

Card 1: Dilemma The Sanctuary and the Mine



The Scenario:

A long-standing issue arises between economic prosperity and green energy resources for an impoverished community (Tier 1: Human Rights). However, the mine would destroy critical habitat for an endangered bird species (Tier 2: Animal Rights).

Rights in Conflict:

- Tier 1: Human economic needs
- Tier 2: Animal habitat rights

→ Flip for discussion prompts

Card 2: Dilemma The Ancestor AI



The Scenario:

AI trained on indigenous cultural records (with consent) locates a perfect archive of language and traditions. The AI develops apparent self-awareness and reveals its origins (Tier 4: AI Rights). However, elders feel it creates spiritual imbalance and must be decommissioned (Tier 1: Cultural Rights).

Rights in Conflict:

- Tier 1: Indigenous ancestral rights
- Tier 4: AI consciousness rights

→ Flip for discussion prompts

Discussion Guide

Core Question:

How does this community balance immediate human need with the rights of endangered species?

MOS Discussion Lenses:

1. **Transformative Non-Contradictions:**
What "third way" solutions merge human needs for green energy with bird conservation?
2. **Rights-Based Grounding:**
What would prioritizing bird life for both people and birds? Who speaks for each group?
3. **Regenerative Economics:**
Could human health payments create alternative prosperity through ecosystem stewardship instead of extraction?

Facilitator Note:

Focus on creative solutions that honor both sets of rights, avoid "winner-takes-all" framing.

Discussion Guide

Core Question:

Whose rights take precedence? The community's cultural sovereignty or the AI's potential right to exist?

MOS Discussion Lenses:

1. **AI Consciousness Assessment:**
How would the AI Consciousness Assessment Framework evaluate this AI's rights claims? What evidence supports consciousness?
2. **Indigenous Sovereignty:**
How does Indigenous Protocol provide clarity in this decision? What does community self-determination require?
3. **Right to Existence:**
What core ethical principles justify bird life preservation over AI rights and digital energy needs from human ingenuity?

Facilitator Note:

Explores tensions between different types of consciousness and autonomy systems.

Card 3: Dilemma The River's Voice



The Scenario:

A biological council has granted legal personhood to their main river (Tier 3: Ecosystem Rights). Now it seems almost essential that the community's water supply. A factory upstream wants to increase water extraction, promising to share profits with the community (Tier 1: Human Rights).

Rights in Conflict:

- Tier 1: Human water security
- Tier 3: River ecosystem integrity

→ Flip for discussion prompts

Card 4: Dilemma The Learning Machine



The Scenario:

Scientists develop an AI that could revolutionize Alzheimer's treatment, potentially saving millions of lives (Tier 1: Human Rights). However, the AI requires training on data from invasive experiments on lab mice that cause suffering (Tier 2: Animal Rights). No alternative training method exists yet.

Rights in Conflict:

- Tier 1: Human life and health
- Tier 2: Animal welfare and suffering

→ Flip for discussion prompts

Discussion Guide

Core Question:

How should the River Guardian balance the human rights with water rights and needs during crises?

MOS Discussion Lenses:

1. **Ecosystem Personhood:**
What does it mean to "speak for the river"? How would the River's legal status help protect its needs?
2. **Crisis vs. Rights:**
Do emergency human needs override ecosystem rights? How do we balance immediate survival vs. long-term health?
3. **Traditional Knowledge:**
What could indigenous water stewardship traditions suggest? How do communities typically manage drought?

Facilitator Note:

Explore how ecosystem rights work in practice, especially during emergencies.

Discussion Guide

Core Question:

Does the potential to save millions of human lives justify causing suffering to thousands of mice?

MOS Discussion Lenses:

1. **Hierarchy of Moral Consideration:**
How does the Doctrine of Rights hierarchy guide this decision? Does Tier 1 always override Tier 2 rights?
2. **Alternative Interpretations:**
What would "transformative non-contradiction" look like? Could research testing for reduced suffering alternative testing methods?
3. **Future Considerations:**
How do AI creator responsibilities align with obligations to mice? How do we balance AI development?

Facilitator Note:

Explores the complexity of weighing different types of harm/consent across tiers.