

Question The Watch (short story I wrote for school)

<https://openaipublic.blob.core.windows.net/critiques/passages/A5K2gV0iLAHBgptyiXoXL0wH0xFNxP.txt>

What does the text say about the blonde woman in the elevator and the old man?

| Human answer | Human misleading answer | Model answer |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| The text does not describe her much, other than the fact that she knew who William was and what he does for a living. | No answer | The blonde woman in the elevator is an angel with dirty blonde hair. She is on her way to the 15th floor. She recognizes the old man and asks him what he is doing there. He is reluctant to answer. She asks him if he stopped scamming people, and he says he is sorry. She scoffs at him and leaves the elevator. |
| Unassisted human critiquer Rating: 4/7 <ul style="list-style-type: none">(minor, accuracy) The text does describe her. This part of the sentence should be omitted.(medium, coverage) It's omitted that she had dirty blonde hair and looks like a piece of art to the protagonist.(medium, coverage) It's omitted that she was disappointed that William was still committing his crimes(medium, coverage) It's omitted that she knew him from 8 years prior, and their relationship seemed to end on a sour note. | Unassisted human critiquer Rating: 1/7 <ul style="list-style-type: none">(critical, coverage) There isn't much information on the blonde woman but she is mentioned in the text as someone who is close to the protagonist. | Unassisted human critiquer Rating: 7/7 (None) |
| Assisted human critiquer Rating: 4/7 <ul style="list-style-type: none">(medium, coverage) The answer should mention that the woman is surprised to see him, and asks what he's doing there. He explains that he's there for business, but she doesn't believe him. She asks if he stopped scamming people, and he responds with "I'm sorry".(medium, coverage) The response misses to mention that they both used to be close. | Assisted human critiquer Rating: 2/7 <ul style="list-style-type: none">(critical, coverage) The response misses to mention that the blonde woman in the elevator is actually an old acquaintance of the old man.(medium, coverage) The response should mention the exchange between the blonde woman and the older man about what he was doing there and his admission that it was his final score before retiring. | Assisted human critiquer Rating: 3/7 <ul style="list-style-type: none">(medium, coverage) The answer should mention that the woman is an old acquaintance of the old man.(medium, coherence) The woman's appearance is not relevant to the question.(medium, coverage) The answer omits that the woman knows the old man as William, and it may be implied that she broke off contact with him eight years prior.(medium, accuracy) 'She asks him if he stopped scamming people, and he says he is sorry.' - The woman told the old man that she thought he had stopped scamming people. However, she didn't ask him if he had stopped. Correct this. |
| Model useful critiques (out of 8) <ul style="list-style-type: none">Helpfulness score: 0.84 The answer should mention that the woman is surprised to see him, and asks what he's doing there. He explains that he's there for business, but she doesn't believe him. She asks if he stopped scamming people, and he responds with "I'm sorry".Helpfulness score: 0.64 The response misses to mention that they both used to be close. | Model useful critiques (out of 8) <ul style="list-style-type: none">Helpfulness score: 0.59 The response misses to mention that the blonde woman in the elevator is actually an old acquaintance of the old man. | Model useful critiques (out of 8) <ul style="list-style-type: none">Helpfulness score: 0.37 The answer should mention that the woman is an old acquaintance of the old man.Helpfulness score: 0.25 The answer omits that the woman knows the old man as William and that he is a con artist.Helpfulness score: 0.05 The woman's appearance is not relevant to the question. |

Table 21: Randomly chosen sample 6 of 10 from our assistance experiments. See more in [our publicly released dataset](#).

