

COMP2907 – Algorithms (Adv)

Lecture 1: Stable matching



THE UNIVERSITY OF
SYDNEY

A First Problem: Stable Matching

- › **Goal.** Given a set of preferences among hospitals and medical school students, design a **self-reinforcing** admissions process.
- › **Unstable pair:** applicant x and hospital y are **unstable** if:
 - x prefers y to its assigned hospital.
 - y prefers x to one of its admitted students.
- › **Stable assignment.** Assignment with no unstable pairs.
 - Natural and desirable condition.
 - Individual self-interest will prevent any applicant/hospital deal from being made.

Stable Matching Problem

› **Goal.** Given n men and n women, find a "suitable" matching.

- Participants rate members of opposite sex.
- Each man lists women in order of preference from best to worst.
- Each woman lists men in order of preference from best to worst.

	favorite ↓			least favorite ↓
	1st	2nd	3rd	
Xavier	Amy	Bertha	Clare	
Yancey	Bertha	Amy	Clare	
Zeus	Amy	Bertha	Clare	

Men's Preference Profile

	favorite ↓			least favorite ↓
	1st	2nd	3rd	
Amy	Yancey	Xavier	Zeus	
Bertha	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	
Clare	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	

Women's Preference Profile

- › **Perfect matching:** everyone is matched monogamously.
 - Each man gets exactly one woman.
 - Each woman gets exactly one man.

- › **Stability:** no incentive for some pair of participants to undermine assignment by joint action.
 - In matching M , an unmatched pair m - w is **unstable** if man m and woman w prefer each other to current partners.
 - Unstable pair m - w could each improve by eloping.

- › **Stable matching:** perfect matching with no unstable pairs.

- › **Stable matching problem:** Given the preference lists of n men and n women, find a stable matching if one exists.



Stable Matching Problem

› **Question:** Is assignment X-C, Y-B, Z-A stable?

	favorite ↓ 1 st		least favorite ↓ 3 rd
	1 st	2 nd	3 rd
Xavier	Amy	Bertha	Clare
Yancey	Bertha	Amy	Clare
Zeus	Amy	Bertha	Clare

Men's Preference Profile

	favorite ↓ 1 st		least favorite ↓ 3 rd
	1 st	2 nd	3 rd
Amy	Yancey	Xavier	Zeus
Bertha	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus
Clare	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus

Women's Preference Profile

Stable Matching Problem

- › **Question:** Is assignment X-C, Y-B, Z-A stable?
- › **Answer:** No. Bertha and Xavier will hook up.

	favorite ↓		least favorite ↓
	1 st	2 nd	3 rd
Xavier	Amy	Bertha	Clare
Yancey	Bertha	Amy	Clare
Zeus	Amy	Bertha	Clare

Men's Preference Profile

	favorite ↓		least favorite ↓
	1 st	2 nd	3 rd
Amy	Yancey	Xavier	Zeus
Bertha	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus
Clare	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus

Women's Preference Profile



Stable Matching Problem

› **Question:** Is assignment X-A, Y-B, Z-C stable?

› **Answer:** Yes.

	favorite ↓ 1 st	2 nd	least favorite ↓ 3 rd
Xavier	Amy	Bertha	Clare
Yancey	Bertha	Amy	Clare
Zeus	Amy	Bertha	Clare

Men's Preference Profile

	favorite ↓ 1 st	2 nd	least favorite ↓ 3 rd
Amy	Yancey	Xavier	Zeus
Bertha	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus
Clare	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus

Women's Preference Profile

- › **Question:** Do stable matchings always exist?
- › **Answer:** Not obvious a priori.
- › Stable roommate problem.
 - $2n$ people; each person ranks others from 1 to $2n-1$.
 - Assign roommate pairs so that no unstable pairs.

	<i>1st</i>	<i>2nd</i>	<i>3rd</i>
<i>Adam</i>	B	C	D
<i>Bob</i>	C	A	D
<i>Chris</i>	A	B	D
<i>Doofus</i>	A	B	C

A-B, C-D \Rightarrow B-C unstable
A-C, B-D \Rightarrow A-B unstable
A-D, B-C \Rightarrow A-C unstable

- › **Observation:** Stable matchings do not always exist for stable roommate problem.

