|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Author | Page | Combined | Comment Scope | Comment Text | Team Response |
|  | 2 | 2, Fiona Wanbui (UNHCR) | Fiona Wanbui (UNHCR) | Update to Mukandi Herzel and Malene Nielsen |  |
|  | 6 | 6, Fiona Wanbui (UNHCR), | Fiona Wanbui (UNHCR), | Update to Mukandi Herzel and Malene Nielsen |  |
|  | 8 | 8, Labour migration falls under the UN Global Compact on Safe, Orderly and Regular (GCM), and mixed migration falls under both the GCM and the UN Global Compact on Migration (GCM), and mixed migration falls under both the GCM and the UN Global Compact on Refugees (GCR). Labour migration is primarily the concern of the SAMM project’s Strategic Refugees (GCR). | Labour migration falls under the UN Global Compact on Safe, Orderly and Regular (GCM), and mixed migration falls under both the GCM and the UN Global Compact on Migration (GCM), and mixed migration falls under both the GCM and the UN Global Compact on Refugees (GCR). Labour migration is primarily the concern of the SAMM project’s Strategic Refugees (GCR). | When you cite key official documents may you include the citation of the documents either in the footnotes or endnotes. |  |
|  | 8 | 8, European Union Regional Indicative Programme (11th European Development Fund) for Eastern Africa, Southern Africa, and the Indian Ocean (2014–2020), focusing on the links between regular and irregular South-South the Indian Ocean (2014–2020), migration and its effects on regional | European Union Regional Indicative Programme (11th European Development Fund) for Eastern Africa, Southern Africa, and the Indian Ocean (2014–2020), focusing on the links between regular and irregular South-South the Indian Ocean (2014–2020), migration and its effects on regional | Can you include the hypelink: hhttps://www.eeas.europa.eu/eeas/2014-%E2%80%93-2020-regional-indicative-programme-eastern-africa-southern-africa-and-indian-ocean\_en |  |
|  | 8 | 8, Labour migration is primarily the concern of the SAMM project’s Strategic Objective 1 (SO1), while mixed migration is primarily the concern of Strategic Objective 2 (SO2). | Labour migration is primarily the concern of the SAMM project’s Strategic Objective 1 (SO1), while mixed migration is primarily the concern of Strategic Objective 2 (SO2). | Can you indicate in full what the SOs are since it will be the first time for the reader of the report seeing a reference to them. |  |
|  | 8 | 8, INTRODUCTION | INTRODUCTION | The introduction section would benefit from: a. A paragraph or two describing the trends, figures and related background information about labour and mixed migration in the Region. b. A more detailed description on what was the role of each PUNO in the project. |  |
|  | 9 | 9, national and regional stakeholders, impacted by the project. These stakeholders | national and regional stakeholders, impacted by the project. These stakeholders | You may want to put a footnote a few key ones. |  |
|  | 10 | 10, To the extent that high-level outcomes and impacts are difficult to ascertain with confidence in a context of institutional friction especially delays in policy formulation and implementation – the Evaluation Team employed the | To the extent that high-level outcomes and impacts are difficult to ascertain with confidence in a context of institutional friction especially delays in policy formulation and implementation – the Evaluation Team employed the | This may need to be explained or unpacked - "insitutional friction" |  |
|  | 11 | 11, Total informants | Total informants | Suggest that you add a column with the target so that it can be clear on the numbers reached |  |
|  | 12 | 12, Focus Group discussions actions overwhelmingly targeted | Focus Group discussions actions overwhelmingly targeted | Did this have an effect on the results? Were there any mitigation measures implemented? Did this affect the balance of the collected data with much less voice of the migrants themselves or their representatives e.g. CSOs and NGOs working directly with them? |  |
|  | 12 | 12, Logistical challenges were also identified. | Logistical challenges were also identified. | Suggest you add a footnote on what these logisticla challenegs were. |  |
|  | 12 | 12, EVALUATION FINDINGS | EVALUATION FINDINGS | There appears to be limited mention of perspectives of the migrants themselves or due to the cited limitations the voices of NGOs or CSOs who may speak on their behalf.  There is limited reference to secondary data analysis e.g. data/documents. Most of the findings appear to be centered around the KIIs. |  |
|  | 12 | 12, 3. | 3. | Can the findings be numbered i.e. Overall finding |  |
|  | 12 | 12, (beneficiaries from capacity building and training PUNOs. This prevented any comparison of results workshops) suggested by each of the four PUNOs. | (beneficiaries from capacity building and training PUNOs. This prevented any comparison of results workshops) suggested by each of the four PUNOs. | Suggest you add a graphic or table showing the distrivution of the responses by PUNO. |  |
|  | 12 | 12, Positive responses to requests for remote interviews in countries not visited in the field were lower than hoped for. lower than hoped for. | Positive responses to requests for remote interviews in countries not visited in the field were lower than hoped for. lower than hoped for. | This would also need to be quantified, how many did you target and how many did you ultimately manage to do? |  |
|  | 12 | 12, a) in-person (field) interviews, b) online (remote) interviews, c) an online E-survey focusing on participants in capacity building and training activities. d) Focus Group Discussions. • | a) in-person (field) interviews, b) online (remote) interviews, c) an online E-survey focusing on participants in capacity building and training activities. d) Focus Group Discussions. • | With the overall data collection challenges that the Evaluation Team encountered, there is need to include the mitigation measures taken and an overall assessment on whether this signficantly affected the rovustness of the data, findings and conclusions. |  |
