## **EXHIBIT A**

## **GIUFFRE**

VS.

## **MAXWELL**

**Deposition** 

## **VIRGINIA GIUFFRE**

05/03/2016

Agren Blando Court Reporting & Video, Inc.

216 16th Street, Suite 600 Denver Colorado, 80202 303-296-0017

		Page 25		Page 27	
1	Janua	ry 19th, 2015?	1	filed under oath is no longer true, correct?	
2	Α	At the very top of the page it says	2	MR. EDWARDS: Object to the form.	
3	Januar	y 21st, 2015.	3	A I wouldn't say that it wasn't true. I was	
4	0	The date it was filed. Is there a date	4	just unaware of the times and the dates.	
5	•	bove the signature block?	5	Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) Again, is there more	
6	A	Oh, yes, sorry. Yes, there is.	6	than one truth, Ms. Roberts?	
7	Q	And what date what date was that?	7	A No, there's no more than one truth.	
8	A	The 19th day of January, 2015.	8	Q All right. So a document in which you	
9	Q	Okay. And this document is something that	9	swore that you were 15 years old when you met	
10	•	elieve contains the truth, correct?	10	Ms. Ghislaine Maxwell is an untrue statement,	
11	A	To the best of my knowledge at the time,	11	correct?	
12	yes.	, , ,	12	MR. EDWARDS: Object to the form.	
13	Q	All right. Did something change between	13	A It's not that it's an untrue statement.	
14	•	ne then and today that makes you believe that	14	It was a mistake. So it wasn't intentionally trying	
15	it's not all accurate?		15	to say something that wasn't true. It was to my best	
16	Α	Well, as you can see, in line 4 on page 1,	16	knowledge that I thought it was 1999. And when I got	
17	I wasn	't aware of my dates. I was just doing the	17	my records from Mar-a-Lago I was able to find out	
18		quesstimate when I actually met them.	18	that it was 2000. And this was entered before I	
19		Since then I've been able to find out that	19	found out the actual dates that I did work at	
20	throug	h my Mar-a-Lago records that it was actually	20	Mar-a-Lago.	
21		mmer of 2000, not the summer of 1999.	21	Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) Okay. So a document	
22	Q	Oh, I'm sorry. Are you back on page 1?	22	that you filed under oath	
23	A	On the first page.	23	A Um-hum.	
24	Q	Okay.	24	Q is now, you believe to be untrue,	
25	A	Yes.	25	correct?	
			1		
		Page 26		Page 28	
1	Q	Page 26 And you're talking about line 4?	1	Page 28  MR. EDWARDS: Objection. Asked and	
1 2	<b>Q</b> A	Page 26 And you're talking about line 4? Line 4.	1 2		
	_	And you're talking about line 4?		MR. EDWARDS: Objection. Asked and	
2	A	And you're talking about line 4? Line 4.	2	MR. EDWARDS: Objection. Asked and answered.	
2	A <b>Q</b>	And you're talking about line 4? Line 4.  Paragraph 4 or line 4?  Oh, sorry. Number 4, the paragraph	2	MR. EDWARDS: Objection. Asked and answered.  Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) You may answer.	
2 3 4	A <b>Q</b> A	And you're talking about line 4? Line 4.  Paragraph 4 or line 4?  Oh, sorry. Number 4, the paragraph	2 3 4	MR. EDWARDS: Objection. Asked and answered.  Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) You may answer.  MR. EDWARDS: Answer again.	
2 3 4 5	A Q A numbe	And you're talking about line 4? Line 4.  Paragraph 4 or line 4? Oh, sorry. Number 4, the paragraph r 4.	2 3 4 5	MR. EDWARDS: Objection. Asked and answered.  Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) You may answer.  MR. EDWARDS: Answer again.  A Again, I wouldn't say it's untrue. Untrue	
2 3 4 5	A Q A numbe	And you're talking about line 4? Line 4.  Paragraph 4 or line 4? Oh, sorry. Number 4, the paragraph r 4.  Okay. And what part of paragraph 4 do you	2 3 4 5	MR. EDWARDS: Objection. Asked and answered.  Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) You may answer.  MR. EDWARDS: Answer again.  A Again, I wouldn't say it's untrue. Untrue would mean that I would have lied. And I didn't lie.	
