Calibration, Coherence, and Consilience in Radiometric Measures of Geologic Time

Bokulish

RO, Nov 21, Harry Luo

1. **Introduction**
   - Geochronology measures geological time using radiometric methods. U-Pb and 40Ar/39Ar clocks date Earth events up to 4.5 billion years.
   - The Geological Time Scale (GTS) anchors events using radiometric dates. In 2012, one-quarter of GTS's boundaries were revised, some by over 4 million years.
   - Raises the puzzle: why revise foundational physical methods? Philosophy of metrology clarifies through concepts of calibration, coherence, and consilience.
2. **Metrology Foundations**
   - **Indication vs. Outcome:** Instrument readings ≠ final measurements; they require calibration.
   - **Calibration:** Defines relations between instrument indications and true values via modeling systematic/random errors (e.g., decay constants/auxiliary geological knowledge).
   - **Coherence Testing:** Compares methods (e.g., U-Pb with 40Ar/39Ar). Discordant evidence in incoherences refines methods rather than just reconciling them.
   - **Consilience:** Independent convergence across methods (greater epistemic strength). Intercalibration sacrifices independence, reducing power of consilience arguments.
3. **Radiocarbon Dating Case Study**
   - Radiocarbon (14C) methods rely on calibration curves derived from non-radiometric methods (e.g., tree rings, lake varves).
   - Geologic complexities: spatial (e.g., hemispheric or oceanic variations) and temporal (reservoir effects) refinements show radiometric methods rely on auxiliary sources.
   - Lesson: intermethod dependence reduces consilience but ensures calibration robustness.
4. **Uranium-Lead (U-Pb) Dating & Coherence**
   - Used to date the Permian extinction but coherence tests with 40Ar/39Ar revealed systematic offsets.
   - Challenges: Pb loss, zircon inheritance, prolonged growth. Geological complexity obstructs standard assumptions like closed systems.
   - Resolution: Iterative refinements in chemical abrasion, auxiliary corrections, and data-processing models.
5. **Argon-Argon (40Ar/39Ar) Revision**
   - Primary errors: potassium decay constants and Fish Canyon Tuff (FCTs) standard age.
   - Astrochronology intercalibration tied FCTs to orbital dating, improving precision but reducing independence of clocks.
   - Revised 40Ar/39Ar offset from U-Pb by 0.64%, adjusted for 2012 GTS.
6. **Conclusion**
   - GTS revisions illustrate ongoing recalibration and iterative learning in radiometric methods. Legacy data issues arise, requiring recalibration for pre-2012 studies.
   - Coherence tests uncover discordances, driving calibration and methodological progress. Independence is vital for consilience; trade-offs depend on epistemic goals.