Special Cases in Assignment Problem

- Assignment Problem with Maximization objective
- Number of Assignees ≠ Number of Assignment (Unbalanced Assignment Problem)
- Reduced Matrix does not contain single zero in any row or column
- A particular job *i* should not be performed by resource *j*

Maximization type assignment problem

Unless otherwise stated, the assignment problem is a minimization type.

- If the problem is a maximization problem (Profit, sales, effectiveness, etc.), convert the problem into a minimization problem by multiplying each c_{ij} by -1.
- Then apply the usual procedure of an assignment problem.

Example: Assign 4 sales persons to four different sales regions such that total sales is maximized.

| Sales region Sales person | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
|---------------------------|----|----|----|----|
| 1 | 10 | 22 | 12 | 14 |
| 2 | 16 | 18 | 22 | 10 |
| 3 | 24 | 20 | 12 | 18 |
| 4 | 16 | 14 | 24 | 20 |

Modified data, after multiplying the cell entries by -1.

| Sales region Sales person | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
|---------------------------|-----|-----|-----|-----|
| 1 | -10 | -22 | -12 | -14 |
| 2 | -16 | -18 | -22 | -10 |
| 3 | -24 | -20 | -12 | -18 |
| 4 | -16 | -14 | -24 | -20 |

Row Reduction

| Sales region Sales | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
|--------------------|-----|-----|-----|-----|
| person | | | | |
| 1 | -10 | -22 | -12 | -14 |
| 2 | -16 | -18 | -22 | -10 |
| 3 | -24 | -20 | -12 | -18 |
| 4 | -16 | -14 | -24 | -20 |

Row Reduction

| Sales region Sales person | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
|---------------------------|----|----|----|----|
| 1 | 12 | 0 | 10 | 8 |
| 2 | 6 | 4 | 0 | 12 |
| 3 | 0 | 4 | 12 | 6 |
| 4 | 8 | 10 | 0 | 4 |

Column reduction

| Sales region Sales person | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
|---------------------------|----|----|----|---|
| 1 | 12 | 0 | 10 | 4 |
| 2 | 6 | 4 | 0 | 8 |
| 3 | 0 | 4 | 12 | 2 |
| 4 | 8 | 10 | 0 | 0 |

Start making Assignments

| Sales region Sales person | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
|---------------------------|----|----|----|---|
| 1 | 12 | 0 | 10 | 4 |
| 2 | 6 | 4 | 0 | 8 |
| 3 | 0 | 4 | 12 | 2 |
| 4 | 8 | 10 | 0 | 0 |

| Sales region Sales person | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
|---------------------------|----|----|----|---|
| 1 | 12 | 0 | 10 | 4 |
| 2 | 6 | 4 | 0 | 8 |
| 3 | 0 | 4 | 12 | 2 |
| 4 | 8 | 10 | Ø | 0 |

| Sales region Sales person | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
|---------------------------|----|----|----|---|
| 1 | 12 | 0 | 10 | 4 |
| 2 | 6 | 4 | 0 | 8 |
| 3 | 0 | 4 | 12 | 2 |
| 4 | 8 | 10 | Ø | 0 |

Solution is feasible and optimal

| Sales region Sales person | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
|---------------------------|----|----|----|---|
| 1 | 12 | 0 | 10 | 4 |
| 2 | 6 | 4 | 0 | 8 |
| 3 | 0 | 4 | 12 | 2 |
| 4 | 8 | 10 | Ø | 0 |

• Result:

| Sales person | Sales region | Sales |
|--------------|--------------|-------|
| 1 | 2 | 22 |
| 2 | 3 | 22 |
| 3 | 1 | 24 |
| 4 | 4 | 20 |

Unable to get single zero in any row or column of the reduced matrix

- ➤ If there is no single zero in any row or column of the reduced matrix, then arbitrarily select a row or column having minimum number of zeros.
- Arbitrarily, choose a zero in the selected row or column for assignment and cross the remaining zeros in that row or column.
- > Apply the usual procedure.

