

THESIS INTRODUCTION

TIM LUCAS. JANUARY 15, 2016

1. ABSTRACT

ABSTRACT. Pathogens make up a huge proportion of global diversity and their role in disease strongly affects human disease, economics and development as well as having an important ecological role. However, the factors that control the number of pathogen species are poorly understood.

The patterns of contacts between individuals — in both human and animal populations — are nonrandom and depend on the density of individuals. Population structure and density have important epidemiological consequences, but their role in the control of pathogen richness is unknown.

It is still unknown whether population structure and density controls pathogen richness in bats. Furthermore, the specific mechanisms by which structure might influence pathogen richness have not been studied.

In this thesis I have studied how population structure and density control pathogen richness using bats as a case study. I have used epidemiological simulations and comparative analyses of data from wild bat populations to show that population structure does not have a strong affect on pathogen richness. Using further simulations I have shown that the interaction between population density and population structure is an important consideration. Finally, I have created a model for estimating bat densities — previously an incredibly challenging task — using acoustic data. Together, these studies clarify the relative roles of population density and structure and facilitate further study of population density in bats as a driver of pathogen richness.

While theory previously predicted that population structure should increase pathogen richness, the expectation in the ecological literature was that population structure would decrease pathogen richness. My studies support neither of these views, instead suggesting that population structure does not have a strong affect in either direction.

2. INTRODUCTION

The diversity of pathogens is huge and largely unknown (Poulin 2014). Recent large studies have found tens (Anthony et al. 2013) or even hundreds of virus species in a single host species (Anthony et al. 2015). This suggests the number of mammalian viruses globally is of the order of hundreds of thousands of virus species (Anthony et al. 2013) while only 3,000 species of virus, across all host groups, are currently described (King et al. 2011). Recent large databases include nearly 2,000 pathogens from approximately 400 wild animal hosts (Wardeh et al. 2015). Given that there are nearly 4,000 named mammal species (Wilson & Reeder 2005), the undiscovered diversity of pathogens is likely huge.

In general we can expect competition between pathogens. Competition between pathogens can occur by different mechanisms: immunological mechanisms such as cross-immunity or shared immune response (Fenton & Perkins 2010) and ecological mechanisms such as removal of susceptible hosts by death (Rohani et al. 2003) or competition for internal host resources (Griffiths et al. 2014). Like ecological systems this competition leads us to expect competitive exclusions (Ackleh & Allen 2003, Ackleh & Salceanu 2014, Bremermann & Thieme 1989, Martcheva & Li 2013, Turner & Garnett 2002) so the diversity of parasites needs an explanation.

This diversity of pathogens presents a risk to human health. 60% of newly emerged disease are zoonotic (acquired from animals) with wild animals being the predominant

source (Jones et al. 2008, Taylor et al. 2001, Woolhouse & Gowtage-Sequeria 2006). Zoonotic diseases can be extremely virulent: viruses such as Nipah (Luby et al. 2009), Ebola (Lefebvre et al. 2014) having case fatality rates over 50%. Furthermore these pathogens can have large economic costs (e.g. SARS is estimated to have cost \$40 billion (Knobler et al. 2004)). In particular these impacts can have huge effects on developing economies. For example the 2014 ebola epidemic caused both Liberia and Guinea to fall from positive to negative per capita growth rates (World Bank 2014, World Bank 2015).

Surveillance of zoonotic diseases is crucial to mitigate these health impacts. In particular we want to categorise diseases before they spillover into humans (SARS was not identified until months into the pandemic for example (Drosten et al. 2003)) and we want to anticipate outbreaks. If we know there is an increased number of infections in host species, increased numbers of a species that is a known reservoir of a high risk zoonotic disease, or increased contacts between humans and a pathogen reservoir, we can prepare for a potential outbreak in that area.

