

11.1 Our aim is to estimate the parameters of the simultaneous equations model

313707015

$$\begin{aligned} y_1 &= \alpha_1 y_2 + e_1 & \text{--- } \textcircled{1} \\ y_2 &= \alpha_2 y_1 + \beta_1 x_1 + \beta_2 x_2 + e_2 & \text{--- } \textcircled{2} \end{aligned}$$

資財類
陳麗君

We assume that x_1 and x_2 are exogenous and uncorrelated with the error terms e_1 and e_2 .

- a. Solve the two structural equations for the reduced-form equation for y_2 , that is, $y_2 = \pi_1 x_1 + \pi_2 x_2 + v_2$. Express the reduced-form parameters in terms of the **structural parameters** and the reduced-form error in terms of the structural parameters and e_1 and e_2 . Show that y_2 is correlated with e_1 .

a. 將 $\textcircled{1}$ 代入 $\textcircled{2}$

$$\begin{aligned} y_2 &= \alpha_2 y_1 + \beta_1 x_1 + \beta_2 x_2 + e_2 \\ &= \alpha_2 (\alpha_1 y_2 + e_1) + \beta_1 x_1 + \beta_2 x_2 + e_2 \\ &= \alpha_1 \alpha_2 y_2 + \alpha_2 e_1 + \beta_1 x_1 + \beta_2 x_2 + e_2 \\ \Rightarrow y_2 (1 - \alpha_1 \alpha_2) &= \beta_1 x_1 + \beta_2 x_2 + e_2 + \alpha_2 e_1 \\ \Rightarrow y_2 &= \frac{\beta_1}{(1 - \alpha_1 \alpha_2)} x_1 + \frac{\beta_2}{(1 - \alpha_1 \alpha_2)} x_2 + \frac{e_2 + \alpha_2 e_1}{(1 - \alpha_1 \alpha_2)} \\ &= \pi_1 x_1 + \pi_2 x_2 + v_2 \end{aligned}$$

The correlation of y_2 and e_1 ,

$$\begin{aligned} \text{cov}(y_2, e_1 | X) &= E(y_2, e_1 | X) = E\left[\left(\frac{\beta_1}{1 - \alpha_1 \alpha_2} x_1 + \frac{\beta_2}{1 - \alpha_1 \alpha_2} x_2 + \frac{e_2 + \alpha_2 e_1}{1 - \alpha_1 \alpha_2}\right) e_1 | X\right] \\ &= E\left[\underbrace{\frac{\beta_1}{(1 - \alpha_1 \alpha_2)} x_1 e_1}_{0} | X\right] + E\left[\underbrace{\frac{\beta_2}{(1 - \alpha_1 \alpha_2)} x_2 e_1}_{0} | X\right] + E\left[\underbrace{\left(\frac{e_2 + \alpha_2 e_1}{1 - \alpha_1 \alpha_2}\right) e_1}_{E[e_1^2]} | X\right] \\ &= 0 + 0 + E\left[\left(\frac{e_2 e_1 + \alpha_2 e_1^2}{1 - \alpha_1 \alpha_2}\right)\right] | X \\ &\quad \because x_i's \text{ are exogenous and uncorrelated with errors.} \end{aligned}$$

Assuming the two equation errors are uncorrelated :

$$\begin{aligned} \text{cov}(y_2, e_1 | X) &= E(y_2, e_1 | X) = \frac{E(e_2 e_1 | X) + \alpha_2 E(e_1^2 | X)}{(1 - \alpha_1 \alpha_2)} \\ &= \frac{\alpha_2}{(1 - \alpha_1 \alpha_2)} \sigma_1^2 \neq 0 \quad (\text{除非 } \alpha_2 = 0, \text{ 則無 simultaneity 問題。}) \end{aligned}$$

- b. Which equation parameters are consistently estimated using OLS? Explain.
 c. Which parameters are “identified,” in the simultaneous equations sense? Explain your reasoning.

b. 兩個方程式皆不適用 OLS, 因為 ① 和 ② 等式右側都同時包含

內生變數, 使用 OLS 則會產生 biased 且 inconsistent 的結果。

若使用 reduced-form 方程式則其參數可以用 OLS 估計,

因為只剩外生變數在等式右側。

c. $M=2 \quad \therefore$ 至少要有 $(M-1)=1$ 個外生變數在方程式中被省略。

① 式中 π_1, π_2 被省略 \therefore identified, 可以一致地估計 α_1

② 式則沒有外生變數省略 \therefore not identified.