2 3 4 5 6 7	A Q A numbe Q now b	And you're talking about line 4? Line 4.  Paragraph 4 or line 4? Oh, sorry. Number 4, the paragraph r 4.  Okay. And what part of paragraph 4 do you elieve to be untrue?	2 3 4 5 6	MR. EDWARDS: Objection. Asked and answered.  Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) You may answer.  MR. EDWARDS: Answer again.  A Again, I wouldn't say it's untrue. Untrue would mean that I would have lied. And I didn't lie.  This was my best knowledge at the time. And I did my	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	A Q A numbe Q now b	And you're talking about line 4? Line 4.  Paragraph 4 or line 4? Oh, sorry. Number 4, the paragraph r 4.  Okay. And what part of paragraph 4 do you elieve to be untrue?  In approximately	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	MR. EDWARDS: Objection. Asked and answered.  Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) You may answer.  MR. EDWARDS: Answer again.  A Again, I wouldn't say it's untrue. Untrue would mean that I would have lied. And I didn't lie.  This was my best knowledge at the time. And I did my very best to try to pinpoint time periods going back	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	A Q A numbe Q now b	And you're talking about line 4? Line 4.  Paragraph 4 or line 4? Oh, sorry. Number 4, the paragraph r 4.  Okay. And what part of paragraph 4 do you elieve to be untrue? In approximately MR. EDWARDS: Object to the form.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	MR. EDWARDS: Objection. Asked and answered.  Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) You may answer.  MR. EDWARDS: Answer again.  A Again, I wouldn't say it's untrue. Untrue would mean that I would have lied. And I didn't lie.  This was my best knowledge at the time. And I did my very best to try to pinpoint time periods going back such a long time ago.	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	A Q A numbe Q now b	And you're talking about line 4? Line 4.  Paragraph 4 or line 4? Oh, sorry. Number 4, the paragraph r 4.  Okay. And what part of paragraph 4 do you elieve to be untrue? In approximately MR. EDWARDS: Object to the form. You can answer.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	MR. EDWARDS: Objection. Asked and answered.  Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) You may answer.  MR. EDWARDS: Answer again.  A Again, I wouldn't say it's untrue. Untrue would mean that I would have lied. And I didn't lie.  This was my best knowledge at the time. And I did my very best to try to pinpoint time periods going back such a long time ago.  It wasn't until I found the facts that I	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	A Q A numbe Q now b	And you're talking about line 4? Line 4.  Paragraph 4 or line 4? Oh, sorry. Number 4, the paragraph r 4.  Okay. And what part of paragraph 4 do you elieve to be untrue? In approximately MR. EDWARDS: Object to the form. You can answer. In approximately 1999 when I was 15 years	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	MR. EDWARDS: Objection. Asked and answered.  Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) You may answer.  MR. EDWARDS: Answer again.  A Again, I wouldn't say it's untrue. Untrue would mean that I would have lied. And I didn't lie.  This was my best knowledge at the time. And I did my very best to try to pinpoint time periods going back such a long time ago.  It wasn't until I found the facts that I worked at Mar-a-Lago in 2000 that I was able to	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	A Q A numbe Q now b A	And you're talking about line 4? Line 4.  Paragraph 4 or line 4? Oh, sorry. Number 4, the paragraph r 4.  Okay. And what part of paragraph 4 do you elieve to be untrue? In approximately MR. EDWARDS: Object to the form. You can answer. In approximately 1999 when I was 15 years set Ghislaine Maxwell.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	MR. EDWARDS: Objection. Asked and answered.  Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) You may answer.  MR. EDWARDS: Answer again.  A Again, I wouldn't say it's untrue. Untrue would mean that I would have lied. And I didn't lie.  This was my best knowledge at the time. And I did my very best to try to pinpoint time periods going back such a long time ago.  It wasn't until I found the facts that I worked at Mar-a-Lago in 2000 that I was able to figure that out.	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	A Q A numbe Q now b A  A old I m Q A	And you're talking about line 4? Line 4.  Paragraph 4 or line 4? Oh, sorry. Number 4, the paragraph r 4.  Okay. And what part of paragraph 4 do you elieve to be untrue? In approximately MR. EDWARDS: Object to the form. You can answer. In approximately 1999 when I was 15 years set Ghislaine Maxwell.  (BY MS. MENNINGER) Okay.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	MR. EDWARDS: Objection. Asked and answered.  Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) You may answer.  MR. EDWARDS: Answer again.  A Again, I wouldn't say it's untrue. Untrue would mean that I would have lied. And I didn't lie.  This was my best knowledge at the time. And I did my very best to try to pinpoint time periods going back such a long time ago.  It wasn't until I found the facts that I worked at Mar-a-Lago in 2000 that I was able to figure that out.  Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) And approximately when	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	A Q A numbe Q now b A  A old I m Q A	And you're talking about line 4? Line 4.  Paragraph 4 or line 4? Oh, sorry. Number 4, the paragraph r 4.  Okay. And what part of paragraph 4 do you elieve to be untrue? In approximately MR. EDWARDS: Object to the form. You can answer. In approximately 1999 when I was 15 years let Ghislaine Maxwell.  (BY MS. MENNINGER) Okay. I now know that it was 2000, that I was 16	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	MR. EDWARDS: Objection. Asked and answered.  Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) You may answer.  MR. EDWARDS: Answer again.  A Again, I wouldn't say it's untrue. Untrue would mean that I would have lied. And I didn't lie.  This was my best knowledge at the time. And I did my very best to try to pinpoint time periods going back such a long time ago.  It wasn't until I found the facts that I worked at Mar-a-Lago in 2000 that I was able to figure that out.  Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) And approximately when did you learn those facts about the dates you worked	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	A Q A numbe Q now b A  Old I m Q A years o	And you're talking about line 4? Line 4.  Paragraph 4 or line 4? Oh, sorry. Number 4, the paragraph r 4.  Okay. And what part of paragraph 4 do you elieve to be untrue? In approximately MR. EDWARDS: Object to the form. You can answer. In approximately 1999 when I was 15 years let Ghislaine Maxwell.  (BY MS. MENNINGER) Okay. I now know that it was 2000, that I was 16 old when I met Ghislaine Maxwell.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	MR. EDWARDS: Objection. Asked and answered.  Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) You may answer.  MR. EDWARDS: Answer again.  A Again, I wouldn't say it's untrue. Untrue would mean that I would have lied. And I didn't lie.  This was my best knowledge at the time. And I did my very best to try to pinpoint time periods going back such a long time ago.  