Using AC-3 to come up with a good title

David Hildering Dennis Lindberg Joel Maxson Helen Sand Andy S. Tatman

Thursday 20th March, 2025

Abstract

We give a toy example of a report in *literate programming* style. The main advantage of this is that source code and documentation can be written and presented next to each other. We use the listings package to typeset Haskell source code nicely.

Contents

1	Intr	roduction	2
2 The skeleton files			2
	2.1	The AC3Solver library	2
	2.2	The Backtracking library	4
3	The problem files		
	3.1	The NQueens library	5
	3.2	The Graph Colouring library	6
	3.3	The Scheduling library	11
4	Wrapping it up in an exectuable		17
5	The test file(s)		18
6	AC3 tests		18
7	AC3 tests Conclusion		20
Bi	Bibliography		

1 Introduction

TODO: What is AC-3, why use it (etc)...

AC-3 paper: [Mac77]

TODO: Add a note that AC-3 cannot solve -> See Dennis' example, now in ac3Tests.lhs

2 The skeleton files

These files form the basis of our implementation, which we then use to solve various problems.

2.1 The AC3Solver library

This module contains the main algorithm and definition for our project, the AC3 type.

```
module AC3Solver where

import Control.Monad.Writer

( runWriter, MonadWriter(tell), Writer )
```

To start of, we define the AC3 instance. For each agent, we have a set of agents of type a. An AC3 instance then constrains a list of constraints constraintAA, and a list of domains. Each constraintAA contains a pair of agents (X,Y), and then a function, such as (==), which is the constraint on the arc from X to Y. ¹ Each Domain item contains an agent, and then a list of values of type b.

We may have multiple constraints for a pair of agents (X,Y), such as both (>) and (>=). The programme however expects that each agent mentioned in a constraint has exactly 1 (possibly empty) domain specified for it.

Note that we do not define an arbitrary instance for AC3. Instead, we define arbitrary instances for specific problems. (See for example Section 3.2.)

```
data AC3 a b = AC3 {
    -- Constraint should take values from the first & second agents as params x & y resp.
    in \x,y-> x ?=? y.
    -- We should allow for multiple constraints for (X,Y), eg. both (x > y) AND (x < y) in
        the set.
    cons :: [ConstraintAA a b],
    -- Assume we have 1 domain list for each variable. (TODO: Check for this?))
    domains :: [Domain a b] }

type Domain a b = (Agent a, [b])
type ConstraintAA a b = (Agent a, Agent a, Constraint b)
type Constraint a = a -> a -> Bool

type Agent a = a
```

For each constraint (X,Y,f), we want to check for each value in the domain of X whether there is a value in Y's domain such that f x y is satisfied. Values of X for which there is no such

¹Note that we only allow for *binary* constraints. The AC-3 algorithm does not allow for ternary (or greater) constraints, and unary constraints can be resolved by restricting that agent's domain. [Mac77] provides other approaches for achieving path consistency, where you may have ternary (or greater) constraints.

value in Y are removed from X's domain. We make use of the Writer monad to do an O(1) lookup to see if we removed items from X's domain.

Each time we call iterate, we start by looking for the domains of agents X & Y for our constraint (X,Y). Once we find these, we are likely to replace the original domain for X with a reduced one. We use popXy and popX to find the domains for X & Y, and at the same time we also remove the *old* domain for X. Using popXy, we do one walk through the list, and save two walks, compared to doing a separate lookup for Y, and a separate walk to delete the old Y.

```
-- PRE: x is an element of (a:as)
popX :: Eq a => Agent a -> [Domain a b] -> ([b], [Domain a b] )
popX _ [] = undefined -- should not occur.
popX x (a@(aA, aD):as) = if x == aA then (aD,as)
                         else let (x', as') = popX x as in (x', a:as')
-- PRE: x != y; x,y are elements of (a:as).
        (else, this is not a binary constraint but a unary one.)
popXy :: Eq a => Agent a -> Agent a -> [Domain a b] -> ([b], [b], [Domain a b] )
popXy _ _ [] = undefined -- should not occur.
popXy x y (a@(aA, aD):as)
    | x == aA = let -- we want to REMOVE a from the list.
        -- search through the rest of the list and return y's domain.
        yDomain = head [b' | (a',b')<-as, y==a']</pre>
        in (aD, yDomain, as)
    | y == aA = let (retX, retAs) = popX x as in (retX, aD, a:retAs)
    | otherwise = let (retX, retY, retAs) = popXy x y as in (retX, retY, a:retAs)
```

We now come to the main part of the algorithm. The iterateAC3 function runs as long as the queue of constraints is not empty, starting with the original set of constraints. We get the domains of X & Y, and remove the *old* domains of X. We then run checkDomain, and add the new domain of X back to the list of domains. If X's domain was altered, then we add all constraints of the form (Y,X) to the back of the queue.

```
ac3 :: (Ord a, Ord b) => AC3 a b -> [Domain a b] -- return a list of domains.
ac3 m@(AC3 c d) = let
   queue = c -- put each constraint into the queue. -- TODO: implement this better, eg a
       proper queue?
    in iterateAC3 m queue d
iterateAC3 :: (Ord a, Ord b) => AC3 a b -> [ConstraintAA a b] -> [Domain a b]
               -> [Domain a b]
iterateAC3 _ [] d = d
iterateAC3 m@(AC3 fullCS _) ((x,y,c):cs) d = let
    (xDomain, yDomain, alteredD) = popXy x y d
    (newX, str) = runWriter $ checkDomain xDomain yDomain c
        -- In a lens, we could do this with "modify (\ (a,_) -> (a, newX))"
   newDomains = (x, newX) : alteredD
    -- take all constraints of the form (y,x, c)
   z = if null str then cs else cs ++ [c'] c'@(y1,x1,_)<-fullCS, y1/=y && y1/=x, x1==x]
   in iterateAC3 m z newDomains
```

2.2 The Backtracking library

Using our AC3 instances, we now define a backtracking method to find one or all solutions (where possible) for a given instance. We start by defining the 'output' of our backtracking method, which will be a list [Assignment a b].

```
module Backtracking where
import AC3Solver
type Assignment a b = (Agent a, b)
```

First of all, we can provide a fast method to check that a solution is even *theoretically* possible: if at least 1 agent has an empty domain, then there will never be a legal assignment.

```
--Returns true iff at least 1 agent has an empty domain.
--Post: Returns true -> \not \exist a solution.
-- However, returns false does NOT guarantee that a solution exists.
determineNoSol :: [Domain a b] -> Bool
determineNoSol = any (\(_, ds) -> null ds)
```

Next, we use backtracking to try and find a solution, using backtracking. For our agent X, we iterate over each value in X's domain. For every constraint (X,Y) or (Y,X), where Y has already got an assigned value, we check if this constraint holds. If at least one of these constraints does not hold, then we continue with the next value in X's domain. Else, we continue with the next agent. If we find a valid assignment Just ..., then we return this, else we try the next value in X's domain.