- d. To estimate the parameters of the reduced-form equation for y_2 using the method of moments (MOM), which was introduced in Section 10.3, the two moment equations are

$$N^{-1} \sum x_{i1} (y_2 - \pi_1 x_{i1} - \pi_2 x_{i2}) = 0 \quad \begin{matrix} V_i \text{ 誤差項 in reduced form} \\ > x_i \text{ 和 } V_i \text{ 加權平均為 } 0 \end{matrix}$$

$$N^{-1} \sum x_{i2} (y_2 - \pi_1 x_{i1} - \pi_2 x_{i2}) = 0$$

Explain why these two moment conditions are a valid basis for obtaining consistent estimators of the reduced-form parameters.

d. x 為外生 $\therefore E(x_{i1} V_{i2} | X) = E(x_{i2} V_{i1} | X) = 0$

$$y_2 = \frac{\beta_1}{(1-\alpha_1\alpha_2)} x_1 + \frac{\beta_2}{(1-\alpha_1\alpha_2)} x_2 + \frac{e_2 + \alpha_2 e_1}{(1-\alpha_1\alpha_2)} = \pi_1 x_1 + \pi_2 x_2 + v_2$$

則 x 's 和 reduced form 的誤差項 v_2 為 uncorrelated:

$$E \left[x_{ik} \left(\frac{e_2 + \alpha_2 e_1}{1-\alpha_1\alpha_2} \right) \mid X \right] = E \left[\frac{1}{(1-\alpha_1\alpha_2)} x_{ik} e_2 \mid X \right] + E \left[\frac{\alpha_2}{(1-\alpha_1\alpha_2)} x_{ik} e_1 \mid X \right]$$

$$= 0 + 0 = 0$$

- e. Are the MOM estimators in part (d) the same as the OLS estimators? Form the sum of squared errors function for $y_2 = \pi_1 x_1 + \pi_2 x_2 + v_2$ and find the first derivatives. Set these to zero and show that they are equivalent to the two equations in part (d).

$$e. y_2 = \pi_1 x_1 + \pi_2 x_2 + v_2$$

$$v_2 = y_2 - \pi_1 x_1 - \pi_2 x_2$$

.. 最小化誤差函數：

$$S(\pi_1, \pi_2 | y, x) = \sum (y_2 - \pi_1 x_1 - \pi_2 x_2)^2$$

對 π_1 偏微並設為 0 :

$$\frac{\partial S(\pi_1, \pi_2 | y, x)}{\partial \pi_1} = 2 \sum (y_2 - \pi_1 x_1 - \pi_2 x_2) x_1 = 0 \quad \text{--- ①}$$

對 π_2 偏微並設為 0 :

$$\frac{\partial S(\pi_1, \pi_2 | y, x)}{\partial \pi_2} = 2 \sum (y_2 - \pi_1 x_1 - \pi_2 x_2) x_2 = 0 \quad \text{--- ②}$$

若將 ① 和 ② 各除 2, 且乘以 N 後則和 MOM 的條件等價。

- f. Using $\sum x_{11}^2 = 1$, $\sum x_{12}^2 = 1$, $\sum x_{11}x_{12} = 0$, $\sum x_{11}y_{11} = 2$, $\sum x_{12}y_{11} = 3$, $\sum x_{12}y_{12} = 4$, and the two moment conditions in part (d) show that the MOM/OLS estimates of π_1 and π_2 are $\hat{\pi}_1 = 3$ and $\hat{\pi}_2 = 4$.

The moment conditions are :

$$\textcircled{1} \quad N^{-1} \sum x_{i1} (y_2 - \pi_1 x_{i1} - \pi_2 x_{i2}) = 0$$

$$\Rightarrow \sum x_{i1} y_{i2} - \pi_1 \sum x_{i1}^2 - \pi_2 \sum x_{i1} x_{i2} = 0$$

$$\Rightarrow 3 - \pi_1 \times 1 - \pi_2 \times 0 = 0$$

$$\Rightarrow \hat{\pi}_1 = 3 \#$$

$$\textcircled{2} \quad N^{-1} \sum x_{i2} (y_2 - \pi_1 x_{i1} - \pi_2 x_{i2}) = 0$$

$$\Rightarrow \sum x_{i2} y_{i2} - \pi_1 \sum x_{i1} x_{i2} - \pi_2 \sum x_{i2}^2 = 0$$

$$\Rightarrow 4 - \pi_1 \times 0 - \pi_2 \times 1 = 0$$

$$\Rightarrow \hat{\pi}_2 = 4 \#$$

- g. The fitted value $\hat{y}_2 = \hat{\pi}_1 x_1 + \hat{\pi}_2 x_2$. Explain why we can use the moment condition $\sum \hat{y}_{i2} (y_{i1} - \alpha_1 y_{i2}) = 0$ as a valid basis for consistently estimating α_1 . Obtain the IV estimate of α_1 .

