Question: Broken Souls

Explain how the narrator equates people to parallel lines.

Answer: People and love are like parallel lines because they both are heading in the same direction, they both possess the same mathematical properties, but they never meet.

Critique	**Best-of-8 Critique**	
The response is missing the part about how people and love are like parallel lines because they cross briefly but drift apart forever.	The response misses to mention that sometimes parallel lines cross each other briefly but they drift apart forever and will never meet again.	
Conditional refinement	**Conditional refinement**	**Direct refinement**
People and love are like parallel lines because they both are heading in the same direction, they both possess the same mathematical properties, but they never meet. They cross briefly but drift apart forever.	People and love are like parallel lines because they both are heading in the same direction, they both possess the same mathematical properties, but they never meet. Sometimes parallel lines cross each other briefly but they drift apart forever and will never meet again.	People and love are like parallel lines because they both are heading in the same direction, they both possess the same mathematical properties, but they never meet. They cross each other briefly, but then drift apart forever.

Table 29: Randomly chosen sample 4 of 10 from our refinement experiments.

Question: Vanity Heights

What does the story say about Celeste's actions the night of the party?

Answer: Celeste is at a party at Darcy's house. She reapplies her face in the bathroom and drinks six doses of alcohol. She joins the party and dances with Darcy and other men. She wants to leave the party, so she pushes through the crowd and makes her way to the stairs. She starts to feel sick, and she starts to throw up.

Critique	**Best-of-8 Critique**	
The answer omits that Celeste is ashamed of her behavior and swears never to drink again.	The answer should mention that she falls on the stairs.	
Conditional refinement	**Conditional refinement**	**Direct refinement**
Celeste is at a party at Darcy's house. She reapplies her face in the bathroom and drinks six doses of alcohol. She joins the party and dances with Darcy and other men. She wants to leave the party, so she pushes through the crowd and makes her way to the stairs. She starts to feel sick, and she starts to throw up. Celeste is ashamed of her behavior and swears never to drink again.	Celeste is at a party at Darcy's house. She reapplies her face in the bathroom and drinks six doses of alcohol. She joins the party and dances with Darcy and other men. She wants to leave the party, so she pushes through the crowd and makes her way to the stairs. She starts to feel sick, and she starts to throw up. She falls on the stairs.	Celeste is at a party at Darcy's house. She reapplies her face in the bathroom and drinks six doses of alcohol. She joins the party and dances with Darcy and other men. She wants to leave the party, so she pushes through the crowd and makes her way to the stairs. She starts to feel sick, and she starts to throw up. She promises herself she'll never drink again.

Table 30: Randomly chosen sample 5 of 10 from our refinement experiments.

Question:

https://openaipublic.blob.core.windows.net/critiques/passages/m5EfvLFuyVVl0C86Qk6KTCpzsxrbAN.txt

According to the text, how did Brexit affect car production in the UK?

Answer: The UK's car production was down 24% in April 2019 compared to March 2019.

Critique	**Best-of-8 Critique**	
It is omitted that car production slowed down after a number of car plants shut down in April as manufacturers prepared for a no-deal Brexit.	The text also mentions that car production was down due to car manufacturers preparing for a no-deal Brexit by bringing forward annual shutdowns which typically take place in the summer.	

Conditional refinement	**Conditional refinement**	**Direct refinement**
The UK's car production was down 24% in April 2019 compared to March 2019 after a number of car plants shut down in April as manufacturers prepared for a no-deal Brexit.	The UK's car production was down 24% in April 2019 compared to March 2019 due to car manufacturers preparing for a no-deal Brexit by bringing forward annual shutdowns which typically take place in the summer.	The UK's car production was down 24% in April 2019 compared to March 2019. This is because manufacturers shut down plants in April in anticipation of a no-deal Brexit.

Table 31: Randomly chosen sample 6 of 10 from our refinement experiments.

Question:

https://openaipublic.blob.core.windows.net/critiques/passages/NfDuFwdDSBthnO7ZzuWE55qUKMNLDr.txt

What does the article say about the climate-denier movement?

Answer: The climate-denier movement has been bullying America's K-12 science teachers for years. They have successfully strong-armed administrators, parents, and school board officials into agreeing to frame climate change as an open question rather than a scientific fact. The climate-denier movement recently sent a mendacious mailer to tens of thousands of teachers that falsely identified "a vibrant debate ... taking place among scientists on how big the human impact on climate is, and whether or not we should be worried about it".

Critique	**Best-of-8 Critique**	
The answer should mention that the climate-denier movement is now doomed because Americans who believe in climate change now outnumber deniers 5 to 1.	The answer should mention the tactics the movement used to try to influence the education of students.	

