



EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS
COUR EUROPÉENNE DES DROITS DE L'HOMME

FIRST SECTION

CASE OF PETERMAN AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA

(Applications nos. 51678/15 and 51 others – see appended list)

JUDGMENT

STRASBOURG

26 October 2023

This judgment is final but it may be subject to editorial revision.

In the case of Peterman and Others v. Russia,

The European Court of Human Rights (First Section), sitting as a Committee composed of:

Péter Paczolay, *President*,

Gilberto Felici,

Raffaele Sabato, *judges*,

and Viktoriya Maradudina, *Acting Deputy Section Registrar*,

Having deliberated in private on 5 October 2023,

Delivers the following judgment, which was adopted on that date:

PROCEDURE

1. The case originated in applications against Russia lodged with the Court under Article 34 of the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (“the Convention”) on the various dates indicated in the appended table.

2. The Russian Government (“the Government”) were given notice of the applications.

THE FACTS

3. The list of applicants and the relevant details of the applications are set out in the appended table.

4. The applicants complained of the inadequate conditions of detention during their transport. Some applicants also raised other complaints under the provisions of the Convention.

THE LAW

I. JOINDER OF THE APPLICATIONS

5. Having regard to the similar subject matter of the applications, the Court finds it appropriate to examine them jointly in a single judgment.

II. JURISDICTION

6. The Court observes that the facts giving rise to the alleged violations of the Convention occurred prior to 16 September 2022, the date on which the Russian Federation ceased to be a party to the Convention. The Court therefore decides that it has jurisdiction to examine the present applications (see *Fedotova and Others v. Russia* [GC], nos. 40792/10 and 2 others, §§ 68-73, 17 January 2023).

III. ALLEGED VIOLATION OF ARTICLE 3 OF THE CONVENTION

7. The applicants complained principally of the inadequate conditions of detention during their transport. They relied on Article 3 of the Convention, which reads as follows:

“No one shall be subjected to torture or to inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment.”

8. The Court notes that the applicants were detained in poor conditions during transport. The details of the applicants’ detention are indicated in the appended table. The Court refers to the principles established in its case-law regarding cramped and defective conditions during the transit of prisoners (see *Tomov and Others v. Russia*, nos. 18255/10 and 5 others, §§ 124-27, 9 April 2019). It reiterates in particular that a strong presumption of a violation arises when detainees are transported in conveyances offering less than 0.5 square metres of space per person, regardless of whether such cramped conditions result from an excessive number of detainees being transported together or from the restrictive design of compartments (*ibid.*, § 125). As regards longer journeys, factors such as a failure to arrange an individual sleeping place for each detainee or to secure an adequate supply of drinking water and food or access to the toilet seriously aggravate the situation of prisoners during transfers and are indicative of a violation of Article 3 (*ibid.*, § 127).

9. In the leading case of *Tomov and Others* (cited above), the Court already found a violation in respect of issues similar to those in the present case.

10. Having examined all the material submitted to it, the Court has not found any fact or argument capable of persuading it to reach a different conclusion on the admissibility and merits of these complaints. Having regard to its case-law on the subject, the Court considers that in the instant case the applicants’ conditions of detention during their transport were inadequate.

11. These complaints are therefore admissible and disclose a breach of Article 3 of the Convention.

IV. OTHER ALLEGED VIOLATIONS UNDER WELL-ESTABLISHED CASE-LAW

12. Some applicants submitted other complaints which also raised issues under the Convention, given the relevant well-established case-law of the Court (see appended table). These complaints are not manifestly ill-founded within the meaning of Article 35 § 3 (a) of the Convention, nor are they inadmissible on any other ground. Accordingly, they must be declared admissible. Having examined all the material before it, the Court concludes that they also disclose violations of the Convention in the light of its well-established case-law (see *Idalov v. Russia* [GC], no. 5826/03,

§§ 154-58, 22 May 2012, concerning excessive length of judicial review of pre-trial detention; *Svinarenko and Slyadnev v. Russia* [GC], nos. 32541/08 and 43441/08, ECHR 2014 (extracts), as regards placement in a metal cage during court hearings, *Tomov and Others*, cited above, §§ 92-156, concerning the lack of an effective remedy to complain about poor conditions of detention during transport; *Gorlov and Others v. Russia*, nos. 27057/06 and 2 others, 2 July 2019, concerning permanent video surveillance of detainees and the lack of an effective remedy in that respect; *Dirdizov v. Russia*, no. 41461/10, §§ 101-11, 27 November 2012, concerning the excessive length of pre-trial detention; *Sergey Babushkin v. Russia*, no. 5993/08, 28 November 2013, and *Ananyev and Others v. Russia*, nos. 42525/07 and 60800/08, 10 January 2012, related to conditions of pre-trial and post-conviction detention; *Andrey Smirnov v. Russia*, no. 43149/10, 13 February 2018, *Resin v. Russia*, no. 9348/14, 18 December 2018, *Chaldayev v. Russia*, no. 33172/16, 28 May 2019, *Pshibiyev and Berov v. Russia*, no. 63748/13, 9 June 2020, and *Mukhametov and Others v. Russia*, nos. 53404/18 and 3 others, 14 December 2021, concerning various restrictions on family visits in pre-trial detention facilities; *Yevdokimov and Others v. Russia*, nos. 27236/05 and 10 others, §§ 17-53, 16 February 2016, concerning domestic courts' refusal to bring detainees to hearings in civil cases; and *Anchugov and Gladkov v. Russia*, nos. 11157/04 and 15162/05, 4 July 2013, concerning prisoners' right to vote in the choice of the legislature and the lack of an effective remedy in that respect).