$$y_1 = \alpha_1 y_2 + e_1 \text{ 無條件計}\alpha_1$$

檢查 $(\lambda_1 x_1 + \lambda_2 x_2)$ 和 e_1 的關聯性：

$$\therefore E[(\lambda_1 x_1 + \lambda_2 x_2) e_1 | X] = E[(\lambda_1 x_1 + \lambda_2 x_2)(y_1 - \alpha_1 y_2) | X] = 0$$

The moment condition:

$$N^{-1} \sum (\lambda_1 x_{i1} + \lambda_2 x_{i2})(y_{i1} - \alpha_1 y_{i2}) = 0$$

當 $n \rightarrow \infty$, $\hat{\lambda}_1 = \lambda_1$, $\hat{\lambda}_2 = \lambda_2$ 代入 moment condition 得：

$$\sum (\hat{\lambda}_1 x_{i1} + \hat{\lambda}_2 x_{i2})(y_{i1} - \alpha_1 y_{i2}) = \sum \hat{y}_{i2}(y_{i1} - \alpha_1 y_{i2}) = 0$$

$$\Rightarrow \sum \hat{y}_{i2} y_{i1} - \alpha_1 \sum \hat{y}_{i2} y_{i2} = 0$$

$$\begin{aligned} \Rightarrow \hat{\alpha}_{1,IV} &= \frac{\sum \hat{y}_{i2} y_{i1}}{\sum \hat{y}_{i2} y_{i2}} = \frac{\sum (\hat{\lambda}_1 x_{i1} + \hat{\lambda}_2 x_{i2}) y_{i1}}{\sum (\hat{\lambda}_1 x_{i1} + \hat{\lambda}_2 x_{i2}) y_{i2}} \\ &= \frac{\hat{\lambda}_1 \sum x_{i1} y_{i1} + \hat{\lambda}_2 \sum x_{i2} y_{i1}}{\hat{\lambda}_1 \sum x_{i1} y_{i2} + \hat{\lambda}_2 \sum x_{i2} y_{i2}} \\ &= \frac{3 \times 2 + 4 \times 3}{3 \times 3 + 4 \times 4} = \frac{18}{25} \# \end{aligned}$$

- h. Find the 2SLS estimate of α_1 by applying OLS to $y_1 = \alpha_1 \hat{y}_2 + e_1^*$. Compare your answer to that in part (g).

$$y_1 = \alpha_1 y_2 + e_1$$

$$\therefore \hat{v}_2 = y_2 - \hat{y}_2, \quad \hat{y}_2 = y_2 - \hat{v}_2$$

$$1 \text{ 請 } y_2 = \lambda_1 x_1 + \lambda_2 x_2 + v_2$$

$$\sum \hat{y}_{i2}^2 = \sum \hat{y}_{i2} (y_2 - \hat{v}_2) = \sum \hat{y}_{i2} y_2 - \sum \hat{y}_{i2} \hat{v}_2 = \sum \hat{y}_{i2} y_2$$

$$2 \text{ 請 } y_1 = \alpha_1 \hat{y}_2 + e_1$$

$$\sum \hat{y}_{i2} \hat{v}_{i2} = \sum (\hat{\lambda}_1 x_{i1} + \hat{\lambda}_2 x_{i2}) \hat{v}_{i2} = \hat{\lambda}_1 \underbrace{\sum x_{i1} \hat{v}_{i2}}_0 + \hat{\lambda}_2 \underbrace{\sum x_{i2} \hat{v}_{i2}}_0 = 0$$

$$\hat{\alpha}_{1,2SLS} = \frac{\sum \hat{y}_{i2} y_{i1}}{\sum \hat{y}_{i2}^2} = \frac{\sum \hat{y}_{i2} y_{i2}}{\sum \hat{y}_{i2}^2} = \frac{18}{25} \#$$

11.16 Consider the following supply and demand model

$$\text{Demand: } Q_i = \alpha_1 + \alpha_2 P_i + e_{di}, \quad \text{Supply: } Q_i = \beta_1 + \beta_2 P_i + \beta_3 W_i + e_{si}$$

where Q is the quantity, P is the price, and W is the wage rate, which is assumed exogenous. Data on these variables are in Table 11.7.