It wasn't until I found the facts that I worked at Mar-a-Lago in 2000 that I was able to figure that out.  Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) And approximately when did you learn those facts about the dates you worked at Mar-a-Lago?	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	A Q A numbe Q now b A Old I m Q A years o Q penalt	And you're talking about line 4? Line 4.  Paragraph 4 or line 4? Oh, sorry. Number 4, the paragraph r 4.  Okay. And what part of paragraph 4 do you elieve to be untrue? In approximately MR. EDWARDS: Object to the form. You can answer. In approximately 1999 when I was 15 years let Ghislaine Maxwell.  (BY MS. MENNINGER) Okay. I now know that it was 2000, that I was 16 old when I met Ghislaine Maxwell.  So when you signed this document under	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	MR. EDWARDS: Objection. Asked and answered.  Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) You may answer.  MR. EDWARDS: Answer again.  A Again, I wouldn't say it's untrue. Untrue would mean that I would have lied. And I didn't lie.  This was my best knowledge at the time. And I did my very best to try to pinpoint time periods going back such a long time ago.  It wasn't until I found the facts that I worked at Mar-a-Lago in 2000 that I was able to figure that out.  Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) And approximately when did you learn those facts about the dates you worked at Mar-a-Lago?  A I would say it was mid-2015.	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	A Q A numbe Q now b A Old I m Q A years o Q penalt	And you're talking about line 4? Line 4.  Paragraph 4 or line 4? Oh, sorry. Number 4, the paragraph r 4.  Okay. And what part of paragraph 4 do you elieve to be untrue? In approximately MR. EDWARDS: Object to the form. You can answer. In approximately 1999 when I was 15 years set Ghislaine Maxwell.  (BY MS. MENNINGER) Okay. I now know that it was 2000, that I was 16 old when I met Ghislaine Maxwell.  So when you signed this document under ty of perjury stating that it was true, you no	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	MR. EDWARDS: Objection. Asked and answered.  Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) You may answer.  MR. EDWARDS: Answer again.  A Again, I wouldn't say it's untrue. Untrue would mean that I would have lied. And I didn't lie.  This was my best knowledge at the time. And I did my very best to try to pinpoint time periods going back such a long time ago.  It wasn't until I found the facts that I worked at Mar-a-Lago in 2000 that I was able to figure that out.  Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) And approximately when did you learn those facts about the dates you worked at Mar-a-Lago?  A I would say it was mid-2015.  Q Mid-2015 is the first time you became	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A Q A numbe Q now b A A old I m Q A years o Q penalt longer A	And you're talking about line 4?  Line 4.  Paragraph 4 or line 4?  Oh, sorry. Number 4, the paragraph r 4.  Okay. And what part of paragraph 4 do you elieve to be untrue?  In approximately MR. EDWARDS: Object to the form. You can answer.  In approximately 1999 when I was 15 years set Ghislaine Maxwell.  (BY MS. MENNINGER) Okay.  I now know that it was 2000, that I was 16 old when I met Ghislaine Maxwell.  So when you signed this document under ry of perjury stating that it was true, you no	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	MR. EDWARDS: Objection. Asked and answered.  Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) You may answer.  MR. EDWARDS: Answer again.  A Again, I wouldn't say it's untrue. Untrue would mean that I would have lied. And I didn't lie.  This was my best knowledge at the time. And I did my very best to try to pinpoint time periods going back such a long time ago.  It wasn't until I found the facts that I worked at Mar-a-Lago in 2000 that I was able to figure that out.  Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) And approximately when did you learn those facts about the dates you worked at Mar-a-Lago?  A I would say it was mid-2015.  Q Mid-2015 is the first time you became aware of the dates	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A Q A numbe Q now b A  A old I m Q A years o Q penalt longer A how to	And you're talking about line 4?  Line 4.  Paragraph 4 or line 4?  Oh, sorry. Number 4, the paragraph r 4.  Okay. And what part of paragraph 4 do you elieve to be untrue?  In approximately  MR. EDWARDS: Object to the form.  You can answer.  In approximately 1999 when I was 15 years let Ghislaine Maxwell.  (BY MS. MENNINGER) Okay.  I now know that it was 2000, that I was 16 old when I met Ghislaine Maxwell.  So when you signed this document under by of perjury stating that it was true, you no believe that to be true, correct?  It was an honest mistake. We had no idea	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	MR. EDWARDS: Objection. Asked and answered.  Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) You may answer.  MR. EDWARDS: Answer again.  A Again, I wouldn't say it's untrue. Untrue would mean that I would have lied. And I didn't lie.  This was my best knowledge at the time. And I did my very best to try to pinpoint time periods going back such a long time ago.  It wasn't until I found the facts that I worked at Mar-a-Lago in 2000 that I was able to figure that out.  Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) And approximately when did you learn those facts about the dates you worked at Mar-a-Lago?  A I would say it was mid-2015.  Q Mid-2015 is the first time you became aware of the dates  A I don't know the exact	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	A Q A numbe Q now b A  Old I m Q A years c Q penalt longer A how to or anyt	And you're talking about line 4?  Line 4.  Paragraph 4 or line 4?  Oh, sorry. Number 4, the paragraph r 4.  Okay. And what part of paragraph 4 do you elieve to be untrue?  In approximately MR. EDWARDS: Object to the form. You can answer.  In approximately 1999 when I was 15 years et Ghislaine Maxwell.  (BY MS. MENNINGER) Okay.  I now know that it was 2000, that I was 16 old when I met Ghislaine Maxwell.  So when you signed this document under by of perjury stating that it was true, you no believe that to be true, correct?  It was an honest mistake. We had no idea pinpoint without any kind of records or dates	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	MR. EDWARDS: Objection. Asked and answered.  Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) You may answer.  MR. EDWARDS: Answer again.  A Again, I wouldn't say it's untrue. Untrue would mean that I would have lied. And I didn't lie.  This was my best knowledge at the time. And I did my very best to try to pinpoint time periods going back such a long time ago.  It wasn't until I found the facts that I worked at Mar-a-Lago in 2000 that I was able to figure that out.  Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) And approximately when did you learn those facts about the dates you worked at Mar-a-Lago?  A I would say it was mid-2015.  Q Mid-2015 is the first time you became aware of the dates  A I don't know the exact  Q If you could just let me finish.	