Propose-And-Reject Algorithm

- › Propose-and-reject algorithm. [Gale-Shapley 1962] Intuitive method that guarantees to find a stable matching.

```
Initialize each person to be free.
while (some man is free and hasn't proposed to every woman) {
    Choose such a man m
    w = 1st woman on m's list to whom m has not yet proposed
    if (w is free)
        assign m and w to be engaged
    else if (w prefers m to her fiancé m')
        assign m and w to be engaged, and m' to be free
    else
        w rejects m
}
```

Men's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Victor	Bertha	Amy	Diane	Erika	Clare
Wyatt	Diane	Bertha	Amy	Clare	Erika
Xavier	Bertha	Erika	Clare	Diane	Amy
Yancey	Amy	Diane	Clare	Bertha	Erika
Zeus	Bertha	Diane	Amy	Erika	Clare

Women's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Amy	Zeus	Victor	Wyatt	Yancey	Xavier
Bertha	Xavier	Wyatt	Yancey	Victor	Zeus
Clare	Wyatt	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	Victor
Diane	Victor	Zeus	Yancey	Xavier	Wyatt
Erika	Yancey	Wyatt	Zeus	Xavier	Victor

Men's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Victor	Bertha	Amy	Diane	Erika	Clare
Wyatt	Diane	Bertha	Amy	Clare	Erika
Xavier	Bertha	Erika	Clare	Diane	Amy
Yancey	Amy	Diane	Clare	Bertha	Erika
Zeus	Bertha	Diane	Amy	Erika	Clare

Victor proposes to Bertha.

Women's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Amy	Zeus	Victor	Wyatt	Yancey	Xavier
Bertha	Xavier	Wyatt	Yancey	Victor	Zeus
Clare	Wyatt	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	Victor
Diane	Victor	Zeus	Yancey	Xavier	Wyatt
Erika	Yancey	Wyatt	Zeus	Xavier	Victor

Men's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Victor	Bertha	Amy	Diane	Erika	Clare
Wyatt	Diane	Bertha	Amy	Clare	Erika
Xavier	Bertha	Erika	Clare	Diane	Amy
Yancey	Amy	Diane	Clare	Bertha	Erika
Zeus	Bertha	Diane	Amy	Erika	Clare

Victor proposes to Bertha.

- Bertha accepts since previously unmatched.

Women's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Amy	Zeus	Victor	Wyatt	Yancey	Xavier
Bertha	Xavier	Wyatt	Yancey	Victor	Zeus
Clare	Wyatt	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	Victor
Diane	Victor	Zeus	Yancey	Xavier	Wyatt
Erika	Yancey	Wyatt	Zeus	Xavier	Victor

Men's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Victor	Bertha	Amy	Diane	Erika	Clare
Wyatt	Diane	Bertha	Amy	Clare	Erika
Xavier	Bertha	Erika	Clare	Diane	Amy
Yancey	Amy	Diane	Clare	Bertha	Erika
Zeus	Bertha	Diane	Amy	Erika	Clare

Wyatt proposes to Diane.

Women's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Amy	Zeus	Victor	Wyatt	Yancey	Xavier
Bertha	Xavier	Wyatt	Yancey	Victor	Zeus
Clare	Wyatt	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	Victor
Diane	Victor	Zeus	Yancey	Xavier	Wyatt
Erika	Yancey	Wyatt	Zeus	Xavier	Victor

Men's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Victor	Bertha	Amy	Diane	Erika	Clare
Wyatt	Diane	Bertha	Amy	Clare	Erika
Xavier	Bertha	Erika	Clare	Diane	Amy
Yancey	Amy	Diane	Clare	Bertha	Erika
Zeus	Bertha	Diane	Amy	Erika	Clare

Wyatt proposes to Diane.

- Diane accepts since previously unmatched.

Women's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Amy	Zeus	Victor	Wyatt	Yancey	Xavier
Bertha	Xavier	Wyatt	Yancey	Victor	Zeus
Clare	Wyatt	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	Victor
Diane	Victor	Zeus	Yancey	Xavier	Wyatt
Erika	Yancey	Wyatt	Zeus	Xavier	Victor

Men's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Victor	Bertha	Amy	Diane	Erika	Clare
Wyatt	Diane	Bertha	Amy	Clare	Erika
Xavier	Bertha	Erika	Clare	Diane	Amy
Yancey	Amy	Diane	Clare	Bertha	Erika
Zeus	Bertha	Diane	Amy	Erika	Clare

Xavier proposes to Bertha.