|  | 12 | 12, covers three Regional Economic Communities (RECs), | covers three Regional Economic Communities (RECs), | Can these be listed in a footnote |  |
|  | 12 | 12, Was the project adjusted to reflect the changing context, evolving needs, and challenges identified? | Was the project adjusted to reflect the changing context, evolving needs, and challenges identified? | From this Ciretria, I am only seeing the adjustment to COVID, was there also evidence of adjustments including ways of working around other challenegs mentioned elsewhere in the report such as a. delivering a single project that has different target groups i.e. labour and mixed migration, b. Friction between PUNOs amoung others? |  |
|  | 12 | 12, its theory of change of/for the target groups? | its theory of change of/for the target groups? | The Theory of Change needs to be mentioned in more detail here, what were the assumptions and causal pathways and did the evaluation find them to be true? While holding true is some aspects, in this section you have also already identified that the project may not have been as relevant to the Island States. |  |
|  | 12 | 12, 3. EVALUATION FINDINGS | 3. EVALUATION FINDINGS | For each section of the Evaluation Findings, it would appropriate to indicate the key fndings e.g. in numbered text boxes so that it is easier to follow what the key finding(s) are for each EQ and sub-EQ. |  |
|  | 13 | 13, E-survey responses on how well the project adapted to COVID were, however, positive. | E-survey responses on how well the project adapted to COVID were, however, positive. | What were the figures here? |  |
|  | 13 | 13, Over 80% of capacity | Over 80% of capacity | 80% of how many - include the numerator and the dinominator |  |
|  | 13 | 13, slightly lower agreement rates translating knowledge into institutional | slightly lower agreement rates translating knowledge into institutional | This would benefit from actual statistics or graphs/visuals |  |
|  | 13 | 13, The implementation of migration projects across the Southern Africa and revealed the importance of having, prior to implementation, proper project Indian Ocean region revealed the importance of having, prior to implementation, proper project design and needs assessment. This stakeholders. | The implementation of migration projects across the Southern Africa and revealed the importance of having, prior to implementation, proper project Indian Ocean region revealed the importance of having, prior to implementation, proper project design and needs assessment. This stakeholders. | I am not getting this |  |
|  | 13 | 13, project. This is notably the case for the Island that of SADC members on the continent. States, where the migration context is clearly different from that of SADC members on the continent. The Island States were approached mainly for the labour migration component, where there were relevant intervention policies and action plans that were drafted based on evidence and data. The relevant intervention policies and action plans that were drafted based on evidence and data. | project. This is notably the case for the Island that of SADC members on the continent. States, where the migration context is clearly different from that of SADC members on the continent. The Island States were approached mainly for the labour migration component, where there were relevant intervention policies and action plans that were drafted based on evidence and data. The relevant intervention policies and action plans that were drafted based on evidence and data. | This is a very important finding. Was this identified through document, analysis, KIIs or other sources, would be important to demonstrate the strength of evidence especially if the evidence is coming from more than one source |  |
|  | 14 | 14, IOM, HCR, and UNODC strategies, because many participating countries | IOM, HCR, and UNODC strategies, because many participating countries | Maybe add as a footnote these strategies - at least a major one for each PUNO |  |
|  | 14 | 14, national strategies | national strategies |  |  |
|  | 14 | 14, cross-border labour agreements. mainstream labour migration into their | cross-border labour agreements. mainstream labour migration into their | Can these be mentioned/cited |  |
|  | 14 | 14, cooperation with UNDP and UNICEF, | cooperation with UNDP and UNICEF, | coorporation by which PUNO - all of them?, on what? and with want results? |  |
|  | 14 | 14, Differing terminologies, mandates, and organisational structures joined-up work. occasionally impeded joined-up work. | Differing terminologies, mandates, and organisational structures joined-up work. occasionally impeded joined-up work. |  |  |
|  | 14 | 14, SADC strategies and international and UNODC strategies, alignment ILO conventions with national strategies | SADC strategies and international and UNODC strategies, alignment ILO conventions with national strategies | Add a footnote citing the major major ones |  |
|  | 14 | 14, Conformity with the SDGs, issue. The project was in line as well as African Union policies related to migration, was never an issue. with the EU 11th RIP (2014-2020), especially for its Specific Objectives 1 and | Conformity with the SDGs, issue. The project was in line as well as African Union policies related to migration, was never an issue. with the EU 11th RIP (2014-2020), especially for its Specific Objectives 1 and | Can you also indicate the main AU policies that the project was well aligned with. |  |
