

| Report Types | Partners | Beth-Israel Deaconess Med Center (BIDMC) | | University of Pittsburgh Med Center (UPMC) | | Total | |
|--------------|---------------------|--|--|--|--|-----------------------|--|
| | Discharge Summaries | Discharge Summaries | | Discharge Summaries (UPMCD) | | Patient Notes (UPMCP) | |
| Training | 97 | 73 | | 98 | | 81 | |
| Testing | 133 | 123 | | 102 | | 119 | |

| Concept Type | Count in Partners | | Count in BIDMC | | Count in UPMCD | | Count in UPMCP | |
|--------------|-------------------|---------|----------------|---------|----------------|---------|----------------|---------|
| | Training | Testing | Training | Testing | Training | Testing | Training | Testing |
| Tests | 1571 | 3258 | 3036 | 5967 | 1217 | 1357 | 1544 | 2317 |
| Treatments | 1768 | 3784 | 3073 | 5560 | 2308 | 2118 | 1347 | 2098 |
| Problems | 2885 | 5545 | 4187 | 7047 | 2728 | 2653 | 2167 | 3305 |

| Assertion Type | Count in Partners | | Count in BIDMC | | Count in UPMD | | Count in UPMP | |
|------------------------------|-------------------|---------|----------------|---------|---------------|---------|---------------|---------|
| | Training | Testing | Training | Testing | Training | Testing | Training | Testing |
| Absent | 658 | 1115 | 938 | 1479 | 378 | 408 | 561 | 607 |
| Associated with someone else | 31 | 45 | 57 | 86 | 3 | 13 | 0 | 1 |
| Conditional | 38 | 74 | 35 | 74 | 16 | 16 | 14 | 7 |
| Hypothetical | 165 | 156 | 217 | 289 | 242 | 257 | 26 | 15 |
| Present | 1901 | 3887 | 2712 | 4735 | 1974 | 1855 | 1452 | 2548 |
| Possible | 91 | 268 | 218 | 384 | 114 | 104 | 112 | 127 |

| Relation Type | Count in Partners | | Count in BIDMC | | Count in UPMD | | Count in UPMP | |
|---------------|-------------------|---------|----------------|---------|---------------|---------|---------------|---------|
| | Training | Testing | Training | Testing | Training | Testing | Training | Testing |
| PIP | 236 | 638 | 519 | 810 | 319 | 293 | 165 | 245 |
| TeCP | 68 | 171 | 98 | 167 | 82 | 70 | 55 | 180 |
| TeRP | 429 | 1132 | 564 | 928 | 398 | 402 | 343 | 571 |
| TrAP | 302 | 773 | 583 | 959 | 349 | 319 | 189 | 436 |
| TrCP | 67 | 179 | 117 | 163 | 80 | 61 | 32 | 41 |
| TrIP | 17 | 60 | 34 | 92 | 43 | 38 | 13 | 8 |
| TrNAP | 21 | 44 | 41 | 68 | 23 | 30 | 21 | 49 |
| TrWP | 7 | 60 | 17 | 49 | 23 | 22 | 9 | 12 |

Table 1: Number of reports and samples in each class of concepts, assertions, and relations in the 2010 i2b2/VA challenge data.

| | Jiang et al. | Kang et al. | Gurulingappa et al. | Patrick et al. | Torii & Liu | Jonnalagadda & Gonzalez | Sasaki et al. | Roberts et al. | Pai et al. |
|-------------------------|--------------|-------------|---------------------|----------------|-------------|-------------------------|---------------|----------------|------------|
| deBruijn et al. | * | * | * | * | * | * | * | * | * |
| Jiang et al. | | * | * | * | * | * | * | * | * |
| Kang et al. | | | NS | NS | * | * | * | * | * |
| Gurulingappa et al. | | | | NS | * | * | * | * | * |
| Patrick et al. | | | | | * | * | * | * | * |
| Torii & Liu | | | | | | NS | * | * | * |
| Jonnalagadda & Gonzalez | | | | | | | * | * | * |
| Sasaki et al. | | | | | | | | * | * |
| Roberts et al. | | | | | | | | | * |