If no value in X's domain leads to a valid assignment, we return Nothing, and try a different assignment, or return Nothing if no solution exists for this instance.

Notably, while findSolution takes an instance of AC3, we can run findSolution without having run ac3, and so we can compare the runtime of findSolution before and after running ac3.

```
findSolution :: Eq a => AC3 a b -> Maybe [Assignment a b]
findSolution (AC3 c d) = helpFS c d []
helpFS :: Eq a => [ConstraintAA a b] -> [Domain a b] -> [Assignment a b] -> Maybe [
   Assignment a b]
helpFS _ [] as = Just as -- Done
helpFS constrs ((x, ds):dss) as = recurseFS ds where
   recurseFS [] = Nothing
    recurseFS (d:ds') = let
        -- we want to try assigning value d to agent x.
        -- Get all constraints (X,Y) and (Y,X), where Y already has a value assigned to it.
        -- Check if x=d works, for all previously assigned values Y.
        checkCons = and $
            [cf d (valY y as) | (x',y,cf) < -constrs, x==x', y 'elemAs' as] ++
            [cf (valY y as) d | (y,x',cf) \leftarrow constrs, x==x', y' 'elemAs' as]
        if not checkCons then recurseFS ds' -- easy case, x=d is not allowed.
            case helpFS constrs dss ((x,d):as) of
                Nothing -> recurseFS ds' -- x=d causes issues later on.
                Just solution -> Just solution -- :)
```

As with findSolution, findAllSolutions returns the (possibly empty) list of all solutions, again using backtracking.

```
-- find all
findAllSolutions :: Eq a => AC3 a b -> [[Assignment a b]]
findAllSolutions (AC3 c d) = helpFSAll c d []
```

Given a solution, verify whether this solution is permissible with the provided constraints.

```
checkSolution :: Eq a => [ConstraintAA a b] -> [Assignment a b] -> Bool
checkSolution [] _ = True
checkSolution ((x,y,f):cs) as = elemAs x as && elemAs y as && let
    xN = valY x as
    yN = valY y as
    in f xN yN && checkSolution cs as
```

Help-functions used by our solution methods.

```
-- Find whether agent Y has an assignment.
elemAs :: Eq a => Agent a -> [Assignment a b] -> Bool
elemAs _ [] = False
elemAs y ((x,_):as) = x==y || y 'elemAs' as

-- Find agent Y's assigned value
-- PRE: y \in as.
valY :: Eq a => Agent a -> [Assignment a b] -> b
valY _ [] = undefined -- should not happen.
valY y ((x,b):as) = if x == y then b else valY y as
```

3 The problem files

3.1 The NQueens library

The NQueens module defines a constraint satisfaction problem where we place N queens on an $N \times N$ chessboard so that no two queens attack each other.

```
module NQueens where
import AC3Solver ( ac3, AC3(AC3) ) -- Import AC3 solver
import Backtracking (findSolution, findAllSolutions ) -- Import backtracking solver

notSameQueenMove :: (Int, Int) -> (Int, Int) -> Bool
notSameQueenMove (a1, a2) (b1, b2) =
    not (a1 == b1 || a2 == b2 || abs (a1 - b1) == abs (a2 - b2))

(//=) :: (Int, Int) -> (Int, Int) -> Bool
(a1, a2) //= (b1, b2) = notSameQueenMove (a1, a2) (b1, b2)
```

The nQueens function encodes the N-Queens problem as a constraint satisfaction problem. The domain is defined in such a way that exactly one queen must be placed in each row. Constraints are generated using list comprehension together with the custom infix function (//=), which ensures that no two queens share the same row, column, or diagonal.

```
nQueens :: Int -> AC3 Int (Int, Int)
nQueens n = let
```

```
agents = [0 .. n-1] -- Queens as row numbers domain = [(row, [(row, col) | col <- [0 .. n-1]]) | row <- agents] -- 1 queen per row constraints = <math>[(a, b, (//=)) | a <- agents, b <- agents, a < b] in AC3 constraints domain
```

There are two functions available to solve the problem. The function solveNQueens finds a single solution using backtracking. Meanwhile, the function solveAllNQueens finds all possible solutions.

```
solveNQueens :: Int -> Maybe [(Int, (Int, Int))]
solveNQueens n = findSolution (AC3 constraints (ac3 (nQueens n)))
where
   AC3 constraints _ = nQueens n

solveAllNQueens :: Int -> [[(Int, (Int, Int))]]
solveAllNQueens n = findAllSolutions (AC3 constraints (ac3 (nQueens n)))
where
   AC3 constraints _ = nQueens n
```

The function prettyPrintBoard is responsible for printing the board. Solutions are displayed using numbers (0,1,2,...) to represent queens, while empty spaces are represented by a dot (.).

```
prettyPrintBoard :: Int -> [(Int, (Int, Int))] -> IO ()
prettyPrintBoard n solution = do
    let board = [[if (r, c) 'elem' map snd solution then show r else "." | c <- [0 .. n-1]]
        | r <- [0 .. n-1]]
        mapM_ (putStrLn . pptHelper) board
        putStrLn ""

pptHelper :: [String] -> String
pptHelper [] = ""
pptHelper [x] = x
pptHelper (x:xs) = x ++ " " ++ pptHelper xs
```

The nQueensMain function provides user interaction by asking for an input value N. It then solves the problem and either prints the full solutions or just the count of solutions, depending on whether prettyPrintBoard is enabled. To start the NQueens program, run stack ghci and then nQueensMain, after which you are prompted to give an integer for N.

```
nQueensMain :: IO ()
nQueensMain = do
   putStrLn "Enter board size (N):"
   n <- readLn
   let solutions = solveAllnQueens n
   -- Uncomment for 1 solution instead
   -- let solutions = solveNQueens n
   if null solutions
   then putStrLn "No solution found."
   else do
        putStrLn "Solutions: "
        -- Comment out if only interested in the number of solutions
        -- mapM_ (prettyPrintBoard n) solutions
        putStrLn $ "Found " ++ show (length solutions) ++ " solution(s)"</pre>
```

3.2 The Graph Colouring library

Graph colouring is a well-known NP-Complete problem [GJS74]. Its nature as a graph problem lends it well to being modelled as an AC3 instance, and then being solved using our backtracking functions.