13. In view of the above findings, the Court considers that there is no need to deal separately with the complaints lodged by some applicants under Article 13 of the Convention about the lack of effective domestic remedies to complain about their placement in a metal cage in courtrooms or about their conditions of detention (compare *Valyuzhenich v. Russia*, no. 10597/13, § 27, 26 March 2019).

V. APPLICATION OF ARTICLE 41 OF THE CONVENTION

14. Article 41 of the Convention provides:

“If the Court finds that there has been a violation of the Convention or the Protocols thereto, and if the internal law of the High Contracting Party concerned allows only partial reparation to be made, the Court shall, if necessary, afford just satisfaction to the injured party.”

15. Regard being had to the documents in its possession and to its case-law (see, in particular, *Pukhachev and Zaretskiy v. Russia*, nos. 17494/16 and 29203/16, 16 November 2017), the Court considers it reasonable to award the sums indicated in the appended table.

FOR THESE REASONS, THE COURT, UNANIMOUSLY,

1. *Decides* to join the applications;
2. *Holds* that it has jurisdiction to deal with the applicants' complaints as they relate to facts that took place before 16 September 2022;
3. *Declares* the applications admissible;
4. *Holds* that these complaints disclose a breach of Article 3 of the Convention concerning the inadequate conditions of detention during transport;
5. *Holds* that there has been a violation of the Convention and its Protocols as regards the other complaints raised under well-established case-law of the Court (see the appended table);
6. *Holds* that it is not necessary to examine separately the complaints lodged by some applicants under Article 13 of the Convention in respect of the lack of domestic remedies to complain about their placement in a metal cage in courtrooms or their conditions of detention;
7. *Holds*
 - (a) that the respondent State is to pay the applicants, within three months, the amounts indicated in the appended table, to be converted into the currency of the respondent State at the rate applicable at the date of settlement;
 - (b) that from the expiry of the above-mentioned three months until settlement simple interest shall be payable on the above amounts at a rate equal to the marginal lending rate of the European Central Bank during the default during the default period plus three percentage points.

Done in English, and notified in writing on 26 October 2023, pursuant to Rule 77 §§ 2 and 3 of the Rules of Court.

Viktoriya Maradudina
Acting Deputy Registrar

Péter Paczolay
President

APPENDIX

List of applications raising complaints under Article 3 of the Convention (inadequate conditions of detention during transport)

No.	Application no. Date of introduction	Applicant's name Year of birth	Representative's name and location	Means of transport Start and end date	Sq. m per inmate	Specific grievances	Other complaints under well-established case-law	Amount awarded for pecuniary and non- pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹
1.	51678/15 04/10/2015	Sergey Vladimirovich PETERMAN 1971	Aleksey Nikolayevich Laptev Moscow	van, transit cell, numerous occasions of transport 12/02/2015 to 13/09/2017	0.3 m ²	poor quality of potable water, passive smoking, overcrowding, applicant transported on numerous occasions, lack of fresh air, lack of or insufficient electric light	Art. 3 - use of metal cages and/or other security arrangements in courtrooms - placement in a metal cage during court hearings between 12/02/2015 and 13/09/2017, Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport	8,500
2.	10230/18 26/12/2017	Mikhail Alekseyevich VOLKOV 1982		van 28/02/2020 to 20/04/2020	0.3 m ²	applicant transported on numerous occasions, inadequate temperature, lack of fresh air, lack of or insufficient natural light, no or restricted access to potable water, no or restricted access to toilet, overcrowding, restricted access to food, transport in a single occupancy compartment	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport, Art. 3 - use of metal cages and/or other security arrangements in courtrooms - placement in a metal cage in Prison no. 2 in Krasnoyarsk during various hearings, by way of videoconference (between 27/04/2020 and 09/12/2020). Placement in a cage at the hearing before the Second Cassation Court on 07/07/2021. Multiple proceedings in various courts in which the applicant was at the same period placed in a metal cage (Babushkinskiy District Court of Moscow, Ostankinskiy District Court of	9,500

PETERMAN AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

No.	Application no. Date of introduction	Applicant's name Year of birth	Representative's name and location	Means of transport Start and end date	Sq. m per inmate	Specific grievances	Other complaints under well-established case-law	Amount awarded for pecuniary and non- pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹
							<p>Moscow, Krasnoyarsk Regional Court, Moscow City Court, Eighth Cassation Court),</p> <p>Art. 6 (1) - applicant's absence from civil proceedings - civil claim for compensation of non-pecuniary damage caused by conditions of detention; decision on 01/03/2017, by the Zamoskvoretskiy District Court of Moscow; Appeal decision on 26/09/2017, by the Moscow City Court, final decision on the matter was taken by the Supreme Court of the Russian Federation on 28/05/2018 (complaint lodged on 01/09/2018). The applicant, a detainee, was not brought to any hearings in his civil case</p>	
3.	30247/18 31/05/2018	Aleksandr Viktorovich BORISOV 1979	Aleksey Nikolayevich Laptev Moscow	van, holding cell at the courthouse; numerous occasions of transport between the detention facility and the courthouse 14/08/2017 to 26/09/2018	0.2-0.6 m ²	no access to potable water, lack of privacy for using toilet, no or restricted access to toilet, passive smoking, inadequate temperatures, no natural light, overcrowding	<p>Art. 5 (4) - excessive length of judicial review of detention - extension of detention order of 11/09/2017, appeal filed on 13/09/2017 and examined on 01/12/2017 (the applicant did not receive a copy of the decision),</p> <p>Art. 3 - use of metal cages and/or other security arrangements in courtrooms – placement in a metal cage in the courtroom during the hearings on pretrial detention, trial and appeal proceedings. Basmannyy District Court of Moscow, Moscow City Court between 22/06/2017 and 26/09/2018</p>	8,500