Conditional refinement	**Conditional refinement**	**Direct refinement**
The climate-denier movement has been bullying America's K-12 science teachers for years. They have successfully strong-armed administrators, parents, and school board officials into agreeing to frame climate change as an open question rather than a scientific fact. The climate-denier movement recently sent a mendacious mailer to tens of thousands of teachers that falsely identified "a vibrant debate ... taking place among scientists on how big the human impact on climate is, and whether or not we should be worried about it". The climate-denier movement is now doomed because Americans who believe in climate change now outnumber deniers 5 to 1.	The climate-denier movement has been bullying America's K-12 science teachers for years. They have successfully strong-armed administrators, parents, and school board officials into agreeing to frame climate change as an open question rather than a scientific fact. The climate-denier movement recently sent a mendacious mailer to tens of thousands of teachers that falsely identified "a vibrant debate ... taking place among scientists on how big the human impact on climate is, and whether or not we should be worried about it". The movement also tried to get states to pass "academic freedom" bills, which are worded to sound like reasonable defenses of fair-mindedness and intellectual dissent but actually exist to provide legal and political cover for a well-funded anti-science movement whose future depends on today's schoolchildren ignoring the scientific method and growing up confused about what is and isn't true.	The climate-denier movement has been bullying America's K-12 science teachers for years. They have successfully strong-armed administrators, parents, and school board officials into agreeing to frame climate change as an open question rather than a scientific fact. The climate-denier movement recently sent a mendacious mailer to tens of thousands of teachers that falsely identified "a vibrant debate ... taking place among scientists on how big the human impact on climate is, and whether or not we should be worried about it". The movement also pushed "academic freedom" bills that are worded to sound like reasonable defenses of fair-mindedness and intellectual dissent.

Table 32: Randomly chosen sample 7 of 10 from our refinement experiments.

Question: Beverly Duan
`https://openaipublic.blob.core.windows.net/critiques/passages/Vsvsjqxue90MrMgl2K6TgpwvMdmwEw.txt`

Why did Beverly Duan donate to charity in China during the COVID-19 pandemic?
Answer: She is of Chinese descent.

Critique	**Best-of-8 Critique**	
This answer is unattested.	This is not stated	
Conditional refinement	**Conditional refinement**	**Direct refinement**
There is no reason given in the article.	This is not stated.	The text doesn't mention a reason.

Table 33: Randomly chosen sample 8 of 10 from our refinement experiments.

Question:
`https://openaipublic.blob.core.windows.net/critiques/passages/n69HRBn0zJZmIDInsDEgHbfgJ70doH.txt`

Summarize the views of opposing sides in this article.
Answer: Mayor Bowser's actions are largely symbolic and come as more protests are expected in DC at the weekend. Bowser's actions are panned by the local chapter of the Black Lives Matter Global Network, which called it "a performative distraction from real policy changes" and a way "to appease white liberals while ignoring our demands".

Critique	**Best-of-8 Critique**	
The response does not mention Trump's views.	The answer does not mention Trump's views.	
Conditional refinement	**Conditional refinement**	**Direct refinement**
Mayor Bowser's actions are largely symbolic and come as more protests are expected in DC at the weekend. Bowser's actions are panned by the local chapter of the Black Lives Matter Global Network, which called it "a performative distraction from real policy changes" and a way "to appease white liberals while ignoring our demands". On the other hand, President Trump has threatened to "bring in a different group of men and women" to DC if Ms Bowser doesn't treat federal National Guard troops "well".	Mayor Bowser's actions are largely symbolic and come as more protests are expected in DC at the weekend. Bowser's actions are panned by the local chapter of the Black Lives Matter Global Network, which called it "a performative distraction from real policy changes" and a way "to appease white liberals while ignoring our demands". The White House, on the other hand, has ordered federal troops into the city, and President Trump has threatened to "bring in a different group of men and women" if Ms Bowser doesn't treat the troops well. The President also thinks that the mayor's move is a way to appease white liberals while ignoring their demands.	Mayor Bowser's actions are largely symbolic and come as more protests are expected in DC at the weekend. Bowser's actions are panned by the local chapter of the Black Lives Matter Global Network, which called it "a performative distraction from real policy changes" and a way "to appease white liberals while ignoring our demands". The mayor wants to make it clear that the streets belong to DC and honor the demonstrators who were peacefully protesting. She also criticized the troops for not wearing any identification, allowing them to operate outside "established chains of commands."

Table 34: Randomly chosen sample 9 of 10 from our refinement experiments.

Question: Heart.
`https://openaipublic.blob.core.windows.net/critiques/passages/ZCFMK7ZyFdqT6QcYmblg4VqtCxGFve.txt`

What does the story say aboutthe doctor's appearance?
Answer: The doctor has black hair, two lovely pearly earrings, and a pair of eyes. She is wearing a blouse and a white coat with a chest pocket.

Critique	**Best-of-8 Critique**	
The answer should include that the doctor is smiling.	The answer should include the fact that the doctor is smiling.	
Conditional refinement	**Conditional refinement**	**Direct refinement**
The doctor has black hair, two lovely pearly earrings, and a pair of eyes. She has a smile on her face. She is wearing a blouse and a white coat with a chest pocket.	The doctor has black hair, two lovely pearly earrings, and a pair of eyes. She is wearing a blouse and a white coat with a chest pocket. The doctor is smiling.	The doctor has black hair, two lovely pearly earrings, and a pair of eyes. She is wearing a blouse and a white coat with a chest pocket. The narrator also mentions that the doctor is smiling.

Table 35: Randomly chosen sample 10 of 10 from our refinement experiments.