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A Q A numbee Q now be A Old I m Q A years o Q penalt longer A how to or anyt chrono	And you're talking about line 4?  Line 4.  Paragraph 4 or line 4?  Oh, sorry. Number 4, the paragraph r 4.  Okay. And what part of paragraph 4 do you elieve to be untrue?  In approximately MR. EDWARDS: Object to the form. You can answer.  In approximately 1999 when I was 15 years let Ghislaine Maxwell.  (BY MS. MENNINGER) Okay.  I now know that it was 2000, that I was 16 old when I met Ghislaine Maxwell.  So when you signed this document under ry of perjury stating that it was true, you no believe that to be true, correct?  It was an honest mistake. We had no idea pinpoint without any kind of records or dates thing like that. I was just going back	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	MR. EDWARDS: Objection. Asked and answered.  Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) You may answer.  MR. EDWARDS: Answer again.  A Again, I wouldn't say it's untrue. Untrue would mean that I would have lied. And I didn't lie.  This was my best knowledge at the time. And I did my very best to try to pinpoint time periods going back such a long time ago.  It wasn't until I found the facts that I worked at Mar-a-Lago in 2000 that I was able to figure that out.  Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) And approximately when did you learn those facts about the dates you worked at Mar-a-Lago?  A I would say it was mid-2015.  Q Mid-2015 is the first time you became aware of the dates  A I don't know the exact  Q If you could just let me finish.  A I'm sorry.	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	A Q A numbe Q now b A  A old I m Q A years o Q penalt longer A how to or anyt chrono time th	And you're talking about line 4?  Line 4.  Paragraph 4 or line 4?  Oh, sorry. Number 4, the paragraph r 4.  Okay. And what part of paragraph 4 do you elieve to be untrue?  In approximately MR. EDWARDS: Object to the form. You can answer.  In approximately 1999 when I was 15 years set Ghislaine Maxwell.  (BY MS. MENNINGER) Okay.  I now know that it was 2000, that I was 16 old when I met Ghislaine Maxwell.  So when you signed this document under by of perjury stating that it was true, you no believe that to be true, correct?  It was an honest mistake. We had no idea pinpoint without any kind of records or dates thing like that. I was just going back logically through time. And that's the best	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	MR. EDWARDS: Objection. Asked and answered.  Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) You may answer.  MR. EDWARDS: Answer again.  A Again, I wouldn't say it's untrue. Untrue would mean that I would have lied. And I didn't lie.  This was my best knowledge at the time. And I did my very best to try to pinpoint time periods going back such a long time ago.  It wasn't until I found the facts that I worked at Mar-a-Lago in 2000 that I was able to figure that out.  Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) And approximately when did you learn those facts about the dates you worked at Mar-a-Lago?  A I would say it was mid-2015.  Q Mid-2015 is the first time you became aware of the dates  A I don't know the exact  Q If you could just let me finish.  A I'm sorry.  Q That's all right. Approximately mid-2015	

Page 217 Page 219 flying on a helicopter with Ghislaine Maxwell? 1 please. 1 2 Q (BY MS. MENNINGER) Do you recall seeing a 2 I believe that it was taken out of 3 press article in which Sharon Churcher reported that 3 context. Ghislaine told me that she flew Bill you were on a helicopter with Bill Clinton and 4 Clinton in. And Ghislaine likes to talk a lot of 4 5 Ghislaine Maxwell as the pilot? 5 stuff that sounds fantastical. And whether it's true 6 MR. EDWARDS: Again, I'll let you answer or not, that is what I do recall telling Sharon 6 7 the question once she's looking at the document that 7 Churcher. 8 you're being asked about. 8 So you told Sharon Churcher that Ghislaine 9 MS. MENNINGER: You're not letting her 9 Maxwell is the one who told you that she flew Bill 10 answer a question about whether she recalls a Clinton in the helicopter? 10 11 I told Sharon Churcher that Ghislaine flew particular press statement? 11 12 MR. EDWARDS: I will let her answer every 12 Bill Clinton onto the island, based upon what 13 question about the press statement as long as she 13 Ghislaine had told me. 14 sees the press statement. I'm okay with that. She 14 Not based upon what Bill Clinton had told 15 can answer all of them. you, correct? 15 16 MS. MENNINGER: No, there is a rule of 16 Α Correct. 17 civil procedure that allows you to direct a witness 17 Did you ever ask Sharon Churcher to not to answer a question when there's a claim of 18 18 correct anything that was printed under her name, 19 privilege. 19 concerning your stories to Sharon Churcher? 20 What privilege are you claiming to direct 20 I wasn't given those stories to read 21 her not to answer this question? 21 before they were printed. 22 MR. EDWARDS: I thought that you wanted 22 After they were printed did you read them? 23 accurate answers from this witness. If the --23 I tried to stay away from them. They were 24 MS. MENNINGER: I asked her if she 24 very hard. You have to understand it was a very hard 25 time for me and my husband to have to have this 25 recalled something --Page 218 Page 220 MR. EDWARDS: If the sole purpose is to public -- we didn't think it was going to be this 1 1 2 just to harass her --2 publicly announced and that big. So we turned off 3 MS. MENNINGER: I asked her if she the news and we stopped reading so many things. 3 recalled something --You didn't read the articles about your 4 4 MR. EDWARDS: Then that's just not going stories to Sharon Churcher --5 5 to be what's happening today. I've read some articles --6 6 (BY MS. MENNINGER) All right. So you're 7 7 Let me just finish. You did not read the 8 refusing to answer a question about whether you 8 articles published by Sharon Churcher about your 9 recall a particular press statement -stories to Sharon Churcher? 9 MR. EDWARDS: She's --I have read some articles about what 10 10 11 (BY MS. MENNINGER) -- is that true? Sharon Churcher wrote. And a lot of the stuff that 11 12 MR. EDWARDS: She is not refusing to 12 she writes she takes things from my own mouth and 13 answer any questions. She --13 changes them into her own words as journalists do. 14 I'm not refusing to answer. I just want And I never came back to her and told her 14 to see the article you're talking about so I can be to correct anything. What was done was done. There 15 15 16 clear in my statement. was nothing else I can do. 16 (BY MS. MENNINGER) Do you recall seeing a 17 17 So even if she printed something that were press article written by Sharon Churcher reporting 18 18 untrue you didn't ask her to correct it, correct? that you flew on a helicopter with Bill Clinton and 19 There was things that she printed that 19 20 **Ghislaine Maxwell as the pilot?** really pissed me off, but there was nothing I could 20 21 No, I do not recall reading a press 21 do about it. It's already out there. article saying that I was on a helicopter with Bill She printed things that were untrue, 22 22 Clinton as Ghislaine is the pilot. 23 23 correct? Do you recall telling Sharon Churcher that MR. EDWARDS: Objection to the form. 24 24 you had conversations with Bill Clinton regarding him 25 Mischaracterization.