Table 3: Statistical significance of exact F-measures in the concept extraction task. * indicates that the system along the row is significantly different from the system along the column at $p=0.05$. NS means “not significant difference” at $p=0.05$. Only the upper diagonal is marked.

| System | Medical Problems | | | Treatments | | | Tests | | |
|---------------------------|------------------|-------|-------|------------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|
| | R | P | F | R | P | F | R | P | F |
| deBruijn et al. | 0.847 | 0.868 | 0.857 | 0.825 | 0.862 | 0.843 | 0.834 | 0.877 | 0.855 |
| Jiang et al. | 0.834 | 0.861 | 0.847 | 0.800 | 0.859 | 0.828 | 0.801 | 0.881 | 0.839 |
| Kang et al. | 0.831 | 0.811 | 0.821 | 0.792 | 0.833 | 0.812 | 0.801 | 0.862 | 0.830 |
| Gurulingappa et al. | 0.807 | 0.839 | 0.823 | 0.771 | 0.842 | 0.805 | 0.799 | 0.853 | 0.826 |
| Patrick et al. | 0.799 | 0.835 | 0.817 | 0.775 | 0.856 | 0.814 | 0.789 | 0.862 | 0.824 |
| Torii and Liu | 0.784 | 0.860 | 0.821 | 0.758 | 0.859 | 0.806 | 0.761 | 0.863 | 0.809 |
| Jonnalagadda and Gonzalez | 0.792 | 0.824 | 0.808 | 0.776 | 0.832 | 0.803 | 0.791 | 0.844 | 0.817 |
| Sasaki et al. | 0.786 | 0.814 | 0.799 | 0.738 | 0.834 | 0.783 | 0.790 | 0.863 | 0.825 |
| Roberts et al. | 0.787 | 0.813 | 0.800 | 0.754 | 0.807 | 0.779 | 0.804 | 0.810 | 0.807 |
| Pai et al. | 0.776 | 0.805 | 0.790 | 0.738 | 0.805 | 0.770 | 0.770 | 0.836 | 0.802 |

Table 4: Exact metrics.

| System | Medical Problems | | | Treatments | | | Tests | | |
|---------------------------|------------------|-------|-------|------------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|
| | R | P | F | R | P | F | R | P | F |
| deBruijn et al. | 0.915 | 0.938 | 0.926 | 0.887 | 0.927 | 0.906 | 0.884 | 0.930 | 0.906 |
| Jiang et al. | 0.905 | 0.934 | 0.919 | 0.863 | 0.927 | 0.894 | 0.848 | 0.933 | 0.888 |
| Kang et al. | 0.909 | 0.887 | 0.898 | 0.861 | 0.906 | 0.883 | 0.854 | 0.919 | 0.886 |
| Gurulingappa et al. | 0.890 | 0.925 | 0.907 | 0.840 | 0.918 | 0.877 | 0.859 | 0.917 | 0.887 |
| Patrick et al. | 0.878 | 0.917 | 0.897 | 0.834 | 0.921 | 0.875 | 0.839 | 0.916 | 0.876 |
| Torii and Liu | 0.871 | 0.955 | 0.911 | 0.831 | 0.942 | 0.883 | 0.828 | 0.939 | 0.880 |
| Jonnalagadda and Gonzalez | 0.880 | 0.914 | 0.897 | 0.849 | 0.910 | 0.878 | 0.856 | 0.913 | 0.884 |
| Sasaki et al. | 0.866 | 0.897 | 0.881 | 0.799 | 0.903 | 0.848 | 0.838 | 0.915 | 0.875 |
| Roberts et al. | 0.877 | 0.906 | 0.891 | 0.832 | 0.890 | 0.860 | 0.872 | 0.879 | 0.876 |
| Pai et al. | 0.870 | 0.902 | 0.886 | 0.819 | 0.894 | 0.855 | 0.826 | 0.897 | 0.860 |

Table 5: Inexact metrics.

