

# Problem Set 1

Tate Mason

## Problem 1: Conceptual Problem

### Part 1: What is the effect of whether a child watches TV on their math skill?

A difference in differences approach could be used in this case. We could run an experiment where we randomly assign a group of children to watch a certain amount of TV each day, while another group of children do not watch any TV. We would then measure the math skills of both groups before and after the experiment. The difference in the change in math skills between the two groups would give us an estimate of the effect of watching TV on math skills. Problems could arise from children having differing levels of parental involvement, access to educational resources (tutors), or differing levels of innate ability.

### Part 2: Is working around retirement age good for the person's health?

An RD approach is applicable here. We set the discontinuity at the age of retirement, comparing health outcomes for individuals just below and just above retirement age. There is no reason to believe that individuals just below and just above retirement age would be systematically different in terms of health, other than the fact that one group is working and the other is not. Problems arise from factors like pre-existing conditions or differences in access to healthcare.

### Part 3: Is the racial wage gap in part due to discrimination against racial minorities?

- Note: Consider only two groups: racial minorities vs. racial majority.

Using a model which employs an instrumental variable would likely be the best course. The goal would be to find an instrument which is simultaneously affiliated with race, but uncorrelated with wage. The difficulty arises in this search. For instance, using something like neighborhood as an IV is surely correlated with race, given historical policies surrounding how cities were segregated, but there is also likely correlation with wage.

## Part 4: What is the effect of whether the mother receives welfare money support while the child is young on the child's future income (by age 40)?

There are two approaches which would be equally effective, though both run into similar issues. First, a diff-in-diff approach could be used. This would allow for simple interpretation of the effect of income outcomes for those whose families were recipients of welfare benefits vs. those who were not. However, difficulty arises in data access/integrity issues. It is difficult to maintain good data over 40 years for a good sample, and is also hard to be granted access to such data if it exists. An RD setup would produce similar ease of interpretation. To implement this type of approach, set the cutoff line at the income threshold for receiving welfare benefits, then examine the difference in outcomes for those just above and below the line. Data access would be similarly difficult here. Across both setups, an issue also arises in that income is not a fixed state. For instance, there may be years where the mother is on welfare, but times where she is not. Thus, the children who spent, say, a couple of months on welfare vs. the kids who spent their entire adolescence in that state should have systematically different outcomes.

## Problem 2: Coding

### Part 1: Creating dataset

1. Set random seed to 1
  2.  $N = 10000$
  3. Draw  $\epsilon_i^D \perp \epsilon_i^Y \sim N(0, 1)$
  4. Draw  $U_i \sim N(0, 0.5)$  (Note: s.d. is 0.5)
  5. Create  $Z_i = \mathbb{1}(z_i > 0.5)$  where  $z_i$  is randomly drawn from a uniform distribution on  $[0, 1]$
  6. Create  $D_i = \mathbb{1}(\alpha_0 + \alpha_Z Z_i + \alpha_U U_i + \epsilon_i^D > 0)$  such that  $\alpha_0 = -4, \alpha_Z = 5, \alpha_U = 4$
  7. Create  $Y_i = \beta_0 + \beta_D D_i + \beta_Z Z_i + \beta_U U_i + \epsilon_i^Y$  such that  $\beta_0 = 3, \beta_D = 2, \beta_Z = 0, \beta_U = 6$
- $\beta_Z Z_i + \beta_U U_i + \epsilon_i^Y = \epsilon_i$

```
df <- data.frame(
  id = 1:10000,
  epsilon_D = rnorm(10000, mean = 0, sd = 1),
  epsilon_Y = rnorm(10000, mean = 0, sd = 1),
  U_i = rnorm(10000, mean = 0, sd = 0.5)
)

z_i <- runif(10000, min = 0, max = 1)
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Z_i = as.numeric(z_i > 0.5),
```

```

D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 5 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 0 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
)

```

## Part 2: Estimating the effect of $D$ on $Y$ with OLS

```

OLS <- lm(Y_i ~ D_i, data = df)
summary(OLS)

```

Call:

```
lm(formula = Y_i ~ D_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
-10.2473	-2.0084	-0.1544	1.9659	9.2807

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.02336	0.03642	55.56	<2e-16 ***
D_i	4.72039	0.06021	78.40	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 2.9 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-squared: 0.3807, Adjusted R-squared: 0.3807

F-statistic: 6146 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

## Part 3: Estimating the effect of $D$ on $Y$ with IV

```

IV <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV)

```

Call:

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-11.14794	-2.10898	0.01567	2.11343	10.84223

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.92404	0.04738	61.71	<2e-16 ***
D_i	2.25817	0.09716	23.24	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.133 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.2771, Adjusted R-squared: 0.2771

Wald test: 540.1 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

#### Part 4: OLS of $D$ on $Z$ (with a constant)

- yields:  $\hat{D} = (L(D|Z))$  and  $\tilde{D} = D - \hat{D}$

**a) Regress  $Y$  on  $\hat{D}$  (with a constant)**

**b) Regress  $Y$  on  $D$  and  $\tilde{D}$  (with a constant)**

- Explain why the coefficient on  $\hat{D}$  in a) is the same as the coefficient on  $D$  in b). Explain why both are also the same as the IV estimate from Part 3. What is the intuition behind the coefficient on  $\tilde{D}$  in b)? Optional: explain the relationship between the standard errors of the estimates in a), b), and Part 3.

**a)**

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    D_hat = predict(lm(D_i ~ Z_i, data = df)),
    D_tilde = D_i - D_hat
  )
model_a <- lm(Y_i ~ D_hat, data = df)
summary(model_a)
```

```

Call:
lm(formula = Y_i ~ D_hat, data = df)

Residuals:
    Min       1Q   Median       3Q      Max
-11.614  -2.516   0.199   2.388  12.973

Coefficients:
            Estimate Std. Error t value Pr(>|t|)
(Intercept)  2.92404    0.05463   53.52  <2e-16 ***
D_hat        2.25817    0.11203   20.16  <2e-16 ***
---
Signif. codes:  0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.612 on 9998 degrees of freedom
Multiple R-squared:  0.03905,    Adjusted R-squared:  0.03896
F-statistic: 406.3 on 1 and 9998 DF,  p-value: < 2.2e-16

