



@Academic

Find me some peer-reviewed studies that showcase both the benefits and costs of education for responding to a thesis that says education's benefits outweigh its costs in response to the following prompt:

In her personal memoir *Educated*, Tara Westover says, "Education is not so much about making a living as making a person." She argues that formal education forces one to challenge long-held assumptions, biases, and family beliefs and ultimately leads one to redefine who they are, and that this can be a both painful and liberating experience.

Write an essay that argues your position on education's role in determining the kind of person one will be and the challenges and benefits that can come with it.

In your response you should do the following:

Respond to the prompt with a thesis that presents a defensible position.

Provide evidence to support your line of reasoning.

Explain how the evidence supports your line of reasoning.

Use appropriate grammar and punctuation in communicating your argument.

Education shapes who people become by influencing identity, values, and well-being, but peer-reviewed research also shows serious psychological and financial costs that complicate the claim that its benefits always outweigh its costs. A nuanced thesis for your essay could be: "Education profoundly shapes the kind of person one becomes by promoting identity development, autonomy, and well-being, yet the same educational processes can produce distress, debt-related anxiety, and identity conflict, so its benefits outweigh its costs only when educational systems support students' mental health and financial security."^[1] ^[2] ^[3]

Studies supporting education's benefits

Several identity-development studies show that engaging seriously with school and educational identity processes predicts stronger well-being and a clearer sense of self. For example, a longitudinal study of adolescents found that strong educational identity commitments and active exploration were associated with higher physical, psychological, and social well-being over time. A large review on adolescent identity development similarly reports that when students connect school with exploring "who they are," they show higher academic engagement, life satisfaction, and self-esteem.^[2] ^[1]

School can also foster the kind of reflective, self-questioning growth Tara Westover describes. A collaborative action-research project in middle schools found that when students did identity-focused projects in class, they developed more "reflexivity," meaning they learned to examine their own beliefs and values and to connect school experiences to their evolving

identities. Another study of experiential education programs (immersion semester high schools) shows that novel, challenging school environments plus strong teacher–student relationships encourage students to reflect on and sometimes revise core beliefs, which is both demanding and personally transformative.^{[4] [5] [6]}

Research on “education-dependent” future identities shows how school can reorient motivation and character. One classic study found that students who imagined adult lives that clearly required education (for example, professions that depend on degrees) earned better grades over time than peers whose imagined futures did not depend on schooling, even when their initial GPAs were similar. When children were experimentally prompted to think about such education-dependent futures, they were much more likely to put in extra effort on schoolwork, suggesting that tying identity to education can build persistence and a long-term orientation.^[7]

Studies highlighting education’s costs

At the same time, research on student loan debt and stress shows that modern education can damage well-being and constrain life choices. A recent mixed-methods study on the mental-health impact of student loan debt reports that higher debt levels correlate with greater anxiety, stress, and depressive symptoms, and that this financial burden shapes major life decisions after graduation. Policy analyses likewise note that while degrees predict higher earnings and better health, rapidly rising tuition has created a debt crisis that undermines those benefits for many students.^{[3] [8]}

Even when schooling promotes identity growth, the process can be painful and destabilizing in ways that echo Westover’s memoir. Studies of adult learners entering higher education describe the first year as being “thrown in the deep end,” with participants struggling to integrate a new “adult learner” identity with family roles and prior self-images. Longitudinal work on adolescent identity trajectories finds that disturbed or unstable identity patterns—often surfacing when school demands conflict with family or cultural expectations—are linked to lower self-esteem, more depressive symptoms, and greater psychological vulnerability.^{[9] [10] [2]}

School environments can also interact with personality and well-being in risky ways. A large study on personality and school experiences in adolescence shows that negative school experiences (such as low well-being at school) predict later changes in personality traits, including less favorable developments in domains like emotional stability. Another longitudinal project on the education-to-work transition finds that when young adults’ sense of mastery in educational or training settings declines, later emotional stability also falls, suggesting that high-pressure or unsupportive programs can erode confidence and personality functioning rather than strengthening them.^{[11] [12]}

