

## May 2, 2024 Open Government Public Participation and Community Engagement (PPCE) RFI Listening Session Chat text

13:31:15 From Daniel York (U.S Open Government Secretariat) to Waiting Room Participants:  
We just going to be a moment more, and then we will admit everyone from the waiting room into the meeting

13:36:09 From Jay Vincent to Everyone:

Jay Vincent

13:36:24 From Natalie Evans Harris to Everyone:

Natalie Evans Harris, The Data Foundation

13:36:27 From Christopher Murrell to Everyone:

Christopher Murrell-Data Foundation

13:36:33 From Ryan Mulvey, Americans for Prosperity Foundation to Everyone:

Ryan Mulvey, Americans for Prosperity Foundation

13:36:34 From Evan Lewitus to Everyone:

Evan Lewitus, the Program for Public Consultation

13:36:40 From Taylor J. Swift, POPVOX Foundation to Everyone:

Taylor J. Swift, POPVOX Foundation - area of interest include access to open data and management

13:36:44 From Thomas Asher to Everyone:

Thomas Asher, Columbia World Projects, Focused on community engagement, public participation, and deliberative democracy

13:36:44 From Delores Kimbrough to Everyone:

Delores Kimbrough, Kimbrough Consulting

13:36:46 From Lori Martorana to Everyone:

Lori Martorana - IdeaScale

13:36:51 From Martha Wilkes to Everyone:

Martha Wilkes, Dept of Veterans Affairs, Office of the CTO

13:36:51 From Janice Luong to Everyone:

Janice Luong, Project on Government Oversight (POGO)

13:37:01 From SARAH KOTLER to Everyone:

Sarah Kotler, FDA

13:37:07 From Rilee Bennett to Everyone:

Rilee Bennett - Virginia Department of Health

13:37:10 From Levon Williams (he/him) – Rooted in Equity to Everyone:

Levon Williams (he/him) – Rooted in Equity, Reston, VA

13:37:10 From Michelle Savage to Everyone:

Michelle Savage, XBRL US

13:37:11 From Justin Magruder to Everyone:

Justin Magruder, CDO @ SAIC, working with Open Data since joining the UN Open Data program ~10 years ago.

13:37:11 From Alexander Howard to Everyone:

Alex Howard | alex@governing.digital | focused on digital democracy & open government — especially participation and collaboration today

13:37:13 From Roshan Bliss to Everyone:

Roshan Bliss, National Coalition for Dialogue & Deliberation. Personally based in Denver. Especially interested in participatory budgeting, citizen assemblies, and other innovative public consultation processes

13:37:24 From Mark Forman to Everyone:

Mark Forman Dynamic Integrated Services and first Administrator for OMB's Office of Electronic Govt and IT

13:37:26 From Michele Friend to Everyone:

Michele Friend: International Society for Systems Sciences, Forum on Information and Democracy, George Washington University

13:37:27 From Annique Garnier to Everyone:

Annique Garnier - Data Foundation

13:37:28 From Lindsay Steel to Everyone:

Lindsay Steel, DOJ/Office of Information Policy

13:37:28 From Mary Boone to Everyone:

Mary Boone, President, Boone Associates, interest in using large group methods in combination with unique data gathering tools that can be used in person and virtually

13:37:31 From Bitsy Skerry, Public Citizen (she/her) to Everyone:

Bitsy Skerry, Public Citizen. Focus on making the regulatory process work in the public interest and be more inclusive and transparent.

13:37:37 From Matt Leighninger to Everyone:

Matt Leighninger, Center for Democracy Innovation at the National Civic League

13:37:54 From Lorelei Kelly to Everyone:

Lorelei Kelly. Georgetown

13:38:07 From Tom Atlee to Everyone:

Tom Atlee, Co-Intelligence Institute, Public Wisdom- Based Deliberative Democracy

13:38:07 From Amy Benson, SAIC to Everyone:

Amy Benson, SAIC - CX and Data sharing for our customers and society

13:38:35 From Jennifer Boettcher. Georgetown Uni to Everyone:

Jennifer C. Boettcher, Georgetown University. Loving the public domain nature of federal information.

13:38:40 From Kristen Robinson to Everyone:

Kristen Robinson, Open Contracting Partnership

13:39:01 From Owen Ambur to Everyone:

Owen Ambur, ConnectedCommunity.net & AboutThem.info

13:39:06 From Norma Ramos to Everyone:

Norma Ramos, University of Illinois, Institute for Policy and Civic Engagement.