| | Clark et al. | Demner-Fushman et al. | Jiang et al. | Grouin et al. | Divita et al. | Cohen et al. | Roberts et al. | Anick et al. | Chang et al. |
|-----------------------|--------------|-----------------------|--------------|---------------|---------------|--------------|----------------|--------------|--------------|
| deBruijn et al. | NS | NS | NS | * | * | * | * | * | * |
| Clark et al. | | NS | NS | NS | NS | * | * | * | * |
| Demner-Fushman et al. | | | NS | NS | NS | * | * | * | * |
| Jiang et al. | | | | NS | NS | NS | NS | * | * |
| Grouin et al. | | | | | NS | NS | NS | * | * |
| Divita et al. | | | | | | NS | NS | * | * |
| Cohen et al. | | | | | | | NS | NS | * |
| Roberts et al. | | | | | | | | NS | * |
| Anick et al. | | | | | | | | | NS |

Table 7: Statistical significance of F-measures in the assertion classification task. * indicates that the system along the row is significantly different from the system along the column at $p=0.05$. NS means “not significant difference” at $p=0.05$. Only the upper diagonal is marked.

| | deBruijn et al. | Grouin et al. | Patrick et al. | Jonnalagadda & Gonzalez et al. | Divita et al. | Solt et al. | Demner-Fushman et al. | Anick et al. | Cohen et al. |
|-------------------------|-----------------|---------------|----------------|--------------------------------|---------------|-------------|-----------------------|--------------|--------------|
| Roberts et al. | NS | * | * | * | * | * | * | * | * |
| deBruijn et al. | | * | * | * | * | * | * | * | * |
| Grouin et al. | | | NS | NS | * | * | * | * | * |
| Patrick et al. | | | | NS | NS | * | * | * | * |
| Jonnalagadda & Gonzalez | | | | | NS | * | * | * | * |
| Divita et al. | | | | | | * | * | * | * |
| Solt et al. | | | | | | | NS | NS | * |
| Demner-Fushman et al. | | | | | | | | NS | NS |
| Anick et al. | | | | | | | | | NS |

Table 8: Statistical significance of F-measures in the relation classification task. * indicates that the system along the row is significantly different from the system along the column at $p=0.05$. NS means “not significant difference” at $p=0.05$. Only the upper diagonal is marked.

| System | Present | | | Absent | | | Possible | | | Conditional | | | Hypothetical | | | Associated with someone else | | |
|-----------------------|---------|-------|-------|--------|-------|-------|----------|-------|-------|-------------|-------|-------|--------------|-------|-------|------------------------------|-------|-------|
| | R | P | F | R | P | F | R | P | F | R | P | F | R | P | F | R | P | F |
| deBruijn et al. | 0.981 | 0.939 | 0.959 | 0.934 | 0.951 | 0.942 | 0.530 | 0.818 | 0.643 | 0.152 | 0.963 | 0.263 | 0.861 | 0.909 | 0.884 | 0.724 | 0.955 | 0.824 |
| Clark et al. | 0.980 | 0.937 | 0.958 | 0.920 | 0.955 | 0.937 | 0.532 | 0.772 | 0.630 | 0.287 | 0.803 | 0.422 | 0.859 | 0.924 | 0.890 | 0.779 | 0.983 | 0.869 |
| Demner-Fushman et al. | 0.983 | 0.932 | 0.957 | 0.923 | 0.958 | 0.940 | 0.509 | 0.815 | 0.626 | 0.257 | 0.759 | 0.384 | 0.792 | 0.937 | 0.859 | 0.766 | 0.917 | 0.835 |
| Jiang et al. | 0.980 | 0.933 | 0.956 | 0.917 | 0.959 | 0.938 | 0.529 | 0.792 | 0.634 | 0.269 | 0.780 | 0.400 | 0.798 | 0.885 | 0.839 | 0.779 | 0.942 | 0.853 |
| Grouin et al. | 0.970 | 0.942 | 0.956 | 0.947 | 0.931 | 0.939 | 0.538 | 0.738 | 0.622 | 0.240 | 0.746 | 0.363 | 0.830 | 0.928 | 0.876 | 0.779 | 0.856 | 0.816 |
| Divita et al. | 0.979 | 0.931 | 0.954 | 0.930 | 0.943 | 0.936 | 0.453 | 0.800 | 0.579 | 0.222 | 0.905 | 0.357 | 0.830 | 0.928 | 0.876 | 0.786 | 1.000 | 0.880 |
| Cohen et al. | 0.975 | 0.934 | 0.954 | 0.926 | 0.944 | 0.935 | 0.514 | 0.759 | 0.613 | 0.298 | 0.850 | 0.442 | 0.816 | 0.930 | 0.869 | 0.510 | 0.673 | 0.580 |
| Roberts et al. | 0.978 | 0.934 | 0.955 | 0.908 | 0.950 | 0.929 | 0.519 | 0.769 | 0.619 | 0.263 | 0.672 | 0.378 | 0.801 | 0.868 | 0.833 | 0.738 | 0.856 | 0.793 |
| Anick et al. | 0.964 | 0.940 | 0.952 | 0.934 | 0.935 | 0.935 | 0.515 | 0.696 | 0.592 | 0.216 | 0.487 | 0.300 | 0.824 | 0.810 | 0.817 | 0.793 | 0.913 | 0.849 |
| Chang et al. | 0.966 | 0.933 | 0.949 | 0.924 | 0.937 | 0.930 | 0.579 | 0.753 | 0.654 | 0.252 | 0.494 | 0.333 | 0.707 | 0.842 | 0.769 | 0.807 | 0.813 | 0.810 |