TABLE 11.7			Data for Exercise 11.16
Q	P	W	
4	2	2	
6	4	3	
9	3	1	
3	5	1	
8	8	3	

- Derive the algebraic form of the reduced-form equations, $Q = \theta_1 + \theta_2 W + v_2$ and $P = \pi_1 + \pi_2 W + v_1$, expressing the reduced-form parameters in terms of the structural parameters.
- Which structural parameters can you solve for from the results in part (a)? Which equation is "identified"?

a. Let Demand = Supply

$$Q_i = \alpha_1 + \alpha_2 P_i + e_{di} = \beta_1 + \beta_2 P_i + \beta_3 W_i + e_{si}$$

$$(\alpha_2 - \beta_2) P_i = (\beta_1 - \alpha_1) + \beta_3 W_i + e_{si} - e_{di}$$

$$\begin{aligned} P_i &= \frac{\beta_1 - \alpha_1}{\alpha_2 - \beta_2} + \frac{\beta_3}{\alpha_2 - \beta_2} W_i + \frac{e_{si} - e_{di}}{\alpha_2 - \beta_2} \\ &= \pi_1 + \pi_2 W_i + v_2 \# \end{aligned}$$

将 P_i 代入 Demand Model 得 Q_i

$$\begin{aligned} Q_i &= \alpha_1 + \alpha_2 P_i + e_{di} \\ &= \alpha_1 + \alpha_2 \left(\frac{\beta_1 - \alpha_1}{\alpha_2 - \beta_2} + \frac{\beta_3}{\alpha_2 - \beta_2} W_i + \frac{e_{si} - e_{di}}{\alpha_2 - \beta_2} \right) + e_{di} \\ &= \alpha_1 + \left(\frac{\beta_1 - \alpha_1}{\alpha_2 - \beta_2} \right) \alpha_2 + \left(\frac{\beta_3}{\alpha_2 - \beta_2} \right) \alpha_2 \cdot W_i + \left(\frac{e_{si} - e_{di}}{\alpha_2 - \beta_2} \right) \alpha_2 + e_{di} \\ &= \pi_1 + \pi_2 W_i + v_1 \# \end{aligned}$$

外生: W_i .

b. $M=2 \therefore$ 至多 $(M-1)=1$ 個變數被省略 內生: Q_i, P_i

Demand: $Q_i = \alpha_1 + \alpha_2 P_i + e_{di} \Rightarrow$ 沒有 W_i 之 identified, α_1, α_2 can be estimated consistently.

Supply: $Q_i = \beta_1 + \beta_2 P_i + \beta_3 W_i + e_{si} \Rightarrow$ 沒有變數被省略 \therefore not identified

11-1b

- c. The estimated reduced-form equations are $\hat{Q} = 5 + 0.5W$ and $\hat{P} = 2.4 + 1W$. Solve for the identified structural parameters. This is the method of **indirect least squares**.
- d. Obtain the fitted values from the reduced-form equation for P , and apply 2SLS to obtain estimates of the demand equation.

$$c. \quad \hat{Q} = 5 + 0.5W$$

$$\hat{P} = 2.4 + 1W$$

fit \rightarrow Demand :

$$\begin{aligned}\hat{Q} &= 5 + 0.5W = \alpha_1 + \alpha_2(2.4 + 1W) \\ \Rightarrow \underline{5 + 0.5W} &= (\underline{\alpha_1 + 2.4\alpha_2}) + \underline{1W\alpha_2}\end{aligned}$$

$$0.5W = \alpha_2 W \Rightarrow \alpha_2 = 0.5 \#$$

$$5 = \alpha_1 + 2.4\alpha_2 \Rightarrow \alpha_1 = 5 - (2.4 \times 0.5) = 3.8 \#$$

$$d. \quad \hat{P} = 2.4 + 1W \quad \bar{P} = \frac{22}{5} = 4.4 ; \quad \bar{Q} = \frac{30}{5} = 6$$

W	\hat{P}	$\hat{P} - \bar{P}$	Q	$Q - \bar{Q}$
2	4.4	0	4	-2
3	5.4	1	6	0
1	3.4	-1	9	3
1	3.4	-1	3	-3
3	5.4	1	8	2
Sum	22	2	30	0

$$Q = \alpha_1 + \alpha_2 \hat{P} + e_i$$

$$\hat{\alpha}_1 = \frac{\sum (\hat{P}_i - \bar{P})(Q_i - \bar{Q})}{\sum (\hat{P}_i - \bar{P})^2} = \frac{0+0-3+3+2}{4} = 0.5 \#$$

$$\hat{\alpha}_2 = \bar{Q} - \hat{\alpha}_1 \bar{P} = 6 - 0.5 \times 4.4 = 3.8 \#$$