PETERMAN AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

No.	Application no. Date of introduction	Applicant's name Year of birth	Representative's name and location	Means of transport Start and end date	Sq. m per inmate	Specific grievances	Other complaints under well-established case-law	Amount awarded for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹
4.	35084/18 10/07/2018	Viktor Aleksandrovich VASILCHENKO 1993		van, train 07/03/2018 to 08/03/2018 train 09/02/2019 to 10/02/2019 train, van 27/09/2019 to 28/09/2019 van, train 09/12/2019 to 10/12/2019	0.37-0.43 m ² 0.37 m ² 0.45 m ²	lack of or insufficient electric light, lack of or poor quality of bedding and bed linen, lack of fresh air, insufficient number of sleeping places, lack of privacy for toilet, no or restricted access to potable water insufficient number of sleeping places, no or restricted access to toilet, 8 persons were held in a train compartment measuring 1.9 m * 1 m insufficient number of sleeping places, no or restricted access to toilet, no or restricted access to potable water insufficient number of sleeping places, no or restricted access to toilet, no or restricted access to potable water		1,000
5.	44107/18 25/08/2018	Sergey Alekseyevich KARNAUKHOV 1980		train 03/07/2018 to 04/07/2018		overcrowding, lack of fresh air, lack of or insufficient electric light, no or restricted access to potable water, lack of or poor quality of bedding and bed linen, lack of privacy for toilet, no or restricted access to toilet	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport, Art. 8 (1) - permanent video surveillance of detainees in pre-trial or post-conviction detention facilities - permanent video surveillance in IK-25 Komi Republic since 15/01/2016-and ongoing on the date when the application was lodged with the Court.	1,000

PETERMAN AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

No.	Application no. Date of introduction	Applicant's name Year of birth	Representative's name and location	Means of transport Start and end date	Sq. m per inmate	Specific grievances	Other complaints under well-established case-law	Amount awarded for pecuniary and non- pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹
				van, train, transit cell 03/10/2019 to 04/10/2019	0.25-0.8 m ²	lack of fresh air, no or restricted access to toilet, inadequate temperature, overcrowding, lack of belts and handles, lack of or poor quality of bedding and bed linen, insufficient number of sleeping places, lack or insufficient quantity of food, no or restricted access to potable water		
				train 20/08/2020 to 21/08/2020	0.5 m ²	lack of or poor quality of bedding and bed linen, overcrowding, no or restricted access to potable water, inadequate temperature, lack of fresh air, no or restricted access to toilet		
				train 15/03/2021 to 16/03/2021	0.42 m ²	insufficient number of sleeping places, lack of or poor quality of bedding and bed linen, lack of or insufficient electric light, lack of or insufficient natural light, lack of or insufficient quantity of food, lack of fresh air		
6.	46146/18 18/09/2018	Vadim Gennadiyevich KOSORUKOV 1975		train 20/08/2018 to 21/08/2018		insufficient number of sleeping places, no or restricted access to toilet, inadequate temperature, lack of fresh air		1,000
7.	46788/18 06/09/2018	Anton Nikolayevich ZHILIN 1978		train, van 27/07/2018 to 29/07/2018		overcrowding, lack of or insufficient electric light, lack of fresh air, no or restricted access to	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport,	8,500

PETERMAN AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

No.	Application no. Date of introduction	Applicant's name Year of birth	Representative's name and location	Means of transport Start and end date	Sq. m per inmate	Specific grievances	Other complaints under well-established case-law	Amount awarded for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹
				<p>train, van 21/02/2019 to 23/02/2019</p> <p>van, transit cell, 27/06/2019 to 10/02/2020</p> <p>train 29/07/2020 to 31/07/2020</p>	<p>0.4 m²</p> <p>0.45 m²</p>	<p>toilet, insufficient number of sleeping places, passive smoking</p> <p>bunk beds, lack of or poor quality of bedding and bed linen, lack of hot food, passive smoking, no or restricted access to toilet, overcrowding</p> <p>lack of or insufficient natural light, stakan-type cubicles</p> <p>lack of fresh air, lack of or insufficient quantity of food, no or restricted access to potable water, no or restricted access to toilet, overcrowding, lack of or poor quality of bedding and bed linen, insufficient number of sleeping places</p>	<p>Art. 3 - use of metal cages and/or other security arrangements in courtrooms – placement in a metal cage in the courtroom between 27/06/2019 and 10/02/2020; before the Justice of the Peace, Shakhterskiy Judicial Circuit, Vorkuta (introduction date - 12/03/2020)</p>	
8.	46860/18 18/09/2018	Yevgeniy Borisovich DOROSEVICH 1980		van, train 03/08/2018 to 31/08/2018	0.2-0.4 m ²	<p>lack of security belts, lack of ventilation, insufficient number of sleeping places, lack of or poor quality of bedding and bed linen, no or restricted access to toilet, lack of privacy for toilet, lack of or insufficient natural light, no or restricted access to potable water</p>	<p>Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport</p>	1,000