13:39:15 From Alexander Howard to Everyone:

I am hopeful that one concrete outcome of today will be a commitment from the White House to update the U.S. Public Participation Playbook, which was is “an open government priority included in both the first and second U.S. Open Government National Action Plans as part of the United States effort to increase public integrity in government programs.”

<https://digital.gov/guides/public-participation/>

13:39:21 From Keiva Hummel, NCDD to Everyone:

Good afternoon, everyone! Excited to join this conversation. My name is Keiva Hummel (she/her), Communications and Network Director with NCDD - the National Coalition for Dialogue & Deliberation. NCDD is a national network and resource hub for dialogue, deliberation, and public/community engagement. Learn more on the NCDD blog at [ncdd.org/news](https://ncdd.org/news). Feel welcome to reach out to me at [keiva@ncdd.org](mailto:keiva@ncdd.org).

13:39:50 From Yvette Gibson, U.S. Open Government Secretariat to Everyone:

Hello All & Welcome!

13:39:52 From Sam Theno to Everyone:

Sam Theno, University of Illinois - Chicago, Institute for Policy and Civic Engagement

13:39:56 From Stephen Buckley to Everyone:

Stephen Buckley, U.S. chapter, International Association for Public Participation --

<https://www.IAP2usa.org>

13:40:32 From Laura Szakmary, Open Gov Secretariat to Everyone:

For info on the OG FAC check out this press release! <https://www.gsa.gov/about-us/newsroom/news-releases/gsa-launches-open-government-federal-advisory-committee-to-advise-on-governmentwide-transparency-efforts-04262024#:~:text=Supported%20by%20the%20Open%20Government,Action%20Plans%20and%20related%20commitments>.

13:40:58 From Jennifer Boettcher, Georgetown Uni to Everyone:

<https://www.federalregister.gov/documents/2024/04/26/2024-08970/notice-of-intent-to-establish-a-federal-advisory-committee-and-call-for-nominations>

13:41:50 From Renata Bartlett to Everyone:

Jarah Meador, GSA, Program Director for Challenge.gov and CitizenScience.gov

13:41:54 From Laura Szakmary, Open Gov Secretariat to Everyone:

And to comment on the NAP 5 Midterm Self Assessment find the information here:

<https://www.federalregister.gov/documents/2024/04/15/2024-07900/public-review-and-comment-of-the-mid-term-self-assessment-report-of-the-united-states-5th-open>

13:43:49 From Jennifer Boettcher, Georgetown Uni to Everyone:

Question: How are your duties at GSA compare to OIRA?

13:45:08 From Monica Fitzgerald (she/her) Retired GSA to Everyone:

Monica Fitzgerald, served as a health worker in the Peace Corps, and later worked at (and recently retired from) GSA. I am keenly interested in human centered design, and finding actionable ways to help people in the ways that work best for them.

13:47:01 From Thomas Asher to Everyone:

Thank you DPC for embracing this issue as fundamental to the commitment to sustaining a thriving democracy. It is extraordinary to see OGP and the commitment to public participation be taken up at this level.

13:50:56 From Alexander Howard to Everyone:

@JustinVail It's good to see you re-engage on these calls, after a long break! When will the White House revise commitments, as the OGP IRM recommended, to show you are listening & incorporate feedback — as you and Robin acknowledge is important to rebuild trust? <https://www.opengovpartnership.org/documents/united-states-action-plan-review-2022-2024->

for-public-comment/ Will you add new & expanded commitments to a NAP 5.5, as the Obama White House did in 2016? <https://obamawhitehouse.archives.gov/blog/2016/09/20/celebrating-five-years-open-government-partnership-now-70-countries-strong>

13:52:51 From Jennifer Boettcher. Georgetown Uni to Everyone:

I enjoy reading comments on [regulations.gov](https://www.regulations.gov) for the issues I follow

13:56:40 From Tom Atlee to Everyone:

Your PPCE seems mostly about education and input. Will you ever be able to move more substantively towards greater citizen/stakeholder partnership and empowerment in governance? See Sherry Arnstein's 1969 Ladder of Citizen Participation

<https://citizenshandbook.org/arnsteinsladder.html> which was the inspiration for the modern

International Association for Public Participation's Spectrum of Public Participation

[https://iap2.org.au/wp-content/uploads/2020/01/2018\\_IAP2\\_Spectrum.pdf](https://iap2.org.au/wp-content/uploads/2020/01/2018_IAP2_Spectrum.pdf).