How to use these studies in your essay

You can use the “benefits” studies to support claims that education shapes “the kind of person one will be” by:

- Showing that educational identity work increases well-being, meaning in life, and self-confidence (cite Identity Matters for Well-Being, the adolescent identity review, and the collaborative school projects).^{[5] [6] [4] [1] [2]}

- Arguing that when students see education as central to their future selves, they become more persistent, reflective, and purpose-driven (cite the “incentivizing education” identity study).^[7]

Then use the “costs” studies to complicate or qualify the claim that benefits always outweigh costs:

- Point out that financial structures of higher education impose debt that harms mental health and limits autonomy (student-loan mental health research and tuition/debt policy analysis).^{[8] [3]}
- Explain that identity change in school can bring confusion, family conflict, and mental health risks, especially for adult or first-generation students and adolescents with unstable identity trajectories (adult learner identity study, identity-trajectory work, and personality–school-experience research).^{[10] [12] [9] [11]}

Sample comparison table for your argument

You can summarize key evidence in your notes with a table like this:

Study / area	Main benefit of education	Main cost or risk	How it supports your thesis
Adolescent educational identity and well-being ^[1] [2]	Strong school-related identity linked to higher well-being and life meaning.	Identity work can be stressful when commitments are unstable.	Shows education shapes who students become and how well they function.
School-based identity projects and experiential programs ^{[4] [5] [6]}	Fosters reflection, 21st-century skills, and re-examination of beliefs.	Reflection can surface painful conflicts about values and family expectations.	Mirrors Westover’s idea that education “makes a person” through challenge.
Education-dependent future identities ^[7]	Tying identity to schooling increases effort and persistence.	Pressure to live up to an education-dependent self can create stress.	Supports the claim that education channels motivation and character.
Student loan debt and tuition burden ^{[3] [8]}	Degrees still predict higher earnings and opportunity.	Debt increases anxiety, depression, and constrains major life choices.	Shows benefits can be undercut by structural financial costs.
Personality and school experiences / mastery ^[11] [12]	Positive school experiences and mastery relate to more adaptive personality development.	Negative experiences and low mastery predict declines in emotional stability.	Demonstrates that how education is structured affects whether it builds or harms the person.

Using this mix of peer-reviewed evidence lets you argue that education can indeed “make a person,” but that whether its benefits truly outweigh its costs depends on how educational systems handle identity disruption, mental health, and money.

Can you give me some studies or articles that showcase that these identity changes, particularly ones that result in a conflict with a pre-existing belief, ultimately lead to positive results in the long term

Several strands of peer-reviewed research show that identity changes that begin with conflict or dissonance often lead to better well-being, clearer purpose, and more mature identities over time.

Transformative learning and study abroad

Work on cultural immersion, study abroad, and global service-learning uses transformative learning theory to show how exposure to unfamiliar norms forces students to confront and reevaluate previous assumptions. One study of study-abroad and service-learning participants found that difficult moments—feeling out of place, recognizing privilege, or encountering conflicting values—prompted students to question prior beliefs and reconstruct a broader, more reflective sense of self and others, rather than simply returning to their old views. The same paper reports that students who engaged most deeply with these tensions described longer-term gains in perspective-taking, critical cultural awareness, and a more grounded sense of identity.^[28]

Identity processes and long-term well-being

Longitudinal research on adolescent identity shows that “in-depth exploration” and “reconsideration of commitments” (both of which usually mean questioning or clashing with earlier beliefs) are linked over time to better psychological and social well-being when they eventually lead to stable new commitments. A large study of adolescents from different cultural backgrounds found that youths who actively explored and sometimes reconsidered their educational and interpersonal identities—but then formed coherent new commitments—reported higher physical, psychological, and social well-being later on. This suggests that friction with old beliefs is not only normal but can be a necessary step toward healthier, more resilient identities as long as it culminates in renewed clarity rather than permanent confusion.^[29]