A problem instance consists of an undirected graph, and an integer n > 0. We are asked to

assign a colour 0..(n-1) to each vertex, where for each edge (u, v), u and v have different colours.

```
--{-# LANGUAGE LambdaCase #-} -- todo remove? if not using data.graph.read...

module GraphCol where

import Control.Monad (when, foldM_)
import Criterion.Main
import Data.Char (toUpper)
import Data.Graph
--import Data.Graph.Read
import Data.List
import Text.Read (readMaybe)
import Test.QuickCheck

import AC3Solver
import Backtracking
import Scheduling (parseInput)
```

We make use of Haskell's Graph library, following in its convention that vertices are numbers, and edges are pairs of vertices.

We define a newtype GraphCol using AC3, where the agents are of type Vertex and the domain is a set of colours \subseteq [0..(n-1)]. All constraints should be of the form (X,Y,(/=)), and this represents an edge (X,Y) in the graph.

We define arbitrary instances for GraphCol using following these conventions.

```
-- We define a newtype, so that we can generate arbitrary instances.
newtype GraphCol = GC (AC3 Vertex Int)
seqPair :: (Gen a, Gen a) -> Gen (a,a)
seqPair (ma, mb) = ma >>= \a -> mb >>= \b -> return (a,b)
-- (Seems graphs don't already have an arbitrary instance...)
instance Arbitrary GraphCol where
    arbitrary = sized arbitGraphColN where
        arbitGraphColN n = do
            nColours <- choose (1, max (n 'div' 4) 1) -- we require n to be > 0 sizeV <- choose (0, n 'div' 3) -- we make vertices 0..sizeV INCLUDING SIZEV!
             sizeE <- choose (0,n 'div' 2)
             e <- sequence [seqPair (choose (0, sizeV), choose (0, sizeV)) | _<-[0..sizeE]]
             -- we do not want edges (x,x)
             let nonReflE = filter (uncurry (/=)) e
             let g = buildG (0, sizeV) nonReflE
             return $ convertGraphToAC3 g nColours --return $ convertGraphToAC3 g n
instance Show GraphCol where
  --show :: GraphCol -> String
 show (GC (AC3 c d)) = let
strCon = "[" ++ makeShow c ++ "]" where
      makeShow [] = ""
      makeShow ((x,y,_):cs) =
        "(" ++ show x ++ ", " ++ show y ++ ", (/=))"
         ++ if not $ null cs then ", " ++ makeShow cs else ""
    strD = show d
    in "GC (AC3 " ++ strCon ++ " " ++ strD ++ " )"
```

We define a method to convert a graph into an instance of GraphCol, and vice versa. Note that graph colouring concerns un directed graphs while the Graph library concerns directed graphs. As a result, g == ac3ToGraph \$ convertGraphToAC3 g n (for any n > 0) is NOT guaranteed to hold.

```
-- NOTE: The Graph library uses *directed* graphs.
-- We add both (x,y,/=) and (y,x,/=), as graph colouring concerns Undirected graphs.
-- Create an instance with colours [0..(n-1)]
-- PRE: n >= 1
```

```
convertGraphToAC3 :: Graph -> Int -> GraphCol
convertGraphToAC3 g n = let
    agents = vertices g
    constr = [(x,y, (/=)) | (x,y) < -edges g]
    in GC $ AC3
        (constr ++ reverseCons constr)
          - In graph colouring, we want to check both X's domain to Y, and Y's to X.
        ((head agents, [0]) : [(a, [0..(n-1)]) | a<-tail agents])
-- Help function: If we have an edge (x,y), we need both (x,y,\ /=) and (y,x,/=) as
   constraints
reverseCons :: [(a,b,c)] -> [(b,a,c)]
reverseCons = map (\ (a,b,c) \rightarrow (b,a,c))
ac3ToGraph :: GraphCol -> Graph
ac3ToGraph (GC (AC3 c d)) = let
    v = [a | (a,_) < -d]
    e = nub [ (a,b) | (a,b,_) < -c] -- If we originally had <math>(x,y) AND (y,x) in our graph,
        then c contains each twice.
    in buildG (foldr min 0 v, foldr max minBound v) e
```

We provide a section of code that may optimise the GraphCol instance. We assign the colour 0 to the vertex 0, as in graph colouring we can arbitrarily assign a colour to the 'first' vertex.

However, if the graph consists of multiple disconnected components, then we can do such an arbitrary assignment to a vertex in each separate component, thereby reducing the search space.

```
optimiseGC :: GraphCol -> GraphCol
optimiseGC gc@(GC (AC3 c d)) = let
  comps = components $ ac3ToGraph gc
  -- if 0 is in the tree, we want to just keep 0. Else, we will take the root and
  -- (arbit.ly) assign it the colour 0, as it is in a separate component to 0.
  dChanges = map (\t@(Node r _) -> if 0 'elem' t then 0 else r) comps
  in GC (AC3 c (map (\((a,b) -> )) if a 'elem' dChanges then (a,[0]) else (a,b)) d))
```

