

11.1 Our aim is to estimate the parameters of the simultaneous equations model

$$y_1 = \alpha_1 y_2 + e_1$$

$$y_2 = \alpha_2 y_1 + \beta_1 x_1 + \beta_2 x_2 + e_2$$

We assume that x_1 and x_2 are exogenous and uncorrelated with the error terms e_1 and e_2 .

- a. Solve the two structural equations for the reduced-form equation for y_2 , that is, $y_2 = \pi_1 x_1 + \pi_2 x_2 + v_2$. Express the reduced-form parameters in terms of the **structural parameters** and the reduced-form error in terms of the structural parameters and e_1 and e_2 . Show that y_2 is correlated with e_1 .

$$y_2 = \alpha_2 y_1 + \beta_1 x_1 + \beta_2 x_2 + e_2$$

$$= \alpha_2 (\alpha_1 y_2 + e_1) + \beta_1 x_1 + \beta_2 x_2 + e_2$$

$$= \alpha_1 \alpha_2 y_2 + \alpha_2 e_1 + \beta_1 x_1 + \beta_2 x_2 + e_2$$

$$\Rightarrow (1 - \alpha_1 \alpha_2) y_2 = \alpha_2 e_1 + \beta_1 x_1 + \beta_2 x_2 + e_2$$

$$\Rightarrow y_2 = \frac{\alpha_2}{1 - \alpha_1 \alpha_2} e_1 + \frac{\beta_1}{1 - \alpha_1 \alpha_2} x_1 + \frac{\beta_2}{1 - \alpha_1 \alpha_2} x_2 + \frac{\alpha_2 e_1 + e_2}{1 - \alpha_1 \alpha_2} v_2$$

$$\text{Cov}(y_2, e_1) = \text{Cov}\left(\frac{\alpha_2}{1 - \alpha_1 \alpha_2} e_1 + \frac{\beta_1}{1 - \alpha_1 \alpha_2} x_1 + \frac{\beta_2}{1 - \alpha_1 \alpha_2} x_2 + \frac{\alpha_2 e_1 + e_2}{1 - \alpha_1 \alpha_2}, e_1\right)$$

$$= \frac{\alpha_2}{1 - \alpha_1 \alpha_2} \text{Cov}(e_1, e_1) + \frac{\beta_1}{1 - \alpha_1 \alpha_2} \text{Cov}(x_1, e_1) + \text{Cov}\left(\frac{\alpha_2 e_1}{1 - \alpha_1 \alpha_2}, e_1\right) + \text{Cov}\left(\frac{e_2}{1 - \alpha_1 \alpha_2}, e_1\right)$$

$$= 0 + 0 + \frac{\alpha_2}{1 - \alpha_1 \alpha_2} \text{Cov}(e_1, e_1) + 0 = \frac{\alpha_2}{1 - \alpha_1 \alpha_2} \text{Cov}(e_1, e_1) \neq 0 \text{ if } \alpha_2 \neq 0.$$

- b. Which equation parameters are consistently estimated using OLS? Explain.

Both equation (1) (2) have an endogenous variable on the right hand-side. \Rightarrow OLS is biased and inconsistent.
The reduced form equation can be estimated consistently by OLS. Because there is only one exogenous on the right hand side.

- c. Which parameters are “identified,” in the simultaneous equations sense? Explain your reasoning.

$M=2 \Rightarrow$ 至少有 $M-1$ 個外生變數被剔除

$y_1 = \alpha_1 + \beta_1 x_1 + \epsilon_1 \Rightarrow x_1$, and x_2 are absent \Rightarrow identified.

$y_2 = \alpha_2 + \beta_2 x_1 + \beta_3 x_2 + \epsilon_2 \Rightarrow$ No exogenous variable absent \Rightarrow identified.

- d. To estimate the parameters of the reduced-form equation for y_2 using the method of moments (MOM), which was introduced in Section 10.3, the two moment equations are

$$N^{-1} \sum x_{i1} (y_2 - \pi_1 x_{i1} - \pi_2 x_{i2}) = 0$$

$$N^{-1} \sum x_{i2} (y_2 - \pi_1 x_{i1} - \pi_2 x_{i2}) = 0$$

Explain why these two moment conditions are a valid basis for obtaining consistent estimators of the reduced-form parameters.

$$E(x_{i1}, v_{i1}|x) = E(x_{i2}, v_{i2}|x) = 0 \quad (\because x_1, x_2 \text{ are exogenous})$$

$$\begin{aligned} E(x_{i1} \left(\frac{\alpha_2 + \beta_2 x_1 + \beta_3 x_2 + \epsilon_2}{1 - \alpha_2 - \beta_2} \right) | x) &= \frac{\alpha_2}{1 - \alpha_2 - \beta_2} E(x_{i1} \epsilon_2 | x) + \frac{1}{1 - \alpha_2 - \beta_2} E(x_{i1} x_2 | x) \\ &= 0 + 0 = 0 \end{aligned}$$

- e. Are the MOM estimators in part (d) the same as the OLS estimators? Form the sum of squared errors function for $y_2 = \pi_1 x_1 + \pi_2 x_2 + v_2$ and find the first derivatives. Set these to zero and show that they are equivalent to the two equations in part (d).