However, funds for zoonotic surveillance are limited and so efforts must be optimised. Knowing which species are likely to have many pathogens allows us to sample and identify potentially zoonotic viruses efficiently. Suggested factors that might control pathogen richness include individual traits (body mass (Arneberg 2002, Kamiya et al. 2014, Poulin 1995) and longevity (Ezenwa et al. 2006, Nunn et al. 2003)) as well as environmental factors such as latitude (Kamiya et al. 2014, Poulin 2010). Furthermore, population level traits that affect the dynamics of disease spread have also been studied (animal density (Arneberg 2002, Kamiya et al. 2014, Nunn et al. 2003), sociality (Altizer et al. 2003, Bordes et al. 2007, Ezenwa et al. 2006, Vitone et al. 2004), population structure (Gay et al. 2014, Maganga et al. 2014, Nunes et al. 2006, Turmelle & Olival 2009) and species range size (Kamiya et al. 2014, Nunn et al. 2003)). This understanding provides a basis for predicting which species will have high pathogen richness and should be prioritised for sampling and surveillance. Furthermore, given a good mechanistic understanding of how pathogen richness is created and maintained we can start to predict how pathogen richness (and zoonotic disease risk) will respond to global change.

In recent decades bats have been implicated in a number of high profile zoonotic outbreaks including Nipah (Field et al. 2001), Ebola (Leroy et al. 2005), SARS (Li et al. 2005) and Hendra (Field et al. 2001). This has led to much research on whether bats are a particular source of zoonotic disease (Luis et al. 2013, Olival et al. 2015, Wang et al. 2011) and examinations of factors, such as flight, social living and longevity, that might predispose them to being reservoirs of zoonotic viruses (Calisher et al. 2006, Dobson 2005, O'Shea et al. 2014, Racey 2015). Given that bats are the second largest order of mammals (Wilson & Reeder 2005), we may expect them to be the source of many viruses simply through weight of numbers (Luis et al. 2013). The broad conclusions are that while bats do host more zoonotic viruses than other groups (Luis et al. 2013) they do not host more virus species in general (Olival et al. 2015). Questions remain as to why bat viruses have a tendency to have such high zoonotic potential.

Many factors of bat populations make them epidemiologically interesting. Firstly, the population density of most bat species is largely unknown. As they are small, nocturnal and difficult to identify in flight, estimating their density is incredibly difficult without disruptive and time consuming roost surveys. As this parameter is tightly linked to pathogen richness (Kamiya et al. 2014) and central to epidemiological models (Anderson & May 1979, May & Anderson 1979) these leaves large gaps in our understanding of disease processes in this group. Secondly they have highly varied and sometimes complex social structures (Kerth 2008). While some species are largely solitary or live in very small groups (e.g. *Lasiurus borealis* (Shump & Shump 1982)) some species live in colonies of millions of individuals (e.g. *Pteropus scapulatus* (Birt et al. 2008)). These groups can be very stable (Kerth et al. 2011, McCracken & Bradbury 1981).

Further complexity arises due to their propensity for seasonal migration (Cryan et al. 2014, Fleming et al. 2003, Richter & Cumming 2008) and seasonally changing social organisation including maternity roosts, hibernation roosts and swarming sites (Kerth 2008). Finally, their ability to fly means populations can be well mixed across large distances (Peel et al. 2013, Petit & Mayer 1999) but this is highly variable with some species having limited dispersal (Wilmer et al. 1994).

In this thesis I have examined the role of population structure and density on pathogen richness. I used bats as a case study throughout due to their interesting social structure and importance as zoonotic reservoirs. I combined empirical, comparative studies with simulation models. This allowed me to study specific mechanisms while linking my theoretical insights to real world tests.

First, in Chapter 2, I empirically tested the hypothesis that population structure is associated with pathogen richness in wild bat populations. I used two measurements of population structure — the number of subspecies and gene flow — and a larger dataset than previous studies. For both measurements I found that bat species with more structured populations have more known viruses. This relationship is robust to controlling for study bias and phylogenetic nonindependence. I also tested for a relationship between body mass and range size, finding strong support for larger bodied bats carrying more viruses and mixed support for range size promoting pathogen richness.