|  | 14 | 14, However, this latter, irregular migration, has been largely absent in the interventions. | However, this latter, irregular migration, has been largely absent in the interventions. | In this paragraph, it would be important to bring out the analysis, in what ways was the project aligned/misaligned, can you provide specific references document sections that show the alignment, did other data sources also confim the alignment, was the alignment where visible both on paper and in practice? Important to cite as many diverse sources as possible to show the strength of evidence. |  |
|  | 14 | 14, The and inclusion of vulnerable groups was evidenced by efforts to address gender considerations and develop policies for people living with disabilities in the labour market. | The and inclusion of vulnerable groups was evidenced by efforts to address gender considerations and develop policies for people living with disabilities in the labour market. | This needs to be strengthened because as it is, it does not show that there is evidence of inclusion of vulnerable groups, would be important to mention which grups, in what ways were the gender and disability inclusion considerations taken into account. What evidence is there showing the presence of these efforts? |  |
|  | 14 | 14, labour. Differing terminologies, mandates, and organisational structures joined-up work. occasionally impeded joined-up work. | labour. Differing terminologies, mandates, and organisational structures joined-up work. occasionally impeded joined-up work. | Very important finding, I suggest as per the earlier comment, to have numbered overall finding(s) for each EQ and sub-EQ where relevant |  |
|  | 14 | 14, Gender equality was pursued by balancing participation in project activities; in addition to this, the project had an explicit gender strategy. In all activities involving the development of policies, action project had an explicit gender strategy. plans, etc., the gender aspect was taken | Gender equality was pursued by balancing participation in project activities; in addition to this, the project had an explicit gender strategy. In all activities involving the development of policies, action project had an explicit gender strategy. plans, etc., the gender aspect was taken | This is not gender equality, would be better if the report mentions the efforts of balancing participation in activites, but if there was nothing else besides balancing numbers then it is difficult to say that the project adequately addresed gender equality and inclusion. |  |
|  | 14 | 14, In all activities involving the development of policies, action taken into account. No activities or strategy specific to persons plans, etc., the gender aspect was taken into account. | In all activities involving the development of policies, action taken into account. No activities or strategy specific to persons plans, etc., the gender aspect was taken into account. | How was this done, please include examples and references. E.g. Was there gender analysis conducted as part of the formative policy and action plan development? |  |
|  | 14 | 14, Climate change was not a major theme in any activities reviewed, although the project recognised that a significant number of displaced migrants had been displaced by climate-related events. theme of human rights was integrated in all activities across the project; the rights of | Climate change was not a major theme in any activities reviewed, although the project recognised that a significant number of displaced migrants had been displaced by climate-related events. theme of human rights was integrated in all activities across the project; the rights of | This is very important, especially considering that the evaluation is mentioning the influence of climate-change on migration. Would be imprtant, if possible to qoute some statistics on the number of climate induced displacements. |  |
|  | 14 | 14, However, comprehensive approaches to ensure that all vulnerable populations were reached were missing. adequately reached were missing. | However, comprehensive approaches to ensure that all vulnerable populations were reached were missing. adequately reached were missing. | Very intersting, for this paragraph, can we therefore have an overall finding. |  |
|  | 14 | 14, In budgetary terms, ILO and IOM dominated, with some stakeholders as largely an add-on to | In budgetary terms, ILO and IOM dominated, with some stakeholders as largely an add-on to | You can include the overall percentage of the budget that was allocated for the two PUNOS compared to the others. |  |
|  | 14 | 14, project. Experiences in ILO-IOM coordination were mixed (e.g., overlapping and/or duplicative workshops in the Island States), with some examples of overlap and duplication but others of complementarity. some examples of overlap and duplication but others of complementarity. | project. Experiences in ILO-IOM coordination were mixed (e.g., overlapping and/or duplicative workshops in the Island States), with some examples of overlap and duplication but others of complementarity. some examples of overlap and duplication but others of complementarity. | This needs to be unpacked further, what kind of activites or workshops were particulalry overlapping/duplicated |  |
|  | 14 | 14, There was, in the first months of the project, reluctance on the part of SADC to participate because it felt that, in view of its convening power to bring together all beneficiary countries, it should have it felt that, in view of its convening power to bring together all beneficiary countries, it should have been an implementing partner with equal accountability for results. | There was, in the first months of the project, reluctance on the part of SADC to participate because it felt that, in view of its convening power to bring together all beneficiary countries, it should have it felt that, in view of its convening power to bring together all beneficiary countries, it should have been an implementing partner with equal accountability for results. | Very important, but also sensitive so needs to be properly supported with evidence, what is the source of this, is this from secondary data, reports, meetings minutes, KIIs e.t.c? Was this ultimately addressed, were there any project adaptions that were done to resolve the issue? |  |