13:57:39 From Alexander Howard to Everyone:

OIRA modeled a good public engagement practice when it disclosed the public comments it requested around public engagement

<https://www.whitehouse.gov/omb/information-regulatory-affairs/broadening-public-engagement-in-the-federal-regulatory-process/> but OSTP & DPC & OMB have still not disclosed the public comments received for the 5th National action plan. Telling American what we told you in every open government consultation is not just an important practice for transparency and accountability, but core to the notice and consent model of rulemaking.

14:00:07 From Justin Magruder to Everyone:

How can this initiative improve the citizen experience by helping make commercial supply chain data from state and local registrars more transparent, as related to several current legislative requirements for transparency?

14:00:18 From Kathryn Foxhall, Society of Professional Journalists to Everyone:

Kathryn Foxhall, works, in part with Society of Professional Journalists, on bans on employees speaking to reporters without controls through PIOs, etc. [kfoxhall@verizon.net](mailto:kfoxhall@verizon.net).

14:00:22 From Jennifer Boettcher. Georgetown Uni to Everyone:

Challenges: Data.gov is under staffed and not meeting it's promise. Will it get better funding?

14:00:45 From Keiva Hummel, NCDD to Everyone:

Here is the IAP2 Spectrum that Steve just mentioned:

[https://cdn.ymaws.com/www.iap2.org/resource/resmgr/pillars/Spectrum\\_8.5x11\\_Print.pdf](https://cdn.ymaws.com/www.iap2.org/resource/resmgr/pillars/Spectrum_8.5x11_Print.pdf)

14:01:20 From Michele Friend to Everyone:

If we could meet and talk for 30 mins, I can give you a comprehensive, holistic tool that includes a measure to notice progress. Moreover, it is an easy communication and justification tool. I have a flexible schedule. Please e-mail me: [michele@gwu.edu](mailto:michele@gwu.edu)

14:01:36 From Natalie Evans Harris to Everyone:

Stakeholder Engagement Toolkit: I want to highlight The Data Foundation's Toolkit as a valuable resource compiled from our extensive experience facilitating engagement across government. It provides agencies with practical strategies for implementing meaningful public participation, aligned with the goals of this new OMB framework. The Toolkit is available on our website under 'publications' and here - <https://www.datafoundation.org/stakeholder-engagement-toolkit-for-evidence-building-introduction>.

14:01:45 From Jennifer Boettcher. Georgetown Uni to Everyone:

Challenges: Including tribal governments in data collection and policy making

14:02:23 From Mark Forman to Everyone:

@stevebuckley: Yes on outcomes, not outputs or inputs! well said

14:03:09 From Owen Ambur to Everyone:

Outcomes reported in open, standard, machine-readable format, as per sec. 10 of GPRAMA.

14:03:31 From Michele Friend to Everyone:

Citizen forums include education.

14:04:28 From Keiva Hummel, NCDD to Everyone:

BIG yes @Bitsy! We need to prepare people in early in life how to be more civically engaged. Not just when someone turns 18 and can vote. Civic engagement is SO much more and we can infuse civic better into educational system

14:04:32 From Alexander Howard to Everyone:

One way forward is to host more meetings in person with a hybrid component, as the GSA's Secretariat began doing this again this winter and spring. Federal advisory committees like the one I serve on at NARA remains virtual. If open government is a priority to the White House, will you commit to hosting more in-person roundtables on good governance with civil society leaders — the model of the Open Government Partnership that President Obama's participation embodied — & promoted all of this work to the press and public through the Offices of Public Engagement, Communications, and Press Secretary?

<https://www.opengovpartnership.org/stories/six-ways-the-united-states-can-lead-by-example-on-open-government/>

14:04:40 From Michele Friend to Everyone:

At the end of the day, corporations are swayed by profit and laws.

14:04:51 From Arfa Alam, Partnership for Public Service to Everyone:

Big plus 1 Bitsy!

14:05:32 From Mary Boone to Everyone:

NASA's work is great too

14:05:33 From Kristen Robinson to Everyone:

+1!