Page 223 I wouldn't say that they were untrue. I to why I want my client to answer all of these 1 1 2 would just say that she printed them as journalists 2 questions, but I want her to have the fair take your words and turn them into something else. 3 3 opportunity to see this document. (BY MS. MENNINGER) She got it wrong? 4 4 (BY MS. MENNINGER) Did Sharon Churcher MR. EDWARDS: Object to the form. 5 5 print things that you felt were inaccurate? Mischaracterization. 6 MR. EDWARDS: Same objection. Same 6 7 In some ways, yes. 7 instruction. If she sees the document, she's going (BY MS. MENNINGER) Did she print things 8 8 to answer every one of these questions. in her articles that you did not say to her? 9 9 (BY MS. MENNINGER) Did any other reporter MR. EDWARDS: I object and ask that the 10 10 print statements that you believe are inaccurate? 11 witness be given the opportunity to see the document 11 MR. EDWARDS: Same objection. Same 12 so that she can review it and answer that question 12 instruction. 13 accurately. Otherwise she's unable to answer the 13 (BY MS. MENNINGER) Did any reporter print question. I'm not going to allow her to answer. 14 14 statements about Ghislaine Maxwell that were MS. MENNINGER: You know the civil rules 15 inaccurate? 15 16 tell you not to suggest answers to your client. 16 MR. EDWARDS: Same objection. Same 17 (BY MS. MENNINGER) And you understand 17 instruction your lawyer is now directing you to not all of a 18 18 This is harassing. This is harassing a 19 sudden remember what your answer is. That's what 19 sexual abuse victim. And all I'm asking is for 20 he's suggesting that you say. So you're not supposed 20 fairness, that we just let her see the document so 21 to listen to him suggest that to you. You're 21 she can answer this. 22 supposed to tell me from your memory. 22 MS. MENNINGER: Mr. Edwards, please stop MR. EDWARDS: That is not what I'm --23 23 saying anything other than an objection, what the 24 (BY MS. MENNINGER) Did you --24 basis is, or instructing your client not to answer. 25 MR. EDWARDS: That's not what I'm doing. 25 MR. EDWARDS: I will do that. Page 222 Page 224 You don't get to just talk over me and 1 MS. MENNINGER: That's what the Federal 1 Rules of Civil Procedure provide. 2 tell my client when not to listen to me. All you 2 3 have to do to get answers is show her the document 3 MR. EDWARDS: I hear you. They also provide for fairness and civility. And all I'm you're talking about, and I'll let her answer every 4 4 question. I don't know why we're so scared of the asking, very calmly, is for her to see this. 5 5 actual documents. MS. MENNINGER: Mr. Edwards, this is not 6 6 7 your deposition. I'm asking your client what she 7 MS. MENNINGER: I don't know why you're remembers. If she doesn't want to talk about what 8 scared of your client's recollection, Mr. Edwards. 8 she remembers, then let her not answer. But you 9 But anyway --9 MR. EDWARDS: Why would you do this to 10 cannot instruct her not to answer unless there's a 10 her? 11 privilege. 11 (BY MS. MENNINGER) Did Sharon Churcher What privilege --12 12 MR. EDWARDS: I am instructing her not to 13 print things that you did not say? 13 MR. EDWARDS: I'm going to instruct my 14 answer. 14 15 client not to answer unless you give her what it is 15 (BY MS. MENNINGER) All right. You are 16 that you're talking about that was printed. And she 16 refusing to answer questions about whether statements to the press about Ghislaine Maxwell attributed to 17 will tell you the answer, the accurate answer to your 17 you were inaccurate? 18 question. Just without the document to refresh her 18 MR. EDWARDS: She's not refusing not to 19 recollection and see it, she's not going to answer 19 20 the question. 20 answer. 21 0 (BY MS. MENNINGER) Did Sharon Churcher 21 Α You are refusing to show me these 22 documents so I could answer properly. I would give 22 print things that you did not say? MR. EDWARDS: Same objection. Same you an answer if you were to show me some documents. 23 23 (BY MS. MENNINGER) You can't say without 24 24 instruction not to answer. 25 25 looking at a document whether the press attributed to I think I've made a very clear record as

		Daga 22E			Page 0 01 0
1	vou is	Page 225 accurate or inaccurate?	1	Α	Page 227
1			1		Single sheets.
2	A	Please show me the document.	2	Q	And did you write a long document or a
3	Q	You can't say from the top of your head	3		document? What was it?
4		er any inaccurate statement has been attributed	4	A	I can't recall how long the document was,
5	-	in the press?	5		ould say it would be a few pages.
6	Α	Please show me a document and I will tell	6	Q	And other than asking you to write
7	you.		7		ver you remember about Prince Andrew, did she
8	Q	Are you refusing to answer my questions	8		ou any other directions about what you should
9		your knowledge of whether inaccurate statements	9	write?	
10	have b	een attributed to you in the press?	10	Α	She was interested in two things, really.