The actual main part of the programme, for Graph Colouring:

```
getGraphChoice :: IO Int
getGraphChoice = do
 putStr "Choose one of the following options: \n\
         \1: Read in a graph colouring instance from the terminal \n\
         \2: Read in a graph colouring instance from a file \n\
         \3: Run benchmarks \n"
  choice <- getLine
 case readMaybe choice of
   Nothing -> do
     putStrLn "Invalid choice, please try again."
      getGraphChoice
    Just n ->
     if n > 0 && n < 4 then return n else do
        putStrLn "Invalid choice, please try again."
        getGraphChoice
graphColMain :: IO ()
graphColMain = do
   choice <- getGraphChoice
    case choice of
       1 -> terminalGraph
        2 -> fileGraph
        3 -> benchmarkTests
        _ -> undefined
 - PRE: m <= n.
getEdges :: Int -> Int -> IO [Edge]
getEdges m n
 | m == n = return []
  | otherwise = do
     putStrLn $ "Edge " ++ show m
     x <- parseInput "Enter the first vertex: "
```

```
y <- parseInput "Enter the second vertex: "
                     rest <- getEdges (m+1) n
                     return $ (x,y) : rest
terminalGraph :: IO ()
terminalGraph = do
     nVertices <- parseInput "Enter the number of vertices: "
      {\tt putStrLn~\$~"Okay,~we~number~the~vertices~from~0~to~"~++~show~(nVertices-1)}
           - TODO: Error handling, eg. if nVertices <= 0 ?
     nEdges <- parseInput "Enter the number of edges: "</pre>
       eList <- getEdges 0 nEdges
     let graph = buildG (0, nVertices-1) eList
nColours <- parseInput "Enter the number of colours: "</pre>
     let g = convertGraphToAC3 graph nColours
     putStrLn $ "We run AC3 on this instance: " ++ show g
      runGraph g
-- Given a graphcol instance, we run AC3 on it. If we have at least 1 solution (after back
           prop.),
            show it to the user, % \left( 1\right) =\left( 1\right) +\left( 1\right
runGraph :: GraphCol -> IO ()
runGraph (GC ac3Inst) = do
      let ac3Domain = ac3 ac3Inst
       if determineNoSol ac3Domain
             then putStrLn "AC3 has found an empty domain for at least 1 agent -> No solution"
              else do
                     putStrLn "AC3 has at least 1 option for each agent."
                      case findSolution ac3Inst of
                             Nothing -> putStrLn "There is no solution based on the reduced AC3 input."
                             Just sol -> do
                                    putStrLn $ "We have found a solution: " ++ show sol
                                    putStrLn "Do you want to find out how many different solutions we have? (Y/N) "
                                    choice <- getLine
                                    when (toUpper (head choice) == 'Y') $ do
                                           let allSols = findAllSolutions ac3Inst
                                            if length allSols == 1 then putStrLn "There is only 1 solution."
                                            else do -- it should not be possible to reach here if all Sols = 0.
                                                   putStrLn $ "There are " ++ show (length allSols) ++ " different solutions. \
                                                                 nDo you want to see them? (Y/N)
                                                   choice2 <- getLine</pre>
                                                   when (toUpper (head choice2) == 'Y') $ mapM_ print allSols
```

PROBABLY TODO REMOVE (but nice to break up)

```
readGraphFromFile :: String -> IO GraphCol
readGraphFromFile filename = do
 filecon <- readFile filename
 let fileInput = words filecon
 let nVertices = read $ head fileInput
 let nEdges = read $ head (tail fileInput)
 let edgeList = makeEdges nEdges (drop 2 fileInput) -- includes nColours
 let nColours = read $ last fileInput
 let graph = buildG (0, nVertices-1) edgeList
 let g = convertGraphToAC3 graph nColours
 return g
fileGraph :: IO ()
fileGraph = do
 putStrLn "We expect the file to be of the following format: \n\
           \[ number of vertices ] \ \ \
           \[number of edges] \n\
           \ \ [the number of colours > 0.]\n"
 putStrLn "Provide the file name:"
 filename <- getLine
 filecon <- readFile filename
 let fileInput = words filecon
 let nVertices = read $ head fileInput
```

```
let nEdges = read $ head (tail fileInput)
 let edgeList = makeEdges nEdges (drop 2 fileInput) -- includes nColours
  let nColours = read $ last fileInput
  let graph = buildG (0, nVertices-1) edgeList
 let g = convertGraphToAC3 graph nColours
  - }
 g <- readGraphFromFile filename
 putStrLn $ "We run AC3 on this instance: " ++ show g
 runGraph g
-- PRE: n >= 0.
makeEdges :: Int -> [String] -> [Edge]
makeEdges 0 _ = []
-- if n > 0, but we have run out of edges -> fail
makeEdges _ [] = undefined
makeEdges _ [_] = undefined
makeEdges n (x:y:es) = (read x, read y) : makeEdges (n-1) es
graphFileFormat :: GraphCol -> IO ()
graphFileFormat (GC (AC3 c d)) = do
  --let nVertices = (fst . last . sort) d
  -- nVertices
  -- succ, as we want vertices from (0..n-1)
 (print . succ . fst . maximum) d
  --let nEdges = length c
  -- nEdges
  (print . length) c
   - print each edge
  foldM_{-} ( \_ (x,y,_) -> putStrLn $ show x ++ " " ++ show y) () c
  -- print nColours
  print . succ foldr (\(\_, ds) x \rightarrow foldr max x ds) 0 d
```

PROBABLY TODO REMOVE (but nice to break up)

```
-- A method to note the difference before & after running AC3.
getTotalDomainOptions :: [Domain a b] -> Int
getTotalDomainOptions = foldr (\(_, ds) prev -> length ds + prev) 0
testFiles :: [String] --TODO: Automate this for all files in /lib
testFiles = map ("graphcolInstances/"++) ["n10e16nc14.txt", "n10e18nc9.txt", "n15e16nc2.txt", "n15e38nc6.txt", "n20e96nc20.txt", "n25e110nc15.txt", "n25e134nc22.txt"]
benchmarkTests :: IO ()
benchmarkTests = mapM_ runBenchmark testFiles
runBenchmark :: String -> IO ()
runBenchmark filename = do
 gc@(GC inst) <- readGraphFromFile filename</pre>
  let origNOpts = getTotalDomainOptions $ domains inst
 let newD = ac3 inst
 let newNOpts = getTotalDomainOptions newD
  let (GC optiInst) = optimiseGC gc
 let newOptiD = ac3 optiInst
let newNOptiD = getTotalDomainOptions newOptiD
 putStrLn $ "Filename: " ++ filename
  putStrLn $ "Pre AC-3:
                                 " ++ show origNOpts
                                 " ++ show newNOpts
  putStrLn $ "Post AC-3:
                                 " ++ (show . getTotalDomainOptions . domains) optiInst
  putStrLn $ "OptimiseGC:
  putStrLn $ "OptimiseGC AC-3: " ++ show newNOptiD
  -- Benchmark Criterion bit
  defaultMain [
    bgroup filename [ bench "pre AC-3" \$ whnf findSolution inst
                     , bench "post AC-3" $ whnf findSolution (AC3 (cons inst) (ac3 inst))
                      , bench "OptimiseGC, no AC-3" $ whnf (\(GC oi) -> findSolution oi) (
                          optimiseGC gc)
                      , bench "OptimiseGC, + AC-3" $ whnf (\(GC oi) -> findSolution (AC3 (
                         cons inst) (ac3 oi))) (optimiseGC gc)
```