$$S(\pi_1, \pi_2 | y, x) = \sum (y_2 - \pi_1 x_1 - \pi_2 x_2)^2$$

$$\frac{\partial S(\pi_1, \pi_2 | y, x)}{\partial \pi_1} = 2 \sum (y_2 - \pi_1 x_1 - \pi_2 x_2) x_1 = 0 \Rightarrow \frac{1}{N} \sum (y_2 - \pi_1 x_1 - \pi_2 x_2) x_1 = 0$$

$$\frac{\partial S(\pi_1, \pi_2 | y, x)}{\partial \pi_2} = 2 \sum (y_2 - \pi_1 x_1 - \pi_2 x_2) x_2 = 0 \Rightarrow \frac{1}{N} \sum (y_2 - \pi_1 x_1 - \pi_2 x_2) x_2 = 0$$

- f. Using $\sum x_{i1}^2 = 1$, $\sum x_{i2}^2 = 1$, $\sum x_{i1}x_{i2} = 0$, $\sum x_{i1}y_{1i} = 2$, $\sum x_{i1}y_{2i} = 3$, $\sum x_{i2}y_{1i} = 3$, $\sum x_{i2}y_{2i} = 4$, and the two moment conditions in part (d) show that the MOM/OLS estimates of π_1 and π_2 are $\hat{\pi}_1 = 3$ and $\hat{\pi}_2 = 4$.

$$\begin{aligned} \sum (y_2 - \pi_1 x_1 - \pi_2 x_2) x_1 = 0 &\Rightarrow \sum (x_1 y_2 - \pi_1 x_1^2 - \pi_2 x_1 x_2) = 0 \Rightarrow 3 - \hat{\pi}_1 x_1 - \hat{\pi}_2 x_0 = 0 \Rightarrow \hat{\pi}_1 = 3 \\ \sum (y_2 - \pi_1 x_1 - \pi_2 x_2) x_2 = 0 &\Rightarrow \sum (x_2 y_2 - \pi_1 x_1 x_2 - \pi_2 x_2^2) = 0 \Rightarrow 4 - \hat{\pi}_1 x_0 - \hat{\pi}_2 x_1 = 0 \Rightarrow \hat{\pi}_2 = 4 \end{aligned}$$

- g. The fitted value $\hat{y}_2 = \hat{\pi}_1 x_1 + \hat{\pi}_2 x_2$. Explain why we can use the moment condition $\sum \hat{y}_{i2}(y_{i1} - \alpha_1 y_{i2}) = 0$ as a valid basis for consistently estimating α_1 . Obtain the IV estimate of α_1 .

$$E(y_2 | x) = E[(\pi_1 x_1 + \pi_2 x_2) | x] = E[(\pi_1 x_1 + \pi_2 x_2)(y_1 - \alpha_1 y_2) | x] = 0$$

$$\hat{\pi}_1 \xrightarrow{P} \pi_1, \hat{\pi}_2 \xrightarrow{P} \pi_2$$

$$\sum (\hat{\pi}_1 x_1 + \hat{\pi}_2 x_2)(y_1 - \alpha_1 y_2) = \sum \hat{y}_2 (y_1 - \alpha_1 y_2) = 0$$

$$\Rightarrow \sum \hat{y}_2 y_1 - \alpha_1 \sum \hat{y}_2 y_2 = 0 \Rightarrow \hat{\alpha}_1 = \frac{\sum \hat{y}_2 y_1}{\sum \hat{y}_2 y_2} = \frac{\sum (\hat{\pi}_1 x_1 + \hat{\pi}_2 x_2) y_1}{\sum (\hat{\pi}_1 x_1 + \hat{\pi}_2 x_2) y_2} = \frac{\hat{\pi}_1 \sum x_1 y_1 + \hat{\pi}_2 \sum x_2 y_1}{\hat{\pi}_1 \sum x_1 y_2 + \hat{\pi}_2 \sum x_2 y_2} = \frac{18}{25}$$

- h. Find the 2SLS estimate of α_1 by applying OLS to $y_1 = \alpha_1 \hat{y}_2 + e_1^*$. Compare your answer to that in part (g).

$$\hat{\alpha}_{1, 2SLS} = \frac{\sum \hat{y}_2 y_1}{\sum \hat{y}_2^2}$$

$$\because \hat{v}_2 = y_2 - \hat{y}_2 \rightarrow \hat{y}_2 = y_2 - \hat{v}_2$$

$$\therefore \sum \hat{y}_2 = \sum \hat{y}_2 (y_2 - \hat{v}_2) = \sum \hat{y}_2 y_2 - \boxed{\sum \hat{y}_2 \hat{v}_2}$$

$$= \sum \hat{y}_2 y_2$$

$$\Rightarrow \hat{\alpha}_{1, 2SLS} = \frac{\sum \hat{y}_2 y_1}{\sum \hat{y}_2^2} \text{ 與 (g) 相同}$$

$$\begin{aligned}\sum \hat{y}_2 \hat{v}_2 &= \sum (\hat{\alpha}_1 x_1 + \hat{\alpha}_2 x_2) \hat{v}_2 \\ &= \hat{\alpha}_1 \sum x_1 \hat{v}_2 + \hat{\alpha}_2 \sum x_2 \hat{v}_2 = 0\end{aligned}$$