11	Α	Are you refusing to give me the documents	11	How Ep	ostein got away with so many counts of child
12	to look at?		12	trafficking for sex and how Prince Andrew was	
13	Q	Are you refusing to answer the question?	13	involve	d in it. Those were her two main inquiries.
14	Α	I am refusing to answer the question based	14	Q	What did she ask you to write?
15	upon th	ne fact that you are not being fair enough to	15	Α	She asked me to write about Prince Andrew.
16	let me	see the document in order to give you an	16	Q	Did she tell you to put it in your own
17	honest	answer.	17	handwriting?	
18	Q	Ms. Giuffre	18	Α	No, she just asked me to write down what I
19	Α	Yes.	19	can rer	nember.
20	Q	we are talking about press that has	20	Q	Did you give her everything that you
21	been p	published on the Internet, correct?	21	wrote	?
22	A	Yes.	22	Α	Did I give her the whole entire pages that
23	Q	Do you have access to the Internet?	23	I wrote	
24	A	Yes.	24	0	Yes.
25	Q	Have you looked on the Internet and read	25	A	Yeah, I wrote pages for her specifically.
-		Page 226			Page 228
		raye 220			
1	article	3	1	0	
1		es that attribute statements to you about	1 2	<b>Q</b> A	In your own handwriting?
2	Ghisla	es that attribute statements to you about ine Maxwell?	2	Α	In your own handwriting? In my own handwriting.
2	<b>Ghisla</b> A	es that attribute statements to you about nine Maxwell?  Yes.	2	А <b>Q</b>	In your own handwriting? In my own handwriting. And what you wrote, was that true?
2 3 4	Ghisla A Q	es that attribute statements to you about ine Maxwell?  Yes.  Do you know any statement that has been	2 3 4	A <b>Q</b> A	In your own handwriting? In my own handwriting. And what you wrote, was that true? Yes.
2 3 4 5	Ghisla A Q attrib	es that attribute statements to you about nine Maxwell?  Yes.  Do you know any statement that has been uted to you in a press article on the Internet	2 3 4 5	A <b>Q</b> A <b>Q</b>	In your own handwriting? In my own handwriting. And what you wrote, was that true? Yes. And did you get paid for those pieces of
2 3 4 5	Ghisla A Q attrib	es that attribute statements to you about ine Maxwell?  Yes.  Do you know any statement that has been uted to you in a press article on the Internet Ghislaine Maxwell that is untrue?	2 3 4 5	A Q A Q paper	In your own handwriting? In my own handwriting. And what you wrote, was that true? Yes. And did you get paid for those pieces of
2 3 4 5 6	Ghisla A Q attrib about	es that attribute statements to you about sine Maxwell? Yes. Do you know any statement that has been uted to you in a press article on the Internet Ghislaine Maxwell that is untrue?  MR. EDWARDS: Same objection. Same	2 3 4 5 6	A Q A Q paper	In your own handwriting? In my own handwriting. And what you wrote, was that true? Yes. And did you get paid for those pieces of? Not for the papers, I don't believe.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	A Q attribution about	es that attribute statements to you about nine Maxwell?  Yes.  Do you know any statement that has been uted to you in a press article on the Internet Ghislaine Maxwell that is untrue?  MR. EDWARDS: Same objection. Same etion.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	A Q A Q paper A Q	In your own handwriting? In my own handwriting. And what you wrote, was that true? Yes. And did you get paid for those pieces of? Not for the papers, I don't believe. Okay. Have you gotten paid when they've
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	A Q attribution about instruction A	res that attribute statements to you about sine Maxwell? Yes.  Do you know any statement that has been uted to you in a press article on the Internet Ghislaine Maxwell that is untrue?  MR. EDWARDS: Same objection. Same stion.  Please show me a specific document.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	A Q A Q paper A Q been i	In your own handwriting? In my own handwriting. And what you wrote, was that true? Yes. And did you get paid for those pieces of? Not for the papers, I don't believe. Okay. Have you gotten paid when they've reprinted?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	A Q attribu about instruct A Q	es that attribute statements to you about sine Maxwell? Yes. Do you know any statement that has been uted to you in a press article on the Internet Ghislaine Maxwell that is untrue? MR. EDWARDS: Same objection. Same stion. Please show me a specific document. (BY MS. MENNINGER) Do you know of any	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	A Q A Q paper A Q been t	In your own handwriting? In my own handwriting. And what you wrote, was that true? Yes. And did you get paid for those pieces of? Not for the papers, I don't believe. Okay. Have you gotten paid when they've reprinted? No.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	A Q attribution about instruction A Q such s	es that attribute statements to you about nine Maxwell?  Yes.  Do you know any statement that has been uted to you in a press article on the Internet Ghislaine Maxwell that is untrue?  MR. EDWARDS: Same objection. Same stion.  Please show me a specific document.  (BY MS. MENNINGER) Do you know of any statement about Ghislaine Maxwell attributed to	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	A Q A Q paper A Q been t A	In your own handwriting? In my own handwriting. And what you wrote, was that true? Yes. And did you get paid for those pieces of? Not for the papers, I don't believe. Okay. Have you gotten paid when they've reprinted? No. Have you negotiated any deal with Radar
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	A Q attributions about instruction A Q such s you by	es that attribute statements to you about sine Maxwell?  Yes.  Do you know any statement that has been uted to you in a press article on the Internet Ghislaine Maxwell that is untrue?  MR. EDWARDS: Same objection. Same stion.  Please show me a specific document.  (BY MS. MENNINGER) Do you know of any statement about Ghislaine Maxwell attributed to y the press that is inaccurate?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	A Q A Q paper A Q been r A Q	In your own handwriting? In my own handwriting. And what you wrote, was that true? Yes. And did you get paid for those pieces of? Not for the papers, I don't believe. Okay. Have you gotten paid when they've reprinted? No. Have you negotiated any deal with Radar