Women's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Amy	Zeus	Victor	Wyatt	Yancey	Xavier
Bertha	Xavier	Wyatt	Yancey	Victor	Zeus
Clare	Wyatt	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	Victor
Diane	Victor	Zeus	Yancey	Xavier	Wyatt
Erika	Yancey	Wyatt	Zeus	Xavier	Victor

Men's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Victor	Bertha	Amy	Diane	Erika	Clare
Wyatt	Diane	Bertha	Amy	Clare	Erika
Xavier	Bertha	Erika	Clare	Diane	Amy
Yancey	Amy	Diane	Clare	Bertha	Erika
Zeus	Bertha	Diane	Amy	Erika	Clare

Xavier proposes to Bertha.

- Bertha dumps Victor and accepts Xavier.

Women's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Amy	Zeus	Victor	Wyatt	Yancey	Xavier
Bertha	Xavier	Wyatt	Yancey	Victor	Zeus
Clare	Wyatt	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	Victor
Diane	Victor	Zeus	Yancey	Xavier	Wyatt
Erika	Yancey	Wyatt	Zeus	Xavier	Victor

Men's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Victor	Bertha	Amy	Diane	Erika	Clare
Wyatt	Diane	Bertha	Amy	Clare	Erika
Xavier	Bertha	Erika	Clare	Diane	Amy
Yancey	Amy	Diane	Clare	Bertha	Erika
Zeus	Bertha	Diane	Amy	Erika	Clare

Victor proposes to Amy.

Women's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Amy	Zeus	Victor	Wyatt	Yancey	Xavier
Bertha	Xavier	Wyatt	Yancey	Victor	Zeus
Clare	Wyatt	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	Victor
Diane	Victor	Zeus	Yancey	Xavier	Wyatt
Erika	Yancey	Wyatt	Zeus	Xavier	Victor

Men's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Victor	Bertha	Amy	Diane	Erika	Clare
Wyatt	Diane	Bertha	Amy	Clare	Erika
Xavier	Bertha	Erika	Clare	Diane	Amy
Yancey	Amy	Diane	Clare	Bertha	Erika
Zeus	Bertha	Diane	Amy	Erika	Clare

Victor proposes to Amy.

- Amy accepts since previously unmatched.

Women's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Amy	Zeus	Victor	Wyatt	Yancey	Xavier
Bertha	Xavier	Wyatt	Yancey	Victor	Zeus
Clare	Wyatt	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	Victor
Diane	Victor	Zeus	Yancey	Xavier	Wyatt
Erika	Yancey	Wyatt	Zeus	Xavier	Victor

Men's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Victor	Bertha	Amy	Diane	Erika	Clare
Wyatt	Diane	Bertha	Amy	Clare	Erika
Xavier	Bertha	Erika	Clare	Diane	Amy
Yancey	Amy	Diane	Clare	Bertha	Erika
Zeus	Bertha	Diane	Amy	Erika	Clare

Yancey proposes to Amy.

Women's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Amy	Zeus	Victor	Wyatt	Yancey	Xavier
Bertha	Xavier	Wyatt	Yancey	Victor	Zeus
Clare	Wyatt	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	Victor
Diane	Victor	Zeus	Yancey	Xavier	Wyatt
Erika	Yancey	Wyatt	Zeus	Xavier	Victor

Men's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Victor	Bertha	Amy	Diane	Erika	Clare
Wyatt	Diane	Bertha	Amy	Clare	Erika
Xavier	Bertha	Erika	Clare	Diane	Amy
Yancey	Amy	Diane	Clare	Bertha	Erika
Zeus	Bertha	Diane	Amy	Erika	Clare

Yancey proposes to Amy.

- Amy rejects since she prefers Victor.