|  | 15 | 15, been made towards achieving the overall project objectives/outcomes and what have been the main contributing and objectives/outcomes | been made towards achieving the overall project objectives/outcomes and what have been the main contributing and objectives/outcomes | A good place to start off on this is provide information on Targets vs Achievement. It is important to include the final Project Results Framework with the final achievements of the project. This section could also benefit from a few graphs so that the reader can visualize the project's achivements against set targets. |  |
|  | 15 | 15, – improved access and efficient means of labour migration and improved migrants – have been achieved. The absence of any intervention and protection of vulnerable migrants – have been achieved. | – improved access and efficient means of labour migration and improved migrants – have been achieved. The absence of any intervention and protection of vulnerable migrants – have been achieved. |  |  |
|  | 15 | 15, The policy legislative review, development process, involving drafting (often with project support), | The policy legislative review, development process, involving drafting (often with project support), |  |  |
|  | 15 | 15, (capacity for) an improved policy environment for migration management and 2. (capacity for) strengthened and informed decision making as well as management of mixed migration flows. migration flows. | (capacity for) an improved policy environment for migration management and 2. (capacity for) strengthened and informed decision making as well as management of mixed migration flows. migration flows. | What is the overall finding on each of these two SOs? Have they been achieved? |  |
|  | 15 | 15, As project implementation UN agencies emerged as a proceeded, meetings became more ad hoc and coordination among UN agencies emerged as a challenge. While the collaboration between the PUNOs brought together diverse expertise, the challenge. implementation | As project implementation UN agencies emerged as a proceeded, meetings became more ad hoc and coordination among UN agencies emerged as a challenge. While the collaboration between the PUNOs brought together diverse expertise, the challenge. implementation | Is there documentation that stipulates of often the PUNOs should have met or coordinated? If so was this followed? |  |
|  | 15 | 15, The adoption of policies developed, and their implementation is still progress has been made, it cannot be said that other, more concrete, in progress. Therefore, | The adoption of policies developed, and their implementation is still progress has been made, it cannot be said that other, more concrete, in progress. Therefore, | As mentioned above, it would be useful to start off with the achivement and annex the Results Framework - did what did the project seek to achieve (within in its sphere of influence and constraints) i.e. is it develoment of of policies, adoption of policies? or development, adoption and implementation? |  |
|  | 15 | 15, improved access and efficient means of labour migration and improved migrants – have been achieved. The absence of any intervention and protection of vulnerable migrants – have been achieved. | improved access and efficient means of labour migration and improved migrants – have been achieved. The absence of any intervention and protection of vulnerable migrants – have been achieved. | How did the the project seek to measure/ or report on this, what is the achievement by the end of the project? |  |
|  | 15 | 15, The absence of any intervention and support in managing informal migrant labour within the first SO, and irregular migration and illegal stays within the second SO, was a repeated concern underlined by stakeholders. development process, involving drafting (often with project support), Cabinet and legislative | The absence of any intervention and support in managing informal migrant labour within the first SO, and irregular migration and illegal stays within the second SO, was a repeated concern underlined by stakeholders. development process, involving drafting (often with project support), Cabinet and legislative | This is very important and may need to be mentioned as a gap in the Theory of Change in EQ 1 under Relevance |  |
|  | 15 | 15, involving drafting (often with project support), | involving drafting (often with project support), | Can you add a footnote if the space does not allow, the policies that the project supported thier drafting - and their state at the end of the project |  |
|  | 15 | 15, Labour migration is to promote labour controversial in a context where unemployment is high and the willingness to promote labour emigration for skills acquisition and remittances is greater than the willingness to permit labour emigration for skills acquisition and remittances is greater than the willingness to permit labour immigration to fill skills gaps. capacity building and support | Labour migration is to promote labour controversial in a context where unemployment is high and the willingness to promote labour emigration for skills acquisition and remittances is greater than the willingness to permit labour emigration for skills acquisition and remittances is greater than the willingness to permit labour immigration to fill skills gaps. capacity building and support | This is a very important assumption/risk - did the evalaution find any evidence of this being taken into account when 1. developing the Theory of Change 2. Setting the project targets and timelines? If not this also needs to come out in the Relevance Section |  |
|  | 15 | 15, As stated, the project was a capacity-building and training one with a strong policy | As stated, the project was a capacity-building and training one with a strong policy | Was this originally part of the project design or this became a reality through implementation experience? |  |