PETERMAN AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

No.	Application no. Date of introduction	Applicant's name Year of birth	Representative's name and location	Means of transport Start and end date	Sq. m per inmate	Specific grievances	Other complaints under well-established case-law	Amount awarded for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹
				train, van 25/03/2019 to 26/03/2019		insufficient number of sleeping places, lack of fresh air, lack of or inadequate hygienic facilities, lack of privacy for toilet, no or restricted access to toilet, overcrowding		
9.	49982/18 04/10/2018	Khuler Eduardovich BOPUY-OOL 1993		van, train 26/03/2018 to 20/05/2018		overcrowding, inadequate temperature, lack of fresh air, lack of or insufficient electric light, no or restricted access to potable water, no or restricted access to toilet	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport	1,000
10.	50661/18 09/10/2018	Ivan Anatolyevich MALAKHOV 1962		train, (one round trip) 27/04/2018 to 08/07/2018	0.6 m ²	no or restricted access to toilet, lack of or insufficient electric light, both trips lasted cumulatively 19 hours	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport, Art. 3 - use of metal cages and/or other security arrangements in courtrooms - during court hearings at the Pushkinskiy District Court of Syktyvkar from 07/04 to 07/06/2021 and held by the Justice of the Peace of the Krasnozatskiy Judicial Circuit of Syktyvkar on 12/07/2021.	8,500
11.	52108/18 05/11/2018	Danis Miratovich FAYZRAKHMANOV 1988		van, transit cell 30/05/2017 to 30/07/2018 train, van 22/10/2020 to 05/12/2020	0.2-0.7 m ² 0.5 m ²	lack of fresh air, inadequate temperature, lack of or insufficient electric light, no or restricted access to toilet no or restricted access to toilet, no or restricted access to potable water, overcrowding, applicant transported on numerous occasions, insufficient number of sleeping places, the	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport	1,000

PETERMAN AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

No.	Application no. Date of introduction	Applicant's name Year of birth	Representative's name and location	Means of transport Start and end date	Sq. m per inmate	Specific grievances	Other complaints under well-established case-law	Amount awarded for pecuniary and non- pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹
						transfer (van+ train on 22/10/2020) lasted 22.5 hours, 8 to 11 inmates per train compartment		
12.	55833/18 15/11/2018	Mikhail Anatolyevich ROSKOSHIN 1980		van, train 27/05/2018 to 29/05/2018 van, train 11/06/2018 to 13/06/2018 train 24/03/2021 to 25/03/2021	0.4 m ² 0.4 m ² 0.4 m ²	overcrowding, no or restricted access to toilet, insufficient number of sleeping places, lack of or poor quality of bedding and bed linen, lack of fresh air, passive smoking, lack of or insufficient electric light overcrowding, insufficient number of sleeping places, lack of or poor quality of bedding and bed linen, no or restricted access to toilet, lack of fresh air, passive smoking, lack of or insufficient electric light overcrowding, lack of fresh air, poor quality of food, lack of or poor quality of bedding and bed linen, insufficient number of sleeping places, lack of or insufficient natural light, lack of or insufficient electric light, no or restricted access to toilet	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport	1,000
13.	58662/18 21/11/2018	Vladimir Nikolayevich SKOROMETS 1956		train, van, two occasions of transport during the period indicated below 01/10/2018 to 31/10/2018	0.6 m ²	overcrowding, insufficient number of sleeping places	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport	1,000

PETERMAN AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

No.	Application no. Date of introduction	Applicant's name Year of birth	Representative's name and location	Means of transport Start and end date	Sq. m per inmate	Specific grievances	Other complaints under well-established case-law	Amount awarded for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹
14.	58907/18 27/11/2018	Vladislav Alekseyevich REDIN 1994		train 09/08/2018 to 10/08/2018		no or restricted access to toilet, insufficient number of sleeping places, lack of fresh air	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport	1,000
15.	59302/18 20/11/2018	Artem Aleksandrovich SMIRNOV 1987		train 05/10/2018 to 07/10/2018		insufficient number of sleeping places, lack of fresh air, overcrowding	Art. 3 - use of metal cages and/or other security arrangements in courtrooms – placement in a metal cage in the courtroom of the Ukhta Town Court of the Komi Republic, between 11/06/2021 and 02/09/2021, Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport	8,500
16.	1912/19 08/11/2018	Sergey Olegovich DERGACHEV 1979		train, van 19/12/2018 to 28/12/2018	0.4 m ²	overcrowding, lack of fresh air, lack of or insufficient natural light, lack of privacy for toilet, passive smoking, no or restricted access to toilet, lack of or poor quality of bedding and bed linen, lack or insufficient quantity of food		1,000
17.	7343/19 22/01/2019	Roman Vyacheslavovich SHIROKOV 1993		van, train 26/09/2018 to 01/12/2018		lack of fresh air, inadequate temperature, lack of or poor quality of bedding and bed linen, no or restricted access to toilet, no or restricted access to potable water		1,000
18.	7871/19 19/12/2018	Sergey Yuryevich OSOKIN 1979		train 12/10/2018 to 14/10/2018	0.4 m ²	insufficient number of sleeping places, lack of fresh air, lack of or inadequate hygienic facilities, no or restricted access to toilet, overcrowding	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport	1,000

PETERMAN AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

No.	Application no. Date of introduction	Applicant's name Year of birth	Representative's name and location	Means of transport Start and end date	Sq. m per inmate	Specific grievances	Other complaints under well-established case-law	Amount awarded for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹
19.	8977/19 23/01/2019	Anton Olegovich PONOMAREV 1989		train, transit cell, van 19/12/2018 to 28/12/2018	0.2 m ²	overcrowding, lack of fresh air, no or restricted access to toilet, passive smoking, mouldy or dirty cell		1,000
20.	11252/19 12/03/2019	Andrey Vladimirovich ILLARIONOV 1982		train, van 21/12/2018 to 28/01/2019 train, van 09/09/2020 to 09/11/2020		lack of fresh air, no or restricted access to toilet, overcrowding, poor quality of food, poor quality of potable water applicant transported on numerous occasions, no or restricted access to toilet, no or restricted access to potable water, lack of or insufficient electric light, no or restricted access to warm water, lack of fresh air, low ceilings in cells, passive smoking, lack of or insufficient natural light, insufficient number of sleeping places, lack of or poor quality of bedding and bed linen, poor quality of food, overcrowding	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport	1,000
21.	12047/19 29/01/2019	Artem Gabitovich GATAULIN 1977		train 23/01/2019 to 24/01/2019 van 05/02/2019 to 05/02/2019	0.4 m ²	lack of fresh air, insufficient number of sleeping places, lack of or insufficient natural light, no or restricted access to toilet, overcrowding, no or restricted access to potable water overcrowding, lack of or insufficient natural light, inadequate temperature, no handrails	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport	1,000