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	A Q attribution about instruction A Q such s you by	res that attribute statements to you about sine Maxwell?  Yes.  Do you know any statement that has been uted to you in a press article on the Internet Ghislaine Maxwell that is untrue?  MR. EDWARDS: Same objection. Same stion.  Please show me a specific document.  (BY MS. MENNINGER) Do you know of any statement about Ghislaine Maxwell attributed to y the press that is inaccurate?  If you could please show me a specific	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	A Q A Q paper A Q been i A Q Online	In your own handwriting? In my own handwriting. And what you wrote, was that true? Yes. And did you get paid for those pieces of? Not for the papers, I don't believe. Okay. Have you gotten paid when they've reprinted? No. Have you negotiated any deal with Radar of the papers. No.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	A Q such s you by A docum	res that attribute statements to you about sine Maxwell? Yes.  Do you know any statement that has been uted to you in a press article on the Internet Ghislaine Maxwell that is untrue?  MR. EDWARDS: Same objection. Same stion.  Please show me a specific document. (BY MS. MENNINGER) Do you know of any statement about Ghislaine Maxwell attributed to y the press that is inaccurate?  If you could please show me a specific sent.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	A Q paper A Q been r A Q Online A Q	In your own handwriting? In my own handwriting. And what you wrote, was that true? Yes. And did you get paid for those pieces of? Not for the papers, I don't believe. Okay. Have you gotten paid when they've reprinted? No. Have you negotiated any deal with Radar or the syou negotiated any deal with Sharon
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	A Q attribution about instruction A Q such s you by A documen Q	res that attribute statements to you about sine Maxwell? Yes.  Do you know any statement that has been uted to you in a press article on the Internet Ghislaine Maxwell that is untrue? MR. EDWARDS: Same objection. Same stion. Please show me a specific document. (BY MS. MENNINGER) Do you know of any statement about Ghislaine Maxwell attributed to y the press that is inaccurate?  If you could please show me a specific sent. Tell me what Sharon Churcher asked you to	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	A Q paper A Q been a A Q Church	In your own handwriting? In my own handwriting. And what you wrote, was that true? Yes. And did you get paid for those pieces of? Not for the papers, I don't believe. Okay. Have you gotten paid when they've reprinted? No. Have you negotiated any deal with Radar ?? No. Have you negotiated any deal with Sharon ther for the purpose of publishing those pieces
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	A Q attribution about instruction A Q such s you by A documen Q	res that attribute statements to you about sine Maxwell?  Yes.  Do you know any statement that has been uted to you in a press article on the Internet Ghislaine Maxwell that is untrue?  MR. EDWARDS: Same objection. Same stion.  Please show me a specific document.  (BY MS. MENNINGER) Do you know of any statement about Ghislaine Maxwell attributed to you the press that is inaccurate?  If you could please show me a specific sent.  Tell me what Sharon Churcher asked you to for her.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	A Q paper A Q been r A Q Online A Q	In your own handwriting? In my own handwriting. And what you wrote, was that true? Yes. And did you get paid for those pieces of? Not for the papers, I don't believe. Okay. Have you gotten paid when they've reprinted? No. Have you negotiated any deal with Radar ?? No. Have you negotiated any deal with Sharon ther for the purpose of publishing those pieces
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	A Q attribution about instruction A Q such s you by A documen Q	res that attribute statements to you about sine Maxwell? Yes.  Do you know any statement that has been uted to you in a press article on the Internet Ghislaine Maxwell that is untrue? MR. EDWARDS: Same objection. Same stion. Please show me a specific document. (BY MS. MENNINGER) Do you know of any statement about Ghislaine Maxwell attributed to y the press that is inaccurate?  If you could please show me a specific sent. Tell me what Sharon Churcher asked you to	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	A Q paper A Q been a A Q Church	In your own handwriting? In my own handwriting. And what you wrote, was that true? Yes. And did you get paid for those pieces of? Not for the papers, I don't believe. Okay. Have you gotten paid when they've reprinted? No. Have you negotiated any deal with Radar ?? No. Have you negotiated any deal with Sharon ther for the purpose of publishing those pieces
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	A Q attribution about instruction A Q such s you by A documen Q write A	res that attribute statements to you about sine Maxwell?  Yes.  Do you know any statement that has been uted to you in a press article on the Internet Ghislaine Maxwell that is untrue?  MR. EDWARDS: Same objection. Same stion.  Please show me a specific document.  (BY MS. MENNINGER) Do you know of any statement about Ghislaine Maxwell attributed to you the press that is inaccurate?  If you could please show me a specific sent.  Tell me what Sharon Churcher asked you to for her.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	A Q A Q paper A Q been r A Q Churcl of pap	In your own handwriting? In my own handwriting. And what you wrote, was that true? Yes. And did you get paid for those pieces of? Not for the papers, I don't believe. Okay. Have you gotten paid when they've reprinted? No. Have you negotiated any deal with Radar se? No. Have you negotiated any deal with Sharon ther for the purpose of publishing those pieces per?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	A Q attribution about instruction A Q such s you by A documen Q write A	res that attribute statements to you about sine Maxwell? Yes.  Do you know any statement that has been uted to you in a press article on the Internet Ghislaine Maxwell that is untrue?  MR. EDWARDS: Same objection. Same stion.  Please show me a specific document.  (BY MS. MENNINGER) Do you know of any statement about Ghislaine Maxwell attributed to y the press that is inaccurate?  If you could please show me a specific ent.  Tell me what Sharon Churcher asked you to for her.  Any knowledge that I had about my time	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	A Q A Q paper A Q been r A Q Churcl of pap	In your own handwriting? In my own handwriting. And what you wrote, was that true? Yes. And did you get paid for those pieces of? Not for the papers, I don't believe. Okay. Have you gotten paid when they've reprinted? No. Have you negotiated any deal with Radar ?? No. Have you negotiated any deal with Sharon ther for the purpose of publishing those pieces pieces piece? Not those pieces of paper.