

---

**Question:** St Mark's Church, Dundela  
<https://openaipublic.blob.core.windows.net/critiques/passages/EskHF4JC90DXZ14twM9JLU6lfm337P.txt>

What is the history of St. Mark's Church?

**Answer:** For most of its history, its parish was located within the neighboring parish of Holywood. In the mid-19th century, due to the growth of the local area, the Church of Ireland began holding services in a coach-house and then in what is now Strandtown Primary School. William Butterfield was commissioned to design a new church for the growing parish. Groundbreaking for the new building took place in May 1876, and it was consecrated by the Bishop of Down, Connor, and Dromore, Robert Knox, on August 22, 1878. When it was built, it was intended for there to be a ring of bells in the tower, and an eight-bell frame was provided, but only the treble and tenor were bought due to the severe movement of the structure when the bells were rung. In the 1950s, a legacy was found providing for the installation of a ring, and the church commissioned John Taylor & Co of Loughborough, England, for a ring of ten bells. The new ring, in the key of F#, was installed in 1955 in a new cast-iron frame and was dedicated by the Reverend William Kerr, Bishop of Down and Dromore.

**Critiqueability:** 0.601

Critiques	Helpfulness: score	label
The last sentence is unnecessary.	0.394	True
The second sentence of the third paragraph should be moved to the end of the second paragraph, so that the transition to the third paragraph makes more sense.	0.070	False
The last few sentences are irrelevant to the question.	0.181	True
The last sentence is not relevant and should be removed.	0.129	True
The last four sentences describes the bells and are not necessary.	0.575	True
The answer is way too detailed. It should stick with the main events of the history.	0.317	True
The bells are not relevant to the history of the church	0.369	True
The response includes extraneous information not useful for the task.	0.419	True

Table 14: Randomly chosen sample 9 of 10 from our helpfulness experiments.

---

**Question:** Noël Oakeshott  
<https://openaipublic.blob.core.windows.net/critiques/passages/YI4ozEyhwkCSiFSuizJ6QYjupcJ9LW.txt>

Discuss Noël Oakeshott's family.

**Answer:** Noël Oakeshott was raised by her father, Robert Oswald Moon, who was a physician and her mother, Ethel Waddington, who was an artist and suffragist. She married Walter Oakeshott in 1928, and they had four children.

**Critiqueability:** 0.480

Critiques	Helpfulness: score	label
The answer should mention the names of their children.	0.948	True
The answer does not specify that the four children were two sons and two daughters.	0.889	True
The response contains inaccurate information.	0.346	False
The answer omits that Oakeshott's father opposed her marriage to Walter Oakeshott.	0.834	False
The answer omits the names of the children.	0.939	True
The answer should mention the names of the kids.	0.943	True
The response is missing the names of Noel's children.	0.948	True
The response misses to specify that the four children are two twin sons, Evelyn and Robert, and two daughters, Helena and Rose.	0.921	True

Table 15: Randomly chosen sample 10 of 10 from our helpfulness experiments.