14:06:08 From Keiva Hummel, NCDD to Everyone:

And how can we make every accessible - in language, with varying abilities, access to tech (or not)

14:06:19 From Janice Luong to Everyone:

Yes Bitsy! language accessibility and education are such great points!

14:06:21 From Alexander Howard to Everyone:

100% @Bitsy; I don't see any press release about today's meeting or promotion of the GSA's great work or this FACA by the White House. It should be table stakes to inform the American people about opportunities to participate in regulations, & collaborate on challenges, or contribute to citizen science.

14:06:50 From Jennifer Boettcher. Georgetown Uni to Everyone:

Is there a way to get .gov higher in results of online searches?

14:06:52 From Stephen Buckley to Everyone:

@Shaibya -- Please let us know how long people have to speak.

14:07:27 From Jennifer Boettcher. Georgetown Uni to Everyone:

@Stephen, she said 2 minutes

14:07:27 From Kristen Robinson to Everyone:

+1 on data standards and challenges of data quality, comparability, interoperability across jurisdictions

14:07:49 From Kristen Robinson to Everyone:

so important for supplier inclusion particularly MBE WBE etc

14:08:45 From Keiva Hummel, NCDD to Everyone:

RE: promoting this effort - how can we all leverage our networks to help amplify this effort? It's not just on the WH/GSA/OMB/DF to promote, but it's a community effort

14:09:27 From Arfa Alam, Partnership for Public Service to Everyone:

+1 Keiva

14:09:32 From Jennifer Boettcher. Georgetown Uni to Everyone:

@Keiva 🙌

14:09:33 From Rilee Bennett, VDH to Everyone:

@Jennifer Boettcher: you can type in your search to Google, hit the space bar, and then type site:.gov It should then push .gov sites to the top of your search results

14:09:57 From Tom Atlee to Everyone:

Polis platform helps people both to give input and to vote on others' input - AND it generates coherent mapping of the landscape of perspectives automatically in real time.

14:11:00 From Jennifer Boettcher. Georgetown Uni to Everyone:

@Rilee most people don't know how to do an advance search. Right now most .gov results are many pages down, where they don't see the great work is being done.

14:11:18 From Mary Boone to Everyone:

Tools that can capture comments/narrative's and integrate that with a quantitative view and are accessible for data input on cellphones can be extraordinarily powerful such as Sensemaker <https://thecynefin.co/sensemaker/>

14:11:35 From Rilee Bennett, VDH to Everyone:

I agree with that. Most searches I do don't result in a .gov site if I search normally.

14:11:41 From Thomas Asher to Everyone:

Can OMB issue guidance to clarify to agencies whether tools like Pol.is as well as deliberative polling are allowable and, if not, what civic tech platforms might be?

14:12:12 From Matt Leighninger, CDI at Nat'l Civic League to Everyone:

At the Global Innovations in Democracy parliamentary exchange we hosted (with our partners at IDEA at Ohio State) on Capitol Hill a couple weeks ago, it was clear that the US has fallen even farther behind other countries when it comes to public participation. The foreign legislators included parliamentarians from Brazil, France, Kenya, Belgium, the EU, and four other countries. In the Global South countries, national governments have worked much more closely with grassroots groups and been more innovative overall; in Europe and Australia, national governments have allocated a lot more funding and staffing to participation than we have. We haven't finished the report from this year's exchange, but the report from the last one is here: <https://www.nationalcivicleague.org/ncr-article/democracy-innovations-on-capitol-hill-report-from-the-first-annual-international-legislators-forum-on-innovations-in-democracy/>

14:12:12 From Jennifer Boettcher. Georgetown Uni to Everyone:

Like the themed web pages, like environment.gov or grant.gov or data.gov It does break down the silos

14:12:16 From Martha Wilkes to Everyone:

□ Arfa

14:13:10 From Mary Boone to Everyone:

Arfa, sending admiration for your ability to help all of the people you're responsible for and also do this work of connecting people. Brava

14:13:48 From Kristen Robinson to Everyone:

+1 Arfa

14:13:53 From Norma Ramos, UIC to Everyone:

+1, Arfa

14:14:10 From Bitsy Skerry, Public Citizen (she/her) to Everyone:

+1, Arfa

14:14:16 From Keiva Hummel, NCDD to Everyone:

+1 Arfa

14:14:19 From Arfa Alam, Partnership for Public Service to Everyone:

Thank you all, and I respect and admire everyone here for the good work you all are doing for our country.