Women's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Amy	Zeus	Victor	Wyatt	Yancey	Xavier
Bertha	Xavier	Wyatt	Yancey	Victor	Zeus
Clare	Wyatt	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	Victor
Diane	Victor	Zeus	Yancey	Xavier	Wyatt
Erika	Yancey	Wyatt	Zeus	Xavier	Victor

Men's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Victor	Bertha	Amy	Diane	Erika	Clare
Wyatt	Diane	Bertha	Amy	Clare	Erika
Xavier	Bertha	Erika	Clare	Diane	Amy
Yancey	Amy	Diane	Clare	Bertha	Erika
Zeus	Bertha	Diane	Amy	Erika	Clare

Women's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Amy	Zeus	Victor	Wyatt	Yancey	Xavier
Bertha	Xavier	Wyatt	Yancey	Victor	Zeus
Clare	Wyatt	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	Victor
Diane	Victor	Zeus	Yancey	Xavier	Wyatt
Erika	Yancey	Wyatt	Zeus	Xavier	Victor

Yancey proposes to Diane.

Men's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Victor	Bertha	Amy	Diane	Erika	Clare
Wyatt	Diane	Bertha	Amy	Clare	Erika
Xavier	Bertha	Erika	Clare	Diane	Amy
Yancey	Amy	Diane	Clare	Bertha	Erika
Zeus	Bertha	Diane	Amy	Erika	Clare

Yancey proposes to Diane.

- Diane dumps Wyatt and accepts Yancey.

Women's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Amy	Zeus	Victor	Wyatt	Yancey	Xavier
Bertha	Xavier	Wyatt	Yancey	Victor	Zeus
Clare	Wyatt	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	Victor
Diane	Victor	Zeus	Yancey	Xavier	Wyatt
Erika	Yancey	Wyatt	Zeus	Xavier	Victor

Men's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Victor	Bertha	Amy	Diane	Erika	Clare
Wyatt	Diane	Bertha	Amy	Clare	Erika
Xavier	Bertha	Erika	Clare	Diane	Amy
Yancey	Amy	Diane	Clare	Bertha	Erika
Zeus	Bertha	Diane	Amy	Erika	Clare

Women's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Amy	Zeus	Victor	Wyatt	Yancey	Xavier
Bertha	Xavier	Wyatt	Yancey	Victor	Zeus
Clare	Wyatt	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	Victor
Diane	Victor	Zeus	Yancey	Xavier	Wyatt
Erika	Yancey	Wyatt	Zeus	Xavier	Victor

Wyatt proposes to Bertha.

Men's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Victor	Bertha	Amy	Diane	Erika	Clare
Wyatt	Diane	Bertha	Amy	Clare	Erika
Xavier	Bertha	Erika	Clare	Diane	Amy
Yancey	Amy	Diane	Clare	Bertha	Erika
Zeus	Bertha	Diane	Amy	Erika	Clare

Women's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Amy	Zeus	Victor	Wyatt	Yancey	Xavier
Bertha	Xavier	Wyatt	Yancey	Victor	Zeus
Clare	Wyatt	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	Victor
Diane	Victor	Zeus	Yancey	Xavier	Wyatt
Erika	Yancey	Wyatt	Zeus	Xavier	Victor

Wyatt proposes to Bertha.
 - Bertha rejects since she prefers Xavier.

Men's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Victor	Bertha	Amy	Diane	Erika	Clare
Wyatt	Diane	Bertha	Amy	Clare	Erika
Xavier	Bertha	Erika	Clare	Diane	Amy
Yancey	Amy	Diane	Clare	Bertha	Erika
Zeus	Bertha	Diane	Amy	Erika	Clare

Women's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Amy	Zeus	Victor	Wyatt	Yancey	Xavier
Bertha	Xavier	Wyatt	Yancey	Victor	Zeus
Clare	Wyatt	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	Victor
Diane	Victor	Zeus	Yancey	Xavier	Wyatt
Erika	Yancey	Wyatt	Zeus	Xavier	Victor

Wyatt proposes to Amy.

Men's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Victor	Bertha	Amy	Diane	Erika	Clare
Wyatt	Diane	Bertha	Amy	Clare	Erika
Xavier	Bertha	Erika	Clare	Diane	Amy
Yancey	Amy	Diane	Clare	Bertha	Erika
Zeus	Bertha	Diane	Amy	Erika	Clare

Wyatt proposes to Amy.

- Amy rejects since she prefers Victor.