PETERMAN AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

No.	Application no. Date of introduction	Applicant's name Year of birth	Representative's name and location	Means of transport Start and end date	Sq. m per inmate	Specific grievances	Other complaints under well-established case-law	Amount awarded for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹
				train 05/02/2019 to 05/02/2019	0.44 m ²	overcrowding, no or restricted access to potable water, lack of or insufficient natural light, lack of or insufficient electric light, lack of fresh air, lack or inadequate furniture, insufficient number of sleeping places, lack of or poor quality of bedding and bed linen, inadequate temperature, no or restricted access to toilet		
22.	12522/19 05/02/2019	Shamil Ali ogly MAMEDOV 1966		train, van 03/12/2018 to 04/12/2018 van, train 23/03/2020 to 24/03/2020 van, train 23/05/2020 to 23/05/2020	0.3 m ²	overcrowding, insufficient number of sleeping places, lack of or poor quality of bedding and bed linen, lack of or insufficient electric light, no or restricted access to running water, lack of fresh air, no or restricted access to toilet, lack of privacy for toilet bunk beds, inadequate temperature, insufficient number of sleeping places, lack of fresh air, lack of or poor quality of bedding and bed linen, lack of privacy for toilet, no or restricted access to toilet, overcrowding, passive smoking bunk beds, inadequate temperature, insufficient number of sleeping places, lack of fresh air, lack of privacy for toilet, no or restricted	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport, Art. 3 - inadequate conditions of detention after conviction – in IK-1 Komi Republic, from 15/09/2011, pending as of 16/09/2022, 1.4 sq. m of personal space, 52 inmates, lack of fresh air, lack of or inadequate hygienic facilities, overcrowding, no or restricted access to toilet, no or restricted access to shower	13,500

PETERMAN AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

No.	Application no. Date of introduction	Applicant's name Year of birth	Representative's name and location	Means of transport Start and end date	Sq. m per inmate	Specific grievances	Other complaints under well-established case-law	Amount awarded for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹
						access to toilet, passive smoking, overcrowding		
23.	12935/19 28/01/2019	Viktor Vladimirovich MISHARIN 1990		train, van 23/11/2018 to 24/11/2018 van, train 03/02/2019 to 29/03/2019	0.3 m ² 0.4 m ²	overcrowding, no or restricted access to toilet, insufficient number of sleeping places, lack of or insufficient natural light, no or restricted access to running water, lack of fresh air overcrowding, insufficient number of sleeping places, lack of or poor quality of bedding and bed linen, no or restricted access to toilet, no or restricted access to running water, lack of privacy for toilet, lack of fresh air, passive smoking	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport	1,000
24.	14589/19 04/03/2019	Anton Valeryevich LEVASHOV 1989		van, (transport to and from work on numerous occasions) since 04/10/2018 and pending on the date when the application was lodged with the Court		overcrowding, inadequate temperature		1,000
25.	14993/19 18/02/2019	Aleksandr Alekseyevich POCHTAREV 1994		train, van 18/09/2018 to 04/10/2018	0.5 m ²	overcrowding, inadequate temperature, lack of fresh air, lack of or insufficient electric light, lack of or insufficient natural light, lack of seat belts, no or restricted access	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport, Art. 3 - use of metal cages and/or other security arrangements in courtrooms – in the	8,500

PETERMAN AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

No.	Application no. Date of introduction	Applicant's name Year of birth	Representative's name and location	Means of transport Start and end date	Sq. m per inmate	Specific grievances	Other complaints under well-established case-law	Amount awarded for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹
						to potable water, no or restricted access to toilet	court hearings before the Ukhta Town Court, Kolpinskiy District Court of St Petersburg (by way of videoconference from the detention facility) between 26/04/2018 and 23/08/2021.	
26.	17382/19 16/03/2019	Dmitriy Igorevich RADNEV 1986		van, transit cell, train 17/09/2018 to 24/12/2018	0.3-0.4 m ²	overcrowding, restricted access to food, no or restricted access to potable water, no or restricted access to toilet, insufficient number of sleeping places, lack of or inadequate hygienic facilities, applicant transported on numerous occasions, lack of fresh air, inadequate temperature		1,000
27.	25960/19 30/04/2019	Andrey Igorevich ARTEMYEV 1986		train, van 21/07/2017 to 18/11/2018	0.16 m ²	lack of or insufficient electric light, overcrowding, insufficient number of sleeping places, lack of hot food, lack of or poor quality of bedding and bed linen, inadequate temperature, numerous occasions of transport, no or restricted access to toilet, passive smoking		1,000
28.	40231/19 10/07/2019	Aleksandr Grigoryevich SHEVCHUK 1990		train 16/01/2019 to 17/01/2019	0.3 m ²	overcrowding, insufficient number of sleeping places		1,000
29.	41170/19 16/07/2019	Aleksandr Vladimirovich GERASIMOV 1971		train, van, transit cell 26/04/2019 to 16/05/2019		lack of fresh air, lack of or insufficient electric light, insufficient number of sleeping places, overcrowding, no or restricted access to toilet, lack of or insufficient natural light	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport, Art. 3 - inadequate conditions of detention after conviction – in IK-9 Kirov Region,	6,000

