
                \land pmb = [self \in Nodes \mapsto \{\}]
75
                \land Q = [self \in Nodes \mapsto \{\}]
76
                \land pc = [self \in ProcSet \mapsto "P"]
77
     P(self) \stackrel{\triangle}{=} \wedge pc[self] = "P"
79
                     \wedge IF up[self] \wedge \neg t[self]
80
                            THEN \wedge IF d[self] = -1
81
                                             THEN \wedge d' = [d \text{ EXCEPT } ! [self] = self]
82
83
                                             ELSE \land TRUE
                                                      \wedge d' = d
84
                                      \land Q' = [Q \text{ EXCEPT } ![self] = Nodes]
85
                                      \land pc' = [pc \text{ EXCEPT } ![self] = "PS"]
86
                            ELSE \land pc' = [pc \text{ EXCEPT } ! [self] = \text{"Done"}]
87
                                      \wedge unchanged \langle d, Q \rangle
88
89
                     \land UNCHANGED \langle FailNum, up, pt, t, mb, pmb \rangle
     PS(self) \triangleq \land pc[self] = "PS"
91
                       \wedge IF up[self] \wedge Q[self] \neq \{\}
92
                              THEN \wedge \exists p \in Q[self]:
93
                                              \wedge mb' = [mb \text{ EXCEPT } ![p] = mb[p] \cup \{d[self]\}]
94
                                             \land Q' = [Q \text{ EXCEPT } ![self] = Q[self] \setminus \{p\}]
95
                                              \wedge IF FailNum > 0 \wedge up[self]
96
                                                     THEN \wedge \vee \wedge up' = [up \text{ EXCEPT } ![self] = \text{FALSE}]
97
```

```
\wedge FailNum' = FailNum - 1
 98
                                                                         \vee \wedge \text{TRUE}
 99
                                                                             \wedge UNCHANGED \langle FailNum, up \rangle
100
                                                           ELSE \land TRUE
101
                                                                     \land UNCHANGED \langle FailNum, up \rangle
102
                                            \land pc' = [pc \text{ EXCEPT } ! [self] = "PS"]
103
                                            \wedge pt' = pt
104
                                   ELSE \wedge IF up[self]
105
                                                     Then \wedge pt' = [pt \text{ except } ![self] = pt[self] + 1]
106
                                                     ELSE ∧ TRUE
107
                                                               \wedge pt' = pt
108
                                            \land pc' = [pc \text{ EXCEPT } ! [self] = "PR"]
109
                                            \land UNCHANGED \langle FailNum, up, mb, Q \rangle
110
                          \wedge UNCHANGED \langle t, d, pmb \rangle
111
       PR(self) \stackrel{\Delta}{=} \wedge pc[self] = "PR"
113
                          \wedge (up[self] \wedge (\forall k \in Nodes : up[k] \Rightarrow pt[k] = pt[self]))
114
                          \wedge d' = [d \text{ EXCEPT } ![self] = SetMin(mb[self])]
115
                          \wedge IF pmb[self] = mb[self]
116
                                   THEN \wedge t' = [t \text{ EXCEPT } ! [self] = \text{TRUE}]
117
118
                                   ELSE ∧ TRUE
                                            \wedge t' = t
119
                          \land pmb' = [pmb \text{ EXCEPT } ![self] = mb[self]]
120
                          \wedge mb' = [mb \text{ EXCEPT } ![self] = \{\}]
121
                          \wedge pc' = [pc \text{ EXCEPT } ! [self] = "P"]
122
                          \land UNCHANGED \langle FailNum, up, pt, Q \rangle
123
      n(self) \stackrel{\Delta}{=} P(self) \vee PS(self) \vee PR(self)
125
      Next \stackrel{\triangle}{=} (\exists self \in Nodes : n(self))
127
                       V Disjunct to prevent deadlock on termination
128
                          ((\forall self \in ProcSet : pc[self] = "Done") \land UNCHANGED vars)
129
      Spec \stackrel{\Delta}{=} \wedge Init \wedge \Box [Next]_{vars}
131
                    \land \forall self \in Nodes : WF_{vars}(n(self))
132
       Termination \triangleq \Diamond(\forall self \in ProcSet : pc[self] = "Done")
134
        END TRANSLATION
136
      Agreement \stackrel{\triangle}{=} \forall i, j \in Nodes : t[i] \land t[j] \Rightarrow (d[i] = d[j] \land d[i] \neq -1)
138
      NoTerm \stackrel{\triangle}{=} \neg \forall i \in Nodes : up[i] \Rightarrow t[i]
      SyncTerm \stackrel{\triangle}{=} \forall i, j \in Nodes : t[i] \land t[j] \Rightarrow pt[i] = pt[j]
       Term \stackrel{\triangle}{=} \lozenge \forall i \in Nodes : up[i] \Rightarrow t[i]
        Remember \stackrel{\Delta}{=} \square [(\forall j \in Nodes: v'[p] \geq v[p])]\_vars
142
143
```

Agreement. Two correct processes can not commit to different decision variables. $(i,j:ti\ tj:di=dj)$ Validity (Nontriviality). If all initial values are equal, correct processes must decide on that value. (k::(i::vi=k)) (i:ti:di=vi) Termination. The system eventually terminates. true (i::ti)

Synchronous consensus Every process broadcasts (to all other processes, including itself) its initial value vi. In a synchronous network, this can be done in a single "round" of messages. After this round, each process decides on the minimum value it received. If no faults occur, this algorithm is correct. In the presence of a crash fault, however, a problem can arise. In particular, a problem may occur if a process crashes during a round. When this happens, some processes may have received its (low) initial value, but others may not have.

To address this concern, consider this simplifying assumption: say that at most 1 process can crash. How can we modify the algorithm to handle such a failure? Answer: by using 2 rounds. In 1st round, processes broadcast their own initial value. In 2nd round, processes broadcast the minimum value they heard. Each process then decides on the min value among all the sets of values it received in 2nd round. If the one crash occurs during the first round, the second round ensures that all processes have the same set of values from which to decide. Else, if the one crash occurs during the second round, the first round must have completed without a crash and hence all processes have the same set of values from which to decide.

The key observation is that if no crash occurs during a round, all processes have the same set of values from which to decide and they correctly decide on the same minimum value. Thus, to tolerate multiple crashes, say f, the protocol is modified to have f+1 rounds of synchronous communication. Of course, this requires knowing f, an upper bound on the number of possible crash faults.