Transformational college experiences and life outcomes

A recent conceptual and empirical paper on “transformational” undergraduate experiences (such as intensive mentoring, service learning, and authentic, problem-based learning) argues that structured identity work—often involving clashes between students’ incoming assumptions and new perspectives—predicts better long-term life outcomes. Drawing on large alumni surveys and prior empirical work, the authors report that experiences that explicitly engage students’ sense of purpose and identity (for example, community-based projects that challenge prior views of civic responsibility or privilege) are associated with stronger later well-being, agency, and civic engagement. The same review highlights evidence that dialog across differences and racial/cultural awareness workshops, which frequently surface painful tensions

with pre-existing beliefs, are linked to greater long-term civic mindedness and sustained engagement after college.^[30]

Professional identity change in education

Research on professional and teacher identity also shows that identity conflict can have productive long-term effects. A synthesis on teacher-identity development argues that teachers who confront tensions between their prior self-image and new professional expectations (for example, negotiating authority, care, and cultural power in the classroom) eventually develop more flexible, context-sensitive professional identities that support effectiveness and emotional resilience. Similarly, work on coaching and identity in career transitions (such as the MAP "Me-As-a-Process" coaching model) describes how explicitly working through identity conflicts during voluntary career changes increases the likelihood that people will sustain the transition and report higher satisfaction and well-being afterward.^{[31] [32]}

How you can use these in your essay

To support a claim that painful identity conflicts during education can have positive long-term results, you can:

- Cite study-abroad and service-learning research showing that disorienting, value-clashing experiences abroad push students to reexamine and then broaden their identities, leading to more nuanced self-understanding and empathy.^[28]
- Use longitudinal identity research to argue that questioning and even temporarily rejecting earlier beliefs (reconsideration of commitments) predicts better well-being once students form new, coherent commitments.^[29]
- Draw on work about transformative college experiences to say that programs designed to challenge students' assumptions about culture, power, and community are associated with higher long-term well-being, agency, and civic engagement.^[30]
- Refer to professional/teacher identity and career-transition research to show that wrestling with conflicts between old and new identities can yield more adaptive, resilient professional selves.^{[32] [31]}

Together, these sources let you argue that when educational environments support reflection and belonging, the very moments that most conflict with pre-existing beliefs often become the engine for long-term growth, purpose, and well-being rather than lasting damage.



According to the following definition of a 'reason,' create a list of reasons that the benefits of education outweigh the costs

Reasons: Reasons are not the same as evidence or example. Reasons are just that—a general explanation (reasoning) of why you believe what you say in your thesis. Reasons don't have specifics. Reasons can also serve as your TOPIC SENTENCES for your body paragraphs.

Evidence / Examples: Your evidence will come from the nonfiction book, your own experience, your understanding of history and current events, literature, popular culture, science, sports, etc. If you believe that looking up outside information is helpful and necessary, I will ask you to cite it in the following way:

1. Education expands a person's perspective, allowing them to question inherited beliefs and see multiple viewpoints, which leads to a more thoughtful and independent sense of self.
2. Education strengthens critical thinking and problem-solving, giving people the tools to make better decisions in all areas of life, not just in school or work.
3. Education opens doors to more and better career opportunities, which usually means greater financial stability and freedom to choose the kind of life one wants to live.
4. Education helps people develop resilience by putting them in challenging situations where they must adapt, manage failure, and keep going, making future hardships easier to handle.
5. Education builds communication skills—speaking, listening, reading, and writing—so that people can express themselves clearly and advocate for their needs and values.
6. Education exposes people to diverse cultures, ideas, and communities, which can reduce prejudice and increase empathy, making them more understanding and ethical citizens.
7. Education nurtures a sense of purpose by helping people discover their interests, talents, and passions, which can guide major life choices and long-term goals.
8. Education encourages autonomy, teaching people how to learn on their own so they are not dependent on others for information or interpretation.
9. Education supports mental and emotional growth, giving people language for their feelings, awareness of mental health, and strategies for self-reflection and self-improvement.
10. Education builds a connection to something larger than the family or immediate environment—such as history, science, or social issues—so people can see their lives as part of a bigger story.
11. Education increases civic awareness, helping people understand laws, rights, and political systems, which prepares them to participate more responsibly in their communities.
12. Education can break cycles of limitation (such as poverty, narrow thinking, or rigid traditions) by offering alternatives and new models of how to live.
13. Education creates networks and relationships with mentors, peers, and professionals that can support a person's growth long after formal schooling ends.
14. Education helps people integrate both pain and liberation—by forcing them to confront uncomfortable truths, it allows them to rebuild a self that is more honest, self-chosen, and

stable.

15. Education gives people the capacity to keep growing and changing throughout life, so that even when it causes temporary conflict or loss, it equips them to build a stronger identity in the long run.

1. <https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC10879306/>
2. <https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC9298910/>
3. <https://scholarworks.lib.csusb.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=3211&context=etd>
4. <https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC9504224/>
5. <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/10538259221146724>
6. <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1354203.pdf>
7. <https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC2930839/>
8. <https://scholars.org/contribution/how-high-stress-and-skyrocketing-tuition>
9. <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/03075079.2020.1767049?needAccess=true>
10. <https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC10165116/>
11. <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/08902070211062326>
12. <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/jopy.12789>
13. <https://journal.sinergi.or.id/index.php/Psychology/article/view/504>
14. <http://wepub.org/index.php/TSSEHR/article/view/1708>
15. <http://bcpublication.org/index.php/EP/article/view/5112>
16. <http://bcpublication.org/index.php/EP/article/view/870>
17. <https://asmepublications.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/medu.70106>
18. <https://www.nepjol.info/index.php/nprcjmr/article/view/86545>
19. <https://jyesspe.in/index.php/ijyesspe/article/view/83>
20. <https://fahrudin.org/smart/article/view/614>
21. <http://journal2.uad.ac.id/index.php/fundadikdas/article/view/12659>
22. <https://www.frontiersin.org/articles/10.3389/fmed.2025.1616148/full>
23. <https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC7871525/>
24. <https://www.mdpi.com/2079-3200/10/3/64/pdf?version=1662466412>
25. <https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC8697663/>
26. <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1747938X25000417>
27. <https://srcd.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/cdep.12504>
28. <https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC7967506/>
29. <https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC10879306/>
30. <https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC11421152/>
31. <https://www.frontiersin.org/journals/psychology/articles/10.3389/fpsyg.2024.1364134/pdf>
32. <https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC9126123/>
33. <https://link.springer.com/10.1007/s12564-024-09950-9>
34. <https://www.mdpi.com/2227-7102/13/2/166>

35. <https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC8697663/>
36. <http://revistas.unisinos.br/index.php/contextosclinicos/article/download/5482/2718/17187>
37. <https://bera-journals.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1002/rev3.3264>
38. <https://dx.plos.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0285363>
39. <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/17427150231201731>
40. <https://ejournal.undiiksha.ac.id/index.php/JET/article/view/75039>
41. <https://bmcmededuc.biomedcentral.com/articles/10.1186/s12909-024-05993-z>
42. https://journals.lww.com/10.4103/jehp.jehp_861_24
43. <https://ejournal.yasin-alsys.org/IJEMT/article/view/3992>
44. <https://epaa.asu.edu/index.php/epaa/article/view/3239>
45. <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/02701960.2022.2156866>
46. <https://apcz.umk.pl/JEHS/article/view/56522>
47. <https://bmcmededuc.biomedcentral.com/articles/10.1186/s12909-022-03883-w>