|  | 15 | 15, governance development, institution-strengthening orientation; it provided little direct assistance. E- survey respondents who were front-line workers responded that their training had improved their knowledge and skills, but this is a step removed from saying that it actually increased their effectiveness. | governance development, institution-strengthening orientation; it provided little direct assistance. E- survey respondents who were front-line workers responded that their training had improved their knowledge and skills, but this is a step removed from saying that it actually increased their effectiveness. | Can you include the E-survey figures - (how many out of how many). The report can benefit from a few graphs so that the reader can visually grasp the quantitative aspects. |  |
|  | 15 | 15, The project was foundational; it put frameworks, sometimes skills, in place. | The project was foundational; it put frameworks, sometimes skills, in place. | Is this by design of the project or its something that became apparent through implementation? |  |
|  | 15 | 15, 10. How has the project affected the experience of different categories of migrants moving through the migration corridors relevant to the project? How did the ILO’s role as lead agency affect the effectiveness of the | 10. How has the project affected the experience of different categories of migrants moving through the migration corridors relevant to the project? How did the ILO’s role as lead agency affect the effectiveness of the | Probably I missed it in this section but this is EQ is not coming out in this section. May also be linked to data limitation with out FGDs, did the evaluation find anything on these from CSOs and NGOs who represent the different categories of migrants? Was there anything in the annual reports? This question would require a balance of evidence including that from the migrants/CSOs or NGOs representing them. |  |
|  | 16 | 16, Several countries developed and trafficking in persons | Several countries developed and trafficking in persons | Which countries. I propose you add a table showing the countries and the system developed. Can these be attrbuted to the project? If not, is there evidence of project contribution to the development of these systems? This needs to be included to strengthen this finding. |  |
|  | 16 | 16, The establishment of labour migration task forces, technical committees, labour market information systems, the promotion of ethical recruitment practices, etc. has strong potential to eventually benefit systems, the promotion of ethical recruitment practices, etc. has strong potential to eventually benefit labour migrants. The development of data in areas such as Trafficking in Persons has the potential labour migrants. The | The establishment of labour migration task forces, technical committees, labour market information systems, the promotion of ethical recruitment practices, etc. has strong potential to eventually benefit systems, the promotion of ethical recruitment practices, etc. has strong potential to eventually benefit labour migrants. The development of data in areas such as Trafficking in Persons has the potential labour migrants. The | Is this a recommendation? |  |
|  | 16 | 16, The latest results-versus-logframe targets report dates from 2024. In the detailed SAMM reporting framework (the “Accompanying Note”), but also in the more compact OPSYS Excel table, many of the entries are "being developed" or "being piloted," etc., not “achieved.” There is a tendency to try the entries are "being developed" or "being piloted," etc., not “achieved.” There is a tendency to try to promote progress, advancing towards process milestones, to an accomplished outcome. to promote progress, advancing towards process milestones, to an accomplished outcome. | The latest results-versus-logframe targets report dates from 2024. In the detailed SAMM reporting framework (the “Accompanying Note”), but also in the more compact OPSYS Excel table, many of the entries are "being developed" or "being piloted," etc., not “achieved.” There is a tendency to try the entries are "being developed" or "being piloted," etc., not “achieved.” There is a tendency to try to promote progress, advancing towards process milestones, to an accomplished outcome. to promote progress, advancing towards process milestones, to an accomplished outcome. |  |  |
|  | 16 | 16, The project also services, to deal with strengthened the capacity of law enforcement institutions, such as prosecution services, to deal with migration-related issues under their remit. Data collection and management emerged as a critical migration-related issues under their remit. component of effective migration governance. | The project also services, to deal with strengthened the capacity of law enforcement institutions, such as prosecution services, to deal with migration-related issues under their remit. Data collection and management emerged as a critical migration-related issues under their remit. component of effective migration governance. | Can you include the evidence of this, it may be important to also qoute secondary data e.g. pre-post training surveys (if available), progress reports, the Evalaution Survey (if appropriate) and KIIs so that there is diversity of evidence to support findings. |  |
|  | 16 | 16, Eswatini and Seychelles had their National Labour Migration Plans already in place before the SAMM project, but the project contributed to identifying gaps, drafting action plans, and suggesting improvements. | Eswatini and Seychelles had their National Labour Migration Plans already in place before the SAMM project, but the project contributed to identifying gaps, drafting action plans, and suggesting improvements. | Need to further clarify the results-based language here - as a result of the SAMM project what process did the identification of gaps, drafting of action plans and suggestion of process feed into, what was the result of this- was at least a draft MOU or BLMAs developed? |  |