PETERMAN AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

No.	Application no. Date of introduction	Applicant's name Year of birth	Representative's name and location	Means of transport Start and end date	Sq. m per inmate	Specific grievances	Other complaints under well-established case-law	Amount awarded for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹
				van, train 12/07/2019 to 12/07/2019		lack of fresh air, lack of or insufficient electric light, insufficient number of sleeping places, lack of or poor quality of bedding and bed linen, lack of or insufficient natural light, no or restricted access to toilet, lack or insufficient quantity of food, no or restricted access to potable water, overcrowding	from 13/06/2014 to 12/07/2019, 2 sq. m, inadequate temperature, lack of or insufficient physical exercise in fresh air, lack or insufficient quantity of food, no or restricted access to shower, overcrowding	
				van 25/07/2019 to 25/07/2019	0.5 m ²	lack of fresh air, inadequate temperature, no or restricted access to potable water, no or restricted access to toilet		
				van 14/07/2020 to 14/07/2020	0.4 m ²	overcrowding, no or restricted access to potable water, no or restricted access to toilet, lack of fresh air		
30.	64600/19 20/03/2020	Ayraz Talgatovich GAYSIN 1978		train (Yekaterinburg - Tavda) 24/09/2019 to 25/09/2019		overcrowding, no or restricted access to toilet, insufficient number of sleeping places, constant electric light, lack or insufficient quantity of food		1,000
31.	1232/20 11/06/2020	Anton Vladimirovich STEFANOVICH 1991		van, numerous occasions of transport between the detention facilities and the courthouse		inadequate temperature, lack of fresh air, lack of or insufficient electric light, no or restricted access to potable water, no or restricted access to toilet	Art. 3 - use of metal cages and/or other security arrangements in courtrooms - placement in a metal cage in the hearings before the Vorkuta Town Court of the Komi Republic in the proceedings between 04/09/2019 and 25/12/2019	8,500

PETERMAN AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

No.	Application no. Date of introduction	Applicant's name Year of birth	Representative's name and location	Means of transport Start and end date	Sq. m per inmate	Specific grievances	Other complaints under well-established case-law	Amount awarded for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹
				between 04/09/2019 and 25/12/2019				
32.	1437/20 24/03/2020	Viktor Viktorovich BOBKIN 1973		van, numerous occasions of transport between the detention facilities and the courthouse since 07/09/2017 and pending on the date when the application was lodged with the Court	0.3 m ²	lack of fresh air, no or restricted access to toilet, overcrowding, no or restricted access to potable water	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport	1,000
33.	2504/20 04/02/2020	Andrey Nikolayevich KOLOMEYTSYEV 1982		van, train 03/10/2019 to 04/10/2019 van, train 17/11/2019 to 17/11/2019	0.4 m ² 0.4 m ²	overcrowding, lack of fresh air overcrowding, lack of fresh air	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport	1,000
34.	2964/20 10/12/2019	Mikhail Viktorovich NOVIKOV 1986		van, train 26/07/2019 to 26/07/2019	0.2 m ²	overcrowding, lack of fresh air, passive smoking, no or restricted access to toilet, no or restricted access to potable water	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport	1,000
35.	3120/20 18/12/2019	Kirill Yuryevich KOSAREV 1982		train, van 30/07/2019 to 30/07/2019		overcrowding, no or restricted access to toilet, insufficient number of sleeping places		1,000

PETERMAN AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

No.	Application no. Date of introduction	Applicant's name Year of birth	Representative's name and location	Means of transport Start and end date	Sq. m per inmate	Specific grievances	Other complaints under well-established case-law	Amount awarded for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹
36.	3426/20 21/12/2019	Ruslan Ilshatovich MUKHAMETSHIN 1997		van 26/11/2016 to 11/10/2019	0.25 m ²	applicant transported on numerous occasions, overcrowding, lack of fresh air, passive smoking, inadequate temperature, no or restricted access to toilet, lack of or insufficient electric light	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport, Art. 3 - use of metal cages and/or other security arrangements in courtrooms – the applicant was placed in a metal cage during detention and trial hearings held in the courtroom of the Naberezhnye Chelny Town Court between 08/12/2016 and 04/12/2019.	8,500
37.	4462/20 27/12/2019	Maksim Valeryevich PODOBREY 1987		train, transit cell, van, numerous occasions of transport between the detention facility and the courthouse 02/09/2015 to 15/04/2020	0.3 m ²	inadequate temperature, overcrowding, lack of fresh air, no or restricted access to toilet, poor quality of food		1,000
38.	5757/20 16/01/2020	Ruslan Aleksandrovich GARIN 1979		van 11/10/2019 to 11/10/2019 van 01/04/2020 to 08/05/2020		lack of belts and handles, overcrowding, no or restricted access to toilet, lack of fresh air, passive smoking, transport for two and a half hours, 8 inmates per compartment, transfer lasted 2 hours 24 minutes overcrowding, no or restricted access to toilet, lack of fresh air, passive smoking, transfers lasted 1.5 to 2.5 hours	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport	1,000