3.3 The Scheduling library

```
module Scheduling where
import Text.Parsec
import Text.Parsec.String
import Control.Monad (replicateM)
import Data.List (elemIndex)
import AC3Solver
import Backtracking (findSolution)
type ClassAssignment = (Int, Int, Int)
dayNames :: [String]
dayNames = ["monday", "tuesday", "wednesday", "thursday", "friday"]
parseInt :: Parser Int
parseInt = do
 spaces
 n <- many1 digit
  return (read n)
parseInput :: String -> IO Int
parseInput prompt = do
 putStrLn prompt
  read <$> getLine
getNames :: String -> Int -> IO [String]
getNames prompt n = do
 putStrLn prompt
  replicateM n getLine
getUserInputs :: IO (Int, Int, [String], [String], [String])
getUserInputs = do
  numClasses <- parseInput "Enter the number of classes:"</pre>
 classNames <- getNames "Enter class names:" numClasses
 numRooms <- parseInput "Enter the number of rooms:"</pre>
  roomNames <- getNames "Enter room names:" numRooms</pre>
 numTimeSlots <- parseInput "Enter the number of time slots per day:"</pre>
  timeSlotNames <- getNames "Enter time slot names:" numTimeSlots
  return (numClasses, numRooms, numTimeSlots, classNames, roomNames, timeSlotNames)
testUserInputs :: IO ()
testUserInputs = do
  (numClasses, numRooms, numTimeSlots, classNames, roomNames, timeSlotNames) <-
      getUserInputs
 putStrLn "\nCollected Inputs:"
  putStrLn $ "Number of Classes: " ++ show numClasses
 putStrLn $ "Class Names: " ++ show classNames putStrLn $ "Number of Rooms: " ++ show numRooms
 putStrLn $ "Room Names: " ++ show roomNames
 putStrLn $ "Number of Time Slots per Day: " ++ show numTimeSlots
  putStrLn $ "Time Slot Names: " ++ show timeSlotNames
checkSameDay :: ClassAssignment -> ClassAssignment -> Bool
checkSameDay (x,_{,-},_{-}) (y,_{,-},_{-}) = x == y
checkBefore :: ClassAssignment -> ClassAssignment -> Bool
checkBefore (x,x2,_) (y,y2,_) = x == y && x2 + 1 == y2
checkAfter :: ClassAssignment -> ClassAssignment -> Bool
checkAfter (x, x2, _) (y, y2, _) = x == y && x2 == y2 + 1
checkDay :: Int -> ClassAssignment -> Bool
checkDay a (x,_,_) = x == a
checkTime :: Int -> ClassAssignment -> Bool
checkTime a (\_,x,\_) = x == a
```

```
checkRoom :: Int -> ClassAssignment -> Bool
checkRoom a (_,_,x) = x == a
filterDomains :: [Domain Int ClassAssignment] -> [(Agent Int, ClassAssignment -> Bool)] ->
    [Domain Int ClassAssignment]
filterDomains domainList conditions
    [(agent, [v | v <- values, all (\(a, f) -> (a /= agent) || f v) conditions]) | (agent,
       values) <- domainList]</pre>
getConstraint :: [String] -> IO (Maybe [ConstraintAA Int ClassAssignment])
getConstraint classNames = do
 putStrLn "Enter a constraint (e.g., 'class1 is before class2' or 'class1 is the same day
     as class2'). Type 'Done' to finish:"
  input <- getLine
 if input == "Done" then return Nothing else do
    let parts = words input
    case parts of
      [class1, "is", "before", class2] -> Just <$> processConstraints class1 class2 "is
         before" classNames
      [class1, "is", "the", "same", "day", "as", class2] -> Just <$> processConstraints
         class1 class2 "is the same day as" classNames
       putStrLn "Invalid input format"
        getConstraint classNames
processConstraints :: String -> String -> String -> [String] -> IO [ConstraintAA Int
   ClassAssignment]
processConstraints class1 class2 keyword classNames = do
 case (elemIndex class1 classNames, elemIndex class2 classNames) of
    (Just i, Just j) -> case keyword of
      "is before" -> return [(i, j, checkBefore), (j, i, checkAfter)]
      "is the same day as" -> return [(i, j, checkSameDay), (j, i, checkSameDay)]
                  -> error "Invalid keyword"
    _ -> error "Invalid class names"
collectConstraints :: [String] -> IO [ConstraintAA Int ClassAssignment]
collectConstraints classNames = do
 let loop acc = do
       constraint <- getConstraint classNames</pre>
        case constraint of
          Nothing -> return acc
          Just cs -> loop (cs ++ acc)
 loop []
getStartingValues :: [String] -> [String] -> [String] -> IO (Maybe (Agent Int,
    ClassAssignment -> Bool))
getStartingValues classNames roomNames timeslotNames = do
 putStrLn "Enter known values (e.g., 'class1 is in room3', 'class1 is at 11am' or 'class1
     is on monday'). Type 'Done' to finish:"
  input <- getLine
 if input == "Done" then return Nothing else do
   let parts = words input
    case parts of
      [class1, "is", "in", room] -> Just <$> processStartingValues class1 room "is in"
         classNames roomNames
      [class1, "is", "at", time] -> Just <$> processStartingValues class1 time "is at"
         classNames timeslotNames
      [class1, "is", "on", day] -> Just <$> processStartingValues class1 day "is on"
         classNames dayNames
       putStrLn "Invalid input format"
        getStartingValues classNames roomNames timeslotNames
processStartingValues :: String -> String -> String -> [String] -> [String] -> IO (Agent
   Int, ClassAssignment -> Bool)
processStartingValues class1 value keyword classNames valueNames = do
  case (elemIndex class1 classNames, elemIndex value valueNames) of
    (Just i, Just j) -> case keyword of
      "is in" -> return (i, checkRoom j)
      "is at" -> return (i, checkTime j)
      "is on" -> return (i, checkDay j)
                  -> error "Invalid keyword"
```

```
_ -> error "Invalid name"
collectStartingValues :: [String] -> [String] -> [String] -> IO [(Agent Int,
    ClassAssignment -> Bool)]
collectStartingValues classNames roomNames timeslotNames = do
 let loop acc = do
        value <- getStartingValues classNames roomNames timeslotNames
        case value of
          Nothing -> return acc
          Just svs -> loop (svs : acc)
 loop []
printSolution :: [String] -> [String] -> [String] -> [(Agent Int,
   ClassAssignment)] -> IO ()
printSolution classNames days roomNames timeSlotNames list = putStrLn $ concat
 [classNames !! agent ++ " is scheduled on " ++ days !! dayId ++
    " in " ++ roomNames !! roomId ++ " at " ++ timeSlotNames !! timeId ++ ".\n"
  | (agent, (dayId, roomId, timeId)) <- list]</pre>
schedulingMain :: IO ()
schedulingMain = do
  (numClasses, numRooms, numTimeSlots, classNames, roomNames, timeSlotNames) <-
      getUserInputs
 constraints <- collectConstraints classNames</pre>
 let uniquenessConstraints = [(i, j, (/=)) | i < [0..numClasses-1], j < [0..numClasses]
     -1], i /= j]
 let allConstraints = constraints ++ uniquenessConstraints
 let classDomains = [(i, [(d, t, r) | d <- [0..5], t <- [0..numTimeSlots-1], r <- [0..
numRooms-1]]) | i <- [0..numClasses-1]]</pre>
 domainConditions <- collectStartingValues classNames roomNames timeSlotNames
 let filteredDomains = filterDomains classDomains domainConditions
 let possibleSolutions = ac3 AC3 { cons = allConstraints, domains = filteredDomains }
 let solution = findSolution AC3 { cons = allConstraints, domains = possibleSolutions }
 case solution of
    Nothing -> putStrLn "No solution found."
    Just sol -> printSolution classNames dayNames roomNames timeSlotNames sol
```

```
module Sudoku where

import Data.List (intercalate)
import AC3Solver ( AC3 (..), ac3, ConstraintAA, Domain )
```