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A Q attribution about instruction A Q such s you by A documen Q write A with Properties A	es that attribute statements to you about fine Maxwell?  Yes.  Do you know any statement that has been uted to you in a press article on the Internet Ghislaine Maxwell that is untrue?  MR. EDWARDS: Same objection. Same stion.  Please show me a specific document.  (BY MS. MENNINGER) Do you know of any statement about Ghislaine Maxwell attributed to y the press that is inaccurate?  If you could please show me a specific ent.  Tell me what Sharon Churcher asked you to for her.  Any knowledge that I had about my time rince Andrew.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A Q A Q paper A Q been r A Q Churcl of pap	In your own handwriting? In my own handwriting. And what you wrote, was that true? Yes. And did you get paid for those pieces of? Not for the papers, I don't believe. Okay. Have you gotten paid when they've reprinted? No. Have you negotiated any deal with Radar se? No. Have you negotiated any deal with Sharon ther for the purpose of publishing those pieces ter? Not those pieces of paper. When did you write those pieces of paper?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A Q attribution about instruction A Q such s you by A documed A with Property Q	res that attribute statements to you about sine Maxwell? Yes.  Do you know any statement that has been uted to you in a press article on the Internet Ghislaine Maxwell that is untrue?  MR. EDWARDS: Same objection. Same stion.  Please show me a specific document. (BY MS. MENNINGER) Do you know of any statement about Ghislaine Maxwell attributed to y the press that is inaccurate?  If you could please show me a specific sent.  Tell me what Sharon Churcher asked you to for her.  Any knowledge that I had about my time rince Andrew.  And did you write it?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A Q A Q paper A Q been r A Q Online A Q Churcl of pap A Q	In your own handwriting? In my own handwriting. And what you wrote, was that true? Yes. And did you get paid for those pieces of? Not for the papers, I don't believe. Okay. Have you gotten paid when they've reprinted? No. Have you negotiated any deal with Radar or the purpose of publishing those pieces er? Not those pieces of paper. When did you write those pieces of paper? MR. EDWARDS: Object to the form.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	A Q attribution about instruction A Q such s you by A documed A with Property A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A	res that attribute statements to you about sine Maxwell? Yes.  Do you know any statement that has been uted to you in a press article on the Internet Ghislaine Maxwell that is untrue? MR. EDWARDS: Same objection. Same stion. Please show me a specific document. (BY MS. MENNINGER) Do you know of any statement about Ghislaine Maxwell attributed to y the press that is inaccurate? If you could please show me a specific sent.  Tell me what Sharon Churcher asked you to for her. Any knowledge that I had about my time rince Andrew. And did you write it? Um-hum.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	A Q A Q paper A Q been r A Q Churcl of pap A Q A Q	In your own handwriting? In my own handwriting. And what you wrote, was that true? Yes. And did you get paid for those pieces of? Not for the papers, I don't believe. Okay. Have you gotten paid when they've reprinted? No. Have you negotiated any deal with Radar? No. Have you negotiated any deal with Sharon her for the purpose of publishing those pieces piece? Not those pieces of paper. When did you write those pieces of paper? MR. EDWARDS: Object to the form. A week before she came out.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A Q attribution of the control of th	es that attribute statements to you about sine Maxwell? Yes. Do you know any statement that has been uted to you in a press article on the Internet Ghislaine Maxwell that is untrue? MR. EDWARDS: Same objection. Same stion. Please show me a specific document. (BY MS. MENNINGER) Do you know of any statement about Ghislaine Maxwell attributed to y the press that is inaccurate? If you could please show me a specific sent. Tell me what Sharon Churcher asked you to for her. Any knowledge that I had about my time rince Andrew. And did you write it? Um-hum. What did you write it in or on?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A Q A Q paper A Q been r A Q Churcl of pap A Q A Q	In your own handwriting? In my own handwriting. And what you wrote, was that true? Yes. And did you get paid for those pieces of? Not for the papers, I don't believe. Okay. Have you gotten paid when they've reprinted? No. Have you negotiated any deal with Radar se? No. Have you negotiated any deal with Sharon ther for the purpose of publishing those pieces ter? Not those pieces of paper. When did you write those pieces of paper? MR. EDWARDS: Object to the form. A week before she came out. (BY MS. MENNINGER) And when did you give
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	A Q such s you by A docume A with Po Q A	res that attribute statements to you about sine Maxwell? Yes.  Do you know any statement that has been uted to you in a press article on the Internet Ghislaine Maxwell that is untrue?  MR. EDWARDS: Same objection. Same stion.  Please show me a specific document.  (BY MS. MENNINGER) Do you know of any statement about Ghislaine Maxwell attributed to y the press that is inaccurate?  If you could please show me a specific sent.  Tell me what Sharon Churcher asked you to for her.  Any knowledge that I had about my time rince Andrew.  And did you write it?  Um-hum.  What did you write it in or on?  Paper.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	A Q A Q paper A Q been r A Q Churcl of pap A Q them	In your own handwriting? In my own handwriting. And what you wrote, was that true? Yes. And did you get paid for those pieces of? Not for the papers, I don't believe. Okay. Have you gotten paid when they've reprinted? No. Have you negotiated any deal with Radar re? No. Have you negotiated any deal with Sharon ther for the purpose of publishing those pieces rer? Not those pieces of paper. When did you write those pieces of paper? MR. EDWARDS: Object to the form. A week before she came out. (BY MS. MENNINGER) And when did you give to her?