

JOURNAL OF
ADOLESCENT
HEALTH

www.jahonline.org

Original article

Job Insecurity and Symptoms of Anxiety and Depression Among U.S. Young Adults During COVID-19



Kyle T. Ganson, Ph.D., M.S.W. ^{a,*}, Alexander C. Tsai, M.D. ^{b,c}, Sheri D. Weiser, M.D., M.P.H. ^d, Samuel E. Benabou ^e, and Jason M. Nagata, M.D., M.Sc. ^e

- ^a Factor-Inwentash Faculty of Social Work, University of Toronto, Toronto, Ontario, Canada
- ^b Center for Global Health and Mongan Institute, Massachusetts General Hospital, Boston, Massachusetts
- ^c Harvard Medical School, Boston, Massachusetts
- ^d Division of HIV, Infectious Diseases and Global Medicine, School of Medicine, University of California, San Francisco, San Francisco, California
- e Division of Adolescent and Young Adult Medicine, Department of Pediatrics, University of California, San Francisco, San Francisco, California

Article history: Received July 30, 2020; Accepted October 5, 2020

Keywords: COVID-19; Anxiety; Depression; Job insecurity; Unemployment; Young adults

ABSTRACT

Purpose: This study aimed to estimate the associations between job insecurity and symptoms of anxiety and depression among U.S. young adults amidst the COVID-19 pandemic.

Methods: We analyzed data on young adults aged 18-26 years from June 15 to June 30, 2020, from the weekly, cross-sectional Household Pulse Survey (n=4,852) conducted by the U.S. Census Bureau. Two job insecurity measures and four anxiety and depression measures were analyzed using multivariable Poisson regression models adjusting for age, sex, race/ethnicity, education, and marital status.

Results: Fifty-nine percent of participants experienced direct or household employment loss since the start of the COVID-19 pandemic, and 38% were expected to experience direct or household employment loss in the coming 4 weeks. Recent direct or household employment loss and expected direct or household employment loss, among participants who did not experience recent employment loss, were associated with a greater risk of poor mental health on all four measures. **Conclusions:** U.S. young adults experience a significant mental health burden as a result of job insecurity amidst the COVID-19 pandemic.

© 2020 Society for Adolescent Health and Medicine. All rights reserved.

IMPLICATIONS AND CONTRIBUTION

Job insecurity as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic results in symptoms of anxiety and depression for U.S. young adults. Public health professionals, clinicians, and policymakers all have a unique role in addressing these problems as the pandemic continues.

Young adulthood, ranging from 18 to 26 years, is often marked by important developmental transitions, including entering the workforce [1]. Although young adults are less susceptible to the serious adverse health outcomes associated with COVID-19 [2], young people have not been immune to the

Conflicts of interest: The authors report no conflicts of interest.

Financial Disclosure: A.C.T. reports salary support from the Sullivan Family Foundation.

E-mail address: kyle.ganson@utoronto.ca (K.T. Ganson).

economic and employment downturns [3]. Recent reports have shown that 25% of young people aged 16–24 years in the U.S. were unemployed in May 2020 [3] during the height of the pandemic lockdowns and social distancing. There are several reasons why young people experienced greater rates of unemployment compared with older adults. For one, young adults often work in industries most adversely affected by lockdowns and are not amenable to remote, work-from-home arrangements [3]. These economic and employment hardships may exacerbate the mental health of young people who may already be experiencing symptoms of anxiety, depression [4–6], and post-traumatic stress disorder [6] related to the pandemic. The

^{*} Address correspondence to: Kyle T. Ganson, Ph.D., M.S.W., Factor-Inwentash Faculty of Social Work, University of Toronto, 246 Bloor Street W, Toronto, ON M5S 1V4.

combination of living through the uncertainty of a global pandemic and the subsequent economic and employment hardships may be particularly burdensome on the mental health of young adults. This study aimed to estimate the association between direct or household job insecurity and symptoms of anxiety and depression among young adults in the U.S.

Methods

We analyzed data from June 15 to June 30, 2020, from the weekly, cross-sectional Household Pulse Survey (HPS; n=4,852), conducted by the U.S. Census Bureau in collaboration with five other federal agencies to produce data on the social and economic impacts of COVID-19 among adults in the U.S. The HPS questionnaire was reviewed by independent experts at the Center for Behavioral Science Methods, as well as the Demographic Directorate and representatives from the five partner federal agencies. HPS used the Census Bureau's Master Address File as the sampling frame and the online platform Qualtrics as the primary data collection method. The Census Bureau website [7] provides more information and access to publicly available data.