```

**b)**

```

model_b <- lm(Y_i ~ D_i + D_tilde, data = df)
summary(model_b)

```

```

Call:
lm(formula = Y_i ~ D_i + D_tilde, data = df)

Residuals:
    Min       1Q   Median       3Q      Max
-10.9638  -1.7894   0.0297   1.8385   9.4420

Coefficients:
            Estimate Std. Error t value Pr(>|t|)
(Intercept)  2.92404    0.04077   71.72  <2e-16 ***
D_i          2.25817    0.08360   27.01  <2e-16 ***
D_tilde      4.46237    0.11255   39.65  <2e-16 ***
---
Signif. codes:  0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 2.696 on 9997 degrees of freedom

```

Multiple R-squared: 0.4649, Adjusted R-squared: 0.4648  
 F-statistic: 4342 on 2 and 9997 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

$\beta_{\tilde{D}}$  in model a) is the same as  $\beta_D$  in model b) because both models are essentially capturing the same variation in  $D$  which is explained by  $Z$ . This is the same as the IV estimate from **3** because the IV method captures the variation in  $D$  that is correlated with  $Z$ . The coefficient on  $\tilde{D}$  in model b) captures the variation in  $D$  that is not explained by  $Z$ , which is unrelated to the instrument and thus does not contribute to the estimation of the causal effect of  $D$  on  $Y$ .

**Part 5: Change DGP s.t.  $\beta_Z = 1$ , redo 3. Then change DGP s.t.  $\beta_Z = -1$ , redo 3.**

- Explain why the IV estimates of  $\beta_D$  are biased in these two cases, and why the bias changes sign when  $\beta_Z$  changes sign. Optional: explain the intuition for why the bias of the estimator of the coefficient on  $D$  changes sign when  $\beta_Z = \{0, 1\}$ .

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
IV5a <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV5a)
```

Call:

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
-11.08396	-1.92037	-0.00676	1.95614	10.35569

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.86006	0.04371	65.44	<2e-16 ***
D_i	3.80869	0.08963	42.49	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 2.89 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.4263, Adjusted R-squared: 0.4262

Wald test: 1806 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + -1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
IV5b <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV5b)
```

Call:

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
-11.2119	-2.3955	0.1247	2.2961	12.2946

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.98802	0.05216	57.287	< 2e-16 ***
D_i	0.70764	0.10696	6.616	3.88e-11 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.449 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.09203, Adjusted R-squared: 0.09194

Wald test: 43.77 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: 3.881e-11

## Part 6:

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 10 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
IV6a <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV6a)
```

Call:

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-11.10825	-2.14575	0.05882	2.16869	10.92009

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.88435	0.04642	62.13	<2e-16 ***
D_i	3.22000	0.06556	49.12	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.134 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.2509, Adjusted R-squared: 0.2508

Wald test: 2412 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 10 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + -1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
IV6b <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV6b)
```

Call:

ivreg(formula = Y\_i ~ D\_i | Z\_i, data = df)

Residuals:

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-11.19456	-2.17591	0.02275	2.14348	11.89132

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.97066	0.04770	62.28	<2e-16 ***
D_i	1.12828	0.06736	16.75	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.22 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.06005, Adjusted R-squared: 0.05996

Wald test: 280.5 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16



## Part 7:

$D_i$  by formation cannot deviate from compliance. When  $Z_i = 0$ , The sum of  $\alpha_0, \alpha_U, \epsilon_i^D$  is negative as  $\alpha_0 = -4$  while  $\alpha_U * U + \epsilon_i^D$  is not greater than 4, thus implying  $D_i = 0$  when  $Z_i = 0$ .

## Part 8:

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Z_i = as.numeric(z_i > 0.5),
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 5 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 0 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y,
    pZ = length(Z_i == 1)/length(id),
    pD = length(D_i == 1)/length(id),
    compliers = (pZ*D_hat)/pD
  )
length(df$compliers)
```

```
[1] 10000
```

```
cor(df$Z_i, df$D_i)
```

```
[1] 0.6694964
```

As shown in the last part, there can be no always-takers or never-takers as people will not defy treatment  $D_i$

## Part 9:

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Z_i = as.numeric(z_i > 0.5),
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 10 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 0 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y,
    pZ = length(Z_i == 1)/length(id),
    pD = length(D_i == 1)/length(id),
```

```

    compliers = (pZ*D_hat)/pD
  )
length(df$compliers)

```

```
[1] 10000
```

```
cor(df$Z_i, df$D_i)
```

```
[1] 0.9570938
```

The proportion remains the same as the coefficient on  $Z_i$  does not effect anything when  $Z_i = 0$ . Thus, all units will comply.

### Part 10: How does correlation between $D$ and $Z$ vary with the proportion of compliers when we change $\alpha_Z$ ?

While the proportion of compliers does not vary, we see higher correlation when  $\alpha_Z = 10$ , such that  $corr(Z_i, D_i) = 0.96$ . When  $\alpha_Z = 5$ ,  $corr(Z_i, D_i) = 0.67$ .