This file contains the implementation of Sudoku puzzles, printing Sudoku boards, and calling the AC3 solver on puzzles.

The end result is a program that can do something like the following.

```
sudokuMain :: IO ()
sudokuMain = do
    showWelcomeMessage

putStr "Choose your difficulty: \n\
    \ (1) easy\n\
    \ (2) hard\n\
    \ (3) special\n"

putStr "\nSelect one of (1, 2, 3): "
    diff <- getLine

fileName <- case diff of
    "1" -> do
        putStr "Choose a puzzle number between 1 and 50: "
        puzzleNum <- getLine
        return ("easy" ++ puzzleNum)

"2" -> do
```

```
putStr "Choose a puzzle number between 1 and 95: "
            puzzleNum <- getLine
            return ("hard" ++ puzzleNum)
        "3" -> do
            putStr "Choose a puzzle: \n\
                 \ (2) Mirror\n\
            \ (3) Times1\n"
putStr "\nYour choice: "
            puzzleName <- getLine
            return $ case puzzleName of
                "1" -> "impossible'
                "2" -> "Mirror"
                "3" -> "Times1"
                _ -> "impossible"
        _ -> do
            putStrLn "Invalid choice. Please try again."
            sudokuMain -- Restart if invalid choice
                        -- This line is never reached but needed for type checking
    -- Print the initial puzzle and the result after applying AC3
    putStr $ "\nSolving Sudoku puzzle " ++ fileName ++ "...\n
    (beforeAC3, afterAC3) <- computeReductionFromFile fileName
   putStrLn "The average domain size:"
putStrLn $ " Before AC3: " ++ show beforeAC3
putStrLn $ " After AC3: " ++ show afterAC3
    -- Solve the Sudoku puzzle from the file
    solveSudokuFromFile fileName
-- Display welcome banner
showWelcomeMessage :: IO ()
showWelcomeMessage = do
   putStrLn "-----
                   SUDOKU AC3 SOLVER
    putStrLn "|
                                                         1.9
    putStrLn "---
    putStrLn ""
```

The constraints on any given cell are: 1. it must contain a distinct number from other cells in the same row, 2. it must contain a distinct number from other cells in the same column, 3. it must contain a distinct number from other cells in the same 3x3 box.

An Agent is represented by a cell, which in-turn is represented as a tuple (i, j) where i is the row number and j is the column number.

```
-- Encode all possible cells in a 9x9 grid
allCells :: [(Int, Int)]
allCells = [(i,j) \mid i \leftarrow [1..9], j \leftarrow [1..9]]
sameRow :: (Int, Int) -> (Int, Int) -> Bool
sameRow (x1,_) (y1,_) = x1 == y1
sameCol :: (Int, Int) -> (Int, Int) -> Bool
sameCol(_,x2)(_,y2) = x2 == y2
sameBox :: (Int, Int) -> (Int, Int) -> Bool
sameBox (x1,y1) (x2,y2) = (x1 - 1) 'div' 3 == (x2 - 1) 'div' 3 & (y1 - 1) 'div' 3 == (y2 - 1)
     1) 'div' 3
-- for all x: (fst x - 1) in {0,1,2} (box row)
-- for all y: (snd y - 1) in \{0,1,2\} (box column)
-- when both the box row and box column are the same for x and y, they are in the same box.
-- All cells must obey the three constraints.
sudokuConstraints :: [ConstraintAA (Int, Int) Int]
                        [(i, j, (/=)) | i <- allCells, j <- allCells, i /= j, i 'sameRow' j] ++ [(i, j, (/=)) | i <- allCells, j <- allCells, i /= j, i 'sameCol' j] ++ [(i, j, (/=)) | i <- allCells, j <- allCells, i /= j, i 'sameBox' j]
sudokuConstraints =
```

```
-- The domain will change depending on the puzzle being solved. Some cells should have fixed values.

-- Each cell can take on a value from 1 to 9.
sudokuDomains :: [Domain (Int, Int) Int]
sudokuDomains = [(i, [1..9]) | i <- allCells]

-- An empty Sudoku puzzle (no initial cells filled in)
sudokuEmpty :: AC3 (Int, Int) Int
sudokuEmpty = AC3 sudokuConstraints sudokuDomains
```

