Bug 116

Summary:	Attempting to use the Forgot Password feature prompts an error reading "Authentication failed."

Product:	ResumeSmarts	**Reporter:**	scott carter <bugzilla@iccarus.me>
Component:	Miscellaneous	**Assignee:**	Marie Taylor Harper <marie.taylor.harper@me.com>
Status:	CONFIRMED ---		
Severity:	normal	**CC:**	marie.taylor.harper@me.com, maypumphreymaryann@fhda.edu
Priority:	---		
Version:	unspecified		
Hardware:	PC		
OS:	Windows		
URL:	https://resumesmarts.com/		

Time tracking:

Orig. Est.	Actual Hours	Hours Worked	Hours Left	%Complete	Gain
0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0	0.0

Attachments:	Authentication Failed Message Forgot Password Message 2 Mary Ann's results

scott carter   2016-04-25 19:39:04 PDT   **Description**

Created attachment 80 [details]
Authentication Failed Message

Description:
The user bugzilla@iccarus.me exists in the system. (see bug 115)
If I attempt to use the Forgot password button on the log in page with that email
address, the system returns an error stating "Authentication failed."

The message seems particularly bad because the users inability to provide
authentication is exactly why they would be using the Forgot Password feature.
The peculiar state of the userID may be the root (Again, see bug 115), but the
error message seems like it should be something less ironic.

1. Navigate to https://resumesmarts.com/

2. Enter bugzilla@iccarus.me into the top right email field.

3. Click the Forgot Password button.

4. Observe the error message.

Expected result:
Email should be sent to bugzilla@iccarus.me providing a new temp password
A message should be returned asserting that email has been sent to the designated
email address

Observed result:
An authentication error is returned.
No email is sent to the designated email address.

Marie Taylor Harper   2016-05-08 19:30:04 PDT   **Comment 1**

Hi Stott,

We are unable to replicate this issue. Can you please work with Mary Ann or a
classmate to see if they can duplicate the issue? If not, can you please show
Mary Ann the issue if you are able to duplicate at De Anza.

Thank you,
marie

Mary Ann May-Pumphrey   2016-05-09 21:24:34 PDT   **Comment 2**

Marie: I can easily reproduce this bug on multiple browsers. What are you seeing
when you click the "Forgot Password" button?

Marie Taylor Harper   2016-05-09 21:43:03 PDT   **Comment 3**

Hi Mary Ann,

I am attaching a copy of what we see when we request a new Password :)

I will meet up with you and see what you get on your Mac…

P.S. Brownies are worth 10 points..

Marie Taylor Harper   **2016-05-09 21:44:08 PDT**   **Comment 4**

Created attachment 98 [details]
Forgot Password Message 2

Mary Ann May-Pumphrey   **2016-05-10 11:31:21 PDT**   **Comment 5**

Created attachment 99 [details]
Mary Ann's results

Mary Ann May-Pumphrey   **2016-05-10 11:40:12 PDT**   **Comment 6**

Marie: Your image doesn't actually show the login field. Secondly, it *does* show
a password, which was not part of the steps in the original description. I'm not
sure whether you made up a password for Scott, simulating the user who has
forgotten his password as he tries to enter it, OR whether that password value was
filled in by your browser from cookies.

Regardless, even when I enter a made-up password for Scott, I still get the
"Authentication failed" message, so that "clue" is probably irrelevant!

Attached is a snapshot of what I'm seeing while at De Anza, using the instructor
Windows computer, and what I'm seeing from home using my Mac.

Three more factoids:

1. Trying with one of my email addresses (mam-p@att.net) which I haven't been
using much on RS, yielded the same bad results.
2. Trying with my usual RS email address (mam_p@yahoo.com) netted expected/good
results ("Check your email for your new temporary password.")
3. Trying with a nonexistent email address(mam-p@nonexistent.com) yielded the bad
results ("Authentication failed").

SUMMARY:

--The problem is clearly not related to the two-char domain as Scott and I had
thought, but rather to email addresses that are in some other non-ideal state.
--Regardless of how the user may have screwed up, the app should not be displaying
an "Authentication failed" message when the user isn't even asking for
authentication, such as when s/he is clicking the FORGOT PASSWORD button.

SPECULATION:

Scott has wondered if your inability to reproduce the problem is related to you
testing while VPN'ed into RS. Can you try from your iPhone or some other device on
which you never do RS dev work?

This is actually more of a BLOCKER in my opinion than bug 76. Users give up when
they have too many problems logging in or requesting their password. And unlike
bug 76, this one has no workaround AFAIK....

Marie Taylor Harper   **2016-05-10 23:22:42 PDT**   **Comment 7**

Hi Scott,

I have actually recreated your issue and I also checked the backend to see what was wrong with your account.

The issue you ran into was because an account was never actually created. That account had been invited to use ResumeSmarts BUT after being invited, you never went through the "Begin" process. I did find your email address and about5-6 other iccarus.me emails in the database. I did try getting a new Password for your account and I also got the Authentication Failed error message. For someone that has never used the system, this message is appropriate -- they aren't in the system and they don't have an account.   In your case your email was added but the account wasn't created.

We will be reviewing this and discussing it in our next Engineering meeting this week.

Thank you,
marie

Marie Taylor Harper   **2016-05-10 23:36:07 PDT**   **Comment 8**

Hi Mary Ann,

I have also investigated your accounts in the database:

1. Trying with one of my email addresses (mam-p@att.net) which I haven't been using much on RS, yielded the same bad results.

    >> This email was added to the system but no account was created and no profile existed.

2. Trying with my usual RS email address (mam_p@yahoo.com) netted expected/good results ("Check your email for your new temporary password.")

    >> This email was added to the system and an account does exist thus a password could be sent.

3. Trying with a nonexistent email address(mam-p@nonexistent.com) yielded the bad results ("Authentication failed").

    >> This email was never added to the system as you indicated.

We will be considering case #1 later this week during our next week Engineering meeting.

And we apologize, we didn't realize Scott's account was in a "strange state" in the database.

Thank you,
marie

Mary Ann May-Pumphrey   **2016-05-11 10:47:55 PDT**   **Comment 9**

> I did try getting a
> new Password for your account and I also got the Authentication Failed error
> message.   For someone that has never used the system, this message is
> appropriate -- they aren't in the system and they don't have an account.

I strongly disagree with this last sentence on the grounds of usability!
"Authentication" is something users do WITH a password, not when asking for help

with a lost/forgotten password. The error message really has to change to give the
user a more sensible message.

Also, regarding my case #3 above, it sounds like you think "Authentication failed"
is a perfectly fine response for it too. Again, NO! "No such account exists" or
"This email address isn't in our system."

To summarize: Case #1 (Scott's original, which I repeated with my mam-p@att.net"
testing) and Case #3 are separate situations, both of which thus deserve their own
error message. And "Authentication failed" doesn't work for either one of them.

Mary Ann May-Pumphrey   **2016-05-29 21:50:11 PDT**   **Comment 10**

Step 4 of your original Description is a bit superfluous. Minor twit.