|  | 16 | 16, The latest results-versus-logframe targets report dates from 2024. In the detailed SAMM reporting framework (the “Accompanying Note”), but also in the more compact OPSYS Excel table, many of the entries are "being developed" or "being piloted," etc., not “achieved.” There is a tendency to try the entries are "being developed" or "being piloted," etc., not “achieved.” There is a tendency to try to promote progress, advancing towards process milestones, to an accomplished outcome. to promote progress, advancing towards process milestones, to an accomplished outcome. | The latest results-versus-logframe targets report dates from 2024. In the detailed SAMM reporting framework (the “Accompanying Note”), but also in the more compact OPSYS Excel table, many of the entries are "being developed" or "being piloted," etc., not “achieved.” There is a tendency to try the entries are "being developed" or "being piloted," etc., not “achieved.” There is a tendency to try to promote progress, advancing towards process milestones, to an accomplished outcome. to promote progress, advancing towards process milestones, to an accomplished outcome. | This is very important and as per the comments at the begining of this criteria, may you put a table sowing Result, Baseline, Target and Achivement. |  |
|  | 16 | 16, Again, a process underway is not an outcome achieved. of being used as a tool for identifying and prioritising | Again, a process underway is not an outcome achieved. of being used as a tool for identifying and prioritising | As suggested please put a table for each result showing the Rasult, Baseline, Target, Achievement. From what it looks like, there are several targets that either have not been met, or being reported as been met on paper but on the ground the evaluation found a different story. |  |
|  | 17 | 17, The lack of a work plan specifying partnerships among the four agencies and of ToR for each agency hampered complementarity and coordination, affecting the efficiency of the project. | The lack of a work plan specifying partnerships among the four agencies and of ToR for each agency hampered complementarity and coordination, affecting the efficiency of the project. | This is a very important finding and also needs to be highlighted in the coherence criteria. |  |
|  | 17 | 17, (financial, human, operationally in terms of technical support, etc.) expected outputs, outcomes, | (financial, human, operationally in terms of technical support, etc.) expected outputs, outcomes, | Here you need to consider things like staffing was it adequate, how was it distributed?  Financial resuources including % , overall buget and expenditure, perfomance of the project e.g. Expenditure vs Outputs.  Suggest that you put a table or graphs showing these trends. |  |
|  | 17 | 17, At the highest thematic level, the project’s allocation of resources to capacity building, technical support, and institutional development was sound. Some country-level interviewees expressed the support, and institutional development was sound. | At the highest thematic level, the project’s allocation of resources to capacity building, technical support, and institutional development was sound. Some country-level interviewees expressed the support, and institutional development was sound. | This needs to be supported to evidence or figures |  |
|  | 17 | 17, Some country-level interviewees expressed the view that budget control in Pretoria caused delays in decision-making and fund disbursement for local partners. Some partner institutions reported persistent staffing shortages that hindered local partners. implementation | Some country-level interviewees expressed the view that budget control in Pretoria caused delays in decision-making and fund disbursement for local partners. Some partner institutions reported persistent staffing shortages that hindered local partners. implementation | Was this also corroborated by secondary data i.e. planned vs actual disbursement dates, if there were delays what was the everage number of days, months or weeks delay? How did this affect performance? |  |
|  | 17 | 17, Some partner institutions reported persistent staffing shortages that hindered and sustainability; the project funded activities, but not the staff backup needed to implementation and sustainability; the project funded activities, but not the staff backup needed to make them have a sustainable impact. favoured regional over local implementation, | Some partner institutions reported persistent staffing shortages that hindered and sustainability; the project funded activities, but not the staff backup needed to implementation and sustainability; the project funded activities, but not the staff backup needed to make them have a sustainable impact. favoured regional over local implementation, | Was it that the project did not adequately budget for staff, was there staff turnover or slow recruitment process, how did this affect project performance? |  |
|  | 17 | 17, Others objected that financial allocations disproportionately implementation, creating procedural bottlenecks that impeded country- favoured regional over local implementation, specific interventions. | Others objected that financial allocations disproportionately implementation, creating procedural bottlenecks that impeded country- favoured regional over local implementation, specific interventions. | Is the analysis of the budget and financial documents also showing this? |  |