Using the 'sudokuConstraints' as a backbone we can define our own sudoku puzzle. It's quite tedious because it requires us to specify the initial grid. The particular example below is a Sudoku puzzle with a unique solution.

```
- Define the initial grid
startingCellsUnique :: [Domain (Int, Int) Int]
startingCellsUnique = [
    ((1,3), [1]),
    ((1,5), [6]),
    ((1,9), [4]),
    ((2,1), [8]),
    ((2,4), [1]),
    ((2,6), [4]),
    ((2,8), [6]),
((3,2), [3]),
    ((3,7), [8]),
    ((3,9), [5]),
    ((4,1), [7]),
    ((4,3), [8]),
    ((4,5), [2]),
    ((4,9), [3]),
    ((5,2), [6]),
    ((5,3), [3]),
    ((5,7), [1]),
    ((5,8), [2]),
    ((5,9), [9]),
    ((6,5), [1]),
    ((7,1), [3]),
    ((7,7), [2]),
    ((7,9), [8]),
    ((8,1), [1]),
    ((8,3), [4]),
    ((8,5), [5]),
((8,6), [9]),
    ((8,7), [3]),
    ((9,2), [7]),
    ((9,4), [8]),
    ((9,6), [3]),
    ((9,7), [5]),
    ((9,8), [9]),
((9,9), [1])
-- Combine the starting values with the rest of the (empty) cells
sudokuExampleDomainUnique :: [Domain (Int, Int) Int]
sudokuExampleDomainUnique = startingCellsUnique ++ [(i, [1..9]) | i <- allCells, i 'notElem
    ' map fst startingCellsUnique]
sudokuExampleUnique :: AC3 (Int, Int) Int
sudokuExampleUnique = AC3 sudokuConstraints sudokuExampleDomainUnique
```

Instead of specifying our own sudoku puzzles we can leverage a repository of sudoku puzzles. Below is the code needed to load sudoku puzzles.

```
-- Read a Sudoku puzzle from a file
readSudokuFromFile :: FilePath -> IO [Domain (Int, Int) Int]
readSudokuFromFile filepath = do
contents <- readFile filepath
```

```
let rows = lines contents
   return (parseSudokuDomains rows)
-- Parse the file contents into domain representation
parseSudokuDomains :: [String] -> [Domain (Int, Int) Int]
parseSudokuDomains rows = cellDomains where
    - Convert characters to domain values
   charToDomain :: Char -> [Int]
    -- Dots represent empty cells, their domain contains all possible values
   charToDomain '.' = [1..9]
    -- Digits represent fixed cells, their domain contains only that value
   charToDomain c = if c >= '1' && c <= '9' then [read [c]] else [1..9]
   -- Return a list of domains for each cell
   string is a row
                (j, c) < -zip [1...9] (take 9 row)]
-- Create a AC3 formatted Sudoku puzzle from a file
loadSudokuPuzzle :: String -> IO (AC3 (Int, Int) Int)
loadSudokuPuzzle fileName = do
   let filepath = "sudokuPuzzles/" ++ fileName ++ ".sud"
   cellDomains <- readSudokuFromFile filepath
   return (AC3 sudokuConstraints cellDomains)
```

Below are two functions that take a file (name) as input and does: - 'solveSudokuFromFile': loads a sudoku puzzle from a file, runs AC3, and prints the initial and final state of the puzzle. - 'computeReductionFromFile': loads a sudoku puzzle from a file, runs AC3, and computes the average domain size before and after running AC3.

Note the input to both of the above should be a **file name**, which means one of the following: - "easy1", "easy2", ..., "easy50", - "hard1", "hard2", ..., "hard95", - "impossible", "Mirror", "Times1".

```
-- Load, run AC3, and print a Sudoku puzzle
solveSudokuFromFile :: String -> IO ()
solveSudokuFromFile fileName = do
    puzzle <- loadSudokuPuzzle fileName
    putStrLn "Initial puzzle:"
    printSudokuPuzzle puzzle
    putStrLn "\nAfter applying AC3:"
    printSudokuSolution puzzle

-- Compute the average domain size before and after running AC3
computeReductionFromFile :: String -> IO (Float, Float)
computeReductionFromFile fileName = do
    puzzle <- loadSudokuPuzzle fileName
    return (computeReduction puzzle)
```

The code above relied on some pretty-printing and reduction computation, which are defined below.

```
-- Visualize a Sudoku board based on current domains
visualizeSudoku :: [Domain (Int, Int) Int] -> String
visualizeSudoku domains' = unlines (
    horizontalLine : concatMap formatRow [1 .. 9]
)
where
-- Get the domain for a specific cell
getDomain i j =
    case [d | ((i', j'), d) <- domains', i' == i, j' == j] of
    (d:_) -> d
    [] -> [1..9] -- Default domain if not specified

-- Display a cell: single digit if domain has 1 element, empty otherwise
```

```
cellValue i j =
       let domain' = getDomain i j
       in if length domain' == 1
          then show (head domain')
    -- Horizontal line patterns
   horizontalLine = "+---+---+---+"
   thickLine = "+==+==+==+==+==+==+==+==+"
   -- Format a row with appropriate separators
   formatRow i =
       let rowStr = " | " ++ intercalate " | " [cellValue i j | j <- [1..9]] ++ " |"
           separator = if i 'mod' 3 == 0 && i /= 9 then thickLine else horizontalLine
       in [rowStr, separator]
-- Function to print the initial state of a Sudoku puzzle
printSudokuPuzzle :: AC3 (Int, Int) Int -> IO ()
printSudokuPuzzle (AC3 _ domains') = do
   putStrLn (visualizeSudoku domains')
-- Function to run and print a Sudoku solution
printSudokuSolution :: AC3 (Int, Int) Int -> IO ()
printSudokuSolution puzzle = do
   let solution = ac3 puzzle
   putStrLn (visualizeSudoku solution)
```

```
-- Compute the amount of reduction in domain size before and after applying AC-3

computeReduction :: AC3 (Int, Int) Int -> (Float, Float)

computeReduction puzzle = (fromIntegral originalSize/81, fromIntegral reducedSize/81)

where

originalSize = sum (map length (getDomains puzzle))

reducedSize = sum (map (length . snd) (ac3 puzzle)) -- Using AC-3 algorithm to reduce

the domains

-- Extract the domains of each cell from a sudoku puzzle

getDomains :: AC3 (Int, Int) Int -> [[Int]]

getDomains (AC3 _ domains') = map snd domains'
```

4 Wrapping it up in an exectuable

TODO

```
module Main where
import Text.Read (readMaybe)
import GraphCol
import Knapsack
import Scheduling
import Sudoku
import NQueens
import ZebraPuzzle
getChoice :: IO Int
getChoice = do
 putStr "Choose one of the following options: \n\
         \1: Graph Colouring \n\
         \2: N-Queens \n\
         \3: Scheduling \n\
         \4: Sudoku \n\
         \5: Zebra Puzzle \n"
 choice <- getLine
 case readMaybe choice of
   Nothing -> do
      putStrLn "Invalid choice, please try again."
```

```
getChoice
    Just n ->
      if n > 0 && n < 6 then return n else do
        putStrLn "Invalid choice, please try again."
main :: IO ()
main = do
 putStrLn "Hello!"
  --print somenumbers
 --print (map funnyfunction somenumbers)
  --myrandomnumbers <- randomnumbers
  --print myrandomnumbers
 --print (map funnyfunction myrandomnumbers)
  --putStrLn "GoodBye"
 -- Get choice
 choice <- getChoice
 case choice of
    1 -> graphColMain
    2 -> nQueensMain
   3 -> schedulingMain
    4 -> sudokuMain
    5 -> zebraPuzzleMain
    _ -> undefined
```