Multiple Optimal Solution Example:

| Employee | A | В | C | D |
|------------|---|---|---|---|
| Assignment | | | | |
| I | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| II | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 |
| III | 7 | 8 | 9 | 8 |
| IV | 3 | 5 | 8 | 4 |

Row Reduction

| Employee | A | В | C | D |
|------------|---|---|---|---|
| Assignment | | | | |
| I | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| II | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 |
| III | 0 | 1 | 2 | 1 |
| IV | 0 | 2 | 5 | 1 |

Column Reduction

| Employee | A | В | C | D |
|------------|---|---|---|---|
| Assignment | | | | |
| I | 0 | 0 | 0 | 2 |
| II | 0 | 0 | 0 | 2 |
| III | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| IV | 0 | 1 | 3 | 0 |

| Employee | A | В | C | D |
|------------|---|---|---|---|
| Assignment | | | | |
| I | × | 0 | 0 | 2 |
| II | × | 0 | 0 | 2 |
| III | × | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| IV | 0 | 1 | 3 | × |

| Employee | A | В | C | D |
|------------|---|---|---|---|
| Assignment | | | | |
| I | × | 0 | 0 | 2 |
| II | × | 0 | 0 | 2 |
| III | × | × | X | 0 |
| IV | 0 | 1 | 3 | X |

| Employee | A | В | C | D |
|------------|---|---|---|---|
| Assignment | | | | |
| I | × | 0 | × | 2 |
| II | × | × | 0 | 2 |
| III | × | × | X | 0 |
| IV | 0 | 1 | 3 | X |

| Employee | A | В | C | D |
|------------|---|---|---|---|
| Assignment | | | | |
| I | × | 0 | × | 2 |
| II | × | × | 0 | 2 |
| Ш | × | × | × | 0 |
| IV | 0 | 1 | 3 | × |

$$I \rightarrow B$$
, $II \rightarrow C$, $III \rightarrow D$, $IV \rightarrow A$

Other optimal assignments are also possible each with cost 20.

$$I \rightarrow A$$
, $II \rightarrow B$, $III \rightarrow C$, $IV \rightarrow D$

$$I \rightarrow C$$
, $II \rightarrow B$, $III \rightarrow A$, $IV \rightarrow D$

$$I \rightarrow C$$
, $II \rightarrow B$, $III \rightarrow D$, $IV \rightarrow A$

$$I \rightarrow B$$
, $II \rightarrow C$, $III \rightarrow A$, $IV \rightarrow D$

Number of Assignees ≠ Number of Assignment (Unbalanced Assignment Problem)

- The assignment problem usually has a square matrix with *n* jobs to be assigned to *n* resources.
- Sometimes we may have fewer resources (rows) or fewer jobs (columns).
- In these cases, we make the matrix squire by creating additional dummy rows or dummy columns depending whether we have fewer rows or columns.
- For example,
 - If the problem has four rows and six columns, we convert it to a 6x6 problem by adding two dummy rows.
 - If it is a 7x5 problem, we create two additional dummy columns.
- The dummy rows and columns have zero cost.

Example

| Job | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
|--------|---|---|---|---|
| Person | | | | |
| A | 7 | 5 | 8 | 4 |
| В | 5 | 6 | 7 | 4 |
| C | 8 | 7 | 9 | 8 |

Introduce a dummy person

| Job | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
|--------------|---|---|---|---|
| Person | | | | |
| A | 7 | 5 | 8 | 4 |
| В | 5 | 6 | 7 | 4 |
| C | 8 | 7 | 9 | 8 |
| D (Dummy) | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |

Row reduction

| Job | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
|--------------|---|---|---|---|
| Person | | | | |
| A | 3 | 1 | 4 | 0 |
| В | 1 | 2 | 3 | 0 |
| C | 1 | 0 | 2 | 1 |
| D (Dummy) | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |

| Job | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
|--------------|---|---|---|---|
| Person | | | | |
| A | 3 | 1 | 4 | 0 |
| В | 1 | 2 | 3 | × |
| C | 1 | 0 | 2 | 1 |
| D (Dummy) | 0 | 0 | 0 | × |

| Job | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
|--------------|---|---|---|---|
| Person | | | | |
| A | 3 | 1 | 4 | 0 |
| В | 1 | 2 | 3 | × |
| C | 1 | 0 | 2 | 1 |
| D (Dummy) | 0 | × | 0 | × |

| Job | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
|---------|---|---|-----------|---|
| Person | | | | |
| A | 3 | 1 | 4 | 0 |
| В | 1 | 2 | 3 | × |
| C | 1 | 0 | 2 | 1 |
| D | 0 | × | × | × |
| (Dummy) | U | X | XX | |

| Job | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
|---------|---|---|---|----------|
| Person | | | | |
| A | 3 | 1 | 4 | 0 |
| В | 1 | 2 | 3 | × |
| C | 1 | 0 | 2 | 1 |
| D | | × | × | × |
| (Dummy) | | X | | X |

| Job | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
|---------|---|-----------|-----------|---|
| Person | | | | |
| A | 3 | 1 | 4 | 0 |
| В | 1 | 2 | 3 | × |
| C | 1 | 0 | 2 | 1 |
| D | | × | × | × |
| (Dummy) | U | XX | XX | |