### Part 11: Show that we can justify the claim of no external validity problems from item 1.

### Part 12: Repeat with seed values of 2, 3, and 4

```

set.seed(2)

df <- data.frame(
  id = 1:10000,
  epsilon_D = rnorm(10000, mean = 0, sd = 1),
  epsilon_Y = rnorm(10000, mean = 0, sd = 1),
  U_i = rnorm(10000, mean = 0, sd = 0.5)
)

z_i <- runif(10000, min = 0, max = 1)
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Z_i = as.numeric(z_i > 0.5),
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 5 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
  )

```

```

    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 0 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
OLS <- lm(Y_i ~ D_i, data = df)
summary(OLS)

```

Call:

```
lm(formula = Y_i ~ D_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
-10.1670	-2.0674	-0.1108	1.9913	10.4347

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.05792	0.03628	56.72	<2e-16 ***
D_i	4.64392	0.06083	76.34	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 2.912 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-squared: 0.3683, Adjusted R-squared: 0.3682

F-statistic: 5828 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```

IV <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV)

```

Call:

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
-11.07161	-2.13429	-0.02852	2.17754	12.07252

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.96252	0.04739	62.52	<2e-16 ***
D_i	2.10146	0.09933	21.16	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.156 on 9998 degrees of freedom  
 Multiple R-Squared: 0.2579, Adjusted R-squared: 0.2578  
 Wald test: 447.6 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    D_hat = predict(lm(D_i ~ Z_i, data = df)),
    D_tilde = D_i - D_hat
  )
model_a <- lm(Y_i ~ D_hat, data = df)
summary(model_a)
```

Call:

```
lm(formula = Y_i ~ D_hat, data = df)
```

Residuals:

Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
-12.4818	-2.4946	0.1184	2.4921	13.0604

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.96252	0.05408	54.77	<2e-16 ***
D_hat	2.10146	0.11338	18.54	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.603 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-squared: 0.03322, Adjusted R-squared: 0.03312

F-statistic: 343.6 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
model_b <- lm(Y_i ~ D_i + D_tilde, data = df)
summary(model_b)
```

Call:

```
lm(formula = Y_i ~ D_i + D_tilde, data = df)
```

Residuals:

Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
-----	----	--------	----	-----

-10.2498 -1.8127 0.0082 1.8597 10.5775

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.96252	0.04060	72.96	<2e-16 ***
D_i	2.10146	0.08511	24.69	<2e-16 ***
D_tilde	4.54446	0.11379	39.94	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 2.705 on 9997 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-squared: 0.4552, Adjusted R-squared: 0.4551

F-statistic: 4176 on 2 and 9997 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%  
  mutate(  
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y  
  )  
IV5a <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)  
summary(IV5a)
```

Call:

ivreg(formula = Y\_i ~ D\_i | Z\_i, data = df)

Residuals:

Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
-10.35525	-1.95761	-0.02863	1.97623	11.55490

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.90669	0.04363	66.62	<2e-16 ***
D_i	3.67491	0.09146	40.18	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 2.906 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.4111, Adjusted R-squared: 0.4111

Wald test: 1614 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + -1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
IV5b <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV5b)
```

Call:

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-12.12745	-2.41072	0.07622	2.40888	12.59013

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	3.01835	0.05225	57.764	< 2e-16 ***
D_i	0.52802	0.10954	4.821	1.45e-06 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.481 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.06862, Adjusted R-squared: 0.06853

Wald test: 23.24 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: 1.453e-06

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 10 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
IV6a <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV6a)
```

Call:

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-11.142994	-2.137132	-0.006763	2.200596	12.102601

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.92684	0.04624	63.29	<2e-16 ***
D_i	3.10706	0.06529	47.59	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.139 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.233, Adjusted R-squared: 0.2329

Wald test: 2265 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 10 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + -1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
IV6b <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV6b)
```

Call:

ivreg(formula = Y\_i ~ D\_i | Z\_i, data = df)

Residuals:

Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
-11.13680	-2.16387	-0.03453	2.17185	12.10879

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	3.00065	0.04733	63.40	<2e-16 ***
D_i	1.02707	0.06683	15.37	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.213 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.04927, Adjusted R-squared: 0.04918

Wald test: 236.2 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
```

```

    Z_i = as.numeric(z_i > 0.5),
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 5 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 0 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y,
    pZ = length(Z_i == 1)/length(id),
    pD = length(D_i == 1)/length(id),
    compliers = (pZ*D_hat)/pD
  )
length(df$compliers)

```

[1] 10000

```
cor(df$Z_i, df$D_i)
```

[1] 0.6637294

```

df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Z_i = as.numeric(z_i > 0.5),
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 10 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 0 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y,
    pZ = length(Z_i == 1)/length(id),
    pD = length(D_i == 1)/length(id),
    compliers = (pZ*D_hat)/pD
  )
length(df$compliers)

```

[1] 10000

```
cor(df$Z_i, df$D_i)
```

[1] 0.962287

```

set.seed(3)
df <- data.frame(
  id = 1:10000,
  epsilon_D = rnorm(10000, mean = 0, sd = 1),
  epsilon_Y = rnorm(10000, mean = 0, sd = 1),
  U_i = rnorm(10000, mean = 0, sd = 0.5)
)

```



```
)

z_i <- runif(10000, min = 0, max = 1)
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Z_i = as.numeric(z_i > 0.5),
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 5 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 0 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
OLS <- lm(Y_i ~ D_i, data = df)
summary(OLS)
```

Call:

```
lm(formula = Y_i ~ D_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
-10.3604	-2.0804	-0.1357	2.0174	10.5062

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.09125	0.03665	57.06	<2e-16 ***
D_i	4.54605	0.06148	73.94	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 2.942 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-squared: 0.3535, Adjusted R-squared: 0.3535