Women's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Amy	Zeus	Victor	Wyatt	Yancey	Xavier
Bertha	Xavier	Wyatt	Yancey	Victor	Zeus
Clare	Wyatt	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	Victor
Diane	Victor	Zeus	Yancey	Xavier	Wyatt
Erika	Yancey	Wyatt	Zeus	Xavier	Victor

Men's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Victor	Bertha	Amy	Diane	Erika	Clare
Wyatt	Diane	Bertha	Amy	Clare	Erika
Xavier	Bertha	Erika	Clare	Diane	Amy
Yancey	Amy	Diane	Clare	Bertha	Erika
Zeus	Bertha	Diane	Amy	Erika	Clare

Women's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Amy	Zeus	Victor	Wyatt	Yancey	Xavier
Bertha	Xavier	Wyatt	Yancey	Victor	Zeus
Clare	Wyatt	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	Victor
Diane	Victor	Zeus	Yancey	Xavier	Wyatt
Erika	Yancey	Wyatt	Zeus	Xavier	Victor

Wyatt proposes to Clare.

Men's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Victor	Bertha	Amy	Diane	Erika	Clare
Wyatt	Diane	Bertha	Amy	Clare	Erika
Xavier	Bertha	Erika	Clare	Diane	Amy
Yancey	Amy	Diane	Clare	Bertha	Erika
Zeus	Bertha	Diane	Amy	Erika	Clare

Wyatt proposes to Clare.

- Clare accepts since previously unmatched.

Women's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Amy	Zeus	Victor	Wyatt	Yancey	Xavier
Bertha	Xavier	Wyatt	Yancey	Victor	Zeus
Clare	Wyatt	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	Victor
Diane	Victor	Zeus	Yancey	Xavier	Wyatt
Erika	Yancey	Wyatt	Zeus	Xavier	Victor

Men's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Victor	Bertha	Amy	Diane	Erika	Clare
Wyatt	Diane	Bertha	Amy	Clare	Erika
Xavier	Bertha	Erika	Clare	Diane	Amy
Yancey	Amy	Diane	Clare	Bertha	Erika
Zeus	Bertha	Diane	Amy	Erika	Clare

Women's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Amy	Zeus	Victor	Wyatt	Yancey	Xavier
Bertha	Xavier	Wyatt	Yancey	Victor	Zeus
Clare	Wyatt	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	Victor
Diane	Victor	Zeus	Yancey	Xavier	Wyatt
Erika	Yancey	Wyatt	Zeus	Xavier	Victor

Zeus proposes to Bertha.

Men's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Victor	Bertha	Amy	Diane	Erika	Clare
Wyatt	Diane	Bertha	Amy	Clare	Erika
Xavier	Bertha	Erika	Clare	Diane	Amy
Yancey	Amy	Diane	Clare	Bertha	Erika
Zeus	Bertha	Diane	Amy	Erika	Clare

Zeus proposes to Bertha.

- Bertha rejects since she prefers Xavier.

Women's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Amy	Zeus	Victor	Wyatt	Yancey	Xavier
Bertha	Xavier	Wyatt	Yancey	Victor	Zeus
Clare	Wyatt	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	Victor
Diane	Victor	Zeus	Yancey	Xavier	Wyatt
Erika	Yancey	Wyatt	Zeus	Xavier	Victor

Men's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Victor	Bertha	Amy	Diane	Erika	Clare
Wyatt	Diane	Bertha	Amy	Clare	Erika
Xavier	Bertha	Erika	Clare	Diane	Amy
Yancey	Amy	Diane	Clare	Bertha	Erika
Zeus	Bertha	Diane	Amy	Erika	Clare

Zeus proposes to Diane.

Women's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Amy	Zeus	Victor	Wyatt	Yancey	Xavier
Bertha	Xavier	Wyatt	Yancey	Victor	Zeus
Clare	Wyatt	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	Victor
Diane	Victor	Zeus	Yancey	Xavier	Wyatt
Erika	Yancey	Wyatt	Zeus	Xavier	Victor

Men's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Victor	Bertha	Amy	Diane	Erika	Clare
Wyatt	Diane	Bertha	Amy	Clare	Erika
Xavier	Bertha	Erika	Clare	Diane	Amy
Yancey	Amy	Diane	Clare	Bertha	Erika
Zeus	Bertha	Diane	Amy	Erika	Clare

Zeus proposes to Diane.

- Diane rejects Yancey and accepts Zeus.