Measures

Dependent variables

Symptoms of anxiety and worry were assessed using two items adapted from the Generalized Anxiety Disorder 7-item scale [8]. Symptoms of loss of interest and depression were assessed using two items adapted from the Patient Health Questionnaire-9 [9]. Response options for all dependent variables were dichotomized to "any days" and "not at all."

Independent variables

Job insecurity was assessed using two measures. Recent employment loss was measured using the question, "Have you, or has anyone in your household, experienced a loss of employment income since March 13, 2020?" Expected employment loss was measured using the question, "Do you expect that you or anyone in your household will experience a loss of employment income in the next 4 weeks because of the coronavirus pandemic?" Response options for both measures were "yes" or "no." These measures align with models of job insecurity previously proposed [10].

Statistical analysis

We fitted modified multivariable Poisson regression models to estimate the associations between direct or household job insecurity and anxiety and depression symptoms (eight regression models total). The use of robust estimates of variance permits straightforward interpretation of the exponentiated regression coefficients as risk ratios (RRs) [11]. We adjusted for potential confounders, including age, sex, race/ethnicity, education, and marital status. Nonresponse sample weighing was applied. The analyses estimating the association between expected employment loss and anxiety and depression symptoms were restricted to the subset of participants whose households did not experience recent employment loss. We also conducted a sensitivity analysis by removing this sample

restriction and fitting these regression models to the entire sample. E-values corresponding to our estimates were calculated [12]. Analyses were conducted using Stata 15.1. (StataCorp LLC, College Station, TX) [13].

Results

Fifty-nine percent of participants experienced direct or household employment loss since the start of the COVID-19 pandemic, and 38% were expected to experience direct or household employment loss in the coming 4 weeks (Table 1). The indicators of poor mental health were two- to six-fold higher among participants who experienced or anticipated employment loss (Supplementary Table 1). In multivariable regression models (Table 2), experiencing recent employment loss was associated with a higher risk of experiencing symptoms of anxiety (adjusted RR [ARR] = 1.22; 95% confidence interval [CI], 1.12–1.32), worry (ARR = 1.31; 95% CI, 1.18–1.44), loss of interest (ARR = 1.23; 95% CI, 1.12–1.36), and depression (ARR = 1.25; 95% CI, 1.13–1.37). The e-values corresponding to these estimates

Table 1 Weighted sample characteristics of U.S. young adults aged 18-26 years from the U.S. Census Household Pulse Survey, June 15-30, 2020 (n=4,852)

.s. Cellsus Household Palse survey, Julie 13–30, 2020 ($II = 4,832$)							
	%						
Age, years (mean \pm SE)	22.5 ± 0.7						
Sex							
Female	46.8						
Male	53.2						
Race/ethnicity							
Hispanic or Latino (may be of any race)	25.0						
White alone, not Hispanic	54.3						
Black alone, not Hispanic	10.2						
Asian alone, not Hispanic	5.8						
Two or more races + other races, not Hispanic	4.6						
Education							
High school graduate or equivalent or less	41.3						
Some college or more	58.7						
Marital status							
Married	13.3						
Not married	86.7						
Job insecurity							
Direct or household employment loss, since March 13, 2020							
No	41.3						
Yes	58.7						
Expected direct or household employment loss, next 4 weeks							
No	61.8						
Yes	38.2						
Mental health symptoms							
Nervous, anxious, or on edge, past 7 days ^a							
Not at all	24.7						
Any days	75.3						
Not being able to stop or control worrying, past 7 days ^b							
Not at all	32.2						
Any days	67.8						
Little interest or pleasure in doing things, past 7 days ^c							
Not at all	33.2						
Any days	66.8						
Feeling down, depressed, or hopeless, past 7 days ^d	20.0						
Not at all	33.0						
Any days	64.0						

^a "Over the last 7 days, how often have you been bothered by the following problems ... Feeling nervous, anxious, or on edge?"

b "Over the last 7 days, how often have you been bothered by the following problems ... Not being able to stop or control worrying?"

^c "Over the last 7 days, how often have you been bothered by ... Having little interest or pleasure in doing things?"

 $^{^{}m d}$ "Over the last 7 days, how often have you been bothered by \dots Feeling down, depressed, or hopeless?"