F-statistic: 5467 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
IV <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV)
```

Call:

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
-11.32054	-2.15633	0.01342	2.15176	12.24840

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	3.05137	0.04859	62.79	<2e-16 ***
D_i	1.84377	0.10258	17.97	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.214 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.2286, Adjusted R-squared: 0.2285

Wald test: 323.1 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    D_hat = predict(lm(D_i ~ Z_i, data = df)),
    D_tilde = D_i - D_hat
  )
model_a <- lm(Y_i ~ D_hat, data = df)
summary(model_a)
```

Call:

lm(formula = Y\_i ~ D\_hat, data = df)

Residuals:

Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
-12.4803	-2.5186	0.1553	2.4288	14.0154

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	3.05137	0.05464	55.85	<2e-16 ***
D_hat	1.84377	0.11533	15.99	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.614 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-squared: 0.02493, Adjusted R-squared: 0.02483

F-statistic: 255.6 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
model_b <- lm(Y_i ~ D_i + D_tilde, data = df)
summary(model_b)
```

Call:

```
lm(formula = Y_i ~ D_i + D_tilde, data = df)
```

Residuals:

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-11.1236	-1.7829	0.0116	1.8346	9.5598

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	3.05137	0.04114	74.17	<2e-16 ***
D_i	1.84377	0.08684	21.23	<2e-16 ***
D_tilde	4.72955	0.11488	41.17	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 2.721 on 9997 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-squared: 0.4472, Adjusted R-squared: 0.4471

F-statistic: 4044 on 2 and 9997 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%  
  mutate(  
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y  
  )  
IV5a <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)  
summary(IV5a)
```

Call:

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-11.254	-1.965	-0.020	1.943	10.719

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.98493	0.04456	66.98	<2e-16 ***
D_i	3.43945	0.09407	36.56	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 2.948 on 9998 degrees of freedom  
 Multiple R-Squared: 0.389, Adjusted R-squared: 0.389  
 Wald test: 1337 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + -1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
IV5b <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV5b)
```

Call:

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-12.3145	-2.4747	0.1354	2.3866	13.7776

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	3.11782	0.05375	58.004	<2e-16 ***
D_i	0.24808	0.11346	2.186	0.0288 *

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.555 on 9998 degrees of freedom  
 Multiple R-Squared: 0.03252, Adjusted R-squared: 0.03243  
 Wald test: 4.781 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: 0.02881

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 10 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
IV6a <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV6a)
```

Call:

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-11.27465	-2.11405	0.02026	2.13714	11.19224

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	3.00548	0.04649	64.64	<2e-16 ***
D_i	2.94582	0.06596	44.66	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.146 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.2248, Adjusted R-squared: 0.2247

Wald test: 1994 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 10 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + -1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
IV6b <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV6b)
```

Call:

ivreg(formula = Y\_i ~ D\_i | Z\_i, data = df)

Residuals:

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-11.678019	-2.149812	-0.004922	2.113936	13.201871

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	3.09280	0.04788	64.6	<2e-16 ***
D_i	0.84887	0.06793	12.5	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.239 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.04213, Adjusted R-squared: 0.04203

Wald test: 156.2 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Z_i = as.numeric(z_i > 0.5),
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 5 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 0 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y,
    pZ = length(Z_i == 1)/length(id),
    pD = length(D_i == 1)/length(id),
    compliers = (pZ*D_hat)/pD
  )
length(df$compliers)
```

```
[1] 10000
```

```
cor(df$Z_i, df$D_i)
```

```
[1] 0.6547057
```

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Z_i = as.numeric(z_i > 0.5),
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 10 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 0 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y,
    pZ = length(Z_i == 1)/length(id),
    pD = length(D_i == 1)/length(id),
    compliers = (pZ*D_hat)/pD
  )
length(df$compliers)
```

```
[1] 10000
```

```
cor(df$Z_i, df$D_i)
```

```
[1] 0.9544518
```

```
set.seed(4)

df <- data.frame(
  id = 1:10000,
```

```

epsilon_D = rnorm(10000, mean = 0, sd = 1),
epsilon_Y = rnorm(10000, mean = 0, sd = 1),
U_i = rnorm(10000, mean = 0, sd = 0.5)
)

z_i <- runif(10000, min = 0, max = 1)
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Z_i = as.numeric(z_i > 0.5),
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 5 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 0 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
OLS <- lm(Y_i ~ D_i, data = df)
summary(OLS)

```

Call:

```
lm(formula = Y_i ~ D_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
-11.4046	-1.9854	-0.1565	1.9254	10.3646

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.13905	0.03606	59.32	<2e-16 ***
D_i	4.49902	0.06058	74.26	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 2.898 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-squared: 0.3555, Adjusted R-squared: 0.3554

F-statistic: 5515 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```

IV <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV)

```

Call:

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-12.300464	-2.116453	0.006042	2.120659	11.762486

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	3.03490	0.04691	64.70	<2e-16 ***
D_i	1.97053	0.09837	20.03	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.14 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-squared: 0.2432, Adjusted R-squared: 0.2431

Wald test: 401.3 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    D_hat = predict(lm(D_i ~ Z_i, data = df)),
    D_tilde = D_i - D_hat
  )
model_a <- lm(Y_i ~ D_hat, data = df)
summary(model_a)
```

Call:

lm(formula = Y\_i ~ D\_hat, data = df)

Residuals:

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-13.6293	-2.4288	0.1159	2.4444	12.5395

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	3.0349	0.0531	57.16	<2e-16 ***
D_hat	1.9705	0.1113	17.70	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.554 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-squared: 0.03038, Adjusted R-squared: 0.03028

F-statistic: 313.2 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16



```
model_b <- lm(Y_i ~ D_i + D_tilde, data = df)
summary(model_b)
```

Call:

```
lm(formula = Y_i ~ D_i + D_tilde, data = df)
```

Residuals:

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-11.3063	-1.7988	0.0274	1.7855	10.2777