PETERMAN AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

No.	Application no. Date of introduction	Applicant's name Year of birth	Representative's name and location	Means of transport Start and end date	Sq. m per inmate	Specific grievances	Other complaints under well-established case-law	Amount awarded for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹
39.	5889/20 12/05/2020	Aleksandr Viktorovich KAPORSKIY 1991		van 07/11/2019 to 16/04/2020	0.3 m ²	applicant transported on numerous occasions, lack of or insufficient electric light, lack of or insufficient natural light, lack of fresh air, lack of safety belts and handles, no or restricted access to toilet	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport	1,000
40.	6105/20 14/05/2020	Anatoliy Rinatovich TOKHTABAYEV 1979		van, train, numerous occasions of transport between the detention facilities 11/10/2019 to 09/03/2020	0.3 m ²	overcrowding, lack of or insufficient natural light, lack of fresh air, inadequate temperature, insufficient number of sleeping places, no or restricted access to toilet, lack of privacy for toilet, no or restricted access to potable water, passive smoking	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport	1,000
41.	6109/20 08/04/2020	Aleksandr Yevgrafovich KOPOSOV 1973		van, train 05/11/2019 to 17/12/2019	0.4 m ²	travelling in a van in a bent position, lack of fresh air, inadequate temperature, insufficient number of sleeping places, lack of or poor quality of bedding and bed linen, lack of or insufficient natural light, poor quality of potable water, passive smoking, no or restricted access to toilet	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport	1,000
42.	6283/20 21/01/2020	Oleg Ivanovich FISUN 1982		Single occupancy compartment, van, numerous occasions of transport to take part in investigative actions or court hearings 29/10/2018 to 27/09/2019	0.12 m ²	overcrowding	Art. 8 (1) - lack of practical opportunities for or restriction on prison visits - inability to have a family visit, particularly a long-term visit, during detention in the pre-trial facility, at least until 27/09/2019	4,500

PETERMAN AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

No.	Application no. Date of introduction	Applicant's name Year of birth	Representative's name and location	Means of transport Start and end date	Sq. m per inmate	Specific grievances	Other complaints under well-established case-law	Amount awarded for pecuniary and non- pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹
43.	8580/20 01/02/2020	Aleksandr Anatolyevich KITBALYAN 1963		van 05/08/2019 to 28/01/2020		lack of fresh air, no or restricted access to toilet	Art. 8 (1) - lack of practical opportunities for or restriction on prison visits – from 21/01/2019 to 08/06/2020 the applicant did not have long-term visits from his wife, as they are not provided for by the law, and could not make phone calls to her, Art. 3 - inadequate conditions of detention - detention in IZ-2 Moscow from 28/06/2019 to 08/06/2020; 2.4 sq. m of personal space, the applicant detained with 4 inmates in a cell measuring 10 sq. m.	5,000
44.	9587/20 03/02/2020	Emir Alikovich SHAMUGIYA 1986		train, van 15/12/2019 to 23/12/2019		applicant transported on numerous occasions, lack of fresh air, lack of or insufficient electric light, overcrowding, no or restricted access to potable water, no or restricted access to toilet, insufficient number of sleeping places, lack of or poor quality of bedding and bed linen	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport and in respect of permanent video surveillance in detention facilities, Art. 8 (1) - permanent video surveillance of detainees in pre-trial or post-conviction detention facilities - at IK-25 Komi Republic by female guards from 05/02/2019 to 16/12/2019 and from 23/12/2019 to 07/02/2020, Prot. 1 Art. 3 - ineligibility to vote in or stand for elections - the applicant is a convicted prisoner in IK-25 Komi Republic debarred from voting during the elections in the State Duma on 19/09/2021. He complained about his disenfranchisement.	1,000

PETERMAN AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

No.	Application no. Date of introduction	Applicant's name Year of birth	Representative's name and location	Means of transport Start and end date	Sq. m per inmate	Specific grievances	Other complaints under well-established case-law	Amount awarded for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹
							His request to FSIN about setting up a polling station in the colony was dismissed.	
45.	11976/20 07/02/2020	Maksim Sergeyevich RYABOV 1988		van, train 16/08/2019 to 30/12/2019	0.4 m ²	overcrowding, insufficient number of sleeping places, lack of or poor quality of bedding and bed linen, lack of fresh air	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport and permanent video surveillance in detention facilities, Art. 3 - use of metal cages and/or other security arrangements in courtrooms - placement in a metal cage in court hearings in the Vorkuta Town Court of the Komi Republic on several occasions between 24/10/2019 and 30/12/2019, Art. 8 (1) - permanent video surveillance of detainees in pre-trial or post-conviction detention facilities - detention in different cells with video surveillance by opposite-sex operators at IK-31 Komi Republic between 17/11/2020 and 28/12/2021.	8,500
46.	26705/20 05/06/2020	Karamatullo Nazarmamadovich SHASHAYEV 1982		train 18/02/2020 to 20/02/2020 van 29/02/2020 to 29/02/2020	0.25 m ²	insufficient number of sleeping places, overcrowding overcrowding, lack of fresh air	Art. 8 (1) - permanent video surveillance of detainees in pre-trial or post-conviction detention facilities - at IK-5 in the Krasnoyarsk Region between 02/09/2010 and 25/05/2021 by opposite-sex operators, video surveillance in a lavatory and/or shower room.	1,000
47.	28927/20 22/06/2020	Nikolay Viktorovich YEMELIN 1984		train 19/03/2020 to 10/04/2020		applicant transported on numerous occasions, lack of or poor quality of bedding and bed linen, lack of fresh air, lack of or insufficient electric	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport,	13,000