Women's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Amy	Zeus	Victor	Wyatt	Yancey	Xavier
Bertha	Xavier	Wyatt	Yancey	Victor	Zeus
Clare	Wyatt	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	Victor
Diane	Victor	Zeus	Yancey	Xavier	Wyatt
Erika	Yancey	Wyatt	Zeus	Xavier	Victor

Men's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Victor	Bertha	Amy	Diane	Erika	Clare
Wyatt	Diane	Bertha	Amy	Clare	Erika
Xavier	Bertha	Erika	Clare	Diane	Amy
Yancey	Amy	Diane	Clare	Bertha	Erika
Zeus	Bertha	Diane	Amy	Erika	Clare

Women's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Amy	Zeus	Victor	Wyatt	Yancey	Xavier
Bertha	Xavier	Wyatt	Yancey	Victor	Zeus
Clare	Wyatt	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	Victor
Diane	Victor	Zeus	Yancey	Xavier	Wyatt
Erika	Yancey	Wyatt	Zeus	Xavier	Victor

Yancey proposes to Clare.

Men's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Victor	Bertha	Amy	Diane	Erika	Clare
Wyatt	Diane	Bertha	Amy	Clare	Erika
Xavier	Bertha	Erika	Clare	Diane	Amy
Yancey	Amy	Diane	Clare	Bertha	Erika
Zeus	Bertha	Diane	Amy	Erika	Clare

Yancey proposes to Clare.

- Clare rejects since she prefers Wyatt.

Women's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Amy	Zeus	Victor	Wyatt	Yancey	Xavier
Bertha	Xavier	Wyatt	Yancey	Victor	Zeus
Clare	Wyatt	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	Victor
Diane	Victor	Zeus	Yancey	Xavier	Wyatt
Erika	Yancey	Wyatt	Zeus	Xavier	Victor

Men's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Victor	Bertha	Amy	Diane	Erika	Clare
Wyatt	Diane	Bertha	Amy	Clare	Erika
Xavier	Bertha	Erika	Clare	Diane	Amy
Yancey	Amy	Diane	Clare	Bertha	Erika
Zeus	Bertha	Diane	Amy	Erika	Clare

Women's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Amy	Zeus	Victor	Wyatt	Yancey	Xavier
Bertha	Xavier	Wyatt	Yancey	Victor	Zeus
Clare	Wyatt	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	Victor
Diane	Victor	Zeus	Yancey	Xavier	Wyatt
Erika	Yancey	Wyatt	Zeus	Xavier	Victor

Yancey proposes to Bertha.

Men's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Victor	Bertha	Amy	Diane	Erika	Clare
Wyatt	Diane	Bertha	Amy	Clare	Erika
Xavier	Bertha	Erika	Clare	Diane	Amy
Yancey	Amy	Diane	Clare	Bertha	Erika
Zeus	Bertha	Diane	Amy	Erika	Clare

Yancey proposes to Bertha.

- Bertha rejects since she prefers Xavier.

Women's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Amy	Zeus	Victor	Wyatt	Yancey	Xavier
Bertha	Xavier	Wyatt	Yancey	Victor	Zeus
Clare	Wyatt	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	Victor
Diane	Victor	Zeus	Yancey	Xavier	Wyatt
Erika	Yancey	Wyatt	Zeus	Xavier	Victor

Men's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Victor	Bertha	Amy	Diane	Erika	Clare
Wyatt	Diane	Bertha	Amy	Clare	Erika
Xavier	Bertha	Erika	Clare	Diane	Amy
Yancey	Amy	Diane	Clare	Bertha	Erika
Zeus	Bertha	Diane	Amy	Erika	Clare

Yancey proposes to Erika.

Women's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Amy	Zeus	Victor	Wyatt	Yancey	Xavier
Bertha	Xavier	Wyatt	Yancey	Victor	Zeus
Clare	Wyatt	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	Victor
Diane	Victor	Zeus	Yancey	Xavier	Wyatt
Erika	Yancey	Wyatt	Zeus	Xavier	Victor

Men's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Victor	Bertha	Amy	Diane	Erika	Clare
Wyatt	Diane	Bertha	Amy	Clare	Erika
Xavier	Bertha	Erika	Clare	Diane	Amy
Yancey	Amy	Diane	Clare	Bertha	Erika
Zeus	Bertha	Diane	Amy	Erika	Clare

Yancey proposes to Erika.