REFERENCES

- Ackleh, AS & LJ Allen (2003). “Competitive exclusion and coexistence for pathogens in an epidemic model with variable population size”. *Journal of mathematical biology* 47.2, pp. 153–168. DOI: 10.1007/s00285-003-0207-9.
- Ackleh, AS & PL Salceanu (2014). “Robust uniform persistence and competitive exclusion in a nonautonomous multi-strain SIR epidemic model with disease-induced mortality”. *Journal of mathematical biology* 1-2, pp. 453–475. DOI: 10.1007/s00285-012-0636-4.
- Altizer, S, CL Nunn, PH Thrall, JL Gittleman, J Antonovics, AA Cunningham, AP Dobson, V Ezenwa, KE Jones, et al. (2003). “Social organization and parasite risk in mammals: integrating theory and empirical studies”. *Annual Review of Ecology, Evolution, and Systematics*, pp. 517–547. DOI: 10.1146/annurev.ecolsys.34.030102.151725.
- Anderson, RM & RM May (1979). “Population biology of infectious diseases: Part I.” *Nature* 280, pp. 361–7.
- Anthony, SJ, JH Epstein, KA Murray, I Navarrete-Macias, CM Zambrana-Torrel, A Solovyov, R Ojeda-Flores, NC Arrigo, A Islam, SA Khan, P Hosseini, TL Bogich, KJ Olival, MD Sanchez-Leon, WB Karesh, T Goldstein, SP Luby, SS Morse, JAK Mazet, P Daszak, & WI Lipkin (2013). “A strategy to estimate unknown viral diversity in mammals”. *MBio* 4.5, e00598–13. DOI: 10.1128/mBio.00598-13.
- Anthony, SJ, A Islam, C Johnson, I Navarrete-Macias, E Liang, K Jain, PL Hitchens, X Che, A Solovyov, AL Hicks, R Ojeda-Flores, C Zambrana-Torrel, W Ulrich, MK Rostal, A Petrosov, J Garcia, N Haider, N Wolfe, T Goldstein, SS Morse, M Rahman, JH Epstein, JK Mazet, P Daszak, & WI Lipkin (2015). “Non-random patterns in viral diversity”. *Nature communications* 6. DOI: 10.1038/ncomms9147.
- Arneberg, P (2002). “Host population density and body mass as determinants of species richness in parasite communities: comparative analyses of directly transmitted nematodes of mammals”. *Ecography* 1, pp. 88–94. DOI: 10.1034/j.1600-0587.2002.250110.x.