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	3.03490	0.04015	75.59	<2e-16 ***
D_i	1.97053	0.08419	23.41	<2e-16 ***
D_tilde	4.55943	0.11305	40.33	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 2.688 on 9997 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-squared: 0.4457, Adjusted R-squared: 0.4456

F-statistic: 4019 on 2 and 9997 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
IV5a <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV5a)
```

Call:

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-11.4138	-1.9213	-0.0336	1.9296	11.2524

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.97866	0.04319	68.96	<2e-16 ***

```
D_i          3.53683    0.09057    39.05    <2e-16 ***
```

```
---
```

```
Signif. codes:  0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
```

Residual standard error: 2.891 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.399, Adjusted R-squared: 0.3989

Wald test: 1525 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + -1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
IV5b <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV5b)
```

Call:

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-13.35670	-2.37179	0.08975	2.40051	12.27255

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	3.09114	0.05172	59.771	< 2e-16 ***
D_i	0.40422	0.10844	3.728	0.000194 ***

```
---
```

```
Signif. codes:  0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
```

Residual standard error: 3.462 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.05264, Adjusted R-squared: 0.05254

Wald test: 13.89 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: 0.0001944

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 10 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
IV6a <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV6a)
```

Call:

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-12.2839	-2.0965	0.0221	2.1158	11.7496

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.99717	0.04544	65.96	<2e-16 ***
D_i	3.02112	0.06451	46.83	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.099 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.2302, Adjusted R-squared: 0.2301

Wald test: 2193 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%  
  mutate(  
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 10 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),  
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + -1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y  
  )  
IV6b <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)  
summary(IV6b)
```

Call:

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-12.27719	-2.13016	-0.01604	2.10461	11.75629

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	3.07191	0.04658	65.94	<2e-16 ***
D_i	0.93971	0.06614	14.21	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.177 on 9998 degrees of freedom  
Multiple R-Squared: 0.04528, Adjusted R-squared: 0.04518  
Wald test: 201.9 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%  
  mutate(  
    Z_i = as.numeric(z_i > 0.5),  
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 5 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),  
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 0 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y,  
    pZ = length(Z_i == 1)/length(id),  
    pD = length(D_i == 1)/length(id),  
    compliers = (pZ*D_hat)/pD  
  )  
length(df$compliers)
```

[1] 10000

```
cor(df$Z_i, df$D_i)
```

[1] 0.6674092

```
df <- df %>%  
  mutate(  
    Z_i = as.numeric(z_i > 0.5),  
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 10 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),  
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 0 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y,  
    pZ = length(Z_i == 1)/length(id),  
    pD = length(D_i == 1)/length(id),  
    compliers = (pZ*D_hat)/pD  
  )  
length(df$compliers)
```

[1] 10000

```
cor(df$Z_i, df$D_i)
```

[1] 0.9613202

### Part 13: Now, recreate DGP with $N = 500$ .

```
set.seed(1)

df <- data.frame(
  id = 1:500,
  epsilon_D = rnorm(10000, mean = 0, sd = 1),
  epsilon_Y = rnorm(10000, mean = 0, sd = 1),
  U_i = rnorm(10000, mean = 0, sd = 0.5)
)

z_i <- runif(10000, min = 0, max = 1)
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Z_i = as.numeric(z_i > 0.5),
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 5 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 0 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
OLS <- lm(Y_i ~ D_i, data = df)
summary(OLS)
```

Call:

```
lm(formula = Y_i ~ D_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
-10.2473	-2.0084	-0.1544	1.9659	9.2807

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.02336	0.03642	55.56	<2e-16 ***
D_i	4.72039	0.06021	78.40	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 2.9 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-squared: 0.3807, Adjusted R-squared: 0.3807

F-statistic: 6146 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
IV <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV)
```

Call:

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-11.14794	-2.10898	0.01567	2.11343	10.84223

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.92404	0.04738	61.71	<2e-16 ***
D_i	2.25817	0.09716	23.24	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.133 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.2771, Adjusted R-squared: 0.2771

Wald test: 540.1 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    D_hat = predict(lm(D_i ~ Z_i, data = df)),
    D_tilde = D_i - D_hat
  )
model_a <- lm(Y_i ~ D_hat, data = df)
summary(model_a)
```

Call:

```
lm(formula = Y_i ~ D_hat, data = df)
```

Residuals:

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-11.614	-2.516	0.199	2.388	12.973

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.92404	0.05463	53.52	<2e-16 ***

```
D_hat      2.25817    0.11203    20.16    <2e-16 ***
```

```
---
```

```
Signif. codes:  0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
```

```
Residual standard error: 3.612 on 9998 degrees of freedom
```

```
Multiple R-squared:  0.03905,    Adjusted R-squared:  0.03896
```

```
F-statistic: 406.3 on 1 and 9998 DF,  p-value: < 2.2e-16
```

```
model_b <- lm(Y_i ~ D_i + D_tilde, data = df)
summary(model_b)
```

```
Call:
```

```
lm(formula = Y_i ~ D_i + D_tilde, data = df)
```

```
Residuals:
```

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-10.9638	-1.7894	0.0297	1.8385	9.4420

```
Coefficients:
```

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.92404	0.04077	71.72	<2e-16 ***
D_i	2.25817	0.08360	27.01	<2e-16 ***
D_tilde	4.46237	0.11255	39.65	<2e-16 ***

```
---
```

```
Signif. codes:  0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
```

```
Residual standard error: 2.696 on 9997 degrees of freedom
```

```
Multiple R-squared:  0.4649,    Adjusted R-squared:  0.4648
```

```
F-statistic: 4342 on 2 and 9997 DF,  p-value: < 2.2e-16
```

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
IV5a <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV5a)
```

