

**United States District Court
Southern District of New York**

Virginia L. Giuffre,

Plaintiff,

Case No.: 15-cv-07433-RWS

v.

Ghislaine Maxwell,

Defendant.

**PLAINTIFF MS. GIUFFRE'S RESPONSE TO DEFENDANT'S MOTION TO
EXCLUDE EVIDENCE PURSUANT TO FED. R. EVID. 404(B)**

Sigrid McCawley
BOIES SCHILLER FLEXNER LLP
401 E. Las Olas Blvd., Suite 1200
Ft. Lauderdale, FL 33301
(954) 356-0011

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

	<u>Page</u>
<u>Cases</u>	
<i>Blind-Doan v. Sanders</i> , 291 F.3d 1079 (9th Cir. 2002).....	24
<i>Dosier v. Miami Valley Broadcasting Corp.</i> , 656 F.2d 12954 (9th Cir. 1981).....	17
<i>Huddleston v U.S.</i> , 485 U.S. 681 (1988)	16
<i>Ismail v. Cohen</i> , 706 F. Supp. 243 (S.D.N.Y.1989).....	20
<i>Jane Does v. United States</i> , No. 9:08-cv-80736-KAM (S.D. Fla. Dec. 30, 2014)	3
<i>McMahon v. Valenzuela</i> , 2015 WL 7573620, Case No. 2:14 CV-02085 CAS (C.D. Ca. Nov. 25, 2015).....	23
<i>Morris v. Eversley</i> , 2004 WL 856301, No. 00 Civ. 8166 DC (S.D.N.Y. Apr. 20, 2004)	23
<i>Perry v. Ethan Allen, Inc.</i> , 115 F.3d 143 (2d Cir.1997)	24
<i>Roshan v. Fard</i> , 705 F.2d 102 (4th Cir. 1983).....	19
<i>United States v. Abu-Jihaad</i> , 630 F.3d 102 (2d Cir. 2010)	16
<i>United States v. Barnason</i> , 852 F. Supp. 2d 367 (S.D.N.Y. 2012).....	22, 23
<i>United States v. Carboni</i> , 204 F.3d 39 (2d Cir.2000).....	15, 21
<i>United States v. Diaz</i> , 176 F.3d 52 (2d Cir. 1999).....	12, 18
<i>United States v. Figueroa</i> , 618 F.2d 934 (2d Cir.1980)	24

<i>United States v. Gilan</i> , 967 F.2d 776 (2d Cir.1992)	25
<i>United States v. Hughes</i> , 310 F.3d 557 (2002).....	17
<i>United States v. Jacobs</i> , 44 F.3d 1219 (2d Cir. 1995)	19
<i>United States v. Jobson</i> , 102 F.3d 214 (6th Cir. 1996)	19, 20
<i>United States v. Larson</i> , 112 F.3d 600 (2d Cir. 1997).....	22
<i>United States v. Levy</i> , 731 F.2d 997 (2d Cir. 1984).....	17
<i>United States v. Ozsusamlar</i> , 428 F. Supp. 2d 161 (S.D.N.Y.2006).....	24
<i>United States v. Pipola</i> , 83 F.3d 556 (2d Cir.1996)	17
<i>United States v. Robinson</i> , 702 F.3d 22 (2d Cir. 2012).....	15, 25
<i>United States v. Roldan–Zapata</i> , 916 F.2d 795 (2d Cir.1990)	25
<i>United States v. Rosa</i> , 11 F.3d 315 (2d Cir.1993)	18
<i>United States v. Senffner</i> , 280 F.3d 755 (7th Cir. 2002)	19
<i>United States v. Serang</i> , 156 F.3d 910 (9th Cir. 1998).....	20
<i>United States v. Taylor</i> , 92 F.3d 1313 (2d Cir.1996).....	16

Rules

Fed. R. Evid. 401	15
Fed. R. Evid. 402	15
Fed. R. Evid. 403	22, 24

Fed. R. Evid. 404(b).....*passim*

Fed. R. Evid. 404(b)(1)..... 17

Fed. R. Evid. 404(b)(2)..... 17

Fed. R. Evid. 413-415 22

Fed. R. Evid. 415*passim*

A horizontal bar chart consisting of 18 bars. The bars are arranged in a single column. Most bars are black, but two bars are light gray. The bars vary in length, with the longest bar being the 10th bar from the top and the shortest being the 1st and 18th bars. The bars are arranged in a single column, with the longest bar in the middle and the shortest at the top and bottom.