- Birt, P, M McCoy, & C Palmer (2008). "Little Red Flying-fox, *Pteropus scapulatus*". In: *The mammals of Australia*. Ed. by S Van Dyck & R Strahan. 3rd ed. Sydney, Australia: Reed New Holland, pp. 446–447.
- Bordes, F, DT Blumstein, & S Morand (2007). "Rodent sociality and parasite diversity". *Biology letters* 3.6, pp. 692–694. DOI: 10.1098/rsbl.2007.0393.
- Bremermann, HJ & H Thieme (1989). "A competitive exclusion principle for pathogen virulence". *Journal of mathematical biology* 27, pp. 179–190. DOI: 10.1007/BF00276102.
- Calisher, C, J Childs, H Field, K Holmes, & T Schountz (2006). "Bats: important reservoir hosts of emerging viruses". *Clinical Microbiology Reviews* 19.3, pp. 531–545. DOI: 10.1128/CMR.00017-06.
- Cryan, PM, CA Stricker, & MB Wunder (2014). "Continental-scale, seasonal movements of a heterothermic migratory tree bat". *Ecological Applications* 24.4, pp. 602–616. DOI: 10.1890/13-0752.1.
- Dobson, AP (2005). "What links bats to emerging infectious diseases?" *Science* 310.5748, pp. 628–629. DOI: 10.1126/science.1120872.
- Drosten, C, S Günther, W Preiser, S Van Der Werf, HR Brodt, S Becker, H Rabenau, M Panning, L Kolesnikova, RA Fouchier, et al. (2003). "Identification of a novel coronavirus in patients with severe acute respiratory syndrome". *New England Journal of Medicine* 348.20, pp. 1967–1976. DOI: 10.1056/NEJMoa030747.
- Ezenwa, VO, SA Price, S Altizer, ND Vitone, & KC Cook (2006). "Host traits and parasite species richness in even and odd-toed hoofed mammals, Artiodactyla and Perissodactyla". *Oikos* 115.3, pp. 526–536. DOI: 10.1111/j.2006.0030-1299.15186.x.
- Fenton, A & SE Perkins (2010). "Applying predator-prey theory to modelling immune-mediated, within-host interspecific parasite interactions". *Parasitology* 137.06, pp. 1027–1038. DOI: 10.1017/s0031182009991788.
- Field, H, P Young, J Yob, J Mills, L Hall, & J Mackenzie (2001). "The natural history of Hendra and Nipah viruses". *Microbes and infection* 3.4, pp. 307–314. DOI: 10.1016/S1286-4579(01)01384-3.
- Fleming, TH, P Eby, T Kunz, & M Fenton (2003). "Ecology of bat migration". In: *Bat ecology*. Ed. by T Kunz & M Brock Fenton. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, pp. 156–208.
- Gay, N, KJ Olival, S Bumrungsri, B Siriaronrat, M Bourgarel, & S Morand (2014). "Parasite and viral species richness of Southeast Asian bats: Fragmentation of area distribution matters". *International Journal for Parasitology: Parasites and Wildlife* 3.2, pp. 161–170. DOI: 10.1016/j.ijppaw.2014.06.003.
- Griffiths, EC, AB Pedersen, A Fenton, & OL Petchey (2014). "Analysis of a summary network of co-infection in humans reveals that parasites interact most via shared resources". *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B: Biological Sciences* 281.1782, p. 20132286. DOI: 10.1098/rspb.2013.2286.
- Jones, KE, NG Patel, MA Levy, A Storeygard, D Balk, JL Gittleman, & P Daszak (2008). "Global trends in emerging infectious diseases". *Nature* 451.7181, pp. 990–993. DOI: 10.3201/eid0903.020336.
- Kamiya, T, K O'Dwyer, S Nakagawa, & R Poulin (2014). "What determines species richness of parasitic organisms? A meta-analysis across animal, plant and fungal hosts". *Biological Reviews* 89.1, pp. 123–134. DOI: 10.1111/brv.12046.
- Kerth, G (2008). "Causes and consequences of sociality in bats". *Bioscience* 58.8, pp. 737–746. DOI: 10.1641/B580810.
- Kerth, G, N Perony, & F Schweitzer (2011). "Bats are able to maintain long-term social relationships despite the high fission–fusion dynamics of their groups". *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B: Biological Sciences* 278.1719, pp. 2761–2767.