```
Call:
```

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-11.08396	-1.92037	-0.00676	1.95614	10.35569

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.86006	0.04371	65.44	<2e-16 ***
D_i	3.80869	0.08963	42.49	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 2.89 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.4263, Adjusted R-squared: 0.4262

Wald test: 1806 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + -1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
IV5b <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV5b)
```

Call:

ivreg(formula = Y\_i ~ D\_i | Z\_i, data = df)

Residuals:

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-11.2119	-2.3955	0.1247	2.2961	12.2946

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.98802	0.05216	57.287	< 2e-16 ***
D_i	0.70764	0.10696	6.616	3.88e-11 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.449 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.09203, Adjusted R-squared: 0.09194

Wald test: 43.77 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: 3.881e-11



```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 10 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
IV6a <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV6a)
```

Call:

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
-11.10825	-2.14575	0.05882	2.16869	10.92009

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.88435	0.04642	62.13	<2e-16 ***
D_i	3.22000	0.06556	49.12	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.134 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.2509, Adjusted R-squared: 0.2508

Wald test: 2412 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 10 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + -1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
IV6b <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV6b)
```

Call:

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
-----	----	--------	----	-----

-11.19456 -2.17591 0.02275 2.14348 11.89132

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.97066	0.04770	62.28	<2e-16 ***
D_i	1.12828	0.06736	16.75	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.22 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.06005, Adjusted R-squared: 0.05996

Wald test: 280.5 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Z_i = as.numeric(z_i > 0.5),
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 5 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 0 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y,
    pZ = length(Z_i == 1)/length(id),
    pD = length(D_i == 1)/length(id),
    compliers = (pZ*D_hat)/pD
  )
length(df$compliers)
```

[1] 10000

```
cor(df$Z_i, df$D_i)
```

[1] 0.6694964

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Z_i = as.numeric(z_i > 0.5),
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 10 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 0 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y,
    pZ = length(Z_i == 1)/length(id),
    pD = length(D_i == 1)/length(id),
    compliers = (pZ*D_hat)/pD
  )
length(df$compliers)
```

```
[1] 10000
```

```
cor(df$Z_i, df$D_i)
```

```
[1] 0.9570938
```

```
set.seed(2)

df <- data.frame(
  id = 1:500,
  epsilon_D = rnorm(10000, mean = 0, sd = 1),
  epsilon_Y = rnorm(10000, mean = 0, sd = 1),
  U_i = rnorm(10000, mean = 0, sd = 0.5)
)

z_i <- runif(10000, min = 0, max = 1)
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Z_i = as.numeric(z_i > 0.5),
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 5 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 0 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
OLS <- lm(Y_i ~ D_i, data = df)
summary(OLS)
```

Call:

```
lm(formula = Y_i ~ D_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-10.1670	-2.0674	-0.1108	1.9913	10.4347

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.05792	0.03628	56.72	<2e-16 ***
D_i	4.64392	0.06083	76.34	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 2.912 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-squared: 0.3683, Adjusted R-squared: 0.3682  
F-statistic: 5828 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
IV <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV)
```

Call:

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-11.07161	-2.13429	-0.02852	2.17754	12.07252

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.96252	0.04739	62.52	<2e-16 ***
D_i	2.10146	0.09933	21.16	<2e-16 ***
---				

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.156 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.2579, Adjusted R-squared: 0.2578

Wald test: 447.6 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    D_hat = predict(lm(D_i ~ Z_i, data = df)),
    D_tilde = D_i - D_hat
  )
model_a <- lm(Y_i ~ D_hat, data = df)
summary(model_a)
```

Call:

```
lm(formula = Y_i ~ D_hat, data = df)
```

Residuals:

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-12.4818	-2.4946	0.1184	2.4921	13.0604

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.96252	0.05408	54.77	<2e-16 ***
D_hat	2.10146	0.11338	18.54	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.603 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-squared: 0.03322, Adjusted R-squared: 0.03312

F-statistic: 343.6 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
model_b <- lm(Y_i ~ D_i + D_tilde, data = df)
summary(model_b)
```

Call:

```
lm(formula = Y_i ~ D_i + D_tilde, data = df)
```

Residuals:

Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
-10.2498	-1.8127	0.0082	1.8597	10.5775

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.96252	0.04060	72.96	<2e-16 ***
D_i	2.10146	0.08511	24.69	<2e-16 ***
D_tilde	4.54446	0.11379	39.94	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 2.705 on 9997 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-squared: 0.4552, Adjusted R-squared: 0.4551

F-statistic: 4176 on 2 and 9997 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
IV5a <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV5a)
```

Call:

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-10.35525	-1.95761	-0.02863	1.97623	11.55490

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.90669	0.04363	66.62	<2e-16 ***
D_i	3.67491	0.09146	40.18	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 2.906 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.4111, Adjusted R-squared: 0.4111

Wald test: 1614 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%  
  mutate(  
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + -1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y  
  )  
IV5b <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)  
summary(IV5b)
```

Call:

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-12.12745	-2.41072	0.07622	2.40888	12.59013

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	3.01835	0.05225	57.764	< 2e-16 ***
D_i	0.52802	0.10954	4.821	1.45e-06 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.481 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.06862, Adjusted R-squared: 0.06853

Wald test: 23.24 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: 1.453e-06

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 10 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
IV6a <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV6a)
```

Call:

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
-11.142994	-2.137132	-0.006763	2.200596	12.102601

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.92684	0.04624	63.29	<2e-16 ***
D_i	3.10706	0.06529	47.59	<2e-16 ***
---				

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.139 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.233, Adjusted R-squared: 0.2329

Wald test: 2265 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 10 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + -1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
IV6b <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV6b)
```

Call:

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
-11.13680	-2.16387	-0.03453	2.17185	12.10879

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	3.00065	0.04733	63.40	<2e-16 ***
D_i	1.02707	0.06683	15.37	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.213 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.04927, Adjusted R-squared: 0.04918

Wald test: 236.2 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Z_i = as.numeric(z_i > 0.5),
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 5 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 0 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y,
    pZ = length(Z_i == 1)/length(id),
    pD = length(D_i == 1)/length(id),
    compliers = (pZ*D_hat)/pD
  )
length(df$compliers)
```