We can run this program with the commands:

```
stack build
stack exec myprogram
```

5 The test file(s)

6 AC3 tests

```
module Main where
import AC3Solver
import Backtracking
import Data.Maybe
import Test.Hspec
import Test.QuickCheck
main :: IO ()
main = hspec $ do
  describe "AC3 Tests" $ do
    -- TODO remove
    --it "Example test" $
       ac3 exampleAC3 'shouldBe' [(4,[1,2]),(3,[0,1,2]),(2,[0,1,2]),(1,[0,1,2]),(0,[0])]
    it "Positive example (each agent has non-empty domain) - 1" $
      ac3 exampleAC3 'shouldNotSatisfy' determineNoSol
    it "Positive example (each agent has non-empty domain) - 2" $
     ac3 exampleAC3_2 'shouldNotSatisfy' determineNoSol
    it "Positive example (each agent has non-empty domain) - 3" $
  ac3 exampleAC3_GFG 'shouldNotSatisfy' determineNoSol
    it "Positive example (at least 1 actual solution) - 1" \$ do
      let newD = ac3 exampleAC3
      findSolution (AC3 (cons exampleAC3) newD) 'shouldSatisfy' isJust
    it "Positive example (at least 1 actual solution) - 2" $ do
      let newD = ac3 exampleAC3_2
      findSolution (AC3 (cons exampleAC3_2) newD) 'shouldSatisfy' isJust
    it "Positive example (at least 1 actual solution) - 3" $ do
```

```
let newD = ac3 exampleAC3_GFG
  findSolution (AC3 (cons exampleAC3_GFG) newD) 'shouldSatisfy' isJust
it "Negative example (has no solution) - 1" $ do
  let newD = ac3 exampleAC3_bad
  findSolution (AC3 (cons exampleAC3_bad) newD) 'shouldBe' Nothing
it "Negative example (has no solution) - 2" $ do
 let newD = ac3 exampleAC3_triv
 findSolution (AC3 (cons exampleAC3_triv) newD) 'shouldBe' Nothing
it "Negative example (has no solution) - 3" $ do
 let newD = ac3 exampleAC3_no_solution
  findSolution (AC3 (cons exampleAC3_no_solution) newD) 'shouldBe' Nothing
-- The --coverage says these cases are never reached, but that is simply not true lol.
-- It says this even with these cases, but that notwithstanding: according to the test
    report.
   we always get the otherwise case, which would seemingly point to us eventually
   reaching the
     [] = undefined case
let xAgent = ("x", [1 :: Int])
let yAgent = ("y", [2])
let d = [xAgent, yAgent]
it "Test popXy x==a" $ do
   popXy "x" "y" d 'shouldBe' ([1], [2], [yAgent])
it "Test popXy y==a" $ do
popXy "y" "x" d 'shouldBe' ([2], [1], [xAgent])
```

```
-- TEST CASES
exampleAC3 :: AC3 Int Int
exampleAC3 = let
    nColours = 3
    nAgents = 5
    -- we assign a specific starting value to an (arbitrary) node. (TODO: for general
    encoding, if a vertex has no edges, assign an arbit colour.)
in AC3 [ (a, (a+1) 'mod' nAgents, (/=)) | a<-[0..nAgents-1]] ((0, [0]) : [ (a, [0..
        nColours -1]) | a < -[1..nAgents -1]])</pre>
-- A graph is 2-colourable iff it is bipartite iff it has no cycles of odd length.
-- (Such as, this example which is a circle of even length.)
exampleAC3_2 :: AC3 Int Int
exampleAC3_2 = let
    nColours = 2
    nAgents = 6
    -- we assign a specific starting value to an (arbitrary) node.
    in AC3 ([ (a, (a-1) 'mod' nAgents, (/=)) | a<-[0..nAgents-1]]++[ (a, (a+1) 'mod'
        nAgents, (/=)) | a<-[0..nAgents-1]])
            ((0, [0]) : [ (a, [0..nColours-1]) | a<-[1..nAgents-1]])
-- NOT 2-colourable, as it has an odd cycle (circle of len 5).
exampleAC3_bad :: AC3 Int Int
exampleAC3_bad = let
    nColours = 2
    nAgents = 5
     -- we assign a specific starting value to an (arbitrary) node.
    in AC3 ([ (a, (a-1) 'mod' nAgents, (/=)) | a<-[0..nAgents-1]]++[ (a, (a+1) 'mod' nAgents, (/=)) | a<-[0..nAgents-1]])
            ((0, [0]) : [ (a, [0..nColours-1]) | a<-[1..nAgents-1]])
 - NOT 1-colourable, as it has an edge.
exampleAC3_triv :: AC3 Int Int
exampleAC3_triv = let
    nColours = 1 -- can only be 1-colourable iff cons = [].
    nAgents = 5
    -- we assign a specific starting value to an (arbitrary) node.
    in AC3 ([ (a, (a+1) 'mod' nAgents, (/=)) | a<-[0..nAgents-1]])
            ((0, [0]) : [ (a, [0..nColours-1]) | a<-[1..nAgents-1]])
-- Example based on https://www.geeksforgeeks.org/3-coloring-is-np-complete/
-- IS 3-colourable.
exampleAC3_GFG :: AC3 String Int
exampleAC3_GFG = let
```

7 Conclusion

Finally, we can see that [LW13] is a nice paper.

References

- [GJS74] M. R. Garey, D. S. Johnson, and L. Stockmeyer. Some simplified NP-complete problems. In Proceedings of the Sixth Annual ACM Symposium on Theory of Computing, STOC '74, page 47–63, New York, NY, USA, 1974. Association for Computing Machinery.
- [LW13] Fenrong Liu and Yanjing Wang. Reasoning about agent types and the hardest logic puzzle ever. *Minds and Machines*, 23(1):123–161, 2013.
- [Mac77] Alan K. Mackworth. Consistency in networks of relations. *Artificial Intelligence*, 8(1):99–118, 1977.