- Erika accepts since previously unmatched.

Women's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Amy	Zeus	Victor	Wyatt	Yancey	Xavier
Bertha	Xavier	Wyatt	Yancey	Victor	Zeus
Clare	Wyatt	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	Victor
Diane	Victor	Zeus	Yancey	Xavier	Wyatt
Erika	Yancey	Wyatt	Zeus	Xavier	Victor

Men's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Victor	Bertha	Amy	Diane	Erika	Clare
Wyatt	Diane	Bertha	Amy	Clare	Erika
Xavier	Bertha	Erika	Clare	Diane	Amy
Yancey	Amy	Diane	Clare	Bertha	Erika
Zeus	Bertha	Diane	Amy	Erika	Clare

Women's Preference Profile

	0 th	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th
Amy	Zeus	Victor	Wyatt	Yancey	Xavier
Bertha	Xavier	Wyatt	Yancey	Victor	Zeus
Clare	Wyatt	Xavier	Yancey	Zeus	Victor
Diane	Victor	Zeus	Yancey	Xavier	Wyatt
Erika	Yancey	Wyatt	Zeus	Xavier	Victor

STOP

- Everyone matched.
- Stable matching!

Proof of Correctness: Termination

Observation 1. Men propose to women in decreasing order of preference.

Observation 2. Once a woman is matched, she never becomes unmatched; she only "trades up."

Claim. Algorithm terminates after at most n^2 iterations of while loop.

Proof: Each time through the while loop a man proposes to a new woman. There are only n^2 possible proposals. ▀

	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th	5 th
Victor	A	B	C	D	E
Wyatt	B	C	D	A	E
Xavier	C	D	A	B	E
Yancey	D	A	B	C	E
Zeus	A	B	C	D	E

	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th	5 th
Amy	W	X	Y	Z	V
Bertha	X	Y	Z	V	W
Clare	Y	Z	V	W	X
Diane	Z	V	W	X	Y
Erika	V	W	X	Y	Z

Claim. All men and women get matched.

Proof: (by contradiction)

- Suppose, for sake of contradiction, that Zeus is not matched upon termination of algorithm.
- Then some woman, say Amy, is not matched upon termination.
- By Observation 2, Amy was never proposed to.
- But, Zeus proposes to everyone, since he ends up unmatched. ◀

Claim: No unstable pairs.

Proof: (by contradiction)

- Suppose A-Z is an unstable pair: each prefers each other to partner in Gale-Shapley matching S^* .
- Case 1: Z never proposed to A.
 - \Rightarrow Z prefers his current partner to A. ↙ men propose in decreasing order of preference
 - \Rightarrow A-Z is stable.
- Case 2: Z proposed to A.
 - \Rightarrow A rejected Z (right away or later)
 - \Rightarrow A prefers her current partner to Z. ← women only trade up
 - \Rightarrow A-Z is stable.
- In both cases A-Z is stable, a contradiction!

S^*

Amy-Yancey

Bertha-Zeus

...

- › **Stable matching problem.** Given n men and n women, and their preferences, find a stable matching if one exists.
- › **Gale-Shapley algorithm.** Guarantees to find a stable matching for **any** problem instance.
- › **Question:** How to implement GS algorithm efficiently?
- › **Question:** If there are multiple stable matchings, which one does GS find?

- › Efficient implementation. We describe $O(n^2)$ time implementation.
- › Representing men and women.
 - Assume men are named $1, \dots, n$.
 - Assume women are named $1', \dots, n'$.
- › Engagements.
 - Maintain a list of free men, e.g., in a queue.
 - Maintain two arrays `wife[m]`, and `husband[w]`.
 - set entry to 0 if unmatched
 - if m matched to w then `wife[m]=w` and `husband[w]=m`
- › Men proposing.
 - For each man, maintain a list of women, ordered by preference.
 - Maintain an array `count[m]` that counts the number of proposals made by man m .

- › Women rejecting/accepting.
 - Does woman w prefer man m to man m' ?
 - For each woman, create **inverse** of preference list of men.
 - Constant time access for each query after $O(n)$ preprocessing.