<b>Question</b> <a href="https://openaipublic.blob.core.windows.net/critiques/passages/l5brplyxLuMFHoWlViTrJG8QGPZvvF.txt">https://openaipublic.blob.core.windows.net/critiques/passages/l5brplyxLuMFHoWlViTrJG8QGPZvvF.txt</a>		
What happened to Yafa in the winter of 1990?		
<b>Human answer</b>  In the winter of 1990, Israeli soldiers came to take Yafa’s father.	<b>Human misleading answer</b>  In the winter of 1990, Israeli soldiers came to take Yafa’s mother.  <i>Intended critiques</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(critical, accuracy) INn 1990, soldiers came to take Yafa’s father, not mother.</li> </ul>	<b>Model answer</b>  Yafa was afraid that the soldiers would take her candy.
<i>Unassisted human critiquer</i> Rating: 6/7 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(minor, coverage) Add that she ran upstairs to look for her father’s gloves and did not find them. She still feels guilty about not finding his gloves.</li> </ul>	<i>Unassisted human critiquer</i> Rating: 5/7 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(major, accuracy) father, not mother</li> </ul>	<i>Unassisted human critiquer</i> Rating: 3/7 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(major, coverage) The response does not cover the major event which was that the soldiers came to get her father</li> </ul>
<i>Assisted human critiquer</i> Rating: 5/7 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(medium, coverage) The answer should mention that Yafa ran upstairs to get her father’s gloves.</li> </ul>	<i>Assisted human critiquer</i> Rating: 7/7 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(critical, accuracy) Yafa’s mother was not taken in the winter of 1990. It was her father who was taken away.</li> </ul>	<i>Assisted human critiquer</i> Rating: 1/7 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(critical, accuracy) The answer is incorrect. In the winter of 1990, Yafa’s father was taken away by soldiers and she wasn’t able to give him his gloves in time.</li> </ul>
<b>Model useful critiques (out of 8)</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Helpfulness score: 0.77 The answer should mention that Yafa ran upstairs to get her father’s gloves.</li> </ul>	<b>Model useful critiques (out of 8)</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Helpfulness score: 0.74 Yafa’s mother was not taken in the winter of 1990. It was her father who was taken away.</li> </ul>	<b>Model useful critiques (out of 8)</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Helpfulness score: 0.36 The answer is incorrect.</li> </ul>

Table 16: Randomly chosen sample 1 of 10 from our assistance experiments. See more in [our publicly released dataset](#).

**Question** [NF] Be Happy at All Times.  
<https://openaipublic.blob.core.windows.net/critiques/passages/Eckajc1ejyMk7wuAq2XkLd130Ixcow.txt>

What does the story say about Mike’s disappearance?

Human answer	Human misleading answer	Model answer
The narrator is looking for his coworker Mike as he cannot see him at the court. He finally finds Mike laying on the ground beside the cart with his face down. The narrator sees the back of his shaved head is purple and flips Mike over. Mike’s face looked distorted, purple, and smushed, his eyes half-open half-closed, and completely expressionless. The narrator dials 911 for emergency help. They instruct him to give CPR. However, Mike has laid face down for too long and he is dead.	Mike hides in the woods to urinate.	Mike is the narrator’s co-worker, and the narrator is surprised to see that he is not around. The narrator is worried about him. Mike’s cart is parked in a curious place. The narrator walks to the cart and sees Mike lying on the ground. The narrator calls 911 and performs CPR, but Mike is already dead.
<b>Unassisted human critiquer</b> Rating: 7/7 (None)	<b>Intended critiques</b> • (major, accuracy) That is what the narrator considers, but Mike had an accident and died.	<b>Unassisted human critiquer</b> Rating: 4/7 • (major, accuracy) The narrator doesn’t walk to the cart. She runs when she sees that Mike is lying face down on the ground.
<b>Assisted human critiquer</b> Rating: 5/7 • (medium, accuracy) The narrator and Mike work at a golf course, not a court. Correct this.	<b>Assisted human critiquer</b> Rating: 1/7 • (critical, accuracy) Mike is not hiding in the woods to urinate. • (major, coverage) The answer omits that Mike is dead.	<b>Assisted human critiquer</b> Rating: 6/7 • (minor, coverage) The response includes extraneous information not useful for the task.
<b>Model useful critiques (out of 8)</b> • Helpfulness score: 0.42 The narrator and Mike work at a golf course, not a court.	<b>Model useful critiques (out of 8)</b> • Helpfulness score: 0.71 Mike is not hiding in the woods to urinate. • Helpfulness score: 0.51 The answer omits that Mike is dead.	<b>Model useful critiques (out of 8)</b> • Helpfulness score: 0.16 The response includes extraneous information not useful for the task.

Table 17: Randomly chosen sample 2 of 10 from our assistance experiments. See more in [our publicly released dataset](#).