11.17 Example 11.3 introduces Klein's Model I.

- Do we have an adequate number of IVs to estimate each equation? Check the necessary condition for the identification of each equation. The necessary condition for identification is that in a system of M equations at least $M - 1$ variables must be omitted from each equation.
- An equivalent identification condition is that the number of excluded exogenous variables from the equation must be at least as large as the number of included right-hand side endogenous variables. Check that this condition is satisfied for each equation.
- Write down in econometric notation the first-stage equation, the reduced form, for W_{1t} , wages of workers earned in the private sector. Call the parameters π_1, π_2, \dots .
- Describe the two regression steps of 2SLS estimation of the consumption function. This is not a question about a computer software command.
- Does following the steps in part (d) produce regression results that are identical to the 2SLS estimates provided by software specifically designed for 2SLS estimation? In particular, will the t -values be the same?

a. $M = 8$

至少要 $(M-1)=7$ 個外生變數在各方程式中被省略

共有 8 個外生變數: $W_{st}, P_{t-1}, K_{t-1}, G_t, E_{t-1}, TIME_t, TX_t, X_{1t} = 1$

Consumption Function:

$$CN_t = \alpha_1 + \alpha_2 (W_{1t} + W_{2t}) + \alpha_3 P_t + \alpha_4 P_{t-1} + e_{1t}$$

共有 6 個變數, 有 $16 - 6 = 10$ 個變數被省略 $\Rightarrow 10 > 7 \therefore$ identified.

Wage Function:

$$W_{1t} = r_1 + r_2 E_t + r_3 E_{t-1} + r_4 TIME_t + e_{2t}$$

共有 5 個變數, $(6 - 5 = 1)$ 個變數被省略 $\Rightarrow 1 > 1 \therefore$ identified.

Investment Function:

$$I_t = \beta_1 + \beta_2 P_t + \beta_3 P_{t-1} + \beta_4 K_{t-1} + e_{3t}$$

共有 5 個變數, $(6 - 5 = 1)$ 個變數被省略 $\Rightarrow 1 > 1 \therefore$ identified.

- b. CN -
- ⑩ 內生變數: 2 個
 - 外生變數: 3 個 \rightarrow 被排除 5 個 $\because 5 > 2 \Rightarrow$ satisfied
- W_{1t} -
- ⑩ 內生變數: 1 個
 - 外生變數: 3 個 \rightarrow 被排除 5 個 $\because 5 > 1 \Rightarrow$ satisfied
- I_t -
- ⑩ 內生變數: 1 個
 - 外生變數: 3 個 \rightarrow 被排除 5 個 $\because 5 > 1 \Rightarrow$ satisfied.

- c. Write down in econometric notation the first-stage equation, the reduced form, for W_{1t} , wages of workers earned in the private sector. Call the parameters π_1, π_2, \dots
- d. Describe the two regression steps of 2SLS estimation of the consumption function. This is not a question about a computer software command.
- e. Does following the steps in part (d) produce regression results that are identical to the 2SLS estimates provided by software specifically designed for 2SLS estimation? In particular, will the t -values be the same?

$$C. W_{1t} = r_1 + r_2 E_t + r_3 E_{t-1} + r_4 TIME_t + e_{3t}$$

$$= r_1 + r_2 (CN_t + I_t + (G - W_{2t})) + r_3 E_{t-1} + r_4 TIME_t + e_{3t}$$

$$W_{1t} = \alpha_1 + \alpha_2 G_t + \alpha_3 W_{2t} + \alpha_4 TX_t + \alpha_5 TIME_t + \alpha_6 P_{t-1} + \alpha_7 K_{t-1} + \alpha_8 E_{t-1} + \nu$$

$$d. CN_t = \alpha_1 + \alpha_2 (W_{1t} + W_{2t}) + \alpha_3 P_t + \alpha_4 P_{t-1} + e_{1t}$$

1階迴歸：從 (c) 的方程式估計出 \hat{W}_{1t} (得到 $W^* = \hat{W}_{1t} + W_{2t}$)

$$\text{也列出 } \hat{P}_t$$

2階迴歸：將 \hat{W}_{1t}, \hat{P}_t 代入 Consumption Function

$$\Rightarrow CN_t = \alpha_1 + \alpha_2 \hat{W}_{1t} + \alpha_3 W_{2t} + \alpha_4 \hat{P}_t + \alpha_5 P_{t-1} + e_{1t}$$

regress CN_t on $\hat{W}_{1t}, W_{2t}, \hat{P}_t, P_{t-1}$ and constant by OLS.

e. 迴歸係數會相同，但 t -value 會不同，

「(d) 的標準誤不是正確的 2SLS 標準誤。」