- King, AM, MJ Adams, & EJ Lefkowitz (2011). *Virus taxonomy: classification and nomenclature of viruses: Ninth Report of the International Committee on Taxonomy of Viruses*. Vol. 9. San Diego, CA: Elsevier. ISBN: 978-0123846846.
- Knobler, S, S Lemon, A Mack, L Sivitz, & K Oberholtzer (2004). *Learning from SARS: Preparing for the Next Disease Outbreak: Workshop Summary*. National Academies Press Washington, DC, USA: DOI: 10.1016/j.socscimed.2006.08.004.
- Lefebvre, A, C Fiet, C Belpois-Duchamp, M Tiv, K Astruc, & LA Glélé (2014). “Case fatality rates of Ebola virus diseases: a meta-analysis of World Health Organization data”. *Médecine et maladies infectieuses* 44.9, pp. 412–416. DOI: 10.1016/j.medmal.2014.08.005.
- Leroy, EM, B Kumulungui, X Pourrut, P Rouquet, A Hassanin, P Yaba, A Délicat, JT Paweska, JP Gonzalez, & R Swanepoel (2005). “Fruit bats as reservoirs of Ebola virus”. *Nature* 438.7068, pp. 575–576.
- Li, W, Z Shi, M Yu, W Ren, C Smith, JH Epstein, H Wang, G Crameri, Z Hu, H Zhang, J Zhang, J McEachern, H Field, P Daszak, BT Eaton, S Zhang, & LF Wang (2005). “Bats are natural reservoirs of SARS-like coronaviruses”. *Science* 310.5748, pp. 676–679. DOI: 10.1126/science.1118391.
- Luby, SP, MJ Hossain, ES Gurley, BN Ahmed, S Banu, SU Khan, N Homaira, PA Rota, PE Rollin, JA Comer, et al. (2009). “Recurrent zoonotic transmission of Nipah virus into humans, Bangladesh, 2001–2007”. *Emerging infectious diseases* 15.8, p. 1229. DOI: 10.3201/eid1508.081237.
- Luis, AD, DTS Hayman, TJ O’Shea, PM Cryan, AT Gilbert, JRC Pulliam, JN Mills, ME Timonin, CKR Willis, AA Cunningham, AR Fooks, CE Rupprecht, JLN Wood, & CT Webb (2013). “A comparison of bats and rodents as reservoirs of zoonotic viruses: are bats special?” *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences* 280.1756, p. 20122753. DOI: 10.1098/rspb.2012.2753.
- Maganga, GD, M Bourgarel, P Vallo, TD Dallo, C Ngoagouni, JF Drexler, C Drosten, ER Nakouné, EM Leroy, & S Morand (2014). “Bat distribution size or shape as determinant of viral richness in african bats”. *PloS one* 9.6, e100172. DOI: 10.1371/journal.pone.0100172.
- Martcheva, M & XZ Li (2013). “Competitive exclusion in an infection-age structured model with environmental transmission”. *Journal of Mathematical Analysis and Applications* 408.1, pp. 225–246. DOI: 10.1016/j.jmaa.2013.05.064.
- May, RM & RM Anderson (1979). “Population biology of infectious diseases: Part II”. *Nature* 280.5722, pp. 455–461.
- McCracken, GF & JW Bradbury (1981). “Social organization and kinship in the polygynous bat *Phyllostomus hastatus*”. *Behavioral Ecology and Sociobiology* 8.1, pp. 11–34. DOI: 10.1007/bf00302840.
- Nunes, A, MT da Gama, & M Gomes (2006). “Localized contacts between hosts reduce pathogen diversity”. *Journal of theoretical biology* 241.3, pp. 477–487. DOI: 10.1016/j.jtbi.2005.12.010.
- Nunn, CL, S Altizer, KE Jones, & W Sechrest (2003). “Comparative tests of parasite species richness in primates”. *The American Naturalist* 162.5, pp. 597–614. DOI: 10.1086/378721.
- Olival, KJ, CC Weekley, & P Daszak (2015). “Are bats really “special” as viral reservoirs? What we know and need to know”. In: *Bats and Viruses: A New Frontier of Emerging Infectious Diseases*. Ed. by LF Wang & C Cowled. New Jersey: Wiley, pp. 281–294. DOI: 10.1002/9781118818824.ch11.
- O’Shea, TJ, PM Cryan, AA Cunningham, AR Fooks, DT Hayman, AD Luis, AJ Peel, RK Plowright, & JL Wood (2014). “Bat flight and zoonotic viruses”. *Emerging infectious diseases* 20.5, p. 741. DOI: 10.3201/eid2005.130539.