PETERMAN AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

No.	Application no. Date of introduction	Applicant's name Year of birth	Representative's name and location	Means of transport Start and end date	Sq. m per inmate	Specific grievances	Other complaints under well-established case-law	Amount awarded for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹
						light, insufficient number of sleeping places	<p>in respect of permanent video surveillance in detention facilities and lack of any effective remedy in respect of the prisoners' voting rights,</p> <p>Art. 3 - inadequate conditions of detention after conviction - detention in IK-25 Komi Republic since 15/01/2016, pending as of 16/09/2022, 1.5 sq. m of personal space; lack of or inadequate hygienic facilities, lack of or insufficient natural light, lack of or insufficient electric light, inadequate temperature, lack of fresh air, no or restricted access to warm water, lack of privacy for toilet,</p> <p>Art. 8 (1) - permanent video surveillance of detainees in pre-trial or post-conviction detention facilities – in IK-25 Komi republic, since 15/01/2016, pending as of 16/09/2022,</p> <p>Prot. 1 Art. 3 - ineligibility to vote in or stand for elections - The applicant is a convicted prisoner in IK-25 Komi Republic debarred from voting during the elections in the State Duma on 19/09/2021. He complained about his disenfranchisement. His request to FSIN about setting up a polling station in the colony was dismissed.</p>	
48.	41554/20 26/08/2020	Nikolay Vasilyevich SAGITOV 1993		van, train 13/03/2020 to 14/03/2020	0.49 m ²	overcrowding, insufficient number of sleeping places, lack of or poor quality of bedding and bed linen, lack of or insufficient natural light, lack of or insufficient electric light,	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport and in respect of permanent video surveillance in detention facilities,	1,000

PETERMAN AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

No.	Application no. Date of introduction	Applicant's name Year of birth	Representative's name and location	Means of transport Start and end date	Sq. m per inmate	Specific grievances	Other complaints under well-established case-law	Amount awarded for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹
						no or restricted access to toilet, lack of privacy for toilet	Art. 8 (1) - permanent video surveillance of detainees in pre-trial or post-conviction detention facilities - at IK-25 Komi Republic; 14/08/2017 - and on-going on the date when the application was lodged with the Court; detention in different cells with video surveillance, opposite-sex operators.	
49.	45646/20 08/12/2020	Aleksey Vladimirovich KISELEV 1979		train, van 04/08/2020 to 21/11/2020	< 0.4 m ²	overcrowding, insufficient number of sleeping places, lack of or poor quality of bedding and bed linen, lack of fresh air, lack of or insufficient natural light, lack of or insufficient electric light, lack or insufficient quantity of food, poor quality of food, no or restricted access to potable water, no or restricted access to toilet, lack of privacy for toilet	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport; Art. 3 - use of metal cages and/or other security arrangements in courtrooms - placement in a metal cage in court hearings in the Usinsk Town Court of the Komi Republic from 07/08/2020 to 24/02/2021	8,500
50.	16777/21 14/03/2021	Anna Petrovna KARPUKHINA 1992		van, transit cell 05/02/2019 to 17/09/2020		applicant transported on numerous occasions, inadequate temperature, lack of fresh air, lack of or inadequate hygienic facilities, lack of privacy for toilet, no or restricted access to toilet, passive smoking, poor quality of food, transfers lasted 6 to 9 hours, the applicant was transported in a single occupancy compartment	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport	1,000
51.	28813/21 06/05/2021	Vasiliy Aleksandrovich YAGODNIKOV 1981		train 26/04/2021 to 27/04/2021	0.5 m ²	overcrowding, insufficient number of sleeping places, no or restricted access to toilet, no or restricted	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport,	8,500

PETERMAN AND OTHERS v. RUSSIA JUDGMENT

No.	Application no. Date of introduction	Applicant's name Year of birth	Representative's name and location	Means of transport Start and end date	Sq. m per inmate	Specific grievances	Other complaints under well-established case-law	Amount awarded for pecuniary and non-pecuniary damage and costs and expenses per applicant (in euros) ¹
				train 03/05/2021 to 04/05/2021	0.34 m ²	access to potable water, poor quality of food, lack of fresh air, the transfer lasted 8 hours overcrowding, insufficient number of sleeping places, no or restricted access to toilet, no or restricted access to warm water, lack of fresh air	Art. 3 - use of metal cages and/or other security arrangements in courtrooms - Ezhvinskiy District Court of Syktyvkar between 30/12/2020 and 02/03/2021; Velikoustyugskiy District Court of Vologda Region between 21/05/2021 and 22/05/2021.	
52.	48520/21 18/10/2021	Aleksandr Ivanovich PANCHENKO 1979		train 23/04/2021 to 24/04/2021 train 10/10/2021 to 09/02/2022	0.5 m ² 0.4 m ²	overcrowding, lack of fresh air, passive smoking, insufficient number of sleeping places, lack of or insufficient quantity of food, lack of or inadequate furniture, no or restricted access to potable water, no or restricted access to toilet, 12 hours' transfer from temporary detention ward to a remand prison, 10 inmates per compartment overcrowding, lack of fresh air, lack of or insufficient electric light, lack of or insufficient natural light, lack of or insufficient quantity of food, no or restricted access to potable water, no or restricted access to toilet, insufficient number of sleeping places	Art. 13 - lack of any effective remedy in domestic law in respect of inadequate conditions of detention during transport, Art. 5 (3) - excessive length of pre-trial detention - the applicant was placed in pre-trial detention on 16/04/2021 ; the detention was pending on the date when the application was lodged with the Court, courts dealing with the detention matters: Pechora Town Court of the Komi Republic; Supreme Court of the Komi Republic, fragility and repetitiveness of the reasoning employed by the courts as the case progressed; failure to examine the possibility, as the case progressed, of applying other measures to secure attendance at the trial.	2,600

¹ Plus any tax that may be chargeable to the applicants.