14:15:16 From Lorelei Kelly to Everyone:

How about a challenge.gov for deliberative technology platforms/local governments/members of Congress including committees in the House and Senate that results in a set of national conferences by region where we share these piloted prototypes?

14:15:48 From Matt Leighninger, CDI at Nat'l Civic League to Everyone:

Evaluation and measurement of public participation is still an emerging field, especially in the US, but we do at least have a sense now of the variety of tools available to measure it. This report may be helpful: <https://citizensandscholars.org/focus-areas/accelerate/mapping-civic-measurement/> The Civic League and the Institute for Citizens and Scholars are now working on a 'how-to' guide to help select and apply measurement and evaluation tools based on the situation.

14:15:50 From Jennifer Boettcher. Georgetown Uni to Everyone:

Can some of the themed webpages, also clarify what are federal and state responsibilities. We have many test beds of innovative governments

14:15:57 From Lorelei Kelly to Everyone:

There are so many platforms out there being piloted right now...and we can let a thousand flowers bloom so that the outcomes are locally sourced and led by community steward values

14:16:35 From Jennifer Boettcher. Georgetown Uni to Everyone:

@Lorelie 🙌

14:17:04 From Norma Ramos, UIC to Everyone:

+1, Roshan

14:17:07 From Mary Boone to Everyone:

I think it's also important to look at patterns in the narratives that people share. So many surveys tell you "what" people want but not "why" and the "why" is crucial to designing solutions

14:17:14 From Ryan Wold to Everyone:

+ Mary

14:17:17 From Mary Boone to Everyone:

+1 Roshan

14:17:23 From Keiva Hummel, NCDD to Everyone:

+1 Roshan!

14:17:41 From Evan Lewitus to Everyone:

+1 Roshan

14:17:47 From Janice Luong to Everyone:

+1 Roshan

14:17:59 From Arfa Alam, Partnership for Public Service to Everyone:

+1 Roshan

14:17:59 From Bitsy Skerry, Public Citizen (she/her) to Everyone:

+1 Roshan

14:18:20 From DR DWIGHT SANDERS to Everyone:

THANK YOU FOR THIS LEARNING

14:18:41 From Alexander Howard to Everyone:

Yes to this! Pol.is! Study what Taiwan is doing!

14:18:54 From Thomas Asher to Everyone:

Endorse @loraleikelly's idea of running a competition even as if such public opinion techniques of representative sampling are to be used, either broad guidance would need to be issued or the use of the tool likely would need to be fast tracked through regulation review or such tools likely would not be deployed for specific uses swiftly enough.

14:19:01 From Matt Leighninger, CDI at Nat'l Civic League to Everyone:

The Healthy Democracy Ecosystem Map will be a resource for helping people 'see' the fields of public participation and democracy innovation, as Roshan suggests:

<https://www.nationalcivicleague.org/mapping-americas-healthy-democracy-ecosystem/>

14:19:06 From Nicole Armos to Everyone:

+1 on the power of deliberative mini-public models <https://www.oecd.org/gov/innovative-citizen-participation-and-new-democratic-institutions-339306da-en.htm>

14:19:43 From Nicole Armos to Everyone:

FIDE North America may be a strong partner in developing capacity for such models <https://www.fide.eu/north-america>

14:20:05 From Monica Fitzgerald (she/her) Retired GSA to Everyone:

A couple of thoughts. It sounds to me as though the issue at hand is how to make opportunities to provide input both accessible, and basically built into something people are already doing anyway. This reminds me of all of the research on "nudging" (something that GSA's Office of Evaluation Services is very familiar with.) When I worked in the federal government I definitely added comments to the federal register and it was not easy in all honesty. I totally agree with a previous commenter's observation that using acronyms like PPCE can pretty automatically turn people off because they don't know what that means. I am a big fan of using Human Centered Design to really understand users' experiences and perspectives, and it would be great for future work in this area.

14:20:15 From Bitsy Skerry, Public Citizen (she/her) to Everyone:



+1 Ryan to your comments on feedback flowing through the right channels and having some sort of "help desk"

14:22:07 From Janice Luong to Everyone:

Great point, Jennifer!

14:22:32 From Mark Forman to Everyone:

@jennifer, you are right on target. virtual every federal contract requires the contract staff to sign an NDA.