V



| \cup |
|--------|
| X |
| 1 |
| × |
| |

√

| Job | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | |
|--------------|----|----------|-----------|----------|---|
| Person | | | | | |
| A | 3 | 1 | 4 | 0 | \ |
| В | 1 | 2 | 3 | × | √ |
| C | 11 | 0 | 2 | 11 | |
| D | Ω | X | XX | X | |
| D (Dummy) | | X | N N | 200 | |
| | | | | • | |
| | | | | V | |

| Job | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
|--------------|---|---|---|---|
| Person | | | | |
| A | 2 | 0 | 3 | 0 |
| В | 0 | 1 | 2 | 0 |
| C | 1 | 0 | 2 | 2 |
| D (Dummy) | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 |

| Job | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
|--------------|---|---|---|---|
| Person | | | | |
| A | 2 | × | 3 | 0 |
| В | 0 | 1 | 2 | 0 |
| C | 1 | 0 | 2 | 2 |
| D (Dummy) | 0 | × | 0 | 1 |

| Job | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
|--------------|---|---|---|---|
| Person | | | | |
| A | 2 | × | 3 | 0 |
| В | 0 | 1 | 2 | × |
| C | 1 | 0 | 2 | 2 |
| D (Dummy) | 0 | × | 0 | 1 |

| Job | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
|--------------|---|---|---|---|
| Person | | | | |
| A | 2 | × | 3 | 0 |
| В | 0 | 1 | 2 | × |
| C | 1 | 0 | 2 | 2 |
| D (Dummy) | × | × | 0 | 1 |

| Job | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |
|---------|-----------|----------------|---|---|
| Person | | | | |
| A | 2 | × | 3 | 0 |
| В | 0 | 1 | 2 | × |
| C | 1 | 0 | 2 | 2 |
| D | × | × | | 1 |
| (Dummy) | XX |)) () | | 1 |

Thus the optimum allocation is:

A \rightarrow 4, B \rightarrow 1 C \rightarrow 2 D \rightarrow 3 (Job 3 is not done by any real person) Optimal cost = 4+5+7 = 16

A particular Assignment *i* should not be performed by resource *j*

- In this case, put $c_{ij} = M$ (where M is a large positive number tends to infinity) in the minimization problem and proceed.
- Example

| Salesman Territory | A | В | С | D |
|-----------------------|----|----|----|----|
| 1 | 20 | - | 32 | 27 |
| 2 | 15 | 20 | 17 | 18 |
| 3 | 16 | 18 | - | 20 |
| 4 | _ | 20 | 18 | 24 |

| Salesman | A | В | C | D |
|-----------|----|----|----|----|
| Territory | | | | |
| 1 | 20 | M | 32 | 27 |
| 2 | 15 | 20 | 17 | 18 |
| 3 | 16 | 18 | M | 20 |
| 4 | M | 20 | 18 | 24 |

Row Reduction

| Salesman | A | В | C | D |
|-----------|---|---|----|---|
| Territory | | | | |
| 1 | 0 | M | 12 | 7 |
| 2 | 0 | 5 | 2 | 3 |
| 3 | 0 | 2 | M | 4 |
| 4 | M | 2 | 0 | 6 |

Column Reduction

| Salesman | A | В | C | D |
|-----------|---|---|----|---|
| Territory | | | | |
| 1 | 0 | M | 12 | 4 |
| 2 | 0 | 3 | 2 | 0 |
| 3 | 0 | 0 | M | 1 |
| 4 | M | 0 | 0 | 3 |

| Salesman | A | В | C | D |
|-----------|---|---|----|---|
| Territory | | | | |
| 1 | 0 | M | 12 | 4 |
| 2 | × | 3 | 2 | 0 |
| 3 | × | 0 | M | 1 |
| 4 | M | 0 | 0 | 3 |

| Salesman | A | В | C | D |
|-----------|---|---|----|---|
| Territory | | | | |
| 1 | 0 | M | 12 | 4 |
| 2 | × | 3 | 2 | 0 |
| 3 | × | 0 | M | 1 |
| 4 | M | 0 | 0 | 3 |

| Salesman | A | В | C | D |
|-----------|---|---|----|---|
| Territory | | | | |
| 1 | 0 | M | 12 | 4 |
| 2 | × | 3 | 2 | 0 |
| 3 | × | 0 | M | 1 |
| 4 | M | × | 0 | 3 |

| Salesman | A | В | C | D |
|-----------|---|---|----|---|
| Territory | | | | |
| 1 | 0 | M | 12 | 4 |
| 2 | Ж | 3 | 2 | 0 |
| 3 | × | 0 | M | 1 |
| 4 | M | × | 0 | 3 |

$$1 \rightarrow A, 2 \rightarrow D, 3 \rightarrow B, 4 \rightarrow C$$