Table 2Estimated association between job insecurity and symptoms of poor mental health

	Anxiety ^a	p	Worry ^a	p	Loss of interest ^a	p	Depression ^a	p
	ARR (95% CI)		ARR (95% CI)		ARR (95% CI)		ARR (95% CI)	
Direct or household employment loss, since March 13, 2020	1.22 (1.12–1.32)	<.001	1.31 (1.18–1.44)	<.001	1.23 (1.12-1.36)	<.001	1.25 (1.13–1.37)	<.001
Expected direct or household employment loss, next 4 weeks ^b	1.56 (1.36–1.79)	<.001	1.50 (1.23-1.84)	<.001	1.34 (1.07-1.69)	.011	1.63 (1.38-1.93)	<.001

ARR = adjusted risk ratio.

ranged from 1.74 to 1.99. Among those who had not experienced recent employment loss, expected employment loss was similarly associated with a higher risk of anxiety (ARR = 1.56; 95% CI, 1.36–1.79), worry (ARR = 1.50; 95% CI, 1.23–1.84), loss of interest (ARR = 1.34; 95% CI, 1.07–1.69), and depression (ARR = 1.63; 95% CI, 1.38–1.93). The e-values corresponding to these estimates ranged from 2.01 to 2.64. When these regression models were fitted to the entire sample, the estimated associations between expected employment loss and poor mental health were slightly attenuated in magnitude but remained statistically significant (Supplementary Table 2).

Discussion

The results from this study show a significant mental health burden stemming from job insecurity among U.S. young adults amidst the COVID-19 pandemic. This aligns with prior research showing the adverse mental health impacts of job insecurity in non-COVID-19 times [14-17]. Overall, approximately half of young adults either have already experienced recent employment loss or expect employment loss in the near future, further highlighting the pervasiveness of unemployment among young people either directly [3] or among those in their household [18]. In addition, more than 65% of young adults experienced symptoms of poor mental health, consistent with prior research [4-6]. The results from multivariable analyses showed statistically significant associations between recent employment loss and expected employment loss (among participants who did not experience recent employment loss) and symptoms of poor mental health among young adults in the U.S.

Although the results of this study are important, there are several limitations to consider. First, the HPS only included a subset of adapted questions from the Generalized Anxiety Disorder 7-item and Patient Health Questionnaire-9, which limited our ability to effectively assess the range of anxiety and depression symptoms and diagnoses that are potentially related to job insecurity during the COVID-19 pandemic. Second, HPS did not ask participants about pre-existing mental health symptoms and diagnoses. Thus, we were unable to control for this potential confounder in our analyses. However, prior studies of job insecurity and current mental health status that have adjusted for prior mental health status or lifetime mental health diagnosis have generally found the estimated association between job insecurity and current mental health status to be robust to inclusion of such variables [19]. The e-values associated with our estimates ranged from 1.74 to 2.64, suggesting that an unobserved confounder (e.g., lifetime mental health diagnosis) would need to have an association with both job insecurity and current mental health status greater than 1.74-2.64 on the risk ratio

scale to completely explain away the observed estimates. Given the magnitude of previously published estimates, we believe this to be unlikely [20,21]. Finally, given the cross-sectional design of HPS, we cannot infer causality from the associations presented.

Despite these limitations, the results of this study are cause for concern and have important implications. Public health professionals should conduct surveillance of mental symptoms that occur amidst the pandemic to inform the implementation of public health or social policy efforts to improve population wellbeing. Clinicians should screen for job insecurity among young adults and provide appropriate referrals to resources that may provide additional support, such as unemployment benefits. Policymakers should consider the long-term "scarring" that may result from employment losses and symptoms of poor mental health experienced by young adults exposed to recessions early in their employment trajectories [22–25]. It is important to support young people through robust unemployment benefit programs, as well as developing policies that expand health insurance and mental health treatment access.

Acknowledgments

Prior Presentations: The results from this study have not been presented previously.

Supplementary Data

Supplementary data related to this article can be found at https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jadohealth.2020.10.008.

References

- [1] Sawyer SM, Azzopardi PS, Wickremarathne D, Patton GC. The age of adolescence. Lancet Child Adolesc Health 2018;2:223–8.
- [2] Stokes EK, Zambrano LD, Anderson KN, et al. Coronavirus disease 2019 case surveillance - United States, January 22-may 30, 2020. MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep 2020:69:759–65.
- [3] Inanc H. Breaking down the numbers: What does COVID-19 mean for youth unemployment?. Mathematica. 2020. Available at: https://www. mathematica.org/our-publications-and-findings/publications/breaking-do wn-the-numbers-what-does-covid-19-mean-for-youth-unemployment. Accessed July 22, 2020.
- [4] Oosterhoff B, Palmer CA, Wilson J, Shook N. Adolescents' motivations to engage in social distancing during the COVID-19 pandemic: Associations with mental and social health. J Adolesc Health 2020;67:179–85.
- [5] Chen F, Zheng D, Liu J, et al. Depression and anxiety among adolescents during COVID-19: A cross-sectional study. Brain Behav Immun 2020;88: 36–8.
- [6] Liu CH, Zhang E, Tin G, et al. Factors associated with depression, anxiety, and PTSD symptomatology during the COVID- 19 pandemic: Clinical implications for U.S. young adult mental health. Psychiatry Res 2020;290: 113172.