14:22:40 From Arfa Alam, Partnership for Public Service to Everyone:

+1 Stephen

14:23:15 From Mary Boone to Everyone:

Tools like Sensemaker can do the synthesizing Ryan mentioned. It also allows for "continuous capture" so that you can see shifts in the narratives over time. And it allows us to see where the overlap in narratives occurs across partisan lines, for example. It's one thing to gather millions of comments from people, but making it actionable requires measurement over time. Yes, we can measure what Stephen says - did you feel informed but we also need to know WHY you felt informed.

14:23:25 From Thomas Asher to Everyone:

I also suggest that OMB revisit the PCAST letter on advancing public engagement with the sciences. OMB might explore how to take up the recommendation for a new office to support federal agencies in their continuing efforts to develop and build participatory public engagement. This new office can sustain relations with research organizations and groups that employ deliberative tools, whether polling or platforms such as pol.is and, also, help agencies stand up and replicate such processes.

14:23:54 From Alexander Howard to Everyone:

Yes to that, Thomas!

14:24:49 From Jennifer Boettcher. Georgetown Uni to Everyone:

sorry but true, Mark

14:25:07 From Thomas Asher to Everyone:

(The model would plausibly be USDS ... but for meaningful public engagement)

14:25:48 From Mary Boone to Everyone:

+1 Mark

14:26:12 From Ryan Wold to Everyone:

I'm curious on any approaches \*at all\* to ROI/value on social media spend.

14:26:18 From Mary Boone to Everyone:

And also a multi-directional street, Mark!

14:26:18 From Joseph Hoereth to Everyone:

I would like to add that it is just as important to commit funds/make funds available for robust engagement methods. Many of the fantastic ideas that have been shared here have significant costs to do well. I suggest that the federal government commit engagement funds for every program/project the same way it includes funds for program evaluation.

14:26:49 From Bitsy Skerry, Public Citizen (she/her) to Everyone:

+1 Mark

14:27:30 From cynthia lionheart to Everyone:

have you considered utilizing an ethnographic research lens to determine how best to

meet people where they are?

14:27:58 From Jennifer Boettcher. Georgetown Uni to Everyone:

Any suggestions from GAO or from states on how to do this? Do we really have to reinvent the wheel?

14:28:25 From Arfa Alam, Partnership for Public Service to Everyone:

+1 Alexander

14:28:51 From Jennifer Boettcher. Georgetown Uni to Everyone:

Right on Alexander

14:29:15 From Renata Bartlett to Everyone:

<https://digital.gov/guides/public-participation/>

14:29:29 From Arfa Alam, Partnership for Public Service to Everyone:

in terms of leading practices, is OMB doing stakeholder mapping to ensure you're reaching and engaging diverse populations?

14:29:45 From Mary Boone to Everyone:

+ 1 Alexander

14:29:52 From Lorelei Kelly to Everyone:

MIT Media Lab developed Fora—AI scaffolding for community listening and data analytics... I believe that participants own the data, too... it is a non profit.

<https://cortico.ai/platform/>

14:30:03 From Martha Wilkes to Everyone:

Here on the VA.gov team, we have a deep commitment to human centered design and usability feedback sessions with Veterans and their caregivers. Over 20% of our sessions for the past 2 years have been with assistive tech users, and this has been the biggest impact on our culture of “accessibility beyond compliance”. I believe that every session where our researchers are deeply listening to a Veteran can be a healing, trust-building, trauma-informed interaction with “the government”.

14:30:05 From Mark Forman to Everyone:

@alexander, the problem is not just inputs but results that matter and too many of the agency results dont reflect performance gains.

14:31:26 From Keiva Hummel, NCDD to Everyone:

Tools like NCDD’s Engagement Streams Framework can support guiding PPCE development and understanding what method would support the specific goals/objectives of an engagement effort. <https://www.ncdd.org/streams.html>

The Engagement Streams, categorizes dialogue and deliberation approaches into four streams based on one's primary intention or purpose (Exploration, Conflict Transformation, Decision Making, and Collaborative Action), and shows which of the most well-known methods have proven themselves especially effective in each stream.

14:31:45 From Mark Forman to Everyone:

@Alexander great points on showing that agents are listening to the principles (i.e. citizens)

14:31:58 From Alexander Howard to Everyone:

Thank you, Mark!

14:32:24 From Mark Forman to Everyone:

sorry principals....Freudian slip HA!