Table 9: Per class results on assertion classification .

| System | Medical Problem—Treatment Relations | | | Medical Problem—Test Relations | | | Medical Problem—Medical Problem Relations | | |
|---------------------------|-------------------------------------|-------|-------|--------------------------------|-------|-------|---|-------|-------|
| | R | P | F | R | P | F | R | P | F |
| Roberts et al. | 0.686 | 0.672 | 0.679 | 0.833 | 0.798 | 0.815 | 0.726 | 0.664 | 0.694 |
| deBruijn et al. | 0.583 | 0.750 | 0.656 | 0.789 | 0.843 | 0.815 | 0.712 | 0.691 | 0.701 |
| Grouin et al. | 0.646 | 0.647 | 0.647 | 0.801 | 0.792 | 0.797 | 0.645 | 0.670 | 0.657 |
| Patrick et al. | 0.599 | 0.671 | 0.633 | 0.774 | 0.813 | 0.793 | 0.627 | 0.677 | 0.651 |
| Jonnalagadda and Gonzalez | 0.679 | 0.581 | 0.626 | 0.828 | 0.765 | 0.795 | 0.730 | 0.586 | 0.650 |
| Divita et al. | 0.582 | 0.704 | 0.637 | 0.782 | 0.794 | 0.788 | 0.534 | 0.710 | 0.610 |
| Solt et al. | 0.629 | 0.621 | 0.625 | 0.779 | 0.801 | 0.790 | 0.711 | 0.469 | 0.565 |
| Demner-Fushman et al. | 0.612 | 0.642 | 0.626 | 0.677 | 0.835 | 0.748 | 0.533 | 0.662 | 0.591 |
| Anick et al. | 0.619 | 0.596 | 0.608 | 0.787 | 0.744 | 0.765 | 0.502 | 0.631 | 0.559 |
| Cohen et al. | 0.578 | 0.606 | 0.591 | 0.781 | 0.750 | 0.765 | 0.492 | 0.627 | 0.552 |

Table 10: Per relation type results on relation classification.