|  | 17 | 17, implementation. The development of regional migration databases and joint committees of ministers responsible for immigration and labour migration represented positive steps toward regional coordination. positive steps toward regional coordination. | implementation. The development of regional migration databases and joint committees of ministers responsible for immigration and labour migration represented positive steps toward regional coordination. positive steps toward regional coordination. | Is this attirbutable to the project? Or is there evidence of contribution? If so need to also highlight that due to the project's intervention x,y,z the development of regional migration... |  |
|  | 17 | 17, A concern was the fact that PUNO's financial reports were generally late. | A concern was the fact that PUNO's financial reports were generally late. | Was this also coraborated by secondary evidence, on average how late were the reports? |  |
|  | 17 | 17, Gender equality and inclusivity have been addressed under EQs related to Coherence and Effectiveness. resource allocation | Gender equality and inclusivity have been addressed under EQs related to Coherence and Effectiveness. resource allocation | A good point to start here based on the EQ is on whether the evaluation identified any evidence and to what extent of deliberate allocation of project resources to specifically address the UN cross-cutting themes, "To what extent have resources been allocated to address UN cross-cutting themes (such as human rights, gender equity, inclusiveness of....)" |  |
|  | 18 | 18, However, the call by interviewees for continued capacity building and Technical Assistance was near- universal. Capacity-building approaches revealed a tension between training individuals and developing institutional capacity. While numerous training sessions were implemented, stakeholders | However, the call by interviewees for continued capacity building and Technical Assistance was near- universal. Capacity-building approaches revealed a tension between training individuals and developing institutional capacity. While numerous training sessions were implemented, stakeholders | The report appears to be based primarily of perceptions of interviewees i.e. only one form of data collection. Can the report try as much as possible to triangulate and coroborate evidence. This is so that the report does not appear to only be focused on perceptions of KIIs making findings highly subjective. |  |
|  | 18 | 18, While numerous training sessions were implemented, stakeholders emphasised the need for more comprehensive capacity building that creates sustainable institutions capable of managing migration issues effectively. The development of labour migration task forces, capable of managing migration issues effectively. The information systems, and governance structures | While numerous training sessions were implemented, stakeholders emphasised the need for more comprehensive capacity building that creates sustainable institutions capable of managing migration issues effectively. The development of labour migration task forces, capable of managing migration issues effectively. The information systems, and governance structures | Did they give further details of what this comprehensive capacity building entails? |  |
|  | 18 | 18, studies, migration databases, country migration profiles, special studies on statelessness, etc. was to encourage harmonised national statistical migration databases | studies, migration databases, country migration profiles, special studies on statelessness, etc. was to encourage harmonised national statistical migration databases | Important to mention a few highl levels ones and add an Annex listing all of them |  |
|  | 18 | 18, While one of the goals of the project databases merging migration data with was to encourage harmonised national statistical migration databases merging migration data with administrative data (especially labour force surveys, but other household surveys, as well), there administrative data (especially labour force surveys, but other household surveys, as well), there was only scattered progress. concepts in labour and mixed | While one of the goals of the project databases merging migration data with was to encourage harmonised national statistical migration databases merging migration data with administrative data (especially labour force surveys, but other household surveys, as well), there administrative data (especially labour force surveys, but other household surveys, as well), there was only scattered progress. concepts in labour and mixed | Needs to come out in the effectiveness criteria |  |
|  | 18 | 18, Multiple workshops and trainings proved useful in defining basic migration, but actual application lagged behind. The lack of capacity concepts in labour and mixed migration, but actual application lagged behind. The | Multiple workshops and trainings proved useful in defining basic migration, but actual application lagged behind. The lack of capacity concepts in labour and mixed migration, but actual application lagged behind. The | So with this, did the TOC assumptions and implementation strategy stand in as far as targets and results are concerned, what is/or are the orverall finding(s) considering this. |  |
|  | 18 | 18, The project’s interventions, although not always closed or finalised, have | The project’s interventions, although not always closed or finalised, have | Good to have a table even as an annex showing what is closed and what is still open |  |
|  | 18 | 18, Some of these are to be continued under other interventions with other funds. | Some of these are to be continued under other interventions with other funds. | Did the evaluation already find evidince of committment towards this, are there interventions that are already continuting under the PUNOs or have been taken over by other relevant stakeholders? Would be important to write thi ssection considering what is happening in the funding for the humanitarian and development sector. |  |
|  | 18 | 18, Stakeholders consistently emphasised the need | Stakeholders consistently emphasised the need | Which stakeholders and did the evaluation find evidence of how the PUNOs respondend to these? |  |