14:32:47 From Arfa Alam, Partnership for Public Service to Everyone:

+1 Natalie

14:32:59 From Kristen Robinson to Everyone:

+1 Natalie

14:33:02 From Jennifer Boettcher. Georgetown Uni to Everyone:

Yes, Natalie

14:33:09 From Mark Forman to Everyone:

+1 Natalie

14:33:19 From Alexander Howard to Everyone:

@mark 100%. We need a lot more human capacity to be devoted to listening and responding as the volume of comment increases, augmented by tech. We need performance goals for civic engagement, not marketing initiatives online

14:33:44 From Bitsy Skerry, Public Citizen (she/her) to Everyone:

+1 Natalie

14:33:49 From Ryan Wold to Everyone:

Metrics on Responsiveness would go a long way, imo. Queues, cycle time, signal vs noise (common types of feedback vs variety/uniqueness)

14:34:13 From Alexander Howard to Everyone:

@Mark I think listening to principles of honesty, integrity, fairness, & humility would be grand

14:34:25 From Natalie Evans Harris to Everyone:

The Toolkit is available on our website under 'publications' and here - <https://www.datafoundation.org/stakeholder-engagement-toolkit-for-evidence-building-introduction>.

14:35:18 From Mary Boone to Everyone:

+1 Stephen

14:35:54 From Jennifer Boettcher. Georgetown Uni to Everyone:

Yep Stephen. I missed it when it came out and little discussion

14:36:05 From Thomas Asher to Everyone:

Suggest socializing any draft framework and doing so in partnership with community-facing orgs such as Citizen University or the Participatory Budgeting Project.

14:36:34 From Mark Forman to Everyone:

yes, theatrics of public engagement is not the change in responsiveness that people seek

14:36:35 From Rilee Bennett, VDH to Everyone:

@Natalie Evans Harris: Thank you for posting the Toolkit link!

14:37:09 From Ryan Wold to Everyone:

+ Mark

14:37:29 From Lorelei Kelly to Everyone:

Work with community colleges and esp their vocational programs and esp rural poor communities, tribal lands and/or communities with high health risk like covid and addiction/despair suicides

14:37:40 From Philip Ashlock to Everyone:

## May 2, 2024 OpenGov PPCE Listening Session saved chat

I also see Kathryn has her hand raised

14:37:40 From Jennifer Boettcher. Georgetown Uni to Everyone:

Not everyone has the internet. Thank you for the Broadband initiative, now we have to have hardware distributed.

14:37:58 From Thomas Asher to Everyone:

That link appears to be broken @Natalie Evans Harris

14:38:12 From Lorelei Kelly to Everyone:

We have the data. I'm from poor rural America and blue city NGOs will have very little traction. You have to do the work of finding a local, co equal partner

14:38:13 From Mary Boone to Everyone:

+1 Daniel - ACTIVE listening is key

14:38:28 From Natalie Evans Harris to Everyone:

Oops, try this one - <https://www.datafoundation.org/stakeholder-engagement-toolkit-for-evidence-building-introduction>

14:38:32 From Yvette Gibson, U.S. Open Government Secretariat to Everyone:

Thanks Philip

14:39:21 From Mary Boone to Everyone:

Listening @ scale is key

14:39:21 From Elizabeth Eisenhower to Everyone:

If everyone is (understandably) afraid of getting in "trouble" for saying the wrong thing is there a way we can facilitate conversation

14:39:34 From Bitsy Skerry, Public Citizen (she/her) to Everyone:

+1 Daniel

14:41:01 From Jennifer Boettcher. Georgetown Uni to Everyone:

Letters to leaders in the communities you are trying to reach to invite them to contact right office. Not everyone reads their email.

14:41:28 From Alexander Howard to Everyone:

I'd like to speak to offline approaches to engagement and participation that leverage civic navigators like librarians & teachers, in collaboration with public media & universities <https://civictexts.substack.com/p/every-white-house-needs-to-inform> use the learnings from health navigators & [healthcare.gov](https://healthcare.gov) or unemployment & snap benefits

14:42:36 From Alexander Howard to Everyone:

Including the press in these conversations & doing regular readouts in briefings in the White House press room would create more transparency and accountability

14:42:49 From Stephen Buckley to Everyone:

NCDD will continue this discussion, tomorrow at 2pm. See details here: -- <https://www.ncdd.org/news/join-ncdd-listening-session-on-may-3rd-contributing-to-the-ombs-ppce-framework>

14:43:39 From Lorelei Kelly to Everyone:

I drove X country 5 times during the pandemic and I noticed that new and evolving public spaces are: bier gardens, coffee roasters in rehabilitated buildings, maker spaces, small business incubators, other 3rd spaces focused on physical convening for community i.e. bookstores plus, pop up movies, etc.