- Peel, AJ, DR Sargan, KS Baker, DT Hayman, JA Barr, G Crameri, R Suu-Ire, CC Broder, T Lembo, LF Wang, et al. (2013). "Continent-wide panmixia of an African fruit bat facilitates transmission of potentially zoonotic viruses". *Nature communications* 4. DOI: 10.1038/ncomms3770.
- Petit, E & F Mayer (1999). "Male dispersal in the noctule bat (*Nyctalus noctula*): where are the limits?" *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B: Biological Sciences* 266.1430, pp. 1717–1722. DOI: 10.1098/rspb.1999.0837.
- Poulin, R (1995). "Phylogeny, ecology, and the richness of parasite communities in vertebrates". *Ecological Monographs*, pp. 283–302. DOI: 10.2307/2937061.
- Poulin, R (2010). "Latitudinal gradients in parasite diversity: bridging the gap between temperate and tropical areas". *Neotropical Helminthology* 4.2, pp. 169–177.
- Poulin, R (2014). "Parasite biodiversity revisited: frontiers and constraints". *International journal for parasitology* 44.9, pp. 581–589. DOI: 10.1016/j.ijpara.2014.02.003.
- Racey, PA (2015). "The uniqueness of bats". In: *Bats and Viruses: A New Frontier of Emerging Infectious Diseases*. Wiley Blackwell. Ed. by LF Wang & C Cowled, pp. 1–22. DOI: 10.1002/9781118818824.ch1.
- Richter, H & G Cumming (2008). "First application of satellite telemetry to track African straw-coloured fruit bat migration". *Journal of Zoology* 275.2, pp. 172–176. DOI: 10.1111/j.1469-7998.2008.00425.x.
- Rohani, P, C Green, N Mantilla-Beniers, & B Grenfell (2003). "Ecological interference between fatal diseases". *Nature* 422.6934, pp. 885–888. DOI: 10.1038/nature01542.
- Shump, KA & AU Shump (1982). "*Lasiurus borealis*". *Mammalian species*, pp. 1–6. DOI: 10.2307/3503843.
- Taylor, LH, SM Latham, & E Mark (2001). "Risk factors for human disease emergence". *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London. Series B: Biological Sciences* 356.1411, pp. 983–989. DOI: 10.1093/acprof:oso/9780198525738.003.0035.
- Turmel, AS & KJ Olival (2009). "Correlates of viral richness in bats (order Chiroptera)". *EcoHealth* 6.4, pp. 522–539. DOI: 10.1007/s10393-009-0263-8.
- Turner, K & G Garnett (2002). "The impact of the phase of an epidemic of sexually transmitted infection on the evolution of the organism". *Sexually transmitted infections* 78, pp. i20–i30. DOI: 10.1136/sti.78.suppl_1.i20.
- Vitone, ND, S Altizer, & CL Nunn (2004). "Body size, diet and sociality influence the species richness of parasitic worms in anthropoid primates". *Evolutionary Ecology Research* 6.2, pp. 183–199.
- Wang, L, P Walker, & L Poon (2011). "Mass extinctions, biodiversity and mitochondrial function: are bats 'special' as reservoirs for emerging viruses?" *Current Opinion in Virology*. DOI: 10.1016/j.coviro.2011.10.013.
- Wardeh, M, C Risley, MK McIntyre, C Setzkorn, & M Baylis (2015). "Database of host-pathogen and related species interactions, and their global distribution". *Scientific data* 2. DOI: 10.1038/sdata.2015.49.
- Wilmer, JW, C Moritz, L Hall, & J Toop (1994). "Extreme population structuring in the threatened ghost bat, *Macroderma gigas*: evidence from mitochondrial DNA". *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B: Biological Sciences* 257.1349, pp. 193–198. DOI: 10.1098/rspb.1994.0115.
- Wilson, DE & DM Reeder (2005). *Mammal species of the world: a taxonomic and geographic reference*. Vol. 12. JHU Press. ISBN: 9780801882210.
- Woolhouse, ME & S Gowtage-Sequeria (2006). "Host range and emerging and reemerging pathogens". In: *Ending the War Metaphor: The Changing Agenda for Unraveling the Host-Microbe Relationship-Workshop Summary*. Vol. 192. National Academies Press.

- World Bank (2014). *Update on the economic impact of the 2014 Ebola epidemic on Liberia, Sierra Leone, and Guinea*. Washington, DC. DOI: 10.1211/pj.2014.20066832. URL: <http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/2014/12/20454884/update-economic-impact-2014-ebola-epidemic-liberia-sierra-leone-guinea>.
- World Bank (2015). "World Development Indicators: Size of the economy". URL: <http://wdi.worldbank.org/table/1.1>.