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

¹ Each of the bullet points below represent a different witness who will testify.

- [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[illegible]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

<div>[REDACTED]</div>	<div>[REDACTED]</div>
<div>[REDACTED]</div>	<div>[REDACTED]</div>
<div>[REDACTED]</div>	<div>[REDACTED]</div>
<div>[REDACTED]</div>	<div>[REDACTED]</div>

<div data-bbox="186 856 446 1081"></div>	
<div data-bbox="186 1262 418 1413"></div>	
<div data-bbox="186 1612 422 1764"></div>	

<div></div>	<div></div>
<div></div>	<div></div>
<div></div>	<div></div>
<div></div>	<div></div>
<div></div>	<div></div>

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

A horizontal bar chart consisting of 20 bars. The bars are arranged in a single column. Most bars are black, but there are three light gray bars. The bars vary in length, with some being very long (nearly the full width of the chart) and others being much shorter. The bars are positioned at regular intervals vertically. The first bar is black and is the longest. The second bar is black and is slightly shorter. The third bar is black and is shorter. The fourth bar is black and is the longest. The fifth bar is black and is shorter. The sixth bar is black and is the longest. The seventh bar is black and is shorter. The eighth bar is black and is the longest. The ninth bar is black and is shorter. The tenth bar is black and is the longest. The eleventh bar is black and is shorter. The twelfth bar is black and is the longest. The thirteenth bar is black and is shorter. The fourteenth bar is black and is the longest. The fifteenth bar is black and is shorter. The sixteenth bar is black and is the longest. The seventeenth bar is black and is shorter. The eighteenth bar is black and is the longest. The nineteenth bar is black and is shorter. The twentieth bar is black and is the longest.

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

Bar Index	Color	Approximate Length (%)
1	Gray	5
2	Black	95
3	Black	100
4	Black	100
5	Black	90
6	Black	95
7	Black	100
8	Black	90
9	Black	95
10	Black	100
11	Black	95
12	Black	100
13	Black	95
14	Black	100
15	Black	10

Category	Percentage
1	10%
2	90%
3	95%
4	98%
5	99%
6	99.5%
7	99.8%
8	99.9%
9	99.95%
10	99.99%

[illegible]

[illegible]

A horizontal bar chart consisting of 20 bars. The bars are arranged in a non-sequential order. Most bars are black, but two bars are light gray. The bars vary in length, with the longest bar being the 10th bar from the top and the shortest being the 19th bar from the top. The bars are arranged in a roughly descending order of length, with some exceptions.

Bar Index (from top)	Bar Color	Approximate Length (relative to longest bar)
1	Black	0.95
2	Black	0.98
3	Black	0.65
4	Light Gray	0.05
5	Black	0.90
6	Black	0.95
7	Black	1.00
8	Black	0.98
9	Black	0.99
10	Black	1.00
11	Black	0.02
12	Light Gray	0.05
13	Black	0.95
14	Black	0.98
15	Black	0.92
16	Black	1.00
17	Black	1.00
18	Black	0.98
19	Black	0.01
20	Black	0.85

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

² The only evidence this Court excluded was evidence of Barnason's prior conviction that dealt with vastly different facts including his assault of a young child that came to meet Barnason's daughter to trade stickers and another incident where he played "doctor" with his daughter's young friends. *Id.* at 376. This Court excluded that evidence because the assaults were vastly different than the assaults on the tenants in the building. *Id.* at 377.