| System | TrIP | | | TrWP | | | TrCP | | | TrAP | | | TrNAP | | |
|-------------------------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|
| | R | P | F | R | P | F | R | P | F | R | P | F | R | P | F |
| Roberts et al. | 0.298 | 0.562 | 0.389 | 0.035 | 0.278 | 0.062 | 0.565 | 0.542 | 0.554 | 0.814 | 0.707 | 0.757 | 0.199 | 0.432 | 0.272 |
| deBruijn et al. | 0.177 | 0.833 | 0.292 | 0.000 | NaN | 0.000 | 0.327 | 0.747 | 0.455 | 0.730 | 0.748 | 0.739 | 0.126 | 0.774 | 0.216 |
| Grouin et al. | 0.414 | 0.458 | 0.435 | 0.168 | 0.774 | 0.276 | 0.435 | 0.550 | 0.486 | 0.760 | 0.676 | 0.715 | 0.251 | 0.495 | 0.333 |
| Patrick et al. | 0.157 | 0.861 | 0.265 | 0.028 | 0.800 | 0.054 | 0.480 | 0.495 | 0.487 | 0.725 | 0.699 | 0.712 | 0.131 | 0.556 | 0.212 |
| Jonnalagadda & Gonzalez | 0.207 | 0.612 | 0.309 | 0.007 | 0.200 | 0.014 | 0.457 | 0.537 | 0.494 | 0.835 | 0.589 | 0.691 | 0.147 | 0.400 | 0.215 |
| Divita et al. | 0.197 | 0.780 | 0.315 | 0.035 | 0.833 | 0.067 | 0.367 | 0.715 | 0.485 | 0.719 | 0.702 | 0.710 | 0.105 | 0.690 | 0.182 |
| Solt et al. | 0.313 | 0.591 | 0.409 | 0.056 | 0.667 | 0.103 | 0.493 | 0.389 | 0.435 | 0.743 | 0.685 | 0.713 | 0.220 | 0.316 | 0.259 |
| Demner-Fushman et al. | 0.369 | 0.635 | 0.467 | 0.126 | 0.346 | 0.185 | 0.491 | 0.536 | 0.512 | 0.712 | 0.675 | 0.693 | 0.199 | 0.376 | 0.260 |
| Anick et al. | 0.237 | 0.528 | 0.328 | 0.014 | 0.182 | 0.026 | 0.561 | 0.442 | 0.495 | 0.731 | 0.632 | 0.678 | 0.157 | 0.517 | 0.241 |
| Cohen et al. | 0.096 | 0.576 | 0.165 | 0.007 | 0.200 | 0.014 | 0.356 | 0.608 | 0.449 | 0.729 | 0.608 | 0.663 | 0.052 | 0.435 | 0.094 |

Table 11: Per class results on medical problem—treatment relations.

| System | TeRP | | | TeCP | | |
|---------------------------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|
| | R | P | F | R | P | F |
| Roberts et al. | 0.906 | 0.825 | 0.864 | 0.456 | 0.594 | 0.516 |
| deBruijn et al. | 0.880 | 0.842 | 0.861 | 0.316 | 0.857 | 0.462 |
| Grouin et al. | 0.881 | 0.813 | 0.846 | 0.391 | 0.612 | 0.477 |
| Patrick et al. | 0.840 | 0.840 | 0.840 | 0.430 | 0.614 | 0.506 |
| Jonnalagadda and Gonzalez | 0.911 | 0.784 | 0.843 | 0.400 | 0.596 | 0.479 |
| Divita et al. | 0.886 | 0.793 | 0.837 | 0.245 | 0.818 | 0.377 |
| Solt et al. | 0.826 | 0.842 | 0.834 | 0.536 | 0.577 | 0.556 |
| Demner-Fushman et al. | 0.733 | 0.872 | 0.796 | 0.393 | 0.594 | 0.473 |
| Anick et al. | 0.848 | 0.765 | 0.804 | 0.475 | 0.597 | 0.529 |
| Cohen et al. | 0.861 | 0.766 | 0.810 | 0.369 | 0.599 | 0.457 |

Table 12: Per class results on medical problem—test relations.

| System | PIP | | |
|---------------------------|-------|-------|-------|
| | R | P | F |
| Roberts et al. | 0.726 | 0.664 | 0.694 |
| deBruijn et al. | 0.712 | 0.691 | 0.701 |
| Grouin et al. | 0.645 | 0.670 | 0.657 |
| Patrick et al. | 0.627 | 0.677 | 0.651 |
| Jonnalagadda and Gonzalez | 0.730 | 0.586 | 0.650 |
| Divita et al. | 0.534 | 0.710 | 0.610 |
| Solt et al. | 0.711 | 0.469 | 0.565 |
| Demner-Fushman et al. | 0.533 | 0.662 | 0.591 |
| Anick et al. | 0.502 | 0.631 | 0.559 |
| Cohen et al. | 0.492 | 0.627 | 0.552 |

Table 13: Per class results on medical problem—medical problem relations.