^a Each cell displays estimates from a single multivariable Poisson regression model with covariate adjustment for age, sex, race/ethnicity, education, and marital status.

b These analyses were conducted among the subset of participants who had not experienced employment loss since March 13, 2020 (n = 1,867).

- [7] United States Census Bureau. Measuring household experiences during the coronavirus (COVID-19) pandemic. Available at: https://www.census.gov/ householdpulsedata. Published 2020. Accessed July 1, 2020.
- [8] Spitzer RL, Kroenke K, Williams JBW, Löwe B. A brief measure for assessing generalized anxiety disorder: The GAD-7. Arch Intern Med 2006;166:1092-7.
- [9] Kroenke K, Spitzer RL, Williams JBW. The PHQ-9: Validity of a brief depression severity measure. J Gen Intern Med 2001;16:606–13.
- [10] Greenhalgh L, Rosenblatt Z. Evolution of research on job insecurity. Int Stud Manag Organ 2010;40:6–19.
- [11] Zou G. A modified Poisson regression approach to prospective studies with binary data. Am J Epidemiol 2004;159:702–6.
- [12] Van Der Weele TJ, Ding P. Sensitivity analysis in observational research: Introducing the E-Value. Ann Intern Med 2017;167:268–74.
- [13] StataCorp LLC. Stata 15. 2020. Availabe at: https://www.stata.com. Accessed July 1, 2020.
- [14] Dooley D. Unemployment, underemployment, and mental health: Conceptualizing employment status as a continuum. Am J Community Psychol 2003:32:9–20.
- [15] McGee RE, Thompson NJ. Unemployment and depression among emerging adults in 12 states, behavioral risk factor surveillance system, 2010. Prev Chronic Dis 2015;12:1–11.
- [16] Olesen SC, Butterworth P, Leach LS, et al. Mental health affects future employment as job loss affects mental health: Findings from a longitudinal population study. BMC Psychiatry 2013;13:144.
- [17] Bartelink VHM, Zay Ya K, Guldbrandsson K, Bremberg S. Unemployment among young people and mental health: A systematic review. Scand J Public Health 2020;48:544–58.

- [18] Parker K, Horowitz JM, Brown A. About half of lower income Americans report household job or wage loss due to COVID-19. Pew Res Cent Soc Demogr Trends. 2020;(April). Available at: https://www.pewsocialtrends. org/2020/04/21/about-half-of-lower-income-americans-report-household -job-or-wage-loss-due-to-covid-19/. Accessed July 22, 2020.
- [19] Burgard SA, Brand JE, House JS. Perceived job insecurity and worker health in the United States. Soc Sci Med 2009;69:777–85.
- [20] ten Have M, van Dorsselaer S, de Graaf R. The association between type and number of adverse working conditions and mental health during a time of economic crisis (2010–2012). Soc Psychiatry Psychiatr Epidemiol 2015;50: 899–907.
- [21] Virtanen M, Koskinen S, Kivimäki M, et al. Contribution of non-work and work-related risk factors to the association between income and mental disorders in a working population: The Health 2000 Study. Occup Environ Med 2008;65:171—8.
- [22] Cutler D, Huan W, Lleras-muney A. When does education matter? The protective effect of education for cohorts graduating in bad times. NBER Work Pap Ser 2014;127:63—73.
- [23] Schwandt H, Wachter T. Socioeconomic decline and death: Midlife impacts of graduating in a recession. IZA Discuss Pap 2020;12908: 1-67.
- [24] Schwandt H, von Wachter T. Unlucky cohorts: Estimating the long-term effects of entering the labor market in a recession in large cross-sectional data sets. IZA Discuss Pap 2018;11926:1–68.
- [25] Oreopoulos P, von Wachter T, Heisz A. The short- and long-term career effects of graduating in a recession. Am Econ J Appl Econ 2012;4:1–29.