A horizontal bar chart titled 'Percentage of respondents who believe that the current administration is responsible for the current state of the world'. The chart displays data for two main categories: 'Age' and 'Gender'. Each category is further divided into sub-groups. The bars are color-coded: blue for 'Total', red for 'Dem/Lean Dem', green for 'Rep/Lean Rep', and grey for 'Other'. The y-axis represents the percentage of respondents, ranging from 0% to 100% in 10% increments. The x-axis represents the percentage of respondents who believe the current administration is responsible for the current state of the world.

Category	Sub-category	Total (%)	Dem/Lean Dem (%)	Rep/Lean Rep (%)	Other (%)
Age	18-29	78	82	75	80
	30-49	72	75	68	70
	50-69	65	68	60	65
	70+	58	60	52	55
	All	68	70	62	65
Gender	Male	62	65	55	60
	Female	75	78	68	72
	Non-binary	68	70	60	65
	Trans	60	62	52	55
	All	68	70	62	65

³ Of course, other reasons may develop at trial for the admissibility of this evidence, but the Court can make a pre-trial ruling based upon applicable law that applies at this stage of proceedings.

A horizontal bar chart consisting of 15 bars. The bars are arranged in a descending order of length from top to bottom. Most bars are black, but two bars are light gray. The first bar is black and is the longest. The second bar is black and is slightly shorter than the first. The third bar is black and is shorter than the second. The fourth bar is black and is shorter than the third. The fifth bar is black and is shorter than the fourth. The sixth bar is black and is shorter than the fifth. The seventh bar is black and is shorter than the sixth. The eighth bar is black and is shorter than the seventh. The ninth bar is black and is shorter than the eighth. The tenth bar is light gray and is shorter than the ninth. The eleventh bar is black and is shorter than the tenth. The twelfth bar is black and is shorter than the eleventh. The thirteenth bar is black and is shorter than the twelfth. The fourteenth bar is black and is shorter than the thirteenth. The fifteenth bar is black and is the shortest.

CONCLUSION

For all of the foregoing reasons, Ms. Giuffre respectfully requests that the Court deny Defendant's motion in limine and permit her to introduce all evidence concerning Defendant's participation in her and Epstein's sexual abuse of females, and all evidence concerning Defendant's participation and role in her and Epstein's sex trafficking organization.

Dated: March 17, 2017

Respectfully Submitted,

BOIES SCHILLER FLEXNER LLP

By: /s/ Sigrid McCawley
Sigrid McCawley (Pro Hac Vice)
Boies Schiller Flexner LLP
401 E. Las Olas Blvd., Suite 1200
Ft. Lauderdale, FL 33301
(954) 356-0011

David Boies
Boies Schiller Flexner LLP
333 Main Street
Armonk, NY 10504

Bradley J. Edwards (Pro Hac Vice)
FARMER, JAFFE, WEISSING,
EDWARDS, FISTOS & LEHRMAN, P.L.
425 North Andrews Avenue, Suite 2
Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33301
(954) 524-2820

Paul G. Cassell (Pro Hac Vice)
S.J. Quinney College of Law
University of Utah
383 University St.
Salt Lake City, UT 84112
(801) 585-5202⁴

⁴ This daytime business address is provided for identification and correspondence purposes only and is not intended to imply institutional endorsement by the University of Utah for this private representation.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that on March 17, 2017, I electronically filed the foregoing document with the Clerk of Court by using the CM/ECF system. I also certify that the foregoing document is being served this day on the individuals identified below via transmission of Notices of Electronic Filing generated by CM/ECF.

Laura A. Menninger, Esq.
Jeffrey Pagliuca, Esq.
HADDON, MORGAN & FOREMAN, P.C.
150 East 10th Avenue
Denver, Colorado 80203
Tel: (303) 831-7364
Fax: (303) 832-2628
Email: lmenninger@hmflaw.com
jpagliuca@hmflaw.com

/s/ Sigrid S. McCawley
Sigrid S. McCawley