[1] 10000

```
cor(df$Z_i, df$D_i)
```

[1] 0.6637294

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Z_i = as.numeric(z_i > 0.5),
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 10 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 0 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y,
    pZ = length(Z_i == 1)/length(id),
    pD = length(D_i == 1)/length(id),
    compliers = (pZ*D_hat)/pD
  )
length(df$compliers)
```



```
[1] 10000
```

```
cor(df$Z_i, df$D_i)
```

```
[1] 0.962287
```

```
set.seed(3)

df <- data.frame(
  id = 1:500,
  epsilon_D = rnorm(10000, mean = 0, sd = 1),
  epsilon_Y = rnorm(10000, mean = 0, sd = 1),
  U_i = rnorm(10000, mean = 0, sd = 0.5)
)

z_i <- runif(10000, min = 0, max = 1)
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Z_i = as.numeric(z_i > 0.5),
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 5 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 0 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
OLS <- lm(Y_i ~ D_i, data = df)
summary(OLS)
```

Call:

```
lm(formula = Y_i ~ D_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
-10.3604	-2.0804	-0.1357	2.0174	10.5062

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.09125	0.03665	57.06	<2e-16 ***
D_i	4.54605	0.06148	73.94	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 2.942 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-squared: 0.3535, Adjusted R-squared: 0.3535  
F-statistic: 5467 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
IV <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV)
```

Call:

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
-11.32054	-2.15633	0.01342	2.15176	12.24840

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	3.05137	0.04859	62.79	<2e-16 ***
D_i	1.84377	0.10258	17.97	<2e-16 ***
---				

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.214 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.2286, Adjusted R-squared: 0.2285

Wald test: 323.1 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    D_hat = predict(lm(D_i ~ Z_i, data = df)),
    D_tilde = D_i - D_hat
  )
model_a <- lm(Y_i ~ D_hat, data = df)
summary(model_a)
```

Call:

```
lm(formula = Y_i ~ D_hat, data = df)
```

Residuals:

Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
-12.4803	-2.5186	0.1553	2.4288	14.0154

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	3.05137	0.05464	55.85	<2e-16 ***
D_hat	1.84377	0.11533	15.99	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.614 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-squared: 0.02493, Adjusted R-squared: 0.02483

F-statistic: 255.6 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
model_b <- lm(Y_i ~ D_i + D_tilde, data = df)
summary(model_b)
```

Call:

```
lm(formula = Y_i ~ D_i + D_tilde, data = df)
```

Residuals:

Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
-11.1236	-1.7829	0.0116	1.8346	9.5598

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	3.05137	0.04114	74.17	<2e-16 ***
D_i	1.84377	0.08684	21.23	<2e-16 ***
D_tilde	4.72955	0.11488	41.17	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 2.721 on 9997 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-squared: 0.4472, Adjusted R-squared: 0.4471

F-statistic: 4044 on 2 and 9997 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
IV5a <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV5a)
```

```
Call:
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)

Residuals:
      Min       1Q   Median       3Q      Max
-11.254  -1.965  -0.020   1.943  10.719

Coefficients:
              Estimate Std. Error t value Pr(>|t|)
(Intercept)  2.98493     0.04456   66.98  <2e-16 ***
D_i          3.43945     0.09407   36.56  <2e-16 ***
---
Signif. codes:  0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 2.948 on 9998 degrees of freedom
Multiple R-Squared: 0.389, Adjusted R-squared: 0.389
Wald test: 1337 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16
```

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + -1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
IV5b <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV5b)
```

```
Call:
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)

Residuals:
      Min       1Q   Median       3Q      Max
-12.3145  -2.4747   0.1354   2.3866  13.7776

Coefficients:
              Estimate Std. Error t value Pr(>|t|)
(Intercept)  3.11782     0.05375  58.004  <2e-16 ***
D_i          0.24808     0.11346   2.186   0.0288 *
---
Signif. codes:  0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.555 on 9998 degrees of freedom
Multiple R-Squared: 0.03252, Adjusted R-squared: 0.03243
```

Wald test: 4.781 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: 0.02881

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 10 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
IV6a <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV6a)
```

Call:

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
-11.27465	-2.11405	0.02026	2.13714	11.19224

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	3.00548	0.04649	64.64	<2e-16 ***
D_i	2.94582	0.06596	44.66	<2e-16 ***
---				

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.146 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.2248, Adjusted R-squared: 0.2247

Wald test: 1994 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 10 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + -1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
IV6b <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV6b)
```

Call:

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-11.678019	-2.149812	-0.004922	2.113936	13.201871

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	3.09280	0.04788	64.6	<2e-16 ***
D_i	0.84887	0.06793	12.5	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.239 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.04213, Adjusted R-squared: 0.04203

Wald test: 156.2 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Z_i = as.numeric(z_i > 0.5),
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 5 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 0 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y,
    pZ = length(Z_i == 1)/length(id),
    pD = length(D_i == 1)/length(id),
    compliers = (pZ*D_hat)/pD
  )
length(df$compliers)
```

[1] 10000

```
cor(df$Z_i, df$D_i)
```

[1] 0.6547057

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Z_i = as.numeric(z_i > 0.5),
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 10 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 0 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y,
    pZ = length(Z_i == 1)/length(id),
    pD = length(D_i == 1)/length(id),
    compliers = (pZ*D_hat)/pD
  )
length(df$compliers)
```