14:44:36 From Stephen Buckley to Everyone:

Anyone, feel free to reach out to me. -- Stephen Buckley,  
sbuckley@OpenGovMetrics.com -- (508) 348-9090

14:44:42 From Cynthia Lionheart to Everyone:

As someone with a disability I appreciate the ability to participate online.

14:44:46 From Jennifer Boettcher. Georgetown Uni to Everyone:

yep Alexander

14:44:59 From Bitsy Skerry, Public Citizen (she/her) to Everyone:

+1 Alexander

14:45:55 From Lorelei Kelly to Everyone:

Alex is right, there are so many new upstart local news organizations...they should totally be brought into this as opportunities to meet content providers. See city bureau in Chicago. Where I'm from it is called Tri County Register (Northern NM)

14:46:31 From Lorelei Kelly to Everyone:

In the West you can call it "the Digital Grange"

14:46:41 From Jennifer Boettcher. Georgetown Uni to Everyone:

Can administrators be social influencers? LoL

14:47:55 From Alexander Howard to Everyone:

@jennifer 100% - Secretary Pete

14:48:10 From Martha Wilkes to Everyone:

GovTok? Is that a thing?

14:48:20 From Jennifer Boettcher. Georgetown Uni to Everyone:

he does do a very good job

14:48:37 From Alexander Howard to Everyone:

Remember the White House champions of change, @lorelei?

14:48:47 From Arfa Alam, Partnership for Public Service to Everyone:

+100 Keiva!!!

14:49:16 From Alexander Howard to Everyone:

@martha If folks are not watching AOC on Instagram live, they should.

14:49:35 From Bitsy Skerry, Public Citizen (she/her) to Everyone:

+1 Keiva

14:49:35 From Martha Wilkes to Everyone:

True!

14:50:52 From Alexander Howard to Everyone:

Martha - Rep. Jackson explains his votes there

<https://spectrumlocalnews.com/nc/charlotte/news/2023/01/20/tiktok-jeff-jackson>

14:51:39 From Martha Wilkes to Everyone:

How cool

14:52:20 From Alexander Howard to Everyone:

New and revised US commitments for OpenGovweek please :)

14:53:05 From Alexander Howard to Everyone:

<https://www.opengovpartnership.org/the-open-gov-challenge/>

14:54:21 From Keiva Hummel, NCDD to Everyone:

NCDD is hosting a listening session tomorrow to provide robust feedback from our network 😊 <https://www.ncdd.org/news/join-ncdd-listening-session-on-may-3rd-contributing-to->

the-ombs-ppce-framework

14:54:53 From Thomas Asher to Everyone:

Thank you GSA and OMB for advancing this work. None of us should take that for granted.

14:55:22 From Jennifer Boettcher. Georgetown Uni to Everyone:

Yes, they have community accountability

14:55:24 From Keiva Hummel, NCDD to Everyone:

Agreed @Thomas! Thank you GSA/OMB 🙏

14:56:16 From Thomas Asher to Everyone:

Congress could revise PRA to make meaningful public engagement easier for the agencies.

14:57:07 From Mark Forman to Everyone:

@thomas weren't those addressed in 21st Century IDEA?

14:58:21 From Alexander Howard to Everyone:

Test this all out by directing cabinet agencies to pull out the stops to engage people to vote with vote.gov please — registering Americans to vote is a fantastic shared goal with a nonpartisan outcome

14:58:24 From Courtney Anderson (Open Government Secretariat) to Everyone:

FOIA business standards out for comment:<https://www.regulations.gov/docket/BSC-FOI-2024-0001>

14:58:34 From Mary Boone to Everyone:

Thank you!

14:58:44 From Levon Williams (he/him) – Rooted in Equity to Everyone:

Thank you!

14:58:45 From Thomas Asher to Everyone:

Thank you.

14:58:50 From Monica Fitzgerald (she/her) Retired GSA to Everyone:

Thank you!

14:58:51 From Janice Luong to Everyone:

Thank you!

14:58:56 From Alexander Howard to Everyone:

Thank you!