Guidelines for Presentations[1]

- **What is the main research question and why does it matter?**
- **State the main research claim(s)[2] in the article.**
  - Note that different claims in a paper may be tested using different methodologies.
  - Claims can have different structures, the most common of which are described below:
    - **Causal claim**: a claim is causal if it can be summarized using causal language. This language can be characterized by the following structure: "The paper estimates the effect of a variable X on outcome Y for population P, using method M." For example: "This paper investigates the impact of bicycle provision (X) on secondary school enrollment (Y) among young women in Bihar/India (P), using a Difference-in-Differences approach (M)."
    - **Descriptive/predictive claim**: a claim is descriptive or predictive if it can be summarized using descriptive or predictive language (e.g., estimating a population's descriptive statistic). This language can be characterized by the following structure: "The paper estimates the value of a variable Y (estimated or predicted) for population P under dimensions X (optional) using method M." For example, "Drawing on a unique Swiss data set (P) and exploiting systematic anomalies in countries' portfolio investment positions (M), I find that around 8% of the global financial wealth of households is held in tax havens (Y)."
- **Summarize the paper, with attention towards the following:**
  - What is the population that is the focus of the paper as a whole?
  - What is the population for which the estimates apply?
  - What are the main dependent variables and independent variables (both in terms of the concepts they are intended to capture and their operationalization)?
  - What are the primary data sources used in the paper?
  - What is the primary statistical or econometric method used to examine each claim?
    - Try to explain the method in your own words, in a way that someone who has only taken basic statistics would understand. You can use figures from the paper to help with this.
  - Describe the main findings in a sentence or two.
  - What, if any, robustness checks does the author provide for their preferred specification?
- **Suggest at least one way that the paper can be improved or extended.**

---

[1] Adapted from the Berkeley INitiative for TRansparent Social Sciences (BITSS)

[2] "A research claim is a single major finding from a published study… Sometimes the claim as described in the abstract does not exactly match the claim that is tested. In this case, you should consider the research claim to be that which is described in the [results of the paper]." – RepliCATS Project.Generally research claims stem from empirical tests.

- These can be suggestions for improving the data, improving the methods, clarifying areas that were insufficiently explained, for additional robustness checks, or for extensions you'd like to see.