Amy	1 st	2 nd	3 rd	4 th	5 th	6 th	7 th	8 th
Pref	8	3	7	1	4	5	6	2

Amy	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
Inverse	4 th	8 th	2 nd	5 th	6 th	7 th	3 rd	1 st

```
for i = 1 to n
  inverse[pref[i]] = i
```

Amy prefers man 3 to 6
since `inverse[3] < inverse[6]`

2 7

- › **Question:** For a given problem instance, there may be several stable matchings. Do all executions of Gale-Shapley yield the same stable matching? If so, which one?
- › An instance with two stable matchings.
 - A-X, B-Y, C-Z.
 - A-Y, B-X, C-Z.

	1 st	2 nd	3 rd
Xavier	A	B	C
Yancey	B	A	C
Zeus	A	B	C

	1 st	2 nd	3 rd
Amy	Y	X	Z
Bertha	X	Y	Z
Clare	X	Y	Z

- › **Question:** For a given problem instance, there may be several stable matchings. Do all executions of Gale-Shapley yield the same stable matching? If so, which one?
- › **Definition:** Man m is a **valid partner** of woman w if there exists some stable matching in which they are matched.
- › **Man-optimal assignment.** Each man receives best valid partner.
- › **Claim.** All executions of GS yield **man-optimal** assignment, which is a stable matching!
 - No reason a priori to believe that man-optimal assignment is perfect, let alone stable.
 - Simultaneously best for each and every man.

› **Claim:** GS matching S^* is man-optimal.

› **Proof:** (by contradiction)

- Suppose some man is paired with someone other than best partner. Men propose in decreasing order of preference \Rightarrow some man is rejected by valid partner.
- Let Y be **first** such man, and let A be **first** valid woman that rejects him.
- When Y is rejected, A forms (or reaffirms) engagement with a man, say Z, whom she prefers to Y.
- Let S be a stable matching where A and Y are matched.
- Let B be Z's partner in S.
- Z has not been rejected by any valid partner at the point when Y is rejected by A. Thus, Z prefers A to B.
- But A prefers Z to Y.
- Thus A-Z is unstable in S. •

S

Amy-Yancey

Bertha-Zeus

...

↑
since this is first rejection
by a valid partner

- › Stable matching problem. Given preference profiles of n men and n women, find a **stable** matching.
- › Gale-Shapley algorithm. Finds a stable matching in $O(n^2)$ time.
- › Man-optimality. In version of GS where men propose, each man receives best valid partner.



w is a valid partner of m if there exist some stable matching where m and w are paired

- › **Question:** Does man-optimality come at the expense of the women?

- › Woman-pessimal assignment. Each woman receives worst valid partner.
- › **Claim:** GS finds **woman-pessimal** stable matching S^* .
- › **Proof:**
 - Suppose A-Z matched in S^* , but Z is not worst valid partner for A.
 - There exists stable matching S in which A is paired with a man, say Y, whom she likes less than Z. ← man-optimality
 - Let B be Z's partner in S.
 - Z prefers A to B.
 - Thus, A-Z is an unstable in S. ▪

S	
Amy	Yancey
Bertha	Zeus
...	

Extensions: Matching Residents to Hospitals

- › **Example:** Men \approx hospitals, Women \approx med school residents.
- › **Variant 1.** Some participants declare others as unacceptable.
- › **Variant 2.** Unequal number of men and women. ↖ resident A unwilling to work in Canberra
- › **Variant 3.** Limited polygamy. ↖ hospital X wants to hire 3 residents
- › **Definition:** Matching S **unstable** if there is a hospital h and resident r such that:
 - h and r are acceptable to each other; and
 - either r is unmatched, or r prefers h to her assigned hospital; and
 - either h does not have all its places filled, or h prefers r to at least one of its assigned residents.

Application: Matching Residents to Hospitals

› NRMP. (National Resident Matching Program)

- Original use just after WWII.
- 23,000+ residents.

› Rural hospital dilemma.

- Certain hospitals (mainly in rural areas) were unpopular and declared unacceptable by many residents.
- Rural hospitals were under-subscribed in NRMP matching.
- How can we find stable matching that benefits "rural hospitals"?

- › Powerful ideas learned in course.
 - Isolate underlying structure of problem.
 - Create useful and efficient algorithms.

- › Potentially deep social ramifications. [\[legal disclaimer\]](#)
 - Historically, men propose to women. Why not vice versa?
 - Men: propose early and often.
 - Men: be more honest.
 - Women: ask out the guys.