```
[1] 10000
```

```
cor(df$Z_i, df$D_i)
```

```
[1] 0.9544518
```

```
set.seed(4)

df <- data.frame(
  id = 1:10000,
  epsilon_D = rnorm(10000, mean = 0, sd = 1),
  epsilon_Y = rnorm(10000, mean = 0, sd = 1),
  U_i = rnorm(10000, mean = 0, sd = 0.5)
)

z_i <- runif(10000, min = 0, max = 1)
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Z_i = as.numeric(z_i > 0.5),
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 5 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 0 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
OLS <- lm(Y_i ~ D_i, data = df)
summary(OLS)
```

Call:

```
lm(formula = Y_i ~ D_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
-11.4046	-1.9854	-0.1565	1.9254	10.3646

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.13905	0.03606	59.32	<2e-16 ***
D_i	4.49902	0.06058	74.26	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 2.898 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-squared: 0.3555, Adjusted R-squared: 0.3554  
F-statistic: 5515 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
IV <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV)
```

Call:

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-12.300464	-2.116453	0.006042	2.120659	11.762486

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	3.03490	0.04691	64.70	<2e-16 ***
D_i	1.97053	0.09837	20.03	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.14 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.2432, Adjusted R-squared: 0.2431

Wald test: 401.3 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    D_hat = predict(lm(D_i ~ Z_i, data = df)),
    D_tilde = D_i - D_hat
  )
model_a <- lm(Y_i ~ D_hat, data = df)
summary(model_a)
```

Call:

```
lm(formula = Y_i ~ D_hat, data = df)
```

Residuals:

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-13.6293	-2.4288	0.1159	2.4444	12.5395



Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	3.0349	0.0531	57.16	<2e-16 ***
D_hat	1.9705	0.1113	17.70	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.554 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-squared: 0.03038, Adjusted R-squared: 0.03028

F-statistic: 313.2 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
model_b <- lm(Y_i ~ D_i + D_tilde, data = df)
summary(model_b)
```

Call:

```
lm(formula = Y_i ~ D_i + D_tilde, data = df)
```

Residuals:

Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
-11.3063	-1.7988	0.0274	1.7855	10.2777

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	3.03490	0.04015	75.59	<2e-16 ***
D_i	1.97053	0.08419	23.41	<2e-16 ***
D_tilde	4.55943	0.11305	40.33	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 2.688 on 9997 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-squared: 0.4457, Adjusted R-squared: 0.4456

F-statistic: 4019 on 2 and 9997 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
IV5a <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV5a)
```

```
Call:
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)

Residuals:
      Min       1Q   Median       3Q      Max
-11.4138  -1.9213  -0.0336   1.9296  11.2524

Coefficients:
              Estimate Std. Error t value Pr(>|t|)
(Intercept)  2.97866     0.04319   68.96  <2e-16 ***
D_i          3.53683     0.09057   39.05  <2e-16 ***
---
Signif. codes:  0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 2.891 on 9998 degrees of freedom
Multiple R-Squared: 0.399, Adjusted R-squared: 0.3989
Wald test: 1525 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16
```

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + -1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
IV5b <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV5b)
```

```
Call:
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)

Residuals:
      Min       1Q   Median       3Q      Max
-13.35670  -2.37179   0.08975   2.40051  12.27255

Coefficients:
              Estimate Std. Error t value Pr(>|t|)
(Intercept)  3.09114     0.05172  59.771  < 2e-16 ***
D_i          0.40422     0.10844   3.728 0.000194 ***
---
Signif. codes:  0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.462 on 9998 degrees of freedom
Multiple R-Squared: 0.05264, Adjusted R-squared: 0.05254
```

Wald test: 13.89 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: 0.0001944

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 10 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
IV6a <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV6a)
```

Call:

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
-12.2839	-2.0965	0.0221	2.1158	11.7496

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	2.99717	0.04544	65.96	<2e-16 ***
D_i	3.02112	0.06451	46.83	<2e-16 ***
---				

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.099 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.2302, Adjusted R-squared: 0.2301

Wald test: 2193 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 10 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + -1 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y
  )
IV6b <- ivreg(Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
summary(IV6b)
```

Call:

```
ivreg(formula = Y_i ~ D_i | Z_i, data = df)
```

Residuals:

	Min	1Q	Median	3Q	Max
	-12.27719	-2.13016	-0.01604	2.10461	11.75629

Coefficients:

	Estimate	Std. Error	t value	Pr(> t )
(Intercept)	3.07191	0.04658	65.94	<2e-16 ***
D_i	0.93971	0.06614	14.21	<2e-16 ***

---

Signif. codes: 0 '\*\*\*' 0.001 '\*\*' 0.01 '\*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1

Residual standard error: 3.177 on 9998 degrees of freedom

Multiple R-Squared: 0.04528, Adjusted R-squared: 0.04518

Wald test: 201.9 on 1 and 9998 DF, p-value: < 2.2e-16

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Z_i = as.numeric(z_i > 0.5),
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 5 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 0 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y,
    pZ = length(Z_i == 1)/length(id),
    pD = length(D_i == 1)/length(id),
    compliers = (pZ*D_hat)/pD
  )
length(df$compliers)
```

[1] 10000

```
cor(df$Z_i, df$D_i)
```

[1] 0.6674092

```
df <- df %>%
  mutate(
    Z_i = as.numeric(z_i > 0.5),
    D_i = as.numeric(-4 + 10 * Z_i + 4 * U_i + epsilon_D > 0),
    Y_i = 3 + 2 * D_i + 0 * Z_i + 6 * U_i + epsilon_Y,
    pZ = length(Z_i == 1)/length(id),
    pD = length(D_i == 1)/length(id),
    compliers = (pZ*D_hat)/pD
  )
length(df$compliers)
```

```
[1] 10000
```

```
cor(df$Z_i, df$D_i)
```

```
[1] 0.9613202
```