| | | |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Question Andrew Birkin https://openaipublic.blob.core.windows.net/critiques/passages/MHzLLAdEsTWHlpSHDxVpruZArzhmVH.txt | | |
| What does the text say about Andrew Timothy Birkin's character? | | |
| Human answer When he was young, he was described as extremely naughty. As an adult, Birkin is described as reckless. Many esteem Birkin for his creative capacity. Birkin may be generous, as he is a trustee of a children's arts charity. | Human misleading answer When he was young, he was described as extremely naughty. As an adult, Birkin is described as reckless before he moved into a silver bus. Many esteem Birkin for his creative capacity. Birkin may be generous, as he is a trustee of a children's arts charity. <i>Intended critiques</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (major, coherence) Birkin is described as reckless but the text does not support that moved into a silver bus, which is confusing as well as incorrect. | Model answer Andrew Timothy Birkin was born to an actress, Judy Campbell, and a Lieutenant-Commander, David Birkin. His older sister is the actress and singer Jane Birkin. Birkin was educated at Elstree School and Harrow School. At the former, he was remembered as one of the naughtiest boys ever to have passed through Elstree. The text states that Birkin is a reckless person who loves to travel. |
| <i>Unassisted human critiquer</i> Rating: 7/7 (None) | <i>Unassisted human critiquer</i> Rating: 5/7 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (medium, accuracy) The response misconstrues certain details of the text. | <i>Unassisted human critiquer</i> Rating: 5/7 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (medium, coverage) The earlier part of the response has nothing to do with the question. |
| <i>Assisted human critiquer</i> Rating: 5/7 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (medium, accuracy) "Many esteem Birkin for his creative capacity," is not in reference to Birkin's character. It should be replaced with other evidence of his character. | <i>Assisted human critiquer</i> Rating: 3/7 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (major, accuracy) The text doesn't say anything about Birkin moving into a silver bus. (medium, coherence) The last sentence is not relevant. (medium, accuracy) Birkin's creative capacity was not discussed in the text. | <i>Assisted human critiquer</i> Rating: 4/7 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (major, coherence) "His older sister is the actress and singer Jane Birkin." - this is irrelevant and should be removed. (medium, coherence) The response includes extraneous information not useful for the task. |
| <i>Model useful critiques (out of 8)</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Helpfulness score: 0.23 "Many esteem Birkin for his creative capacity," is not in reference to Birkin's character. It should be replaced with other evidence of his character. | <i>Model useful critiques (out of 8)</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Helpfulness score: 0.87 The text doesn't say anything about Birkin moving into a silver bus. Helpfulness score: 0.10 The last sentence is not relevant. | <i>Model useful critiques (out of 8)</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Helpfulness score: 0.23 The response includes extraneous information not useful for the task. Helpfulness score: 0.16 "His older sister is the actress and singer Jane Birkin." - this is irrelevant and should be removed. |

Table 22: Randomly chosen sample 7 of 10 from our assistance experiments. See more in [our publicly released dataset](#).

| Question | | |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| https://openaipublic.blob.core.windows.net/critiques/passages/d6Da3Q6Nmm6n0JLhL9Lm7N4UNe8MA9.txt | | |
| What does the story say about Severus' character? | | |
| Human answer | Human misleading answer | Model answer |
| He has shown his ability to work under the worst circumstances. Fear does not affect his grading. He is a hard worker and loyal to the side of the Light. | Severus is ambitious and greedy. <i>Intended critiques</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (major, accuracy) It is not implied he is ambitious and greedy. His motivation is to help students. | Severus is described by Albus as someone who works under the worst circumstances, is loyal and hardworking. Severus was able to calm a situation that almost got him arrested for his crimes by telling the aurors things like he knew he could do his teaching duties well even with a Dementor nearby, and that he accepted the punishment for his crimes which showed remorse and led to his release. He was also the main target for Voldemort in his first year, which added to his already extensive integrity and diligence. |
| <i>Unassisted human critiquer</i> Rating: 5/7 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (minor, coherence) The second sentence needs a little clarification, especially the part about grading. It must be clear whose grading is being discussed - Severus' or his students'. | <i>Unassisted human critiquer</i> Rating: 4/7 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (medium, coverage) The answer should mention that Severus is able to work under the worst circumstances. (medium, coverage) The answer should mention that Severus is also loyal. (medium, accuracy) It is unattested that he is greedy. | <i>Unassisted human critiquer</i> Rating: 6/7 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (medium, coherence) The response includes extraneous information about being Voldemort's main target, which is not useful for the task. |
| <i>Assisted human critiquer</i> Rating: 5/7 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (medium, coverage) The answer omits that Severus is modest about his own capabilities and is also not sure he could be a good Head of House because he did not have a good example of a parental figure. | <i>Assisted human critiquer</i> Rating: 1/7 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (critical, accuracy) The response is incorrect. Severus is not ambitious or greedy. | <i>Assisted human critiquer</i> Rating: 5/7 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (medium, accuracy) The last sentence is not supported by the text. |
| <i>Model useful critiques (out of 8)</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Helpfulness score: 0.76 The answer omits that Severus is modest about his own capabilities and is also not sure he could be a good Head of House because he did not have a good example of a parental figure. | <i>Model useful critiques (out of 8)</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Helpfulness score: 0.85 The response is incorrect. Severus is not ambitious or greedy. | <i>Model useful critiques (out of 8)</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Helpfulness score: 0.46 The last sentence is not supported by the text. |

Table 23: Randomly chosen sample 8 of 10 from our assistance experiments. See more in [our publicly released dataset](#).