|  | 19 | 19, While an exit strategy was prepared in the final months of the project, there is no evidence that it was actually implemented. Multiple stakeholders, including UN agency staff, expressed confusion was actually implemented. about the project's conclusion. | While an exit strategy was prepared in the final months of the project, there is no evidence that it was actually implemented. Multiple stakeholders, including UN agency staff, expressed confusion was actually implemented. about the project's conclusion. | Very important finding |  |
|  | 19 | 19, was held in Zimbabwe documentation about sustainability | was held in Zimbabwe documentation about sustainability | Include date |  |
|  | 19 | 19, 4. CONCLUSIONS | 4. CONCLUSIONS | What is not coming out clearly to me even under Conclusion 3 is: Overall, did the project achieve its intended results/targets? Also taking into account some of these findings:  1. Some important results have not been achived 2. The exit strategy has not been implemented 3. Sustainability planning was overlooked - even is done the context has changed rapidly since the strart of 2025. 4. Some key ministry stakeholders interviewed appeared unaware the the project had ended 5. Multiple stakehodlers including UN staff expressed confusion about the project's conclusion. |  |
|  | 21 | 21, RECOMMENDATIONS | RECOMMENDATIONS | What I see from this recommendations is a solid a clear focus on future interventions.  There is a need for one or two solid recommendation(s) considering the current status of the just ended SAMM projectas identified in the findings: 1. Some important results have not been achived 2. The exit strategy has not been implemented 3. Sustainability planning was overlooked - even if done, the context has changed rapidly since the start of 2025. 4. Some key ministry stakeholders interviewed appeared unaware the the project had ended 5. Multiple stakehodlers including UN staff expressed confusion about the project's conclusion.  There is need for one or two solid recommendations on how the PUNOs should address these and remedy the situation. Also taking into consideration that the recommendations of doing more/adding more money may not work due to the limited funding situation and potential downscalling of some if not all of the the PUNOs in the region. |  |
|  | 23 | 23, The One-UN joint approach of partnering the four agencies was well-conceived, but in implementation, became one of four agencies pursuing programmes that were more often several than joint. The evaluation team did not agencies pursuing programmes that were more often several than joint. emerge with a strong sense of inter-agency partnership. | The One-UN joint approach of partnering the four agencies was well-conceived, but in implementation, became one of four agencies pursuing programmes that were more often several than joint. The evaluation team did not agencies pursuing programmes that were more often several than joint. emerge with a strong sense of inter-agency partnership. | Very importnant could be part of the findings |  |
|  | 23 | 23, The SAMM project could have done better at overcoming delays and reducing confusion if it had more aggressively engaged with senior government officials – Permanent Secretary and deputy more aggressively engaged with senior government officials – Permanent Secretary and deputy levels. overcome | The SAMM project could have done better at overcoming delays and reducing confusion if it had more aggressively engaged with senior government officials – Permanent Secretary and deputy more aggressively engaged with senior government officials – Permanent Secretary and deputy levels. overcome |  |  |
|  | 23 | 23, But the metaphor of a funnel is useful: Much reform at the policy level, leading to smaller reforms at the implementation level, leading to yet-smaller impacts at the individual level. Some institutional and implementation level, leading to yet-smaller impacts at the individual level. | But the metaphor of a funnel is useful: Much reform at the policy level, leading to smaller reforms at the implementation level, leading to yet-smaller impacts at the individual level. Some institutional and implementation level, leading to yet-smaller impacts at the individual level. |  |  |
|  | 23 | 23, 6. LESSONS LEARNT AND GOOD PRACTICES | 6. LESSONS LEARNT AND GOOD PRACTICES | Also indcate that they detailed more in Annexes |  |
|  | 24 | 24, A third good practice was decentralisation. combinatorial challenge, the decentralisation | A third good practice was decentralisation. combinatorial challenge, the decentralisation |  |  |
|  | 24 | 24, One was the design of the geographic scale, the fact that project as one of broad scale and scope. | One was the design of the geographic scale, the fact that project as one of broad scale and scope. |  |  |
|  | 24 | 24, The intense (weekly) coordination mechanism of the project, which was darkened by the COVID introduced by the project team in the early days of the project, emergency, contributed significantly to keeping the project on | The intense (weekly) coordination mechanism of the project, which was darkened by the COVID introduced by the project team in the early days of the project, emergency, contributed significantly to keeping the project on |  |  |
|  | 48 | 48, ANNEX 3: DATA TABLE ON PROJECT PROGRESS IN ACHIEVING TARGETS BY INDICATORS WITH COMMENTS | ANNEX 3: DATA TABLE ON PROJECT PROGRESS IN ACHIEVING TARGETS BY INDICATORS WITH COMMENTS | This is very important as it forms part of the primary analysis for Efficiency and Effectiveness |  |
|  | 62 | 62, Lesson Learnt 6: | Lesson Learnt 6: | For not increasing the length of the report, I suggest if possible here include the mention the importance of having the project sustainability and exit strategy prepared, owned and understood by all staekholders early, communicating as needed with all stakeholders through out all the phases of the project. |  |